AQAS

AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SURABAYA

PUBLIC ADMIN-LAW-GEOGRAPHY EDU

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (BACHELOR OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION)

LAW (BACHELOR OF LAW)

GEOGRAPHY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

December 2023

Q

Content

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION

▪ **"PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION" (BACHELOR OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION)**

▪ **"LAW" (BACHELOR OF LAW)**

▪ **"GEOGRAPHY EDUCATION" (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SURABAYA, SURABAYA, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 19th meeting on 4 December 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes "**Public Administration**" (**Bachelor of Public Administration**), "**Geography Education**" (**Bachelor of Education**), and "**Law**" (**Bachelor of Law**) offered by **Universitas Negeri Surabaya**, **Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

   The accreditations are conditional.

   The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.

3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2029**.

Conditions:

All programmes

1. The university must ensure that newly appointed teaching staff holds a PhD degree and more positions are filled with Associate Professors or Professors. For contracted teaching staff, the university must intensify and support their opportunities for gaining a higher qualification (PhD), by conducting their research projects and by contributing to more to conferences on national and international level.

2. More (part-time) teaching staff must be hired to guarantee satisfactory student support and allow teaching staff to conduct more research.

Law

3. To achieve a comparable set of skills in international law for its graduates, the Law study programme must implement a mandatory course on Private International Law and on Unified Private Law. Preferably, this course should be taught in English.

4. To guarantee that students know the basic legal rules, all courses must include instructions on the theoretical legal background before the students start working on cases. This must be documented via the syllabus and course handbook.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

<u>All programmes</u>

1. To guarantee transparency, the assessment methods for each course must be included in the course descriptions and course handbook of each programme.

2. To reflect the actual student workload, more credits should be assigned to the thesis.

3. To test all skills needed in students' future lives and employment, the examination methods should be diversified to include more oral exams, essays, or papers and the like.

<u>Geography Education</u>

4. To allow students to gain a higher degree of individual specialisation, it is recommended to enable students to choose more elective courses in the Geography Education study programme.

5. To emphasize the Geography Education study programme's strength and build its uniqueness, a deeper anchorage of the location through course topics should be implemented, such as content on urban studies, mega cities, waterfront cities, lowland/delta cities.

6. To guarantee integrated geographical knowledge of its graduates, the proportions of all geographical topics should be distributed more equally in the Geography Education study programme.

7. The amount of fieldwork should be increased to at least three times for each student in the course of their studies for the Geography Education study programme. To ensure the full integration of the practical experience into the content of the curriculum, internship and fieldwork should be explained in more detail in the course handbook.

<u>Public Administration</u>

8. The department of Public Administration should diversify its practical network to allow students a wider range of practical experience and building a network with possible future employers.

9. The emphasis on practical aspects of the study programme Public Administration should be clearly outlined and described in the course content as well as the course handbook to highlight the programme's strength.

10. To keep the curriculum up-to-date and best prepare graduates for the labour market, current topics, such as multilevel governance, participatory governance, digitalization and the aspect of internationalisation should be implemented more in the Public Administration study programme.

<u>Law</u>

11. To bring students in contact with the "real world" as a lawyer early, the study programme should rearrange its curriculum to teach at least two legal skills trainings in the early semesters of the programme.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **"PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION" (BACHELOR OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION)**

- **"LAW" (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **"GEOGRAPHY EDUCATION" (BACHELOR OF LAW)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SURABAYA, SURABAYA, INDONESIA

Visit to the university: 24-27 July 2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Andreas Schwartze, LLM.	University Professor of European Private Law, Comparative Private Law and International Private Law, University of Innsbruck/Austria
Dr. Djati Mardiatno	Professor in Environmental Geomorphology, Faculty of Geography, Department of Environmental Geography Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia ,
Prof. Dr. Jürgen Kegelmann	Professor for Organisation, HR and Management, University of Applied Sciences Kehl/Germany
Dr. Karl Pollmann	Subject Leader for Geography at the Centre for Practical Teacher Training Recklinghausen/Germany (labour market representative)
Luc Zettl	Andrassy University Budapest/Hungary (student representative)

Coordinator:

Dr. Sarah Jenischewski	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
Maria Rentmeister	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I.　Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II.　Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor's programmes "Public Administration", "Law", and "Geography Education" offered by Universitas Negeri Surabaya.

1.　Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2.　Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in November 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In October 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g., number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 5 December 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in in October 2022.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel May 2023. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 24-27 July 2023. The experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g., the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 4 December 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2024, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Negeri Surabaya (UNESA) is a state university located in Surabaya, East Java. The higher education institution was founded in 1964 as an institute of teacher training and education and has since been further expanded into its current status as a state university. UNESA has seven faculties that offer a range of Bachelor's, Master's and doctoral programmes for both teacher education and other professional and academic fields. In total, the university offers programmes for currently approx. 29,000 students (2022).

