



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SURABAYA

CLUSTER FASHION, CULINARY, COS- METOLOGY EDUCATION

FASHION EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

CULINARY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

COSMETOLOGY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

December 2023



Content

Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS 3

I. Preamble 7

II. Accreditation procedure 7

 1. Criteria 7

 2. Approach and methodology 7

III. General information on the university 9

IV. Assessment of the study programmes 9

 1. Quality of the curriculum 9

 2. Procedures for quality assurance 17

 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students 18

 4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification 21

 5. Teaching staff 22

 6. Learning resources and student support 24

 7. Information 27

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts 29

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “FASHION EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
 - “CULINARY EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
 - “COSMETOLOGY EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SURABAYA, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 19th meeting on 04 December 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “Fashion Education” (Bachelor of Education), “Culinary Education” (Bachelor of Education), and “Cosmetology Education” (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2029**.

Conditions:

All programmes

1. UNESA must hand in a staff development plan for the three study programmes that describes how the number of teaching staff in each study programme will be increased and how it can be guaranteed that teaching of students is provided on a professorial level.
2. In order to close the feedback loop, students must be systematically informed about the outcome of the surveys and resulting consequences. A corresponding process must be established and documented in a binding manner that regulates the systematic provision of information to students and defines the responsibilities for this.

Additionally for the study programme “Culinary Education” (Bachelor of Education)

3. The university must present a strategic plan for updating the equipment to integrate modern devices, e.g., electric stoves, into the training and a time frame within which these improvements are to be realized.

Additionally for the study programmes “Culinary Education” (Bachelor of Education) and “Cosmetology Education” (Bachelor of Education)

4. For both study programmes, the documentation of a safety instruction for students must be more formalized.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

All programmes

1. To reduce the workload of the teaching staff in the study programmes and to promote the training of students' pedagogical skills, UNESA should involve student assistants (students from higher semesters) in the basic training of students in lower semesters.
2. UNESA should provide more opportunities for students and teaching staff to improve their English language skills.
3. The thesis defence should have credits assigned that reflect the students' workload.
4. The types of examination should be specified in the module descriptions to represent the large variety in the forms and methods of assessment, e.g., oral exams, applied in the programmes.
5. The teaching staff should be encouraged and enabled to make use of the structures for personal and professional development already provided by the university (support to attend international conferences, international research cooperations and enhancement of language skills).
6. Measures should be strengthened to ensure that students can finish their final thesis within the intended duration of the study programme.
7. To support students in their career development, students should receive guidance for career development by the study programmes.
8. The study programmes should further promote mobility programmes and actively motivate students to participate in exchange programmes at national and international level.
9. UNESA should improve its international website in English language according to the following points:
 - a. provision of all relevant information in English (admission procedure, student handbook, and relevant information and opportunities for (international) student exchange and international activities),
 - b. enhancement of the website's navigation and information for the international public.

Additionally for the study programme “Fashion Education” (Bachelor of Education)

10. The material resources provided should be improved, e.g., by investing in the modernization of PCs and digital embroidery machines.

Additionally for the study programme “Culinary Education” (Bachelor of Education)

11. The teaching of scientific basics should be strengthened, e.g., by including biochemical aspects of nutrition as well as the relationship between nutrition and health.
12. The study programme should implement European and worldwide culinary practices in training to adapt the programme to current international developments. In such case, the documentation of the PLO and CLO should reflect the changes accordingly.

Additionally for the study programme “Cosmetology Education” (Bachelor of Education)

13. To increase the scientific basic knowledge of students in the study programme, modules that teach physiology, dermatology, anatomy, and pathophysiology should be included in the curriculum.

Additionally for the study programmes “Culinary Education” (Bachelor of Education) and “Cosmetology Education” (Bachelor of Education)

14. Students in both study programmes should learn how to teach their students about safety in the laboratories after completing their studies. In a next step, the corresponding skills should be reflected as learning outcomes in the course descriptions.
15. The laboratories for both study programmes should be enhanced to meet the large number of students (tools and equipment used, size of the laboratories).

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT**ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- “FASHION EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- “CULINARY EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)
- “COSMETOLOGY EDUCATION” (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI SURABAYA, INDONESIA

Visit to the university: 07-09 August 2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Waltraud Rusch

Pädagogische Hochschule Karlsruhe (University of Education), Karlsruhe / Germany

Prof. Dr. Heike Raddatz

Trier University of Applied Sciences, Trier / Germany

Ms. Elok Novita

Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Yogyakarta / Indonesia

Ms. Marina Primus

Berufskolleg Kleve (vocational college), Kleve / Germany (representative of the labour market)

Ms. Carina Micheel

University of Paderborn, Paderborn / Germany (student representative)

Coordinator:

Maria Rentmeister &
Dr. Sarah Jenischewski

AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the study programmes “Fashion Education (Bachelor of Education)”, “Culinary Education (Bachelor of Education)” and “Cosmetology Education (Bachelor of Education)” offered by Universitas Negeri Surabaya (Indonesia).

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in November 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In January 2023, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g., number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 27 February 2023. The final version of the SER was handed in March 2023.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in July 2023. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 07-09 August 2023. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g., the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 04 December 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Negeri Surabaya (UNESA) is a state university located in Surabaya, East Java. The higher education institution was founded in 1964 as an institute of teacher training and education and has since been further expanded and developed into its current status as a state university. UNESA has seven faculties that offer Bachelor's, Master's and doctoral programmes for both teacher education and other professional and academic fields. In total, the university offers programmes for currently approx. 29,000 students (2022).

Within the seven faculties, UNESA states to offer 65 undergraduate programmes, 10 vocational programmes, one profession programme, 23 graduate programmes and 9 doctorate programmes in its 7 faculties: Faculty of Education, Faculty of Language and Arts, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law, Faculty of Engineering, Faculty of Sports Sciences, and Faculty of Economics and Business. As stated in the SER, the overall number of teaching staff is 1,048 so that the teacher-student ratio amounts to 1:28 (July 2022).

The university defines its vision as to be "Excellent in Education, Strong in Science." In its development, UNESA strives to combine top-down guidance with bottom-up innovations; a Strategic Plan 2020-2024 and a Development Master Plan (2011-2035) have been implemented. UNESA is targeting 2024-2029 to become a regional university that is recognized, concentrates, and has innovation in the fields of education, research, community service, and expands programmes due to community needs. In 2029-2034, UNESA is targeting to be a recognized international research university. In particular, UNESA aims at developing education science, teacher science, and preparing educators and professional education personnel, developing, implementing and disseminating non-educational science, developing UNESA as a centre of education and a scientific centre based on the values of national culture as well as developing and disseminating science, technology, art, and/or sports to educate the nation while upholding human values through the "tridharma" approach (i.e., education, research, and community service).

For its Bachelor's programmes, the university implemented a number of policies that refer to the Independent Learning-Independent Campus Program (MBKM) as mandated by the Ministry of Education. This programme allows students to schedule courses outside of their study programmes or other campuses (exchange or credit transfer), such as 20 credit courses out of the main campus, industrial internships, field practice, and Real Work Lecture (KKN).

The three study programmes to be accredited in this cluster are affiliated with the Faculty of Engineering (FT), the largest faculty at UNESA, offering 13 undergraduate programmes in total. Overall, the Faculty has five departments. The three Bachelor's programmes of this cluster belong to the Department of Home Economics which also offers the study programme "Nutrition" (not included in this review). The faculty of Engineering has approx. 4,575 students (2022). The faculty is headed by a dean and 3 vice deans.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum

Bachelor's degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Description

General information

As stated in the provided documents, development and implementation of a competency-based curriculum based on the Indonesian National Qualification Framework (IQF / KKN) is part of the university's education policy directions. An overall curriculum restructuring is set to take place every four years while each study programme is set for re-evaluation annually.

