



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

ESA UNGGUL UNIVERSITY

CLUSTER MANAGEMENT

LAW (BACHELOR OF LAW)

MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF MANAGEMENT)

ACCOUNTING (MASTER OF ACCOUNTING)

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION)

May 2023



Content

Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	3
I. Preamble	7
II. Accreditation procedure.....	7
1. Criteria.....	7
2. Approach and methodology	7
III. General information on the university	9
IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....	9
1. Quality of the curriculum	9
2. Procedures for quality assurance	17
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students	18
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification.....	20
5. Teaching staff.....	22
6. Learning resources and student support	23
7. Information	25
V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....	27

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- LAW (BACHELOR OF LAW)
- MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF MANAGEMENT)
- ACCOUNTING (MASTER OF ACCOUNTING)
- PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION)

OFFERED BY ESA UNGGUL UNIVERSITY, JAKARTA, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 17th meeting on 22 May 2023, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “Law” (Bachelor of Law), “Management” (Bachelor of Management), “Accounting” (Master of Accounting) and “Public Administration” (Master of Public Administration) offered by **Esa Unggul University, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 June 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 June 2029**.

Conditions:

For all study programmes:

1. The course descriptions must be improved and contain the same level of details between different courses.
2. The examination forms must be better aligned to the learning outcomes/competencies of each course, thereby raising the variety in terms of examination forms.
3. The complaints procedure must be standardised and made accessible to all students.
4. The university must publish a complete academic handbook for each programme with information on the learning outcomes, the curriculum, and the courses on its website.

Additionally for the study programme “Law”:

5. The graduate profile of ‘Entrepreneurs’ must be formulated more specifically, directly referring to entrepreneurs in the field of law.

6. In order to fully reach the graduate profile of 'International Law Experts', the curriculum must include more courses related to international law.
7. The number of courses that are oriented towards improving skills through practice must be increased (e.g. through role playing). This must be made transparent in the course descriptions.

Additionally for the study programme "Management":

8. English-language courses must be offered more frequently and the teaching of English as a language foundation for business administration must be integrated into the curriculum.
9. The curriculum must be revised and clearly focus on Management Science and on the necessary functions of business administration: Planning, Reporting, Budgeting, Coordination especially Financing, Cost Accounting, Investment, Taxation.

Additionally for the study programme "Accounting":

10. The subject learning outcomes and the course content must be better aligned to the programme learning outcomes. Specific attention must be paid to the correct use of the different competency levels, e.g. according to Bloom's taxonomy, at subject and course level.

Additionally for the study programme "Public Administration":

11. The overall profile and structure of the study programme must be revised: The 3 levels of learning outcomes must be better aligned to each other, taking into account the appropriate levels of Bloom's taxonomy.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all study programmes:

1. The university should standardise the way in which labour market representatives can contribute to the development of the programmes beyond surveys – the process should be structured, clear and documented.
2. English as a language of teaching, learning, and working should be incorporated more extensively into everyday university life.
3. The university should support the development of English competencies among its administrative and academic staff.
4. More practitioners should be involved in teaching.
5. The university should recruit more senior academics and provide additional support for its current staff in moving up the academic ladder.
6. All core information should be provided on the website in English.

Additionally for the study programme "Law":

7. The number of teaching staff in general, and of teaching staff holding a PhD in particular, should be increased.
8. The size of the moot court room should be increased to better accommodate the student body.

Additionally for the study programme “Management”:

9. When reviewing the course descriptions, specific attention should be paid to the content of the courses and their complexity level.
10. Financial mathematical and statistical content should be strengthened in the curriculum.

Additionally for the study programme “Public Administration”:

11. Digitisation, e-government and related topics such as smart city should be included more extensively in the curriculum.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT**ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- **LAW (BACHELOR OF LAW)**
- **MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR OF MANAGEMENT)**
- **ACCOUNTING (MASTER OF ACCOUNTING)**
- **PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION)**

OFFERED BY ESA UNGGUL UNIVERSITY, JAKARTA, INDONESIA

Online visit to the university: 13-16 February 2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Götz Fellrath	University of Applied Sciences for Police and Public Administration in North Rhine-Westphalia (HSPV NRW), Department of General Administration and Pensions (Germany)
Professor Dr. Muchamad Ali Safa'at, S.H., M.H.	Universitas Brawijaya, Faculty of Law (Indonesia)
Assoc. Prof. Suryo Budi Santoso, S.E., M.SA., Ph.D.	Universitas Muhammadiyah Purwokerto, Economic and Business Faculty (Indonesia)
Dr. Jörg Habich	Bertelsmann Stiftung, Gütersloh (Germany) (labour market representative)
Milan Grammerstorf	Student of Bielefeld University (Germany) (student representative)
Coordinator: Alexandre Wipf, Vi Le	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the study programmes “Law” (Bachelor of Law), “Management” (Bachelor of Management), “Accounting” (Master of Accounting) and “Public Administration” (Master of Public Administration) offered by Esa Unggul University.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in October 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In April 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 16 May 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in July 2022.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in August 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place between 13 and 16 February 2023. Online the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 22 May 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In July 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Esa Unggul University (EUU) is a private university in Indonesia, established in 1993 in accordance with a Decree of the Minister of National Education under the auspices of the Kemala Mencerdaskan Bangsa Education Foundation. The university has 10 faculties (Economics and Business, Law, Health Science, Engineering, Computer Science, Physiotherapy, Communication Science, Teacher Training and Education, Design and Creative Industry, Psychology) and 37 departments offering a variety of programmes that lead to Diploma, undergraduate, professional and postgraduate degrees. At the time of submission of the self-evaluation report the university reported 15,746 active students and 504 teaching staff.

The university defines its mission as organising quality and relevant education, creating a conducive academic atmosphere, and creating leaders with character and high competitiveness. Its specific goals in this respect are to train graduates who are relevant to the needs of the global job market and who have a high entrepreneurial spirit and are able to create jobs as well as having lecturers who perform highly. The university has defined specific quantitative targets in these areas. Its strategy is based on the Esa Unggul University Strategic Plan (RENSTRA) focusing on human resources, university structure and university reputation.

The Faculty of Law offers an undergraduate and a graduate programme in Law. The Bachelor's programme "Law" has been offered since 2010.

The study programmes "Management", "Accounting", and "Public Administration" are offered by the Faculty of Economics and Business. The Bachelor's programme "Management" was first introduced in 1993, the Master's programme "Accounting" in 2004 and the Master's programme "Public Administration" in 2011.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Overarching information

A semester at Esa Unggul University covers 16 weeks including 14 meetings, 1 mid-term exam, and 1 final exam. The university employs the national credit system, SKS; it provided a conversion table of SKS to ECTS in its self-evaluation report. The Bachelor's programmes cover 144 and the Master's programmes 36 SKS.