Within the seven faculties, UNESA states to offer 65 undergraduate programmes, ten vocational programmes, one profession programme, 23 graduate programmes and nine doctorate programmes in its seven faculties: Faculty of Education, Faculty of Language and Arts, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law, Faculty of Engineering, Faculty of Sports Sciences, and Faculty of Economics and Business. The overall number of teaching staff is 1,048 (2022), meaning that the overall teacher-student ratio amounts to 1:28.

The university defines its vision as being "Excellent in Education, Strong in Science." In its development, UNESA strives to combine top-down guidance with bottom-up innovations; a Strategic Plan 2020-2024 and a Development Master Plan (2011-2035) have been implemented. In particular, UNESA aims at developing education science, teacher science, and preparing educators and professional education personnel, developing, implementing and disseminating non-educational science, developing UNESA as a centre of education and a scientific centre based on the values of national culture as well as developing and disseminating science, technology, art, and/or sports to educate the nation while upholding human values through the "tridharma" approach (i.e., education, research, and community service).

The three study programmes to be accredited in this cluster are affiliated with the Faculty of Social Sciences and Law (FISH), which offers eight undergraduate programmes in total. The faculty has 112 lecturers/teaching staff and approx. 4,900 students. Its vision is underlined with the four missions related to education, research, service, and good governance.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*
>
> *The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*
>
> *[ESG 1.2]*

All study programmes

Description

According to the SER, the curriculum for all study programmes is developed referring to the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework and involves different stakeholders' judgement. The study programmes under review shall all lead to level 6 of this Indonesian National Qualification Framework. The curriculum of each programme is supposed to help the students develop mastery and understanding of knowledge, intellectual

skills, practical, managerial, leadership, ethics and manners. Furthermore, the SER states that the curriculum structure is based on the university's vision and mission, Programme Educational Objectives, graduate profiles, study materials, programme learning outcomes, course names and descriptions. It is also explained that all curricula contain national course content, university course content, faculty course content and courses according to the discipline of the study programme. An overall curriculum restructuring is set to take place every four years, while each study programme is set for re-evaluation annually.

Students of all reviewed study programmes are allowed to earn up to 20 credits outside of the main campus following the MBKM approach. Additionally, the SER says that UNESA tries to find collaborations with relevant national and international institutions as well as provides guidelines for credit transfer.

UNESA uses a credit system in which one credit equals a workload of 170 minutes/week (i.e., 50 minutes contact, structured assignments of 60 min; independent learning of 60 minutes), which leads to 6523.2 hours over four years of studies and equals 144 CU/229 ECTS credits. Teachers include their students in research, according to the SER. The semester for all study programmes lasts 16 weeks (14 weeks of lectures, one week with midterm exams, one with final exams).

Geography Education (Bachelor)

Description

The study programme is described as a multi-entry study programme which aims at graduates of high schools and vocational schools. It does not accept students who have worked or are working which shall lead to a rather homogenous student body.

The SER states that the programme's vision is to develop innovative geography education and learning with a geography approach in the context of a globally minded science and technology-based city. Graduate profiles include that of teachers and entrepreneurs. Programme learning objectives fall into the four fields of knowledge, general skills, special skills and attitude, and include, amongst others:

- Able to process, analyse, present geosphere data and information using geospatial technology,
- Able to show independent performance and cooperation that produces quality and measurable results,
- Able to plan, implement, evaluate / assess, and compile follow-ups in Geography learning by utilizing various science and technology-based learning resources,
- applying academic values, norms, and ethics.

In the course of their studies, students must take 140 CU/222.6 ECTS credits worth of mandatory courses, while using the remaining 4 CU credits for elective courses. The SER mentions five fields of courses students must take: Education (79.5 ECTS), physical geography (38.16 ECTS), human geography (60.42 ECTS), engineering geography (22.26 ECTS), and environmental geography (19.08 ECTS).

Experts' evaluation

The profile of the programme is adequate and prepares students well for the teacher or entrepreneur profession. The balance between general, subject-specific and educational courses is good. ILOs are measurable and reflective of the courses' and programme's content. They fit the aspired IQF level 6 and are transparent to stakeholders through their documentation. Their successful achievement is measured through fitting assessment and prepares them to be successful in their chosen career path.

To finish the study, students must take 144 CU minimum, with 140 CU compulsory courses and 4 CU elective courses. The amount of 140 CU for compulsory courses is too high for students to qualify with an individual specialisation following their strengths and interests. The study programme should, hence, reduce the number

of compulsory courses and provide a higher amount of CU that can be gained by elective courses (**Finding 1**).

Having said this, the study programme should focus on its uniqueness and strengths to foster international visibility. The university's location in a big city should be reflected more in the curriculum and considered in the programme's strengths. This can be specified within the curriculum in the form of topics in some courses, such as urban studies, mega cities and waterfront cities, lowland/delta cities (**Finding 2**).

Regarding the structure, the proportion of geographical topics taught are not equal in the current curriculum. The experts acknowledge that a slight shift towards human geography is a global trend. Nevertheless, at UNESA its dominance seems too exaggerated in comparison to physical geography, engineering geography, and environmental geography. Considering that graduates are mainly taught to become teachers, this structure is not ideal to teach integrated geographical knowledge. All geographical topics should be equally provided. Therefore, the programme should make sure that the proportion of all geographical topics is distributed more equally (**Finding 3**). Another aspect of the graduate profile of becoming a geography teacher entails their practical training throughout their studies. To help them develop their capacity and skill in the classroom, the department should consider extending the teacher's training programme.