UNESA uses a local credit system, i.e., credit units called CU or SKS. One SKS credit for theory-oriented courses is equivalent to 50 minutes of face-to-face learning per week per semester, 60 minutes of structured assignment activities per week per semester, and 50 minutes of independent assignments per week per semester. For practice-oriented courses, 1 SKS equals to 170 minutes study workload per week per semester. Based on a Rector Decree, one SKS credit is equivalent to 1.59 ECTS credits. On average, students at UNESA take 18 credits (~29 ECTS) per semester.

In 2022, a total of 1.081 students were enrolled in the study programmes of this cluster.

Fashion Education (Bachelor of Education)

The Fashion Education Study Programme has a focus on graduates becoming fashion educational staff at vocational secondary education institutions or a professional fashion-entrepreneur.

Graduates of the study programme obtain a Bachelor's degree in Education (S.Pd.) and can work as professional and certified teachers according to Indonesia's National Qualification Framework (IQF / KKN) level 6. The programme's vision is stated as "to become an advanced study program by 2030 in graduating educators and professionals (fashion-entrepreneurs) in the field of fashion who are competent, creative, have high morality, and have an entrepreneurial outlook". The study programme's mission is stated as follows, 1) preparing qualified, responsible and independent academic and professional staff in the field of fashion to face various future challenges; 2) creating an academic culture that is conducive to optimal and sustainable empowerment of all potentials; 3) conducting professional basic and applied research activities in the fashion education field, at national, regional and international level; 4) developing various forms of community services in education, technology and art that are efficient and effective in empowering and improving people's welfare, and 5) carrying out entrepreneurial activities and cooperating with various institutions/businesses in applying entrepreneurship principles to build a better future.

According to a tracer study, 23.3% of the graduates work as teachers, 46.6% work as fashion-entrepreneurs, 9.7% work as both teachers and fashion-entrepreneurs, and the rest of 3% work in other sectors.

The graduate's profiles are based on the programme's educational objectives (PEO) which are stated as 1) having an academic career with pedagogical competence both in formal and non-formal fashion education, 2) having professional competences in the field of fashion expertise, including fashion designers, pattern-makers, dressmakers, and fashion crafts, with an entrepreneurial outlook, as well as 3) having personal and social competences by prioritizing applicable morals and ethical codes.

The curriculum consists of 144 credits (229 ECTS) in total. The programme is intended to be completed in eight semesters and comprises 52 courses. The courses are grouped into the following categories: 1) general compulsory courses (8 credits), 2) institutional compulsory courses (25 credits), 3) craft skills courses

(18 credits), 4) compulsory core personality development course (2 credits), 5) basic skills courses (9 credits), and 6) science and skills courses (82 credits).

In particular, the study programme defines ten different learning outcomes (PLO). The PLO include the components “Knowledge”, “General Skills,” “Specific Skills”, and “Attitude”. Examples of PLO for the area of knowledge are that graduates are supposed to be able to apply pedagogic concepts in learning in vocational high schools (including lesson planning, device development, evaluation, and science and technology-based learning media) or that they are able to apply concepts in the professional field of fashion to solve problems related to fashion learning and fashion production. For the PLO for the area of general skills, graduates are supposed to be skilled in designing teaching tools and implementing them in learning in the field of fashion by prioritizing local wisdom and regional culture. For the area specific skills, the university states that graduates are skilled in applying the scientific concept of fashion, including work as fashion designers, pattern makers and dressmakers, and fashion crafts with an entrepreneurial outlook. Attitudes the students are to gain, amongst others, are being skilled in cooperating and communicating effectively in the field of fashion.

According to the provided documents, the study programme is set up with a multidisciplinary approach that covers five knowledge areas with an assigned amount of credits in 1) education (42 CU = 67 ECTS), 2) applied science (19 CU = 30 ECTS), 3) social skills and humanities (9 CU = 14 ECTS), 4) fashion and crafts (60 CU = 67 ECTS), and 5) entrepreneurship (14 CU = 22 ECTS).

Based on the provided SER, the study programme allows students opportunities to study off-campus in exchange programmes with other Indonesian universities that offer similar programmes.

Experts' evaluation

The study programme is very well structured. The desired qualifications and learning outcomes to be achieved are presented transparently in the course handbook. The programme contains disciplinary and interdisciplinary elements which meet both academic and labour market policy requirements. Feedback from employers in business and science is recorded. The contents of the programme are regularly evaluated and updated.

Based on the discussion rounds during the site visit, it can be confirmed that the students and employers are very satisfied with the learning outcomes and skills achieved. During the site visit, examples of the students' work were provided for review. The experts can therefore confirm that the skills that students achieve in the study programme are at a very good level.

The students achieve learning outcomes and requirements that correspond to the national, European, and international qualification frameworks, although the focus is on the Indonesian and Asian markets. The transfer of achieved knowledge and credits can be made very well. Proof of competence in specialist knowledge and didactics are sustainably integrated into the examination culture. Specialist internships in schools and business promote students' competence to act, i.e., general personal skills. Throughout the study programme, students develop their own personal attitude.

The curriculum structure is very good. The high proportion of professional practice is appreciated by the panel members because it gives students a chance to get into contact with specific knowledge and subject didactics. Students that wish to work as a teacher are prepared well. For preparation to work as a teacher, students use micro teaching labs and gain practical experience in schools. The study programme applies a good variety of teaching methods and has a vocational focus that prepares students well. The relation of scientific teaching and practical teaching in the programme is evenly distributed. The teaching methods are effective to convey the knowledge students should gain and include problem-based learning, field work, teamwork, as well as computer design work. Throughout the study programme, students are involved in the lecturers' research projects.

This leads to both, a high level of theoretical reflection and the practical feasibility of projects. In total, the study programme corresponds to Indonesia's national requirements. The distribution of credits between the different modules is correct. The curriculum also leaves room for students to organise their individual studies. The organisation of studies is supported by advice from lecturers (academic advisors). The specialisation within the course of studies determines inclination and career choice.

Lecturers and students work with great time commitment. Based on the discussions during the site visit, the experts can confirm that lecturers and students consider the human and material resources as sufficient. But the panel of experts sees room for improvement when it comes to the teaching staff's workload (see chapter on teaching staff below).

The stakeholders consider the equipment within the labs as adequate. Overall, the financial and material resources are sufficient to deliver the study programme. However, in order to stay up-to-date and widen the range of material resources, the panel of experts sees potential for improvement for the material resources provided. It is suggested that the study programme should invest in the modernization of PCs and possibly digital embroidery machines (**Finding 1**). Overall, the experts consider the laboratory equipment to be sufficient.

It is noticeable that the teaching staff faces a high workload. Involving student assistants (students from higher semesters) in the basic training of students in lower semesters would also promote the training of their pedagogical skills and relieve the teaching staff somewhat (**Finding 2**). The number of teachers should also be increased, especially in the area of professors (**Finding 3**). During the site visit, the experts learned that a strategy for this already exists.

During the site visit, the experts also learned that the study programme "Fashion Education" has good cooperations for students' projects with the study programme "Cosmetology Education" that is part of this review as well. In addition, the programme has good cooperations in place with other arts programmes at UNESA that allow students to cooperate with different disciplines for their projects. The experts commend this and encourage the study programme to keep up this good practice.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Culinary Education (Bachelor of Education)

The curriculum profile of the "Culinary Education" study programme focuses on becoming a culinary teacher at a vocational school or a professional culinary practitioner. According to the SER, the graduate profiles include academicians and practitioners in the food industry, managers, and/or entrepreneurs in the culinary field.