According to information in the self-evaluation report, the curricula have been developed while considering three main elements: university values (namely academic excellence for global competition and entrepreneurial ability), body of knowledge of study programmes, and standardisation of associations. Further, the university indicates that it follows the national regulations for higher education and implements an Outcome-Based Education (OBE) approach. The university states that the Bachelor's programmes correspond to level 6 of the Indonesia National Qualification Framework (KKNI) and the Master's programmes to level 8. For each

programme the programme leaders defined graduate profiles, intended learning outcomes at the level of the study programme and course learning outcomes. The learning outcomes are formulated along the categories of attitude, knowledge, special skills, and general skills.

According to information in the self-evaluation report, curriculum development considers the results of the tracer studies, the latest developments in the field and on the job market, the feedback gathered through evaluation and focus group discussions, as well as selected recommendations by representative bodies in each subject. Esa Unggul University indicates in the self-evaluation report that the curricula are evaluated each semester and that a general review including benchmarking is planned every four semesters.

The university states that it is taking steps to implement the national scheme of Independent Campus/Freedom to Learn (MBKM) through which students in Bachelor's programmes can take credited courses, internships and/or study abroad periods outside of their own study programme.

Study programmes

Law (Bachelor)

Description

The study programme "Law" covers 8 semesters and 144 credits. Enrolment is set at 400 students per semester. Upon graduation students are awarded a Bachelor of Law, or SH.

The programme leaders have defined 4 graduate profiles; students should thus be trained to become associate attorneys, notary assistants, international law experts or entrepreneurs. In total they have set 10 learning outcomes. The graduates should, among others, appreciate the diversity of cultures, views, religions, and beliefs as well as the opinions or original findings of others. They should be able to cooperate with persons of different views and obey the law and discipline. They should master the principles and methods of applying regulations, standards, guidelines, and manuals in the fields of criminal law, civil law, state administration, Islam, customary, and international law. They should also be able to examine the implications of implementing policies in the field of law and provide solutions, ideas, and constructive criticism. The graduates should be able to identify and analyse problems in the legal field, then recommend the best solution in accordance with norms, principles, rules in the field of law.

In the first semester students take 7 compulsory courses including "Introduction to Law of Indonesia" and "Indonesian Language". In the second semester there are 6 compulsory courses (e.g. "Pancasila Education", "Civil Law", "Criminal Law") and 1 elective and in the third semester 7 compulsory courses (e.g. "Law & Human Rights", "Civil Procedural Law", "Entrepreneurship"). In the fourth semester as well as in the fifth semester students take again 7 compulsory courses each (e.g. "State Commercial Court Procedural Law", "Environmental Law", "Constitutional Court Procedural Law" and "Agrarian Law", "Trading Contract"). In the sixth semester they take 4 compulsory modules, electives (including "English Language 2") as well as an internship. The seventh semester includes 5 compulsory modules (e.g. "International Commercial Law") and electives. In the eighth and final semester students complete a "Law Clinic" practice, they take 1 final elective (e.g. "Islamic Law of Person, Family and Inheritance") and write their "Minor Thesis".

Experts' evaluation

The curriculum has been formed and evaluated periodically through a mechanism that accommodates scientific developments and the needs of the job market. The programme broadly corresponds to other Law Bachelor's programmes at institutions in Indonesia – the level of the graduates corresponds to level 6 according to the National Qualifications Framework. The employability of graduates is given, there are several aspects of the curriculum supporting the students' employability including an internship and a law clinic, these are positive

aspects. Graduate profiles are clearly defined, namely Associate Attorney, Notary Assistant, International Law Expert, and Entrepreneur. Yet, the profile of 'Entrepreneurs' should be formulated more specifically, namely entrepreneurs in the field of law (**Finding 1**).

The curriculum structure is presented comprehensively which includes graduate profiles, intended learning outcomes, and the courses provided are accompanied by modules or semester learning plans. The curriculum includes relevant subjects. Yet, in order to fully reach the graduate profile of 'International Law Experts' the curriculum needs to be supported by courses that are more related to international law (**Finding 2**).

The course structure has been arranged systematically in each semester which shows an orientation from basic knowledge to specific knowledge and skills. The number of courses that are oriented towards improving skills through practice needs to be increased, for example judicial practice for each type of court and contract drafting. This is very necessary to support the realisation of graduate profiles, especially 'Associate Attorneys' (**Finding 3**). These new additional courses should be oriented towards skills and experience in doing something, not only oriented to knowledge. To run these courses, adequate laboratory facilities and moot court rooms are needed for role playing learning (see Chapter 3 and Chapter 6, **Finding 22**).

All courses are equipped with course descriptions and examples of semester learning plans. It is important for this document to be supplemented with different learning methods according to the ability/competence to be achieved based on the intended learning outcome. In the course descriptions presented, the learning methods of most courses are the same. Therefore, the experts believe that the course descriptions must be improved and contain the same level of details between different courses (**Finding 4**).

Beyond individual course descriptions and semester learning plans the curriculum needs to be equipped with a comprehensive academic guidelines document that can be accessed not only by faculty members and students, but also by the public. This is necessary so that prospective students can find out about it as a consideration when deciding to become a student (see Chapter 7, **Finding 24**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Management (Bachelor)

Description

The study programme "Management" covers 8 semesters and 144 credits. Enrolment is set at 400 students per semester. Upon graduation students are awarded a Bachelor of Management, or SM.

The Bachelor's programme in Management refers to 4 graduate profiles: professional (assistant management/supervisor/analyst), researcher (assistant), management consultant, and entrepreneur. The programme leaders have defined 10 learning outcomes, according to which the students should internalise the spirit of independence, be creative, innovative, proactive, and entrepreneurial and be able to cooperate with others. Graduates should master and be able to compile, analyse, implement, and evaluate regulations, standards, guidelines, and manuals in the field of management. Further, they should be able to plan, organise, implement, evaluate and review, and make appropriate decisions in the context of problem solving based on the results of information and data analysis. Students should also be able to contribute in the preparation of their employer's organisation strategic plan and translate the strategic plan into an organisational operational plan at the functional level.