The current curriculum counts only one integrated field work experience. In the experts' opinion, this does not reflect the importance that fieldwork should be given in geographical studies. Students gain valuable experiences from fieldwork that are not possible to achieve in laboratory work only. The number and fieldwork experience should thus be increased to at least three different occasions during the course of the study programme. To guarantee full transparency for all stakeholders, field work experience as well as the internship programme should also be explained in more detail in the course handbook (**Finding 4**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Public Administration (Bachelor)

Description

According to the SER, the Public Administration study programme is a multi-entry study programme. The SER states that its scientific vision is to become an excellent study programme in the field of management and public policy, globally competitive morally and professionally by 2025. The curriculum is said to have been restructured in 2021 to comply with government policies.

Graduates of this programme are said to have profiles as public administrators and policy analysts. Accordingly, the SER lists its Programme Educational Objectives (PEO) as educating professionals in the field of public administration and public policy, who have knowledge and expertise in organisation, management and public policy; administrators and public policy analysts able to provide alternative solutions and solve problems effectively and efficiently; graduates with lifelong learning attitude through research, professional and community service. Programme learning objectives fall into the four fields of knowledge, general skills, special skills and attitude, such as:

- Able to master the theoretical concepts of public sector management to realize the values of good governance,
- Able to communicate orally and in writing in organization and society,
- Able to formulate alternative solutions to administrative problems in public sector organisations,

- Contribute to the improvement the quality of life in society and state.

Through the course of their studies students take 129 CU (205.11 ECTS) worth of mandatory courses, while choosing the remaining 16 CU from the offered elective courses. According to the SER, all courses fall into the categories of Public Policy, Public Management and Local Government Administration. The faculty claims to have a cooperation with the Indonesian Association of Public Administration, which offers partially the same courses and is responsible for parts of the study materials used in this study programme. In addition to these courses, students are also said to have the opportunity to participate in non-programme courses, whose implementation is coordinated by the Personality Development Course Centre, e.g., Core Personality Development Courses (such as Religious, Pancasila Education, Indonesian education amongst others) and Institutional personality, and development courses (i.e., digital literacy and PE & fitness). As a rule, the SER says, students choose their courses with an academic advisory lecturer.

Apart from their courses, students are said to be supported through guest lecturers, student capability improvement activities, domestic and international internships.

Experts' evaluation

The undergraduate study programme "Public Administration Science" follows a clear vision and strategic approach. The desired qualifications are defined and can be achieved based on the intended learning outcomes and the developed curriculum. The curriculum structure is comprehensible, and the module handbook is clearly structured and guides the students in a very transparent way.

The graduates are accepted by the labour market. Because of the strong collaboration with the Public Administration Association, the needs of the labour market are reflected in the curriculum. This leads to graduates quickly finding a job, but almost exclusively in the immediate vicinity. Graduates, as well as students, would highly benefit from a more diverse practical network that can include further regional and local institutions, and even international ones in the long term. This would inevitably increase the programme's internationality (**Finding 5**).

The practical implementation of the study programme as well as the course handbook would benefit from a better description of the relationship between theory and practice. In its current mode of presentation, the strong focus on internships and work placements does not become evident. These practical efforts should be described better based on a clear strategy how the linkage between theory and practice is organized (**Finding 6**).

The achievements of the modules are tested through different types of exams. Even if the assessments are varying, an overview of the distribution of the different types is missing. It could be helpful, if already in the overview of the curriculum structure a hint could be given concerning the type of examination. In the course descriptions, the specification of the exam method used is mandatory and must be included to make the assessment structure and strategy more transparent (**Finding 7**); also see chapter 3.

Concerning the content of the modules, there is a good distribution of different areas of learning. Management topics, legal topics, financial topics, topics on innovation, etcetera are all included in the curriculum. To keep the curriculum up-to-date and best prepare graduates for the labour market, current topics, such as multilevel governance, participatory governance, digitalization and the aspect of internationalisation (e.g., international organization; international public administration) should take up more space in the curriculum (**Finding 8**).

Following the recommendation for the study programme of Geography Education, the ratio between compulsory and elective should be reviewed. Most of the modules are compulsory and there is little space to elect courses following personal interests or skills. The ratio of credits for mandatory and elective courses should be revised with a focus on more possibilities to choose elective modules (see **Finding 1**). This would signify that the ration between generalization and specialization could be elaborated very stringent and strategic.

Finally, the experts would like to comment on the currently limited possibility of academic enhancement for graduates. There is no Master's programme offered at UNESA and no possibility given to pursue a PhD in Public Administration. Furthermore, the scientific connections are limited. Efforts to allow an academic or scientific path for students and graduates who want to continue their career in this field should be made possible by the department.