Graduates of the study programme obtain a Bachelor's degree in Education (S.Pd.) according to Indonesia's National Qualification Framework (IQF / KKNi) level 6. The vision of the study programme is "Excellence in Culinary Education and Scientific Development". The provided documents state the following seven missions: 1) to produce graduates in the culinary field with character and professionalism, able to compete in meeting the needs of the community, with a maximum length of study of 10 semesters at 100%; 2) improving the science of Culinary Education through research relevant to the advancement of science and technology, with at least five research projects per year; 3) increasing community awareness through community service activities, with a minimum of ten community services per year; 3) Increasing collaboration with various institutions/agencies to improve graduates' relevance and quality, with at least three cooperation agreements signed every three years; 5) Increasing the quantity and/or quality of learning facilities and infrastructure every five

years; 6) expanding the accessibility of information for all types of study programme data in accordance with developments in the faculties and university; and 7) managing a healthy, efficient, effective, productive, transparent, accountable, and prosperous study programme administration.

According to a tracer study conducted in 2022, 18.84% of graduates work as teachers, while 44.92% work in professional fields such as bakers, pâtissiers, cooks, cook helpers, and nutrition staff. In 2021, 29.31% of graduates worked as academics, 35.48% worked as professionals, and 36.21% worked as entrepreneurs.

The graduate's profiles are based on the programme's educational objectives (PEO) which are stated as 1) mastering and applying pedagogic, professional, personality, and social competence in the science and technology of Culinary Education characterized by local wisdom; 2) mastering the scientific method for solving educational science problems and applying culinary skills; 3) have the ability to apply culinary education knowledge in formal and non-formal settings throughout one's life, with a focus on local wisdom; and 4) be able to transfer knowledge and culinary skills (transferable skills).

The curriculum consists of 144 credits (229 ECTS) in total. The programme is intended to be completed in eight semesters and comprises 55 courses. The courses are grouped into the following categories: 1) general compulsory courses (8 credits), 2) institutional compulsory courses (25 credits), 3) work skills courses (18 credits), 4) a personality development course (2 credits), 5) basic skills courses (5 credits), and 6) science and skills courses (86 credits).

In particular, the study programme defines eight different learning outcomes (PLO). The PLO include the components "Knowledge", "General Skills", "Specific Skills", and "Attitude". One examples of PLO for the area of knowledge given in the SER is that graduates are able to understand the concepts of science in the field of pedagogy. For the PLO in the area of general skills, graduates are supposed to be able to apply the principles of adaptive and normative knowledge that support the field of culinary education. For the area of specific skills, the PLO state that graduates are able to design, analyse and implement research results in the field of Culinary Education. Attitudes the students are to gain, amongst others, are an ethical character based on applicable norms, think critically and innovatively, be able to collaborate, be independent, honest, full of responsibility, and strong in the field of culinary education.

According to the provided documents, the study programme is set up with a multidisciplinary approach that covers five knowledge areas with an assigned amount of credits in 1) education (39 CU = 62 ECTS), 2) science (24 CU = 38 ECTS), 3) social skills and humanities (31 CU = 49 ECTS), 4) business management and processing in the culinary field (13 CU = 21 ECTS), and 5) food processing (37 CU = 59 ECTS).

Based on the provided SER, the study programme allows students opportunities to study off-campus in exchange programmes with other Indonesian universities that offer similar programmes.

Experts' evaluation

The desired qualification goals to be achieved as desired learning outcomes are clearly indicated in the module descriptions. Subject-specific elements are clearly recognizable and interdisciplinary elements are also included. Compulsory and elective courses are clearly identified. An idealized typical course schedule is made available. The experts appreciate the effort put into the programme's development and processes which are very well organised. The assignment of credits to the elements of the curriculum is comprehensible.

Overall, the experts can confirm that the scientific basics are fundamentally taught. However, based on the documents provided and the discussion during the site visit, the experts point out that the teaching of scientific basics should be strengthened, for example, by including biochemical aspects of nutrition. In addition, the relationship between nutrition and health should be included (**Finding 4**).

Based on the laboratories visited during the site visit, the experts point out that the experimental workspace in the laboratories for the students should be improved, e.g., learning how to use electric cookers, to comply with European/international standards is required. To this end, the university must present a strategic plan for updating the equipment to integrate modern devices, e.g., electric stoves, into the training (**Finding 5**).

Based on the feedback from the labour market, the experts took note that there is good cooperation with the graduates. In general, representatives of the labour market are regularly invited to provide feedback on the curriculum. Nevertheless, it is a pity that some of the graduates do not work as trainers, educators, or teachers at schools after their studies. While the experts learned from students that they are highly motivated to work as educators, they expect that it will be difficult to find such positions and that they will work as regular chefs instead. In connection with the labour market, it should be reconsidered if the high number of students and desired number of graduates for this programme is feasible to ensure that students will find employment in their field of expertise. The students' motivation to become a trainer or educator should be encouraged and there should be more information/support on how to pursue this career (e.g., guidance through the career centre) (**see Finding 16 below**).

The present curricular structure supports the achievement of the desired learning outcomes and the progress of the learners as a result of the very good organization of the courses. It is noticeable that the teaching staff faces a high workload. Involving student assistants (students from higher semesters) in the basic training of students in lower semesters would also promote the training of their pedagogical skills and relieve the teaching staff somewhat (**Finding 2**). The number of teachers should also be increased, especially in the area of professors (**Finding 3**). During the site visit, the experts learned that a strategy for this already exists.

The experts took note that the students in the study programme receive an introduction to laboratory safety, but that they are not required to sign a document on laboratory safety. Simply posting safety criteria in the laboratory is not sufficient. It is thus strongly recommended to formalize the documentation of a safety instruction in order to sufficiently fulfil European standards (**Finding 6**). In addition, the students should also learn how to teach their students about safety in the laboratories after completing their studies, which should be reflected as a learning outcome in the course descriptions (**Finding 7**).

The study programme has a focus on the Indonesian/Asian market. For the further international development of the programme, European and worldwide culinary practices should be implemented in the training content (**Finding 8**). In such case, the documentation of the PLO and CLO should reflect the changes accordingly.

For future development of the study programme, the experts point out that an exchange and cooperation between the study programmes "Culinary Education" and "Cosmetology Education" could be strengthened on topics such as nutrition and health. From the experts' point of view, both programmes offer good opportunities for collaborations. During the site visit, the experts also learned that the study programme "Cosmetology Education" has good cooperations for the students' projects with the study programme "Fashion Education", as already stated above. The experts commend this and encourage the study programme to keep up this good practice.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Cosmetology Education (Bachelor of Education)

The graduate profile for the "Cosmetology Education" study programme focuses on graduates who can have careers as (1) cosmetology education staff at vocational secondary education institutions, (2) as cosmetology professionals, and (3) as beauty-entrepreneurs (entrepreneurs in the field of cosmetology). Graduates of the

study programme obtain a Bachelor's degree in Education (S.Pd.) according to Indonesia's National Qualification Framework (IQF / KKNI) level 6. The vision of the "Cosmetology Education" study programme is "to become a superior study programme in the field of education and science of cosmetology that has international competitiveness in 2030."