The study programme offers 5 specialisations, namely General Management, Lean Management, Syariah Business, and Digital Business and Entrepreneurship. The curriculum is made up of 129 credits for compulsory

courses and 15 credits for elective courses which correspond to the specialisations. In the first and second semesters students take 8 courses each (including “Macroeconomics”, “Business Mathematics”, “Civic Education” and “Business Statistics”, “Pancasila Education”). In the third and fourth semesters students take 7 courses each (including “Operational Management”, “Financial Management”, and “Organizational Behaviour”, “Money and Capital Markets”, “Business Law”). The fifth semester includes 6 compulsory courses (e.g. “Business Budgeting”, “Business Ethics”) and electives (e.g. “E-Commerce”, “Financial Analysis and Practice”). In the sixth semester students take 4 compulsory courses (e.g. “Strategic Management”, “English Language 3”), an internship as well as electives (e.g. “Islamic Financial Institutions”, “Industrial Psychology”, “Lean transformation”). The seventh semester includes 4 compulsory courses (e.g. “Change Management and Development”) and electives (e.g. “Business Communication and Negotiation”). Students complete their studies in the eighth semester with their final thesis.

Experts’ evaluation

The Bachelor’s programme of Management has 10 learning outcomes – this number is quite high in the view of the experts. The Management study programme applies the National Qualifications Framework (KKNI) level 6 consisting of the aspects of attitude, knowledge, specific skill, and general skill. In the future it would be good for the programme leaders to directly refer in their documentation to the Outcome Based Education (OBE) model.

The study programme includes a broad – from the experts’ point of view perhaps too broad – number of courses. According to its own claim, the faculty wants to help students not only becoming academically intelligent, but also to produce leaders who are able to lead very well and create creative entrepreneurs who are able to create new jobs. Even if this very wide ambition is understandable, it would be easier for the curriculum to concentrate on the academic and practical education of business administration. This is also reflected in the curriculum’s broadness. If the university wants to pursue these important goals, it might be worth considering establishing a Bachelor’s programme of Entrepreneurship and Innovation.

The faculty is also trying to implement the claim of strengthening internationalisation and digitisation in this study programme as well. Therefore, collaboration with national and international universities exist. This means that – at least in theory – there are plenty of international programmes and exchange options. However, to address and fulfil the internationalisation strategy, English-language courses need to be offered more frequently and the teaching of English as a language foundation for business administration needs to be integrated into the curriculum (**Finding 5**).

The learning outcomes are defined at the level of the programme and for each course. The course content presented herein appears understandable and – in general – appropriate for a Bachelor’s programme of business administration with a major on leadership, HR, and marketing. The curriculum structure is presented comprehensively which includes graduate profiles, intended learning outcomes, and the courses provided are accompanied by modules descriptions or semester learning plans. Unfortunately, based on the material provided it cannot be guaranteed that there is no overlap of courses in the curriculum. It would certainly be advisable that the learning plans and the content be harmonised (**Finding 4**) and a revision of the course content take place. In this context, the content level of some courses could also be improved (**Finding 6**).

The university and the faculty received positive feedback from their graduates, and they are well embedded in the local and national practitioners’ and business community. Students are supported by the university during their internships. Accordingly, there is strong positive feedback from the job market. Although graduates very quickly obtain appropriate employment on the labour market, in part essential content of business administration must then be taught in practice (on the job after graduation – as confirmed during the discussions in the site visit). Generally, the study programme has a reputable quality assurance. The procedures at university

and programme level are well established and contribute to the review of the programme (see also Chapter 2). Peer-to-peer feedback is generated and considered in curriculum development.

In general, the quality of the curriculum is acceptable. The main question regarding this Bachelor's study programme is whether students should be taught the subject of business administration in its entire breadth or only selected areas of management (like HR, Marketing, Entrepreneurship etc.) in depth. In principle, both options might be adequate. Nevertheless, the experts would recommend focusing on all the classic parts of management according to Fayol (Planning, Organising, Staffing, Directing, Coordinating, Reporting and Budgeting) as an integral part of this study programme.

However, it is not appropriate if specialisation results in the absence of fundamental parts of business administration. Even if some subjects appear irrelevant to the current Bachelor's study programme (such as the courses Taxation, Financial Analysis and Practice, Cost Accounting, and Money and Capital Markets) these subjects are an integral part of Management Science. Therefore, adding this content would significantly improve the curriculum. Therefore, the experts believe that changes in the curriculum are needed in order to focus clearly on Management Science and on the necessary functions of business administration: Planning, Reporting, Budgeting, Coordination especially Financing, Cost Accounting, Investment, Taxation (**Finding 7**). This would ensure that the students are adequately prepared both for an academic career and for the demands of the labour market.

The high number of courses offered is relatively specific in some areas (e.g. lean management) and other expected areas of management such as finance, tax and investment are not taught comprehensively. Overall, the impression remains that financial mathematical and statistical content should also be strengthened (**Finding 8**). As already mentioned, there is also an in-depth focus on entrepreneurship. Although this is understandable against the background of the needs on the labour market, the aforementioned problem occurs. Such a subject seems appropriate if the basic components of business administration have already been integrated into the curriculum (**Finding 9**).

With these changes the main problem of the study programme could be solved.

The faculty has decided, due to a tight schedule, that both its Bachelor's and Master's study programmes in Management will not be accredited together. Therefore, the traceability and trackability of some courses (especially when it comes to the differentiation of content) cannot be guaranteed by the expert panel. It sometimes seems, that in this Bachelor's programme, content is taught that would be appropriate for a Master's programme, and other content that would have been expected in a Bachelor's curriculum like Budgeting, Investment is simply missing. As a result, a graduate of this programme may not be familiar with basic business functions or may only have rudimentary knowledge and skills. The experts therefore suggest, on a practical note, conducting the next review of the Bachelor's programme together with the Master's programme in order to better assess the goals of the university and the fitness for purpose of the education provided to the students.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Accounting (Master)

Description

The study programme “Accounting” covers 4 semesters and 36 credits. Enrolment is set at 30 students per semester. Upon graduation students are awarded a Master of Accounting, or M.Ak.

According to information in the self-evaluation report, specific attention has been given to the recommendations and the competency standards of the Indonesian Institute of Accountants (IAI) based on International Federation Accounting (IFAC) and International Education Standards (IES). For the Master’s programme there are 2 graduate profiles: accountant and auditor. The programme leaders have defined a total of 10 learning outcomes. Students should therefore, among others, master the application of theories and methods of financial accounting, auditing, management accounting, taxation, public sector accounting, and accounting information systems as well as their implementation and implications in business and economic, social, and behavioural decision-making, both in the form of regulations, accounting standards, and accounting policies. The graduates should be able to formulate management planning and control strategies professionally and apply them in teamwork as well as have good managerial skills, be creative and innovative, and operate economic concepts in modern business in making strategic decisions. Further, they should be able to produce accounting analysis products that are beneficial to the community and manage research and development of accounting applications independently or in groups in order to have scientific papers that can be published in national and international forums. They should also be able to implement accounting information technology used in the preparation of financial statements and accounting systems.