Besides all these recommendations the study programme has a very good quality and is organized and taught very well.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Law (Bachelor)

Description

According to the SER, the Law study programme is a multi-entry study programme. The SER states that its scientific vision is to educate students to become professional in the field of law at national and international levels. The curriculum of this study programme was restructured in 2021 in accordance with the Ministry of Education and Culture.

Profiles for graduates of this study programme include legal officer, attorney or judge, and the SER lists the study programmes PEOs as educating professionals with a career in law, legal skills in order to fulfil the competencies of other legal professions, professional with ethics, and being a professional who is responsible, contributes positively, thinks critically and creatively. Programme learning objectives fall into the four fields of knowledge, general skills, special skills and attitude, such as:

- Able to comprehensively master general knowledge and the basics of jurisprudence,
- Able to apply logical, critical, systematic, and solution thinking,
- Able to solve legal problems by elaborating positive law and legal principles in the field of economic law and law in general,
- Upholding human values and contributing to solving legal problems.

The study programme includes mandatory courses of 135 CU (214.65 ECTS) throughout the duration of the programme. Students can choose ten CU worth of elective courses. According to the SER, courses come from the fields of Economic Law and Procedural Law.

The SER states that students of the first year obtain a general knowledge and the basics of law. Their study plan includes compulsory institutional courses as well as basic courses of the study programme. In their second year, students are supposed to take more specialised courses and begin to develop legal problem solving and critical analysis skills. The next year is supposed to help them develop the ability of legal research for legal conclusions. In their sixth semester students start choosing a concentration. By then, students are supposed to have legal research skills to develop legal arguments and legal reasoning in written and oral communication.. In their last year of this study programme, students are supposed to have specific competencies according to their specialization as well as the opportunity to practice law in the Legal Services and Assistance Unit by assisting academic staff with pro bono cases. Before their graduation they are supposed to be able to demonstrate the ability to integrate knowledge, skills, and attitudes related to legal case settlements.

Experts' evaluation

The Bachelor of Law programme stretches over eight semesters with about 230 credits (ECTS). This provides more room for a thorough legal education than most European LL.B's (lasting only six semesters for 180 credits

(ECTS)). The programme is well structured and documented but still has some deficits in implementing the university's vision of internationality and research.

The intended learning outcomes are formulated in a very general way, only using a few different phrases and mainly focusing on the ability to identify legal issues or to solve legal problems as the main activity of practicing jurists (truly reflecting labour market requirements). The ability to analyse certain aspects of law or to formulate ideas, pointing more to the academic/scientific side of legal education, is much less frequently mentioned. However, especially international employers expect graduates of law study programmes to have these skills. It should, therefore, be considered including ILOs indicating these skills as well. Overall, the learning outcomes are related to the teaching of the courses and are measurable on the basis of the type of exams used. The acceptance of the labour market, where the graduates can smoothly find employment, also demonstrates that the learning outcomes are appropriate for the Indonesian job market.

The curriculum is properly composed of the main areas of law, as usual with a focus on private (or "civil") law (seven of 23 courses in semester 3 and 4 – only three of these 23 courses are from the area of public law and only two from criminal law), and the related procedural topics (one in semester 3, three with doubled credits in semester 5). Indonesian specialities like Adat Law and Islamic Law are rightly taught. Most of the relevant basic legal subjects are included in semester 4 (Legal reasoning, Philosophy and Sociology of law), although others, like Legal history, Comparative law and the more modern Economic theory of law should be considered to be added. The experts therefore recommend their inclusion in the curriculum. The two introductions to neighbouring disciplines, namely Sociology and Economics, in semester 1 are necessary elements of today's legal education.

However, the international area of law is underdeveloped with only up to two courses; one in semester 2 (introductory course in International Law) and one in semester 3 (Public International Law). To teach students to a comparable level of knowledge in international law, a mandatory course on Private International Law and on Unified Private Law is necessary (**Finding 9**). It would be even better if the courses on international law would be presented in English.

More than 25% of the curriculum is dedicated to the integration of practical experience. This is a solid way to prepare the students for their later work: Semester 6 is fully constituted on internships and all courses in semester 7 are independent projects. The option to solve legal problems within the "Legal Service and Assistance Unit", a kind of a US-style "law clinic", is even more remarkable. To prepare students for this phase of their studies, the necessary skills in central areas are developed in advance by five courses during semester 5. This seems to be a little late, so at least two of the Legal Skill Trainings should be placed at the beginning of the studies (e.g., "Contract Drafting" together with "Contract Law" in semester 3 and "Criminal Law" with the correspondent course in semester 2) to bring the students in contact with the real legal world as early as possible (**Finding 10**).

The dominating teaching method is problem-based learning following the case method. The again very practical approach is commendable. However, to handle a case with legal problems requires at least a basic understanding of the applicable legal rules. To guarantee that students know the basic legal rules, all courses must begin with instructions of the theoretical legal background before the students start working on cases (**Finding 11**). Therefore, these instructions must be implemented in foundational law courses and the instructional content of them must be included in the course handbook.