In particular, the study programme defines eight different learning outcomes (PLO). The PLO include the components "Knowledge", "General Skills", "Specific Skills", and "Attitude". The provided documents state the programme learning outcomes for graduates as follows: 1) being able to acquire concepts in the field of pedagogy; 2) being able to acquire basic knowledge in the field of cosmetology; 3) increasing community awareness through community service activities, with a minimum of ten community services per year; 3) being able to understand the principles of professionalism that support the field of cosmetology education including: skin beauty, hair beauty, bridal makeup, and entrepreneurship; 4) being skilled in designing and implementing learning tools in schools by prioritizing local wisdom and regional culture; 5) being able to apply cosmetology skills that support the field of cosmetology education; 6) having skills in the field of cosmetology including: skin make-up, hair make-up, bridal make-up, and entrepreneurial insight; 7) being skilled in designing, conducting research, analysing and implementing research results; and 8) have a professional attitude as educators and practitioners in the field of cosmetology which includes discipline, honesty, responsibility, ethics, ability to work together and communicate effectively.

According to the provided SER, 19% of graduates are employed as educators in the field of beauty, 71.5% work as beauty-entrepreneur, and 9.6% found other occupations.

The curriculum consists of 144 credits in total. The programme is intended to be completed in eight semesters and comprises 59 courses. The courses are grouped into six categories: 1) a personality development course (MKPK) (4 credits), science and skills courses (56 credits), 3) institutional personality development courses, 4) basic skills courses (9 credits), 5) work skills courses (39 credits), and 6) social life courses (6 credits).

According to the provided documents, the study programme offers compulsory and elective courses and is set up with a multidisciplinary approach that covers the six scientific clusters: 1) cosmetology education development, 2) science, 3) social skills and humanities, 4) skin and hair beauty and spa, 5) entrepreneurship, and 6) culture.

Experts' evaluation

The students of the study programme "Cosmetology Education" study dedicatedly to achieve qualifications as proven by learning evaluation scores. Lecturers carry out evaluations by giving assessments in several ways, including assessments during daily practice, and practical assessments for end-of-semester exams. In addition, there are also daily assessments by written theory tests and short oral assessments. Overall, the assessment methods are adequate to assess the students' learning progress.

Students attend lectures by taking compulsory courses consisting of general courses and vocational courses related to cosmetology. For evaluation/assessment of students, the lecturers compose questions in the form of essays, multiple choice, and project work. For the assessments, lecturers compile complete answer keys along with a scoring weight. When students are outside the university carrying out industrial internships or PLP (teaching at school), the employer informs the teaching staff about the students' progress during the practical phase of the study programme.

The curriculum is arranged well starting from basic level courses which are given at the beginning of the semester, based on the students who are accepted from various schools (public schools that are not from the beauty department). As the semester progresses, the courses develop to a more advanced level. The general basic level makes it easier for students to become familiar with knowledge in the field of beauty, including the basics of make-up, basic design, hair care, anatomy and psychology, and decoration. In addition, there are

general subjects, e.g., Pancasila/nationality or English, stated in the PLO roadmap and curriculum structure. In the second semester and the following semesters, the composition of courses is more focused on vocational education in cosmetology, for example, traditional bun courses, facial care, make-up, bridal make-up, and others. However, to increase the scientific basic knowledge of students in the field of cosmetology, the panel of experts suggests to include modules that teach physiology, dermatology, and anatomy. Furthermore, the study programme should teach pathophysiology which includes dermatologic changes in skin and hair, diseases of the immune and hormone systems, as well as basic knowledge of the digestive system (**Finding 9**). While the experts learned that it is already part of the curriculum to a small extent, they point out that the topic waste management and environmental issues could be strengthened even more, e.g., by further implanting these topics into already existing courses. From the experts' point of view, examples for waste management in cosmetology would be that the waste of hair cuttings can be utilized in an artificial bun or hair piece. Furthermore, natural scripts used in body treatments/spa could be utilized as fertilizer for plants.

For the future development of the study programme, the experts point out that an exchange and cooperation between the study programmes "Culinary Education" and "Cosmetology Education" could be strengthened on topics such as nutrition and health. From the experts' point of view, both programmes offer good opportunities for collaborations.

UNESA follows the Indonesian's government regulations to implement MBKM (Free Learning- Independent Campus) in its curriculum. The implementation was carried out in the 7th semester for 40 credits outside the university as evidenced by the existence of 20 credits of teaching field practice courses at school and 20 credits of industrial practice to increase students' ability to go directly into the industrial world. Students have to be able to adapt directly to the world of work by following the rules of working hours and other rules of the company/industry where they are interning. Students are treated like employees; they have to be able to adapt to learning while working.

Students are trained and supported to be able to transfer knowledge outside the university. The university's efforts are to implement KKN (Community Service Program) courses, i.e., going into the community to provide the education that the community needs. It can be in the form of exposure to knowledge about skin and hair health, can provide knowledge of cosmetology in the form of demonstrations and direct practice to teach people to make traditional cosmetics made from herbs to be used for beauty care, or to make health drinks in the form of herbal medicine that can be consumed without having to spend a lot of money.

For practical courses at the university, the panel of experts took note during the site visit that the laboratories are in a good condition. However, based on the large number of students, it is necessary to ensure that the size of the laboratories and the tools in use meet the demand of the number of students (**see Finding 17 below**).

The courses arranged in the curriculum function to provide students with the competencies needed for the future in the field of cosmetology. The number of credits assigned to the courses properly reflects the students' workload for each course. General and vocational courses are interrelated, for example, and there are religious education courses that allow students to develop a responsible personality. For example, religious courses will support students to have ethics in their activities (tolerance with others and respect for other people's personalities). Another example is a mathematics course which is useful for calculating cosmetic measurements when carrying out practical activities.

It is noticeable that the teaching staff faces a high workload. Involving student assistants (students from higher semesters) in the basic training of students in lower semesters would also promote the training of their pedagogical skills and relieve the teaching staff somewhat (**Finding 2**). The number of teachers should also be increased, especially in the area of professors (**Finding 3**). During the site visit, the experts learned that a strategy for this already exists.

Academic supervisors play an important role in guiding students toward graduation. Graduates are given a diploma with a bachelor's degree (abbreviated as S.Pd), provided with a letter accompanying the diploma. Before graduation, students are required to carry out a competency test, and the results are proven by obtaining a competency test certificate from BNSP (National Agency for Professional Certificates) relating to the field of beauty matters. It is done to prepare students for the world of work/industry and proves that the graduate's competence in cosmetology has been tested.

Based on the results of the tracer study, the experts took note that graduates of this programme find employment well. Some graduates work as teachers, some become beauty-entrepreneurs, and some work in other sectors outside of field of cosmetology.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor's degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

According to the SER, Universitas Negeri Surabaya (UNESA) uses an Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) for both academic and non-academic processes. Responsibilities are shared by a Quality Assurance Unit (SPM) at university level, a Quality Assurance Group (GPM) at faculty level, and a Quality Assurance Unit (UPM) at department/study programme level. The Quality Assurance at UNESA is stated to follow the PPEPP cycle (translated from Indonesian: Planning, Implementation, Evaluation, Implementation, Control, Execution, Improvement).

At university level, the Quality Assurance Unit determines quality standards, procedures, manuals, assessment forms and self-assessment checklists. UNESA applies 36 quality standards which are divided into National Higher Education Standards (i.e., Higher Education Standards, Research Standards, Community Service Standards) and Internal Standards of the university (11 standards, i.e., vision and mission standards, student standards, alumni standards, and collaboration standards).