The curriculum is composed of compulsory courses (24 credits, including thesis) and elective courses (12 credits). The elective courses are grouped in the specialisations Business Sector Accounting, Auditing, and Public Sector Accounting. The first semester includes the compulsory courses “Information Technology System”, “Philosophical Theory and Professional Ethics”, “Financial Engineering Technique” and “Business Budgeting and Reporting”. In the second semester students take the compulsory courses “Research Methods”, “Strategic Management”, “Risk Management” and “Governance and Corporate Management”. Electives (e.g. “Business Analysis and Corporate Finance”, “Strategic Management Accounting”, “Audit Seminar”) are to be taken in the third semester. In the fourth semester students complete their final thesis.

Esa Unggul University states in its self-evaluation report that students have an obligation to publish papers in accredited scientific journals or in international journals. Additionally, they must gain at least one Professional / Competence Certificate in order to graduate.

Based on internal regulations, students of the Master’s programme “Accounting” can take a double degree programme with the university’s own Master’s programme “Management” (not part of this accreditation procedure).

Experts’ evaluation

The Master’s programme of Accounting consists of 10 learning outcomes (LO). All subjects offered in the curriculum of the Master’s programme of Accounting are related to the defined LO. The university has well defined which courses are related to which LO, even though some LO are to be attained through many courses, while others are covered by only a limited number of courses.

The subject and course level, in general, use the middle level of Bloom’s taxonomy such as ‘analyse’, ‘evaluate’, etc. Based on this, the experts believe that the subject learning outcomes and the course content must be better aligned to the programme learning outcomes. Specific attention must be paid to the correct use of the different competency level according to Bloom’s taxonomy at subject and course level (**Finding 10**).

In general, however, and when completing the required changes mentioned above, the experts conclude that the programme corresponds to other similar programme at Indonesian universities and that the level of the graduates corresponds to level 8 of the National Qualifications Framework.

In view of the international job market, the study programme should review some aspects. Esa Unggul University has set the vision to train graduates for the international job market, but based on available data this has not been realised in the Accounting programme yet. The university should take some steps to increase the international attractiveness of its graduates – changes to the curriculum might be required (**Finding 11**). The experts believe that for example, students should reach a TOEFL score before graduation of at least 500, more than currently expected. This would enable students to join and contribute to seminars and conferences at the international level.

As mentioned previously, the experts generally believe that the course descriptions must be improved and provide a similar level of detail (**Finding 4**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Public Administration (Master)

Description

The study programme “Public Administration” covers 4 semesters and 36 credits. Enrolment is set at 30 students per semester. Upon graduation students are awarded a Master of Public Administration, or M.AP.

The programme leaders have defined 2 graduate profiles – Public Policy Analyst, Programme Evaluation Expert – and set a total of 10 learning outcomes. Accordingly, the students should, among others, master and be able to compile, analyse, implement, and evaluate regulations, standards, guidelines and manuals in the field of public policy management. They should also master and be able to compile, analyse, evaluate, and implement the results of public policies with reference to applicable regulations, norms, standards, and procedures. They should be able to plan, allocate, evaluate the use of resources in the implementation of public policies, as well as be able to carry out academic validation or studies according to their field of expertise in solving relevant problems in society through the development of their knowledge and expertise in the field of public policy management. Graduates should also be able to make decisions on various choices of public policy methods and techniques in accordance with the needs of the community with an inter- and multidisciplinary approach.

The programme offers 3 specialisations, namely Public Policy Management, Public Services Management, and Programme Evaluation Management. The curriculum is composed of compulsory courses (24 credits) and elective courses (12 credits) in the 3 specialisations. In the first semester students take the compulsory courses “Public Administration Principles”, “Political and Economic Dimensions in Public Administration”, “Public Organization and Bureaucracy Dimensions” and “Research Methodology”. The second semester includes the compulsory courses “Public Policy Process and Formulation”, “Planning and Strategic Management”, “Human Resource Management in Public Sector” and “Public Financial Management”. Students take electives in the third semester, e.g. “Monitoring and program Evaluation”. In the fourth semester they complete their final thesis.

Esa Unggul University states in its self-evaluation report that students must gain at least one Professional / Competence Certificate or Companion Diploma in order to graduate.

Experts' evaluation

The Master's programme in Public Administration offers a wide range of content. This content is oriented towards the requirements of potential employers. The employability of graduates has been confirmed by

employers and graduates alike during the site visit. Based on the labour market requirements the university has defined concrete teaching and learning content via several levels of learning outcomes. This system of learning outcomes is formulated in great detail. For all courses and modules, learning outcomes have been specifically assigned. However, in the view of the experts, this system needs to be revised.

The starting point is the formulation of the 3 specialisations: Public Policy Management, Public Services Management, and Programme Evaluation Management. These 3 specialisations do not match the graduate profiles. Only 2 are mentioned here: Public Policy Analyst and Programme Evaluation Expert. The profile of the Public Service Expert must be added. Overall, the 3 specialisations are very broad. The areas of policy, service and programme have common foundations, but the range of later fields of application is wide. This should be sufficiently taken into account when revising the graduate profiles.

Building on this, the 3 levels of learning outcomes need to be better aligned. The learning outcomes are structured in 3 levels by the programme leaders: Learning Outcomes, Intended Learning Outcomes and Enhanced Learning Outcomes. For these learning outcomes, the levels of Bloom's learning taxonomy must be taken into account. The derived enhanced learning outcomes must reflect the level of the superordinate learning outcomes. This is not the case for many of the analysed subjects in the semester lesson plans. This is shown as an example for the course "Principles of Public Administration". Learning outcome 3 states: "Mastering, compiling, analysing, implementing and evaluating regulations, standards, guidelines and manuals in the practice of Public Sector Bureaucracy". This addresses the highest taxonomy level according to Bloom. The associated Intended Learning Outcomes, however, almost predominantly address only the lower levels of 'analyse' or 'apply'. These, in turn, do not correspond with the levels of the enhanced learning outcomes. This level structure of the learning outcomes must therefore be revised, and a congruence formulated between the taxonomy levels across the 3 learning outcome levels (**Finding 12**).

Finally, the forms of examination for the learning outcomes need to be designed more appropriately for this part. The frequently used form of the quiz is not suitable for a higher taxonomy level, since only predefined answers can be selected, and no own development of answers takes place. This will be addressed in detail later in Chapter 3 (see **Finding 15**).