The allocation of workload to the courses is adequate with one exception: The value of the bachelor thesis, founded on research, seems to be rather low (9.54 ECTS), comparable LL.B's valuate this phase with at least 15 credits (ECTS). Therefore, to reflect the actual student workload, more credits should be assigned to the thesis (**Finding 12**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

UNESA uses an Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) for both academic and non-academic processes. Responsibilities are shared by a Quality Assurance Unit (SPM) at the university level, a Quality Assurance Group (GPM) at the faculty level, and a Quality Assurance Unit (UPM) at the department/study programme level. The SPMI is stated to be carried out based on the Continuous Quality Improvement (CQI) principles, namely promulgating, implementing, evaluating, controlling, and improving the national standards.

At the university level, the Quality Assurance Unit determines quality standards, procedures, manuals, assessment forms and self-assessment checklists. UNESA states that it applies 36 quality standards which are divided into National Higher Education Standards (i.e., Higher Education Standards, Research Standards, Community Service Standards) and Internal Standards of the university (11 standards, i.e., vision and mission standards, student standards, alumni standards, and collaboration standards).

In addition to the external evaluation through the national accreditation agency BAN-PT, UNESA carries out an internal Curriculum Audit to implement the SPMI regularly. Further instruments are, amongst others, audits on learning evaluation, a Leadership Performance Achievement Audit and a collaboration audit.

The progress of the curriculum is to be shown by the assessment of outputs and outcomes derived from the results of the learning outcomes analysis, increasing publications of research and service, tracer studies, GPA scores, number of graduates and length of time for finding employment, and information on the student body in the respective programme which will be audited once a year. Furthermore, the heads of the study programmes are said to assess 1) the success of the course's learning outcomes, 2) the percentage of success of course graduates, 3) the success of the study programme's objectives, and 4) the student workload.

According to the information provided in the SER, results will be followed up through an annual Management Review Meeting, which involves faculty leaders, heads of study programme, coordinator of academics, accounting, finance and state property, student, and alumni affairs.

Students are involved in the quality assurance system by filling out questionnaires at the end of a course and by participating in a customer satisfaction survey. Furthermore, according to the SER, the university collects data on its dropout rates, as well as ideally, the reason for these dropouts. In addition, UNESA outlines an open dialogue between study programme managers, lecturers, and students as a form of evaluation. Graduates are invited to participate in a tracer study.

Experts' evaluation

The university has a very elaborate quality management system. Derived from a clear mission, the quality assurance system has strategic and operative aspects. The frame for the quality assurance is university-wide but the concretization lies within the responsibility of the faculties and the responsible staff in the different programmes. It is also very positive that the stakeholders are involved and contribute with feedback to the processes in the system.

Key performance indicators in all areas are in place which try to make the objectives smart in terms of being specific, measurable, attractive, realistic and time-phased. Good overviews show the frequencies and the way data is used to improve the programmes. Students evaluate their courses, which leads to talks and, if needed, further training for teaching staff, if a lecturer's performance is critiqued. Graduates fill out tracer studies for the university and the programmes to be able to follow their career. Additionally, employers also are involved in the quality assurance process by giving their feedback and actively being involved in making sure the curriculum best prepares students for their career after graduation.

The main question which should be reflected in more detail is how to handle the data in the process of target finding, target implementation and target controlling because sometimes in organizations there are a lot of data available but not used for management and governance. A document detailing how data is used for learning and development, and describing the procedure of how results are used for the improvement of the programme would help the programme's responsibles to always be up to date on current developments.

Academic integrity is also included in the procedures of quality assurance as the online visit confirmed that students are informed about its significance as well as regulations that take effect if a misconduct is detected. Turnitin is used to check theses for signs of plagiarism.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

3. **Learning, teaching and assessment of students**

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*
> *Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*
> *Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
> *[ESG 1.3]*

Description

According to the information in the SER, the study programmes under review prioritise a student-centred learning approach and apply different learning methods including direct instruction, small group discussions, case studies, problem-based and project-based learning. Practical courses in all study programmes are described as using project-based learning. To analyse if the Course Learning Outcomes (CLO) are achieved, the SER states that the university assesses students results according to rubrics.

Examinations fall under three categories, which depend on the learning outcomes of the different courses: paper-based tests for assessing the achievement of knowledge; performance-based tests to measure general and/or specific skills and attitudes as well as project-based tests, which are supposed to combine all ILOs. If a student cannot participate in an exam, a process to follow is provided. The SER also mentions a thesis

programme that is supposed to support students preparing their thesis in the 7th semester. Students are mentored by a lecturer, with whom they meet 4-8 times before submitting their thesis proposal, after which students participate in a proposal seminar with two examiners and other students. Finally, students have to pass the thesis examinations, which include writing and publishing scientific articles as well as including their examiners suggestions to their thesis.

Lecturers are supposed to prepare a Semester Lesson Plan, which shall guide the students in carrying out learning activities throughout the semester. The lesson plans must be uploaded by the lecturers and validated by the Quality Assurance Unit at least one week before the students' course enrolment ends. All regulations are defined in the Academic Guidelines.

Opportunities for students' complaints are provided.