For the study programmes in this cluster, internal quality audits are stated to be regularly performed by an Internal Quality Audit in the areas of 1) learning monitoring and evaluation, 2) curriculum audit, 3) leadership performance achievements audit, and 4) research and community service audit. Results of the audit are stated to be published online on the faculty's website.

The progress of the curriculum evaluation of each programme is to be shown by the assessment of outputs and outcomes derived from the results of the learning outcomes analysis, increasing publications of research and service, tracer studies, GPA scores, number of graduates and length of time in getting a job, and

information on the student body in the respective programme which are supposed to be audited once a year. Furthermore, the heads of the study programmes are said to assess 1) the success of the course's learning outcomes, 2) the percentage of success of course graduates, 3) the success of the study programme objectives, and 4) the student workload.

According to the provided documents, the development progress and success rate of students in the programmes under review are assessed by several indicators, including cumulative Grade Point Average (GPA) and student study period.

According to the SER, students are involved in the quality assurance system by filling out questionnaires at the end of a course and by participating in a customer satisfaction survey. In addition, UNESA outlines that an open dialogue between study programme managers, lecturers, and students is organised as a form of evaluation. Graduates are invited to participate in a tracer study.

Experts' evaluation

The procedure of quality assurance shows high quality in quantifying and qualifying evaluation methods that involve all important internal and external stakeholders. The results are used for adequate monitoring and revision of the study programmes. Based on the knowledge gained during the site visit, the experts can confirm that the development of the curriculum of each programme in this cluster includes the labour market's feedback, e.g., a course "material of children's fashion" was implemented in the curriculum of the programme "Fashion Education". This yearly evaluation allows the university to develop a curriculum quality that is close to vocational dynamics according to recent enhancement of technology and science.

The tracer studies that were provided point out the sectors graduates are employed in as well as the relevant competencies of graduates. Therefore, the need to increase the competencies of English language (teaching staff and students) in the study programmes under review has already been acknowledged by UNESA. The panel of experts also points out that UNESA should provide more opportunities for students and teaching staff to improve their English language skills (**Finding 10**).

The study programmes follow the university's policy by conducting internal audits which are carried out once a year. Internal assessments are carried out to assess vision and mission, cooperation, education, student affairs, human resources, finance, research, service, and graduates. The audit results will be discussed at faculty level for improvements. The satisfaction reports of the teaching staff, workload and teaching methods are good and transparently published.

The surveys that students fill out at the end of a course are also an important part of internal quality assurance and provide information concerning the workload, teaching staff and curriculum's quality. If there is an assessment/complaint about the lecturer who is teaching, then the lecturer concerned will be notified personally by the university management to make changes according to the expectations. However, the experts learned during the site visit that the result of the evaluation is not shared with the students. In order to close the feedback loop, students must be informed about the outcome of the surveys and resulting consequences (**Finding 11**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

Bachelor's degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

According to the information in the SER, the learning process is applied with various learning models according to the needs of the learning outcomes of each subject in the study programme. In addition, it stated to take the diversity of origins of students from both Senior High Schools and Vocational High Schools into account.

As explained in the SER, the study programmes under review apply different teaching methods including direct learning, cooperative learning, project-based learning, problem-based learning, and work-based learning.

Lecturers are supposed to prepare a Semester Lesson Plan which shall guide the students in carrying out learning activities throughout the semester. The lesson plans must be uploaded by the lecturers and validated by the Quality Assurance Unit at least a week before the students' course enrolment ends. All regulations are defined in the Academic Guidelines. UNESA uses an online platform called SIAKADU to support students and teaching staff.

Assessment of students takes place twice per semester, namely in the midterm exam and in the final exam. The assessment methods used are supposed to prove the achievement of the competencies according to the learning outcomes of each course. For cognitive competencies, written tests such as essays or objective tests (multiple choice, matching tests, or short-filling tests) are used. UNESA states that the assignments are mutually agreed upon at the beginning of the lecture by making a lecture contract. Cognitive assessment is carried out using a written test or solving case studies. For assessment in the psychomotor domain, the lecturer prepares an assessment rubric for evaluation. The used non-test evaluation instruments include a performance test, projects, portfolios, or self-assessments and peer-assessments.

According to the documentation, complaints about the result of a final semester examination are in place.

Experts' evaluation

The diversity of learning and teaching methods supports the development of students' competences. It leads to an increasing independence in the acquisition of knowledge and in professionalization. Individual access to the learning and study content is guaranteed. The establishment of an online platform (SIAKADU) enables a further individualization of studying or a supplement to the teaching (as well as for repetition and deepening). It has been observed that the existing teaching methods are effective in achieving the intended learning outcomes.

The panel of experts commend the transparent information provided to the students. In all three study programmes, students are provided with detailed module descriptions and course handbooks that encompass intended learning outcomes and offer insights into the fundamental teaching methods employed in each course. These resources strike a balance between theory and practical application. The module handbooks also specify and present the expected workload for students.

The students are well informed when exams and assessments will take place. However, when looking at the course descriptions provided, the experts took note that the workload for students to prepare for exams may be higher than stated in the documents of all three programmes under review. For example, the documents provided indicate that part of the thesis course is a thesis defence where the scientific work is defended in the examiner forum in the Bachelors' programmes. The experts took note that this thesis defence is not taken into

consideration for the overall credits assigned to the programmes. The experts strongly recommend that this thesis defence should have credits assigned in order to reflect the students' actual workload (**Finding 12**).

At the beginning of the lecture, students have entered into a learning contract which means agreeing to the rules in a lesson. The material that will be received during one semester is known to students because the teaching lecturer provides an RPS (Semester Learning Plan) containing course definitions of learning outcomes, lecture material at each meeting, learning resources, student activities, an assessment system, and assessment weights. The examination procedures are transparent and comprehensible. The examination periods are clearly defined and are stated in the academic calendar rules. Throughout the semester, the students' learning successes are determined in the middle and at the end of the semester.

The various internships support the transfer and application of knowledge and competence to activities in school, business, or industry.

The different forms of examination support students in creatively presenting their motivation, self-reflection, and commitment. The examination formats are introduced at the beginning of the courses. The programmes provide comprehensive module descriptions, emphasize a balanced approach between theory and practicality, and maintain transparency in student assessment standards. Based on the discussions during the site visit, the experts learned that the students face a variety of different assessment methods, such as oral exams or presentations of their work, during the study programme. However, this variety of assessment methods is not reflected in the course descriptions. Therefore, the experts point out that the assessment methods should be reflected and specified in the module descriptions (**Finding 13**). Furthermore, there is an observable surplus of examinations which raises the concern of the experts that it surpasses a manageable workload of students. As a result, the experts see a need to diversify assessment methods beyond traditional exams to enhance students' presentation and speaking skills. To address this concern, it is recommended to represent these alternative examination formats, such as oral module exams or presentations, that already take place in the programmes in the course/module descriptions (**cf. Finding 13**). This approach will not only alleviate the students' workload but also document that students cultivate crucial presentation and speaking skills essential for prospective educators.

A variety of projects are carried out that require the entire competence development of the examinee. The implementation of independent projects with problem-solving strategies shows the acquisition, deepening, and transfer in the generation and transmission of knowledge, art, aesthetics, and media of different kinds. It also shows the students' own competence in the professional as well as personality-developing field.