Out of all the learning outcomes at programme level, 2 are different from the others: LO 1 and LO 2. For these 2 learning outcomes no examinations are required. It is understandable that these LO are included in the Master's programme, partly based on the national context. Evidence of the achievement of the learning outcome is provided through student collaboration, according to information provided during the site visit. A more concrete examination or proof is not required. Here, alternative forms of examination such as homework or group work can provide more concrete proof of the fulfilment of these learning outcomes.

Across all parts of the programme, the topic of digitalisation is given little space. A few enhanced learning outcomes could be assigned to this point. Digitisation, e-government and related topics such as smart city should be included more extensively in the teaching programme (**Finding 13**).

Based on the feedback provided by students and labour market representatives and following the required changes mentioned above, the experts can conclude that the programme can qualify students according to the competences defined for the Master level in the National Qualifications Framework.

As mentioned previously, the experts generally believe that the course descriptions must be improved and provide a similar level of detail (**Finding 4**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

Esa Unggul University has set 24 internal quality assurance standards based on Indonesia's National Higher Education Standards and referring to the three areas of the Tri Dharma of higher education: education, research, and community service. Each unit is required to develop key performance indicators to measure the implementation of the university's strategy.

The university's quality assurance system differentiates between internal quality assurance activities and external quality assurance activities. Esa Unggul University's quality assurance is set up at three levels: a Quality Assurance Unit (UJM) responsible for each study programme, a Quality Control Group (GKM) for each faculty, and the Quality Assurance Office (KPM) for the university as a whole. Each GKM is headed by a chairperson who coordinates with the dean, deputy dean, and the heads of the study programmes. The programme level unit is responsible for drafting the internal quality assurance for study programmes, conducting an internal audit to ensure the norm, standard, procedural, and regulation suitability, monitoring and evaluating the operational implementation of programme activities, measuring and analysing the study programme service quality, directing and coordinating programme activities, and finally making a report on the implementation of activities.

The university's Quality Assurance Office makes use of the documentation system ISO 9001:2015 as well as the accreditation provisions of the Indonesian national agency BAN-PT. It conducts yearly internal audits, the results of which are relayed to the study programmes. In addition, the study programmes undergo external evaluation by the national accreditation agency every five years.

Evaluation instruments include the evaluation of lecturers' attendance in class, the Index of Students Satisfaction on Lecturer's Performance, the evaluation of teaching materials, the analysis of student data (including number active students, GPA, study duration and number of on-time graduates) as well as cooperation in teaching, research, and community service activities. Esa Unggul University conducts an annual alumni survey. Alumni and representatives of the labour market take part in focus group discussions and are invited to complete questionnaires. According to information in the self-evaluation report, the results of the evaluations are discussed in management meetings and accessible on the university's academic platform.

Esa Unggul University lists in its self-evaluation report procedures contributing to the prevention of intolerance and discrimination, including the academic code of ethics and standing operating procedures dealing with student admission, with supporting students with special needs and developing facilities and infrastructure for people with disabilities.

Experts' evaluation

The university has an extensive and detailed structure regarding quality assurance, which is also adequately implemented at the level of the study programmes. The expert panel sees that the quality image of the university is adequate and comprehensive. This image was confirmed especially by the students during the site visit.

According to the university, quality assurance in the programmes is also, but not exclusively, achieved through close personal contact between the programme management and the examination board with the students, as well as through the continuous coordination of the lecturers involved. In addition, the university collects further statistical data on the composition of its student body. Finally, certain parameters are set in relation to each other to identify potential problems at an early stage.

However, the documentation does not contain very much information about which specific changes we carried out over time based on the survey results. This may partially be since the results, viewed as a whole, are very positive. Regarding the other aspects the expert panel got a good impression through asking and cross referencing between the different interview groups. It seems that the general solid quality of the programmes also limited the need for problem-solving through quality assurance processes.

Looking at the development of the quality assurance system as a whole, there is one aspect that the expert panel believes is worth reflecting on. The quality assurance system is currently missing out on opportunities the university could and should use. The university should especially standardise the way in which labour market representatives can contribute to the development of the programmes beyond surveys – the process should be structured, clear and documented (**Finding 14**). The review panel believes that the labour market can contribute to the success of the programmes a lot and missing out on such an opportunity in the long run limits the development and enhancement opportunities of the whole university. However, these thoughts clearly are of broader nature and point to future development opportunities while at this time the quality assurance for the programmes meets the minimum requirements defined by the standard.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

Esa Unggul University characterises its methodology as student centred, based on active discussion and study. As specific teaching and learning methods the university mentions lectures, discussions, and class collaboration, structured tasks, independent study as well as apprenticeships/internships and group work. During the Covid-19 pandemic learning takes place using the university's learning platform following a Blended Learning approach. According to information in the self-evaluation report, specific attention is given to projects and case studies. The programme leaders state that they apply the "adult education system in teaching"

focusing on equality, initiative, and spontaneity whereby the method is described as dynamic and stimulating for students' creativity. In the study programmes (except for the Master's programme "Accounting") the students are also required to complete comparative studies and present their results in class.

The online learning platform of the university offers access to study material including literature, presentations, videos, journal links, quizzes, and assignments.

Esa Unggul University states in its self-evaluation report that the research conducted by lecturers inform their teaching. Additionally, students with a good GPA can be recruited by lecturers to take part in ongoing research projects as research assistants and, where appropriate, to co-publish articles.

To evaluate students, lecturers carry out quizzes and assess the results of discussions, presentations, and essay reports. For each course there is a mid-term and a final exam. In the study programme "Accounting" the programme leaders state that the mid-term exams are conducted through essays.

Experts' evaluation

The university states in its self-evaluation report that the learning method used at this university is the "adult learning method". This learning method provides and encourages students to be active in the learning process. Even though the course description includes all teaching and learning methods, in discussions with teaching staff information was obtained that discussion and case-study methods were widely used in the learning process. The experts believe that in order to improve students' skills, the use of the role-playing method should be increased as well (see Chapter 1, **Finding 3**). To support this method, additional laboratory facilities are required, especially the moot court room, which only has one room in proportion to the number of students (see Chapter 6, **Finding 22**).

Students are also learning through their involvement in lecturers' research, through internships and the Independent Campus/Freedom to Learn (MBKM) scheme. The number of students participating in research and the MBKM programme could however still be increased (see also Chapter 4 regarding student mobility).

According to the given information, students are provided with scripts in all subjects. These are published via the learning platform, where the associated quizzes are also embedded. The curricula are structured according to learning outcomes and their detailing, which was discussed in Chapter 1. The study programmes already have and use an online Learning Management System (LMS). This facility is still in use even though the Covid-19 pandemic is considered over and face-to-face lectures can be carried out again. Based on discussions with teaching staff and students, the LMS platform is used effectively by lecturers and students.