Experts' evaluation

The different learning and teaching methods in the programmes are theoretically designed to reach the intended learning outcomes. In practice, nearly all of the teaching is done through case studies and problem-based teaching which focuses on the necessary practice orientation.

In contrast, Geography Education is lacking field work (see **Finding 4**); also see chapter 1. On "Quality of the curriculum". This study programme should intensify the practical aspect of visiting schools for its students.

While this student-centred approach to learning is to be commended, diversifying teaching methods used, such as direct instruction and small group discussion, would add to a more varied learning process. This would also support students to apply more critical thinking into their academic work as well as prepare them to use it in their future professional and private life.

The different methods of examination are designed to test the students' necessary competences required for their future professional work. Unfortunately, only scarce information describing the different types of exams (e.g., reports or portfolios) is available in the course descriptions and how a certain type of exam is used in a particular course. In this aspect, the examination requirements need to be made more transparent and an overview of assessment methods on a general level should be provided (see **Finding 7**).

Currently, emphasis seems to be laid on written examination. As soft skills, such as communications skills, become more and more important, oral exams should play a bigger role in the programmes under review. Additionally, again especially for students who are interested in continuing their career in academia and research, more essays and papers should be used as examination method. Finally, in the study programme Geography Education the assessment of teaching ability is missing, therefore appropriate tests should be conducted to prepare students for their future employment as well as test their skills as future teachers (**Finding 13**).

To assist the students during the preparation of their thesis with a mentor and via the participation in a seminar gives them a good structure for the phase in which they write their final paper.

Procedures for student appeals are provided and visible.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*

Description

Admission of undergraduate students follows three channels based on national regulations: National Selection for State Universities (SNMPTN), Joint Entrance Selection for State Universities (SBMPTN) and independent pathway programmes.

SNMPTN is held by all state universities in Indonesia – including UNESA – by using grades and other academic achievements during the applicants' study in high schools as admission criteria. SBMPTN is carried out based on a computer-based writing examination. According to the SER, no separate skill proficiency tests are conducted for the study programmes under review.

Information on the admission criteria and procedure are available on the university's website.

Once enrolled, students have to pay tuition fees to the state university. The amount is regulated by criteria and divided into eight different levels.

According to the information in the SER, academic supervisors conduct a monitoring of student's progression. Based on these regulations, the supervisors evaluate students' progress at the end of each semester, especially if students do not reach a minimum of CU credits. Those students will be approached by the head of the study programme.

With the aim to support the internationalization of the programmes, each student must participate in an English Proficiency Test at the beginning and the end of the study period.

The university has a policy of recognizing courses that have been taken by students at other universities through a credit transfer system mechanism. Regulations for recognition of previous learning, including non-formal and informal learning, are said to be available as well.

According to UNESA, after completing their studies, graduates will receive a diploma, an academic transcript, a certificate of companion diploma, a certificate of competence, a professional certificate, and student activity transcripts.

Experts' evaluation

Student admission runs through different channels, each with its own rules. Some of these are set by the state. For prospective students who already have study or work experience, there are recognition regimes for this experience. As far as it could be seen by the experts, these regulations are also applied without any problems. Information on the admission process is available to applicants. An admission requirement for new students is the university's own English test (TEP) which is understandable since some modules are already taught in English.

There is a nine-tier tuition fee system, according to which different tuition fees are determined with the help of various social factors.

Various mobility formats and mechanisms exist for which corresponding recognition regimes are also in place. New adapted curricula are also available for the three study programmes, which take into account the new

Indonesian mobility variant MBKM. Credits gained under this programme can easily be transferred to the student's study programme at UNESA through specific procedures, which students are informed about.

The academic advisor, of which every student has one, meets with them on a regular basis to monitor the student's progress. If a problem becomes apparent, the academic advisor can support the student or report the issue to the head of programme who will then meet with the student.

Upon graduation, all students receive a degree as well as certificate that classify the student's achievements.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff

Bachelor's/Master's degree
The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.
Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.
Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.
[ESG 1.5]

Description

The recruitment mechanism of the programmes' lecturers includes procedures for civil servants and non-civil servants. Additionally, the faculty recruits contract-based educators. As stated by UNESA, the lecturer and educator recruitment procedure follow the national regulations.

The lecturers' workload varies according to their academic qualification, as the SER states, between 12 and 16 credits per semester. Additionally, the university invites national and international practitioners as part-time lecturers, as it says. Currently the teaching staff of the Geography Education programme is said to be comprised of 14 lecturers (six Associate Professors, eight Assistant Professors) of whom ten hold a PhD; the Public Administration programme also has 14 lecturers (one Associate Professor, seven Assistant Professors, six Assistant Professors) of whom two hold a PhD, and the Law programme has 22 lecturers (one Associate Professor, 11 Assistant Professors, six Assistant Professors, four Assistant Professors) of whom five hold a doctorate degree. Minimum qualification for all teaching staff in these study programmes is a Master's degree.

According to the SER, lecturers are offered different career options: lecturer, assistant professor, associate professor, and full professor. The teaching load includes education, research, and community service activities. According to the SER, lecturers under the age of 35 are required to continue their studies abroad.