Students are informed about the result on an assessment. If a student has a low score, a remedial system can be carried out. Alternatively, students can repeat the course in the following semester or the following year. If a student cannot take part in the assessment for reasons of poor health/illness as evidenced by a doctor's certificate, the lecturer gives the student the opportunity to take part in the assessment at a rearranged time and hour (follow-up assessment). Regarding the KKN assessment format using an assessment form published by the university, lecturers are required to make periodic visits or monitoring when students are conducting KKN. KKN student performance assessments are carried out by authorized village officials and KKN supervisors. Learning and teaching methods are adjusted to the type of course, learning outcomes reflect the teaching and learning methods applied. Student learning outcomes can be seen in the Study Result Document (DHS).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

Bachelor's degree

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

Admission of undergraduate students follows three channels based on national regulations: National Selection for State Universities (SNMPTN), Joint Entrance Selection for State Universities (SBMPTN), and Selection for New Student Admissions (SPMB).

SNMPTN is held by all state universities in Indonesia – including UNESA – by using grades and other academic achievements during the applicants' study in high schools as admission criteria. SBMPTN is carried out by a computer-based writing examination and can be added with other criteria according to prospective students' special talents. SPMB is a selection held by UNESA in the form of a paper-based test. Based on the provided documents, UNESA recruits 89.4% of its students from the East Java region and the rest of the students from Java and other Indonesian regions.

Information on the admission criteria and procedure are stated to be available on the university's website.

According to the information in the SER, an Academic Assistant Lecturer conducts the monitoring of student's progression. Based on these regulations, the supervisors evaluate the students' progress periodically per semester (at the beginning, the middle and at the end of each semester). If students do not reach a minimum of SKS credits, they will be approached by the head of their study programme. Furthermore, the faculty provides Counselling Guidance Services facilities for students to supervise students in their development of self-potential, career development, interest-talent, and problem-solving.

The university has a policy of recognizing courses that have been taken by students at other universities through a credit transfer system mechanism. Regulations for recognition of previous learning, including non-formal and informal learning, are said to be available as well. The study programme "Culinary Education" has cooperations with universities in Malaysia and in Indonesia.

According to UNESA, graduates will receive a certificate, supplementary diploma, and transcript after completing their studies.

Experts' evaluation

The formal requirements for admission and the specific prerequisites for the individual study programmes are clearly defined and available to prospective students. The selection procedure follows defined criteria and steps which are also available to prospective students. UNESA accepts students with several pathways including religious achievement, portfolio, underprivileged prospective students, sports achievement, and students with disabilities. The university regularly collects data on the admissions process for current and previous cohorts.

The university has implemented mechanisms to recognise prior learning and regulations regarding the recognition of competences and transfers of credits from other higher education institutions. Likewise, the stages of the registration process for students with disabilities are clearly defined and include several decisive bodies at

the university, such as the admission team, the rector's team, and a disability team. The regulations are documented and available to the students.

In case some students carry out activities outside of the university for a long duration, then there is a course conversion. For example, students join an internship in Japan for a year, then the university carries out a course conversion so that students can still complete their undergraduate programme within four years.

After graduation, the experts learned that UNESA offers a Master's programme in "Vocational and Technical Education". For the Master's programme, the approval regulations are clearly defined and accessible which allows bachelor students to know what criteria they have to fulfil in order to pursue a higher degree.

Certification, including additional certification for specific skills (e.g., in culinary training), is provided to graduates. A diploma supplement will be issued.

The experts took note that in some study programmes (e.g., Fashion Education) the students take a longer duration to finish the study programme. During the site visit, the experts learned that this is mainly due to the practical work experience that students already pursue during their studies. In most cases, the longer duration to finish the programme stems from students who struggle to finish their final thesis as they already start working after the practical phase of the programme. The university is aware of this issue and stated that support to finish the final thesis in a timely manner is provided on the faculty and department level by the academic advisor and the thesis advisor (**cf. Finding 15 below**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff

Bachelor's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

[Short description from the SER](#)

Experts' evaluation

(please add your assessment here)

Guiding questions:

- To what extent do the resources fit the size of the student body?
- Has the university provided a full list of all teaching staff involved in the programme, including their academic qualification, their research and other relevant qualifications, the number of teaching hours, and the duration of employment? Is the teaching staff appropriately qualified with regards to the intended learning outcomes of the programme? Is the number of teaching staff appropriate for the student body? Is the overall workload for staff (teaching, research, administration) appropriate for the delivery of the

programme? Is teaching staff available for the next six years (duration of the accreditation)? If contracts should expire, what are the plans of the university?

- Additionally for PhD: Is supervisory staff also qualified (methodologically) to support and advise PhD candidates? Are the responsibilities of supervisors clearly defined? If external supervisors/examiners are involved, is their role clearly defined? How does the university ensure that they are qualified and made familiar with the requirements of the programme?
- Are recruitment procedures for teaching staff defined and transparent? How does the university ensure that external/guest lecturers involved in the study programme are qualified to teach? How are they made familiar with the requirements of the study programme?
- Has the university defined a concept for staff development? To what extent do staff (including administrative and support staff) have access to further training, for teaching staff especially in their subject but also regarding teaching methods and/or assessment methods?

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled. / The criterion is partially fulfilled. / The criterion is not fulfilled. The recruitment mechanisms of the programmes' lecturers comprise civil servants and non-civil servants. Additionally, the faculty recruits contract-based educators. As stated by the UNESA, the lecturer and educator recruitment procedure follow the national regulations.

Lecturers are offered different career options: lecturer, assistant professor, associate professor, and full professor. According to the SER, the number of permanent lecturers assigned to each study programme is 12 in total for the "Culinary Education" study programme, 9 in total for the "Fashion Education" study programme, and 12 in total (no professor) for the "Cosmetology Education" study programme. Additionally, the study programmes are stated to receive support from invited experts of their field to give guest lecturers for students.

To improve lecturer education, the Faculty of Engineering states in the SER that it provides opportunities for lecturers to carry out doctoral education domestically and abroad.

Based on the information provided in the documents, all lecturers in the Home Economics department are members of associations related to their respective fields. For the "Fashion Education" study programme, the lecturers are members of the Association of Indonesian Fashion Education Study Program (PPTBI). Lecturers of the "Culinary Education" study programme are members of the Indonesian Culinary Education Study Program Forum (FPSPTBI), Indonesian Chef Association (ICA), and also Indonesian Association of Technology and Vocational Education (APTEKINDO). Also, all lecturers of the "Cosmetology Education" study programme are members of the Association of Indonesian Cosmetology Education (PPTRI).

The teaching load includes education, research, and community service activities (three pillars of higher education, *tri dharma*). According to the SER, the lecturers carry out activities in the fields of teaching, research and community service with a load of 12-16 credits per semester (12 credits = 36 working hours per week). As stated in the SER, the research activities of the teaching staff are related to the topics taught.

UNESA also states to support its lecturers in scientific publications and conference participations.

Experts' evaluation

The recruitment system for lecturers is transparent. The documentation about the lecturers and their qualifications is comprehensive and transparent. The qualifications of the lecturers are very impressive, especially their continuous efforts for further education in research and teaching. UNESA provides lecturers with opportunities for further education so their knowledge can be kept up to date. The university supports lecturers by facilitating scholarships to study abroad. UNESA encourages lecturers to become a professor by enabling them to further

their own qualifications by pursuing a PhD, doing research, and publishing the results. Lecturers are required to adhere to the *tridharma* of higher education, e.g., education, research, and community service.

The workload of the lecturers depends on their additional tasks in administration, research, and social service. For the teaching load, lecturers receive a load of 12-16 credits plus other activities in structural positions or positions from other organizations. For general theoretical lectures, they are conducted by a lecturer, while for practical lectures there is a team of lecturers to teach them. This is intended so that practical lectures can be conducive, clearly observed, and address student difficulties when studying.