Students have to take a large number of examinations during the course of their studies. In the following, the aspects of frequency and form of examination are addressed. In the course of the semester, a quiz has to be taken almost every week. This narrow form of examination guidance allows little freedom in learning and prevents coherent learning and examination of several subject areas. The quiz form focuses on the study and understanding of a narrowly defined topic. Coherent knowledge is only tested in the much rarer examination forms of case study, essay and discussion. Final exams take place at the end of the semester for each single course. This wide spread between weekly, monothematic quizzes and semester exams can lead to students being overloaded with exams. In addition, it is questionable whether the quizzes are preparation for the other exams.

The inconsistency of learning taxonomies in learning outcomes, intended learning outcomes, and enhanced learning outcomes in the Master's programmes has already been addressed above (see Chapter 1). The most frequently used form of the quiz does not meet its own requirements for the learning outcomes. Higher taxonomy levels such as 'analyse' or 'evaluate' can only be tested to a limited extent via this form. Rather, it can be assumed that pure knowledge queries take place here. Their usefulness can be doubted, since the students

must prove their knowledge in the later, qualitatively higher examination forms. The scope and form of the quiz can therefore be revised. In conclusion, the experts consider that the examination forms must be better aligned to the learning outcomes/competencies of each course, thereby raising the variety in terms of examination forms (**Finding 15**).

The students may complain about learning and assessment through the suggestion box or by contacting the lecturers directly. However, this procedure needs to be standardised and made accessible to all students (**Finding 16**).

In order to meet international standards, international exposure is needed for lecturers and students. Increasing students' English skills should be the first step so that the students can follow and access international developments and can participate in various international scientific forums. English as a language of teaching, learning, and working should therefore be incorporated more extensively into everyday university life (**Finding 17**). This can be done via English as a separate subject, via examinations in English or the general use of international case studies. The need for this was evident in the site visit, when graduates reported on their current fields of work, and through the comments given by the labour market representatives.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

Student admission requirements, as well as regulations regarding all aspects of the studies including monitoring and progression are set in the Academic Guidelines of the respective faculty. Admission decisions are made by the department in charge of a specific study programme under the responsibility of the Dean of the faculty.

For the study programme "Law" admission is based on the results of the entrance/academic placement test for high school graduates (all subjects are accepted), English skills, as well as interviews. For the "Management" Bachelor's programme the university accepts high school graduates in sciences or social sciences as well as students from vocational schools who complete the academic placement test as well as an English test. In order to enrol in the Master's programmes "Accounting" and "Public Administration" students must have completed their Bachelor studies (all majors are accepted – non-linear students must complete a bridging programme and have a GPA of 3.0), reach a potential academic test score of 600 and a TOEFL score of 450, and complete an interview.

Students' progression is monitored by the lecturers, the head of the study programme and their individual academic advisor based on direct discussions and data from the Academic Information System (SIKAD) (including credit load taken each semester, distribution of courses, achieved credit load). Each semester students can take a maximum of 20 credits. Overall students confirmed that the workload defined is adequate and that their studies are manageable.

According to information in the self-evaluation report, student workload is assessed by the lecturers analysing the students' mark rate in particular courses, by proof of the study implementation activity, homework, and quizzes. In turn, students assess the lecturers' workload by filling up the lecturer evaluation survey.

Students can take part in mobility activities as well as in additional internships in the framework of the national Independent Campus/Freedom to Learn (MBKM) scheme. Esa Unggul University has developed a recognition procedure for such activities for up to 20 credits in the Bachelor's study programme "Management". It states in its self-evaluation report, that due to the focus of the respective curriculum on internal activities, no mobility has been registered in the Bachelor's programme "Law" and in both Master's programmes "Accounting" and "Public Administration" – in the study programme "Management" the university indicates that students have been abroad in Asia and in the US for one semester.

Esa Unggul University states that it supports students in developing and acquiring additional skills through non-formal learning activities, these activities are facilitated by the university's own Professional Certification Body (LSP).

Upon graduation, students receive their diploma, a transcript of grades, and a diploma supplement that provides information about the competencies, achievements, and other activity certificates (e.g. Professional Certificate) they have obtained.

Experts' evaluation

Esa Unggul University has regulations for student admission in both Bachelor's and Master's programmes. The guidelines regarding the recruitment of new students are stated in Rector's Decree No. 05a/SK-R/UEU/I/2015 (updated annually according to developments, and Quality Guidelines for New Student Admission). Esa Unggul University has formal prerequisites for admission and a defined selection procedure. The Admissions and Marketing Department is responsible for the admission, the study programme selection team is responsible for the academic selection and interviews are compulsory – a final report on the results is sent to the dean. In an interview, the questions and topics asked already reflect the topics that must be achieved in the learning outcomes. In the view of the experts, it is a good step. Still, the user-friendliness of the admission website could be improved in order to attract new and better students, through e.g. a chatbot or a call-centre service.

The university has an academic system to check the student's progress based on indicators such as GPA, the number of credits, etc. To monitor students' attendance the university uses a RFID signature and tap system when entering a classroom / registering for presence during a session. The lecturers validate the students' attendance by signing on the attendance list. In the view of the experts, it is an excellent mechanism to control the minimum attendance requirement.

The university has introduced mechanisms and criteria to recognise periods of studies and prior learning. Students must have a look at the curriculum to find out the distribution of compulsory and elective courses and can compare their curricula with offer curricula at other universities in Indonesia or abroad. The documentation can be done through Academic Information System/SIKAD.

The study programme "Management" carries out student exchange programmes with other universities both at home and abroad. A maximum of 20 credits for outside activities and courses can be recognised for the curriculum of the Management study programme. The acknowledgement of these courses is in accordance with government regulations and the rector's rules regarding MBKM. Unfortunately, there has been no mobility exchange in the other study programmes under review.

When completing their studies, students receive an academic Bachelor's or Master's degree respectively. They receive their certificate and a special degree information document. Students can complete additional competency testing for each study programme to obtain additional certificates of competency.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

Staff is selected and recruited centrally at Esa Unggul University based on a needs analysis by the respective faculties and study programmes. Generally, the regulations states that lecturers in a Bachelor's programme must hold at least a Master's degree and that lecturers in a Master's degree must hold at least a PhD.