Degree education leading to an increased academic qualification, such as further studies to a higher level carried out with a study leave and study permit mechanism. Non-degree training is carried out to improve competence of teaching staff in the form of training activities, journal article writing workshops, internships, work visits, seminars, and staff exchanges, both domestically and abroad. Furthermore, the university states that lecturers are supported to increase their English skills through, e.g., IELTS trainings, which are conducted periodically by the language centre.

UNESA also states to support its lecturers in scientific publications and conference participations.

Experts' evaluation

UNESA's Faculty of Social Sciences and Law (FISH) provides opportunities for all teaching staff and supporting staff to develop themselves and increase their capacities. FISH, through the university, allocates an adequate budget for staff development purposes. Specifically for lecturers, FISH provides full support to improve the competences and abilities of lecturers in the fields of teaching, research, and community service.

The number of qualified teaching staff in the faculty is very important. Currently, the number of teaching staff with senior positions, like associate professor and professor, is very low. With these numbers, it is very hard to maintain the adequate academic level of the programmes. Therefore, the number of teaching staff at FISH with professor and associate professor qualifications needs to be increased (**Finding 14**). This issue is already addressed by UNESA, as all teaching staff younger than 35 years are to further their own studies. This policy needs to be continued in the eyes of the experts to ensure that a larger number of academic staff has a doctoral degree. In the short run, raising the prerequisites of academic qualification for newly hired staff is also a possibility.

The ratio between lecturers and students is still not ideal, so that lecturers' workload/teaching hours are quite high. Competence in research and community service is quite good, but the quality of research and community service needs to be improved. Their results should be used to support lectures (research-based learning). This issue can be solved by hiring more (part-time) teaching staff that would allow for a better student-teacher ratio and reduce the currently high teaching-centred workload (**Finding 15**).

The recruitment system follows procedures set by the university, referring to the provisions of the ministry. Current teaching staff shows that the criteria for recruitment work as teaching staff has the adequate qualification and competencies for their position. Guest lecturers who are invited or involved in the learning process meet the criteria set and recognized by the university, too.

Keeping UNESA's wish for more internationalisation in mind, the experts furthermore encourage lecturers to increase their network with international parties.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*
> *Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*
> *[ESG 1.6]*

Description

New students are required to partake in orientation and introduction to campus life activities. Afterwards, students are assigned an academic supervisor. The counselling schedule is supposed to involve at least three meetings per semester, one at the beginning, one before midterm examinations and one at the end of the semester. In addition, thesis supervisors are available to assist the students.

Furthermore, Student Advisory Services are available to all students. For exchange students, the counselling and guidance service is provided by the university's International Office. International networks are supposed to enable international short programmes for students of UNESA. The International Office is also responsible

for supporting UNESA students and their possibilities of student mobility and scholarships, as the university claims.

Support is also offered by UNESA's Centre for Disability Studies and Services which offers activities for disabled students. To support their work, they use the UNESA-DIMETRIC (UNESA Disability Inclusion Metric), as the SER says. According to it, UNESA also tries to be inclusive in other fields which is why it supports anti-discrimination policies, diversity and anti-radicalism activities.

Further support opportunities for students are national and international scholarships and the university's health services. A Career Centre offers support and activities such as a career fair or entrepreneurship training.

To facilitate the students' needs for learning resources as well as non-academic activities, the SER lists the university offering meeting buildings, sports facilities, a language centre, a mosque, e-learning and entrepreneurship laboratories as well as its libraries, which are said to be open seven days of the week. The library is supposed to provide scientific references and international electronic journal subscription libraries such as CAMBRIDGE, EBSCO, EMERALD or SPRINGER. Students can access them from outside the campus, too.

Experts' evaluation

Students receive all relevant information via the university's own information systems. The faculty maintains various facilities (laboratories) in which students can gain practical experience. Facilities are sufficient to accommodate all students of the respective programmes in their practically oriented classes. There is also support for students participating in various academic competitions (e.g., Moot Courts, Model United Nations).

While the university maintains a wide range of digital access to literature, the physical book stock is rather underdeveloped. It should be ensured that a sufficient amount of up-to-date literature is available. At least one hardcopy of all standard literature used in the different study programmes should be made available to the students in the library (**Finding 16**).

Financial support is available for students from weak economic backgrounds or to those who are temporarily in need. Additionally, various scholarship opportunities are available for different mobility options. Unfortunately, these do not seem to be sufficiently communicated, as was communicated by students who did not know about funding options and support available. In terms of greater student participation in the internationalisation of the university, better and more proactive information about scholarship opportunities should be worked towards, and made easily accessible, e.g., via the website (**Finding 17**).

Various support and counselling services are located at the university, at the faculty and at programme level which support students with private and academic problems.

Regarding future career paths, students are supported by a career service. In some cases, formats also exist at the study programme level (Law: Share2Care) to inform students about career opportunities. It should be noted that greater involvement of potential future employers, for example in the form of career fairs, can be positive for the students, the study programmes, and the companies. It should thus be implemented, e.g., by organising respective events by UNESA and/or the faculty.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly.*
> *This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*
> *[ESG 1.8]*

Description

Students are said to be able to access all information on their programmes such as profiles, research, collaboration, etc. via an Integrated Academic Information System as well as via the university's and faculty's websites. The faculty also describes being active on online video platforms and social media.