However, the number of teaching staff seems limited. The panel of experts is not convinced that the lecturer-to-student ratio is sufficient to guarantee a good education and support for students. This is especially a concern if the number of students accepted to the study programmes keeps increasing. The panel of experts therefore requests that UNESA hands in a staff development plan which describes how the number of teaching staff in the study programme shall be increased in the next five years and how it can be guaranteed that teaching of students and research can be conducted on a professorial level (**cf. Finding 3**).

The use of a shift system for the practice room was implemented because the facilities and infrastructure are limited due to the limited size of the practice room and the number of equipment so that several shifts can participate in practical classes in one day if the number of students is large. For example, the capacity of the practice room in the study programme “Cosmetology Education” can accommodate 12-15 students. If there are 30 students, there will be two shifts. The team of lecturers who teach practical courses consists of two people so that the learning process runs well. Similar shift systems and team-teaching methods are applied in the other two study programmes.

Accordingly, the workload of the teaching staff is currently very high. As a possible solution, the experts suggest that students of higher semesters could be involved in the teaching and research of teaching staff in the lower semester to reduce and support the workload of the teaching staff. This would also allow students in higher semesters to gain valuable experience in teaching and research themselves (**cf. Finding 2**).

Based on the documents provided and the discussion rounds during the site visit, the experts learned that UNESA already has structures in place to increase its internationalization of the study programmes. Some of the lecturers' research results are copyrighted (IPR) and accepted in published and accessible national and international journals. To reach a higher international level and to increase international cooperation in the study programmes, the teaching staff should be encouraged and enabled to make use of the structures already provided by the university (international conferences, international research cooperations and language skills) (**Finding 14**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support

Bachelor's degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

[Short description from the SER](#)

Experts' evaluation

According to the SER, the faculty provides the buildings with Wi-Fi and a library managed by the University's central library. Students can use different laboratories for the study programmes in this cluster. In total, 27 Laboratories are listed in the SER to support practical learning activities of the student to improve their skills related to technology, research, and competencies according to the course they must take. The laboratory consists of 10 Fashion design Laboratories, 10 Culinary Laboratories, and 7 Cosmetology Laboratories. Other laboratories are a science laboratory, reading room, computer laboratory, and micro teaching laboratory.

For the "Culinary Education" programme, the listed labs include a food management laboratory, serving laboratory, bakery and pastry laboratory, and a chocolate and sugar confectionery laboratory. For the "Fashion Education" programme, the listed labs include a pattern construction laboratory, textile craft laboratory, fashion management laboratory, draping laboratory, and design laboratory. For the "Cosmetology Education" programme, the list of labs includes a bridal make-up laboratory, make-up laboratory, facial skin care laboratory, and Spa laboratory.

The university also claims offering public facilities to students for sports activities, canteens, a health clinic, and a mosque. Some of the buildings provide infrastructure for students with special needs as well.

UNESA provides a university library on campus that is said to offer international and national online and offline sources (textbooks, articles, thesis, and other references). A digital library is said to provide academic literature types from several sources.

The university provides a single operating system to students and staff. Students can use the Integrated Academic Information System (SIKADU) to receive information related to their courses and lecture schedule.

All new students are required to partake in orientation and introduction to campus life activities. Students are assigned an academic advisor to guide and supervise their course of study. The counselling schedule is supposed to involve at least three meetings per semester, one at the beginning, one before midterm examinations, and one at the end of the semester. The maximum study period for bachelor students is 14 semesters. In addition, thesis supervisors are available to assist the students.

At the beginning of a course, students and lecturer agree on a study contract, which is an agreement between them regarding the lesson plans to achieve the learning objectives for the course.

Furthermore, the university states that Student Advisory Services are available to all students. For exchange students, the counselling and guidance service is provided by the university's International Office. Support is also offered by UNESA's Centre for Disability Studies and Services and by a health clinic on campus. A Career Centre offers support and activities such as a career fair or entrepreneurship training.

As stated in the SER, UNESA provides scholarships to students through affirmations, for outstanding athletes, Jember scholarships, for students with religious achievements, for persons with disabilities, and other options. According to the SER, there are 150 scholarship recipients in the programmer under review in total.

UNESA explains that students in the cluster's programmes are given the opportunity to participate in (international) student competitions in their respective discipline.

Experts' evaluation

All incoming students are required to participate in orientation and campus life introduction events. Each student is assigned an academic advisor at the start of their study programme to provide individual support.

Additionally, a student agency is available for those in need of further assistance. Thesis advisors are also provided to guide students during the final phase of their study programme, assisting with the organization and writing of their thesis. From the experts' point of view, these support structures are well implemented and support the students throughout their course of study. Nevertheless, it has come to the experts' attention, through both UNESA's documents and feedback from former students in the educational study programmes, that the final thesis phase can lead to an extended duration for programme completion. Measures should be strengthened to ensure that students can finish their final thesis within the intended duration of the study programme (**Finding 15**). While orientation and support services are available, it is necessary to address the potential duration extension caused by the final thesis phase.

As stated above, the experts learned from students that they are highly motivated to work as educators but expect that it will be difficult to find such positions and that they will not work as teachers. The students' motivation to become a trainer or educator should be encouraged and there should be more information/support on how to pursue this career (e.g., guidance through the career centre) (**Finding 16**).

Each study programme under review provides its own facilities and laboratories, ensuring hands-on teaching and learning to achieve the intended learning outcomes. It is important to note that all facilities consistently meet hygiene and safety standards. Regarding safety, students are given safety instructions, but are not required to sign a document on laboratory safety. As stated above, it is thus recommended to formalize the documentation of a safety instruction for the programmes "Culinary Education" and "Cosmetology Education" in order to sufficiently fulfil European standards (**cf. Finding 6**). In addition, the students should also learn how to teach their future students about safety in the laboratories after completing their studies (**cf. Finding 7**). This should also be reflected in the course descriptions.

Despite the module handbooks indicating class sizes of up to 35 students, it has been observed that the facilities, especially in "Cosmetology Education" and "Culinary Education", cannot accommodate this number of students simultaneously. To address this, the teaching staff divides course content across multiple groups, ensuring that all students have the opportunity to engage in practical learning segments. The laboratories for these two programmes should be enhanced to meet the large number of students (tools and equipment used, size of the laboratories) to ensure and enhance the international standards (**Finding 17**). However, with the shift system in place, lecturers seem to be able to properly guide the practical lecture process, even though this takes more time for teaching the class in two or more groups and thus increases the teaching staff's workload.

Concerning facility equipment, a notable issue arises within the study programme "Culinary Education", where the existing equipment does not meet international standards yet. It is of utmost importance that the culinary workspace undergoes substantial improvement to align with both European and international norms. To achieve this, the university must expeditiously develop and present a comprehensive strategic plan detailing the necessary updates and equipment enhancements (e.g., incorporation of electric stoves) and a time frame within which these improvements are to be realized (**cf. Finding 5**).

In general, UNESA has a strategy in place to update equipment by having a time limit for use of the tools in place. This is of special importance for those study programmes using electrical equipment such as electric facials.

The library is equipped with all required literature which can be accessed by the students. Additionally, the library offers a comprehensive collection of both international and national resources, including textbooks, articles, theses, and other references, available both online and offline. A digital library is accessible, providing academic literature from various origins.

To successfully complete each of the programmes under review, students must do a compulsory internship. This entails two months of lesson preparation and material development, followed by a four-month assignment at a designated school. Furthermore, industrial practice activities are carried out in semester 7, where students are directed to find an industrial placement to experience practical learning and the work environment.