Teaching staff in the "Law" study programme includes 1 associate professor, 12 assistant professors as well as 32 additional lecturers for a lecturer to student ratio of 1:28. In the "Management" study programme the teaching staff is composed of 53 lecturers including 3 full professors, 2 associate professors and 7 assistant professors. The university indicates that a total of 6 lecturers, all holding a PhD, are teaching in the "Accounting" study programme. In the "Public Administration" study programme there are 10 lecturers, all holding a PhD. Additionally, the programme leaders state that external lecturers/invited experts contribute to the teaching activities in order to provide a direct view on the latest developments on the respective job market. Part-time lecturers are selected and evaluated by the head of the respective study programme.

In addition to teaching activities, lecturers must complete at least one research and community service activity per year in accordance with a roadmap listed in the research master plan of the university's Research and Community Service Institute (LPPM). Esa Unggul University states in its self-evaluation report that specific funding is allocated to research and community service activities, and that teaching as well as administrative staff is offered support in further training. The university provides e.g. scholarships to lecturers wishing to continue their studies. It has set the goal that by 2023 half of all lecturers must have completed a doctoral programme. Training opportunities include planning, workshops, certification, and qualifications for further studies at the doctoral level, post-doctoral and professional levels.

Lecturer assessment considers feedback gathered by student evaluation through the Student Satisfaction Index on Lecturer Performance as well as performance monitoring in research and community service.

Experts' evaluation

Based on the material provided and the information received during the site visit the experts conclude that the procedures for staff recruitment are well defined at the university – they correspond to the usual processes at Indonesian higher education institutions and follow the respective national regulations.

The university provides some support for staff training and further development. There are some incentive programmes for research and publications. However, the experts believe that the university should further support the development of English competencies among its administrative and academic staff (**Finding 18**).

This would support the internationalisation goals of the university and contribute to more research that is also more visible.

Apart from the permanent teaching staff, the lecturers in the Law programme also come from practitioners, for example lawyers and notaries. The teaching staff have good facilities and are happy to teach together with practitioners. The workload is not too high and seems manageable. Teaching staff have access to good facilities to be able to continue their studies and obtain professorships. Data on teaching staff has been presented including academic qualifications, research, and publications. Based on this data, the number of teaching staff is low and should be increased both in terms of quantity and quality. The number of teaching staff with doctorate education qualifications should be increased (**Finding 19**). There are no teaching staff with professor qualifications yet. Not all teaching staff have received additional competency certificates as lecturers. To increase internationalisation, the programme should consider bringing in foreign lecturers or appoint adjunct professors. This will have an impact on students' insights and the enrichment of academic climate in the study programme.

Complete CVs, including publications, of the teaching staff in the study programme "Management" are available for faculty members. The academic background of the teaching staff is adequate for a Bachelor's degree programme. Particularly in this study programme internationalisation should be taken into account and more emphasis should be placed on English-speaking teaching staff.

In the view of the experts, the teaching staff for the Accounting Master's programme is both sufficient and well qualified. The situation in the study programme is comparable to other programmes at Indonesian universities.

Staffing for the Master's programme of Public Administration appears adequate. The number of professors and PhDs is well distributed. The research activities and publications are recognisable at least in the national context. It is positive that the teaching staff is not recruited from the university's own graduates. Here, attention is paid to an external supply of teaching staff, which ensures a knowledge import into the Master's programme. The support of teaching staff for academic continuing education also appears to be good.

Generally for all programmes the experts also come to the conclusion that more practitioners should be involved in teaching (**Finding 20**). Furthermore, the university should recruit more senior academics and provide additional support for its current staff in moving up the academic ladder (completing a PhD up to gaining full professor status) (**Finding 21**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

Students are informed of the content of their studies and courses through the provision of Semester Learning / Teaching Plans (RPS), which are published on the learning platform and include the details of the contents and learning outcomes, the exams and teaching methods, the additional material and literature required for

each course. According to information in the self-evaluation report, learning materials are prepared directly by each lecturer. The semester learning plans are updated each semester based on student feedback gathered in surveys related to course material and in focus group discussions. Additional monitoring on the learning resources is carried out centrally by the Learning Development Institute of Esa Unggul University.

Esa Unggul University provides information to the students during orientation through the Introduction to Campus life event, the ESQ (Emotional Spiritual Quotient) training, and the State Defense Training. During their studies students are assigned an academic advisor, with whom they should meet at least three times per semester. The advisors' duties as set in the university's Education Guidelines cover the fields of academia, personality development, social aspects, culture, sports, mental spirituality, and welfare. Students can also contact lecturers during their consultation hours. In addition, the university has a Guidance and Counselling Unit and refers in its self-evaluation report to additional offers for students with special needs. Esa Unggul University also provides scholarships and mentors for activities like competitions, trainings, and student exchange. Additional counselling and support are also provided by the university's Career Centre Unit (e.g. job interviews, CV writing).

The self-evaluation report lists a number of material resources that are available to students at Esa Unggul University, including classrooms, a library, several laboratories equipped with software programmes, an e-learning studio, sports facilities and a canteen. There are seats, wheelchair-accessible ramps, and parking areas for students with special needs. Specifically for the programmes of the Faculty of Economics and Business the university refers to a statistical laboratory and a business intelligence corner as well as software for fundamentals and financial courses, an enterprise resource planning laboratory, and a computer laboratory. The heads of each study programme plan the material resources needed for their section and submit them to the librarian for material resources. The librarian will publish the available material resources in a repository, which will then be accessible by lecturers and students. Esa Unggul University has a standing operating procedure regarding the maintenance of laboratories and equipment.

Experts' evaluation

The experts found that the course descriptions as well as the general information about the university can be accessed easily by the (prospective) students. For the learning process, the online system of the university is commonly used by students. It supports students in accessing the lesson plans and the course materials. Furthermore, the university portal and social media platforms are used to disseminate information regarding students' activities.

Since the assessment of the programmes was conducted online, a virtual tour of the facilities was shown, which gave a good overview of the premises, the classrooms, library, computer laboratory, discussion rooms and moot court room, which all are accessible for the students outside of lectures, too. The facilities also are accessible and well suited for people with special needs. All classrooms and workspaces reflect current professional standards and are appropriate for the intended learning outcomes. To the extent possible in an online visit the experts conclude that sufficient facilities are available concerning room and space required for the number of students in the programmes. One exception can however be made for the Law study programme: Esa Unggul University only has one moot court room for an intake of 400 students per semester; there are currently 1,200 active students in the programme according to the self-evaluation report. In the view of the experts this is not sufficient, it is doubtful that all students can fully access and use the moot court room. The size of the moot court room should therefore be increased to better accommodate the student body (**Finding 22**). Additional moot court rooms might also offer the possibility for students to work in different environments reflecting the different types and levels of courts in Indonesia.