Information on the university, its mission, its outline, as well as on the programmes is said to be published on the university's and faculty's website. This is supposed to include information on the intended learning outcomes, the admission criteria and procedure and the qualification awarded. Furthermore, according to the SER, prospective students find information on admission, such as selection paths, procedures and registration after their acceptance here.

According to the information given by UNESA, the website of the Faculty of Social Sciences and Law includes information related to profiles, strategics plan, academics, students, services, units, seminars organized by the faculty, and policies, but also a calendar, information on accreditations, collaborations, curricula. The SER states that students can also contribute to this website with information on student organisations, achievements, tuition, academic and non-academic activities.

Additionally to these websites, each study programme has its own website which is supposed to deliver news and information on the programme's profile, staff, research and publications, students and alumni, facilities and collaborations, ILOs, lecture materials.

Every year, UNESA claims to publish a performance accountability report in which, amongst other things, developments are linked to indicators of the business strategic plan.

Experts' evaluation

UNESA´s websites provide diverse information about its institutions and their respective study programmes. The start pages and some of the subpages are available in English, some basic pages even in German, Arabic and Chinese.

The Faculty of Social Science and Law also provides important information in English. Its subpages contain the information about the available study programmes. Furthermore, the homepage contains informational videos about the faculty and its facilities, some in English.

As UNESA pursues internationalisation, an even wider use of English could further promote this endeavour. For this purpose, the experts recommend focusing more on information concerning the study programmes and their content throughout the semesters. A higher information character can potentially lead to more confidence and interest of international stakeholders and applicants.

Finally, to take the homepage to the next level, FISH could highlight its student's organisations online. As with the aforementioned suggestion, such additional content might raise stakeholders' interests in the programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V.   Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes "Law (Bachelor of Law)", "Public Administration (Bachelor of Public Administration)" and "Geography Education (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universidad Negeri Surabaya with conditions.

Commendation:

The experts commend the possibilities of teaching staff to further improve their qualifications as well as their relationship with students. The very practical oriented approach of all study programmes is admirable and well suited to prepare students for their future careers. This is also evident through the close collaboration with future employers, such as the Indonesian Association of Public Administration, which is commendable, as well as the support via a career centre. Students are well supported in all stages of their lifecycle, which is another very positive point to mention.

Findings:

1. To allow students to gain a higher degree of individual specialisation, it is recommended to enable students to choose more elective courses in the Geography Education study programme.

2. To emphasize the Geography Education study programme's strength and build its uniqueness, a deeper anchorage of the location through course topics should be implemented, such as content on urban studies, mega cities, waterfront cities, lowland/delta cities.

3. To guarantee integrated geographical knowledge of its graduates, the proportions of all geographical topics should be distributed more equally in the Geography Education study programme.

4. The amount of fieldwork should be increased to at least three times for each student in the course of their studies for the Geography Education study programme. To ensure the full integration of the practical experience into the content of the curriculum, internship and fieldwork should be explained in more detail in the course handbook.

5. The department of Public Administration should diversify its practical network to allow students a wider range of practical experience and building a network with possible future employers.

6. The emphasis on practical aspects of the study programme Public Administration should be clearly outlined and described in the course content as well as the course handbook to highlight the programme's strength.

7. To guarantee transparency, the assessment methods for each course must be included in the course descriptions and course handbook of each programme.

8. To keep the curriculum up-to-date and best prepare graduates for the labour market, current topics, such as multilevel governance, participatory governance, digitalization and the aspect of internationalisation should be implemented more in the Public Administration study programme.

9. To achieve a comparable set of skills in international law for its graduates, the Law study programme must implement a mandatory course on Private International Law and on Unified Private Law. Preferably, this course should be taught in English.

10. To bring students in contact with the "real world" as a lawyer early, the study programme should rearrange its curriculum to teach at least two legal skills trainings in the early semesters of the programme.

11. To guarantee that students know the basic legal rules, all courses must include instructions on the theoretical legal background before the students start working on cases. This must be documented via the syllabus and course handbook.

12. To reflect the actual student workload, more credits should be assigned to the thesis.

13. To test all skills needed in students' future lives and employment, the examination methods should be diversified to include more oral exams, essays, or papers and the like.

14. The university must ensure that newly appointed teaching staff holds a PhD degree and more positions are filled with Associate Professors or Professors. For contracted teaching staff, the university must intensify and support their opportunities for gaining a higher qualification (PhD), by conducting their research projects and by contributing to more to conferences on national and international level.

15. More (part-time) teaching staff must be hired to guarantee satisfactory student support and allow teaching staff to conduct more research.

16. The library should be better equipped with standard literature of the different study programmes and make at least one hard copy per standard book in its most recent edition available to students.

17. To further improve internationalisation, especially concerning students' mobility, students should be informed more transparently about scholarship options. The information should be made easily accessible, e.g., via the website or flyers.