Regarding student diversity support, it can be stated that UNESA offers various scholarship and opportunities and further individual support to students, including outstanding and prospective students as well as students with disabilities and incoming and outgoing exchange students. In order to facilitate student mobility, the university offers different opportunities including various learning agreements. The International Office of the university offers counselling and guidance services to exchange students.

Generally speaking, UNESA appears dedicated to providing support to its students, both locally and internationally by offering several support systems. Firstly, UNESA offers IISMA (Indonesian International Students' Mobility Award). The experts learned that seven UNESA students are currently studying abroad through this programme, fostering international experience within the university. Secondly, the experts learned that UNESA actively promotes international internships and provides funding/scholarship to facilitate global exposure. Thirdly, partial scholarships for tuition and accommodation are provided locally and internationally. Lastly, scholarship opportunities for high achieving students to recognize their excellence in areas like religion, sports and organizations are available. UNESA also provides scholarships for Indonesian high school students who excel with parents who work in Saudi Arabia. The experts also took note that financial assistance is available for disadvantaged students, provided through reduced tuition fees. The eligibility for these reductions is determined by various factors, including the socioeconomic status of the students' parents.

While UNESA provides a range of support options as listed above for both local and international students, an observation indicates that the internationalization efforts could be further improved in all three study programmes "Fashion Education", "Culinary Education" and "Cosmetology Education" under review. It is thus recommended to implement more active efforts in the study programmes under review to motivate more students to go abroad in order to further foster internationalization (**Finding 18**).

Concerning the support of disabled students, it has been noted during the site visit that students with hearing impairments have been duly recognized and have successfully completed their studies. The experts wish to commend this practice. Furthermore, UNESA offers information and support programmes for disabled students on their website.

UNESA has a job fair forum for information on the requirements of the labour market. The job fair forum is designed for all students who are almost finished with their studies as well as alumni.

The supportive supervision of the students leads to good or to very good results. The drop-out rate is therefore remarkably low. The evaluation of students appears objective and criteria based. The examination modalities are clearly regulated. They include opposition proceedings, repetition of exams, and compensation for disadvantages. Examination and study regulations are published on UNISA's homepage. Students are free to submit appeals and objections to the examination office via their lecturer, course director, or dean.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

7. Information

Bachelor's degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Description

Students are said to be able to access all information on their programmes via an Integrated Academic Information System as well as via the university's and faculty's websites. The faculty also describes being active on online video platforms and social media.

Information on the university, its mission and its outline, as well as on the programmes is said to be published on the university's and faculty's website. This is supposed to include information on the intended learning outcomes, the admission criteria and procedure and the qualification awarded. Each study programme also is supposed to provide information on the conducted tracer study.

Every year, UNESA publishes a performance accountability report in which, among others, developments are linked to indicators of the business strategic plan.

Experts' evaluation

The information provided to the public include the relevant information for the different internal and external stakeholders. Therefore, the students are able to get their information about the programmes, the intended learning outcomes and methods of examinations before each semester. The assessment procedure as well as the conditions for recruitment are transparently offered on UNESA's websites.

Regarding to UNESA's goal of internationalisation, the experts point out that already some information is given in English language. However, the website should provide all relevant information in English (admission procedure, student handbook, etc.). Especially relevant information and opportunities for (international) student exchange and international activities should be included on the website in English language (**Finding 19a**). The experts also point out that the navigation of the website for prospective international students is difficult. Accordingly, UNESA should enhance the website's navigation and information for the international public (**Finding 19b**).

Defined responsibilities of actual information and data are not obvious. To assure this, responsibilities should be clarified and published.

The experts panel recommends, as indicated in chapter 2 of this report, that the outcome of the surveys and resulting consequences should be accessible via the faculty's websites (**cf. Finding 11**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “Fashion Education” (Bachelor of Education), “Culinary Education” (Bachelor of Education), and “Cosmetology Education” (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia, with conditions.

Commendation:

Overall, the panel of experts took note that the teaching staff in the three study programmes under review is highly motivated and willing to pursue higher education for a PhD degree. Likewise, the experts took note that the students in the study programmes seem outstandingly motivated to perform well. Additionally, the experts commend the well set-up structure of the study programmes which is backed up by the good rates of employability of the students in the Indonesian/Asian labour market. The three study programmes are received with great interest from the public and have many registered prospective students. Furthermore, the support for students, especially in regard to support for students with disabilities, the provided scholarship options and the academic advisor is commendable. All lecturers are painstaking in guiding students through practice until they graduate. Students gain knowledge in teaching, apply micro teaching and gain practical knowledge that is useful in the industry, and are equipped well to take part in society. The experts also took note of the good concept for quality assurance that involves all stakeholders.

Findings:

1. For the study programme “Fashion Education”, the material resources provided should be improved, e.g., by investing in the modernization of PCs and digital embroidery machines.
2. To reduce the workload of the teaching staff in the study programmes and to promote the training of students’ pedagogical skills, UNESA should involve student assistants (students from higher semesters) in the basic training of students in lower semesters.
3. UNESA must hand in a staff development plan for the three study programmes that describes how the number of teaching staff in each study programme will be increased and how it can be guaranteed that teaching of students is provided on a professorial level.
4. For the study programme “Culinary Education”, the teaching of scientific basics should be strengthened, e.g., by including biochemical aspects of nutrition as well as the relationship between nutrition and health.
5. For the study programme “Culinary Education”, the university must present a strategic plan for updating the equipment to integrate modern devices, e.g., electric stoves, into the training and a time frame within which these improvements are to be realized.
6. For the study programmes “Culinary Education” and “Cosmetology Education”, the documentation of the safety instructions for students must be more formalized.
7. Students in the study programmes “Culinary Education” and “Cosmetology Education” should learn how to teach their students about safety in the laboratories after completing their studies. In a next step, this skill should be reflected as a learning outcome in the course descriptions.
8. The study programme “Culinary Education” should implement European and worldwide culinary practices in training to adapt the programme to current international developments. In such case, the documentation of the PLO and CLO should reflect the changes accordingly.

9. To increase the scientific basic knowledge of students in the study programme “Cosmetology Education”, modules that teach physiology, dermatology, anatomy, and pathophysiology should be included in the curriculum.
10. UNESA should provide more opportunities for students and teaching staff to improve their English language skills.
11. In order to close the feedback loop, students must be informed about the outcome of the surveys and resulting consequences.
12. For all study programmes, the thesis defence should have credits assigned that reflect the students’ workload.
13. For all study programmes, the types of examination should be specified in the module descriptions to represent the large variety in the forms and methods of assessment, e.g., oral exams, applied.
14. The teaching staff should be encouraged and enabled to make use of the structures already provided by the university (support to attend international conferences, international research cooperations and enhancement of language skills).
15. For all programmes, measures should be strengthened to ensure that students can finish their final thesis within the intended duration of the study programme.
16. To support students in their career development, students should receive guidance for career development by the study programmes.
17. The laboratories for the study programmes “Culinary Education” and “Cosmetology Education” should be enhanced to meet the large number of students (tools and equipment used, size of the laboratories).
18. The study programmes should further promote mobility programmes and actively motivate students to participate in exchange programmes at national and international level.
19. UNESA should improve its international website in English language according to the following points:
 - a. provision of all relevant information in English (admission procedure, student handbook, and relevant information and opportunities for (international) student exchange and international activities),
 - b. enhancement of the website’s navigation and information for the international public.