The general positive evaluation of the facilities and infrastructure is also supported by the tables and lists provided by the university. The central library is equipped with a number of hard copy books and e-books, and grants access to various internationally acclaimed online journals to support learning and research activities.

The university maintains building and other facilities well according to maintenance procedures. Students and faculty raised no concern during the site visit and also the virtual tour gave no indication of problems. It is also ensured that health facilities, like hand sanitisers, are available at appropriate places and in appropriate number. The experts conclude that the environmental and safety aspects of the facilities and personnel are well taken care of by Esa Unggul University.

The university as well as its faculties offer various support programmes to their students. The integrated information system is available, making required information easily accessible by students and prospective students. Newly registered students are offered a campus orientation. They are also equipped with relevant information about the university, faculty, and study programmes and introduced to academic advisers. In addition, the university offers support for the internship organisation, career guidance, financial, psychological and individual support. However, the students asked for more free-time activities by the university, so this could be an area for possible improvement for Esa Unggul University in the view of the expert panel.

The university also provides sufficient support for exchange students through the International Office and related study programmes.

As the panel could confirm during the interview with the students, teaching staff members offer consultation hours regularly and are available to students for any matter. For students, course descriptions are available. These documents contain the intended learning outcomes, learning and teaching method, assessment methods, and the expected workload (self-study and in-class hours – as mentioned above, improvement are however necessary, **Finding 4**). Procedures are applied to ensure that course offerings are coordinated on content and organisational levels to avoid overlap. It was also confirmed that the students that the programmes are designed to allow them to complete their studies within the expected time as defined in the curriculum.

The panel is convinced that the university puts efforts into supporting its students and creates a fruitful learning and living environment at the university.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information

Bachelor's/Master's degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Description

Information on the general profile, the curriculum, the intended learning outcomes, the course descriptions, the admission requirements, as well as the teaching and learning methods and the lecturers are available on the respective websites of each study programme. Additionally, Esa Unggul University states that it informs students of the results of the tracer studies during orientation and that it informs the labour market during specific focus group meetings.

Experts' evaluation

Esa Unggul University provides a wide range of informational materials for students and prospective students and also for partners and the general public. The websites of Esa Unggul University, especially at the Faculty of Economics and Business and the Faculty of Law are available in Indonesian and some also in English. The main weakness, however, is that more detailed information is often only available in the national language. The faculties are offering automatic website translation services, if necessary.

If abstracted from the weakness mentioned, a self-description and the vision of the faculties, a description of the facilities and the faculty profiles and other information are available. The visions, missions, and goals as well as information about the faculties and an overview of the courses offered are easy to find and are quite clearly presented. Especially for national students, information is provided on the study programmes, lecturers and international cooperations. Yet, Esa Unggul University could check whether the structure of the information provided could be more harmonised between the different study programmes (e.g. for the study programme "Management" information on Vision/Mission/Goals, Career, Cooperation, Curriculum and Academic Guidelines, Teaching staff). The loading times are sometimes considerable and could be improved as well. The browser independence of the web presence also seems to be improvable.

The university has published an academic handbook for some of the programmes (partly available in English) with information on the learning outcomes, the curriculum, and the courses on its website: Law – missing, Management – Academic Guidelines 2020/2021, Accounting – Academic Guidelines 2016/2017, Public Management – missing. The curricula are available, in some form, for all study programmes. However, it seems that the information provided is not updated regularly.

Based on this, the experts see the following areas for improvement:

- The website has to be updated more regularly (**Finding 23**).
- The university must publish a complete academic handbook for each programme with information on the learning outcomes, the curriculum and the courses on its website (**Finding 24**).
- All core information should be provided in English (**Finding 25**).

Conclusion

The criterion is not fulfilled.

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes “Law” (Bachelor of Law), “Management” (Bachelor of Management), “Accounting” (Master of Accounting) and “Public Administration” (Master of Public Administration) offered by Esa Unggul University with conditions.

Findings

For Law

1. The graduate profile of ‘Entrepreneurs’ must be formulated more specifically, directly referring to entrepreneurs in the field of law.
2. In order to fully reach the graduate profile of ‘International Law Experts’, the curriculum must include more courses related to international law.
3. The number of courses that are oriented towards improving skills through practice must be increased (e.g. through role playing). This must be made transparent in the course descriptions.

For all programmes

4. The course descriptions must be improved and contain the same level of details between different courses.

For Management

5. English-language courses must be offered more frequently and the teaching of English as a language foundation for business administration must be integrated into the curriculum.
6. When reviewing the course descriptions, specific attention should be paid to the content of the courses and their complexity level.
7. The curriculum must be revised and clearly focus on Management Science and on the necessary functions of business administration: Planning, Reporting, Budgeting, Coordination especially Financing, Cost Accounting, Investment, Taxation.
8. Financial mathematical and statistical content should be strengthened in the curriculum.
9. The in-depth focus on entrepreneurship should only be kept if the basic components of business administration are integrated into the curriculum.

For Accounting

10. The subject learning outcomes and the course content must be better aligned to the programme learning outcomes. Specific attention must be paid to the correct use of the different competency level according to Bloom’s taxonomy at subject and course level.
11. The programme leaders should review the curriculum in order to increase the attractiveness of graduates for the international job market – as stated in the university vision.

For Public Administration

12. The overall profile and structure of the study programme must be revised: a) The graduate profile of the Public Service Expert must be added – in accordance with the offered specialisation. b) The 3 levels of learning outcomes must be better aligned to each other, taking into account the appropriate levels of Bloom’s taxonomy.

13. Digitisation, e-government and related topics such as smart city should be included more extensively in the curriculum.

For all programmes

14. The university should standardise the way in which labour market representatives can contribute to the development of the programmes beyond surveys – the process should be structured, clear and documented.

15. The examination forms must be better aligned to the learning outcomes/competencies of each course, thereby raising the variety in terms of examination forms.

16. The complaints procedure must be standardised and made accessible to all students.

17. English as a language of teaching, learning, and working should be incorporated more extensively into everyday university life.

18. The university should support the development of English competencies among its administrative and academic staff.

For Law

19. The number of teaching staff in general, and of teaching staff holding a PhD in particular, should be increased.

For all programmes

20. More practitioners should be involved in teaching.

21. The university should recruit more senior academics and provide additional support for its current staff in moving up the academic ladder.

For Law

22. The size of the moot court room should be increased to better accommodate the student body.

For all programmes

23. The website has to be updated more regularly.

24. The university must publish a complete academic handbook for each programme with information on the learning outcomes, the curriculum and the courses on its website.

25. All core information should be provided in English.