



AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY, CAIRO, EGYPT

CLUSTER DENTISTRY

DENTAL MEDICINE AND SURGERY (BACHELOR)

CLINICAL DENTISTRY (BACHELOR)

December 2023



Content

Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS	3
I. Preamble	6
II. Accreditation procedure	6
1. Criteria.....	6
2. Approach and methodology	6
III. General information on the university	7
IV. Assessment of the study programmes	8
1. Quality of the curriculum	8
2. Procedures for quality assurance	12
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students	14
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification.....	15
5. Teaching staff.....	19
6. Learning resources and student support	21
7. Information	22
V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....	23

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “DENTAL MEDICINE AND SURGERY” (BACHELOR)
- “CLINICAL DENTISTRY” (BACHELOR)

OFFERED BY AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY, CAIRO, EGYPT

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 18th and 19th meeting on 21 August and 04 December 2023 the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes “Dental Medicine and Surgery” (Bachelor) and “Clinical Dentistry” (Bachelor) offered by **Ain Shams University, Egypt** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2024**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2029**.

Conditions:

1. A clear table which allows the comparison of workload between the Egyptian Credit Point System and the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) must be provided.
2. The ILOs must be described more explicitly and also include aspects of research and the labour market orientation. The quality of the course descriptions should be aligned.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

1. A lab to train basic surgical skills e.g. suture technique should be implemented.
2. More content of preventive dentistry subjects and more interdisciplinary teaching should be implemented, e.g. geriatric dentistry, multimorbidity/multimедication as cross section lecture together with teaching staff from internal medicine and pharmacology and pain management as cross section lecture together with pain therapists, neurologists, neurosurgeons and psychosomatic experts. These issues should also be described in the intended learning outcomes in the course descriptions. Also, methodological and general skills should be considered.

3. It is recommended to summarize data and information on the graduates and inform the public about the success of the graduates.
4. The dropout rate should be clearly outlined, specified and explained.
5. The Quality Assurance System of the Faculty should be described transparently and also the interlinkage between the central QA level and the faculty level should be made more explicit. The outcomes of the QA system should be presented to the stakeholders in an aggregated manner.
6. A systematic approach that includes the development of action plans based on evaluation results and their effective implementation should be implemented to drive improvements and ensure the delivery of high-quality educational programmes.
7. It is recommended to establish robust systems for data analysis and ensure regular monitoring of key metrics.
8. The university should have transparent and published regulations or mitigating circumstances to compensate for disadvantages, illness, or absence and address also students with special needs.
9. The university should implement a policy how prior learning or/and informal learning is recognized, which is important for facilitating student mobility and broadening access to education.
10. The university should adapt its practices regarding credit transfer and recognition of qualifications from other institutions to what is done at other institutions and, if possible, align its policy with international principles like the Lisbon Recognition Convention.
11. In the recruitment process of teaching staff especially the process of decision making should be more specified concerning transparency and composition of the decision-making body.
12. The process of acknowledgment of qualification in academic teaching of external/guest lecturers involved in the study programme for specialized topics should also be specified. This should also include how external lecturers are made familiar with the requirements of the study programme.
13. It should be specified to which extent the various staff members including administrative and supporting staff used short term and long-term training programmes and if there is an evaluation procedure. For a targeted academic staff development research aspects should be taken into consideration to a greater extent.
14. The quality of the website should be improved: it should be updated regularly and clear and transparent information about both programmes should be readily available.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached experts' report.

EXPERTS' REPORT**ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- “DENTAL MEDICINE AND SURGERY” (BACHELOR)
- “CLINICAL DENTISTRY” (BACHELOR)

OFFERED BY AIN SHAMS UNIVERSITY, CAIRO, EGYPT

Visit to the university: 01.05. – 04.05.2023

Panel of experts:

Prof. em. Dr. Dr. Siegmair Reinert	University Hospital Tübingen, Department of Oral and Craniomaxillofacial Surgery
PD Dr. Sameh Attia	Clinic and Polyclinic for Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, University Hospital Giessen
Dr. Mahmoud Alghussein	Clinic and Polyclinic for Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, University Clinic Szeged, Hungary, and Scientific staff and lecturer at the IMC - University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany (representative of the labour market)
Eren Eryilmaz-Zechmeister	Student of Dentistry at the Medical University of Vienna (student expert)
Coordinator: Doris Herrmann	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the two Bachelor programmes “Dental Medicine and Surgery” and “Clinical Dentistry” offered by Ain Shams University.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in June 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In September 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- Course descriptions for both programmes
- academic regulations/examination policy
- National Academic Reference Standards (NARS) on Dentistry
- information on student support unit,
- Non-discrimination policy
- Information on Quality Assurance Unit
- Diploma Supplements

Some additional documents were provided during the site visit at Ain Shams University.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 05th December 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in March 2023.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective discipline, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in March 2023. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 01st – 04th May 2023. On site, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 4 December 2023. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In February 2024, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Ain Shams University is one of the oldest universities in Egypt, the MENA region, and Africa. The university has grown steadily, including 17 faculties and two higher institutes for postgraduate studies. Each faculty offers various educational programmes and activities, including undergraduate and postgraduate programmes, re-

search units, and community service. The university has about 150,000 students, including international students, and nearly 10,000 academic staff, both local and international.

The Faculty of Dentistry at Ain Shams University was established in 1994 and welcomed its first cohort in September 1995. The first graduates from the Faculty of Dentistry graduated in May 2000. The Faculty has served an average of 300 to 400 students per year, in addition to international undergraduates and postgraduates. By 2015, the new Bachelor of Clinical Dentistry (BCD) programme was introduced, increasing the total number of undergraduate students. The Faculty includes three academic departments and eight clinical departments, which are dedicated to community service, serving hundreds of thousands of dental patients annually and providing a valuable service to the local community. Ain Shams University funds the study programmes according to the Ministry of Higher Education budget. The University supports students looking for help after applying for the necessary evidence via the student support unit.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum

Bachelor's degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Description

Ain Shams University offers two programmes in Dentistry in which the basic sciences are shared, some topics are also shared in the 4th year. Practical labs are also available for both. Beside content related differences one other aspect is that BDS programme is governed by the government and is according to the national regulations free of charge while the new programme BCD allows more exposure of students to other topics, is more clinic oriented and students have to pay to be inscribed in this programme. The faculty of dentistry also abides by the National Academic Reference Standards (NARS) issued by National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAA). Both programmes are said to offer the same quality of education and both are accredited by the national agency NAQAAE.

1.1 Bachelor Programme of Dental Medicine and Surgery (BDS)

Following the vision and mission of the University and Faculty, the aim of the Bachelor's degree in Dental Medicine and Surgery (BDS) is geared towards providing a diverse spectrum of basic academic research, biomedical and clinical science and practice necessary to develop knowledgeable, capable and competent graduates who will take responsibility for the primary health interests of the dental public and providing an internal drive for ongoing professional development needs. According to SER, the programme has ten Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) to ensure that the programme objectives are met in the various academic, practical, and intellectual aspects. By the end of the programme, the student should be able to: (1) provide comprehensive dental care based on basic dental and medical knowledge, (2) Offer professional dental services considering all ethical aspects in patient communication, (3) Gain clinical experience, including diagnosis

and treatment plan for oral and dental conditions to provide community-based services, (4) respond to the patient's needs and expectations during dental treatment, (5) communicate with patients of diverse socioeconomic backgrounds, ages, and communities through outreach visits, (6) practice effective dental care in a safe infection control environment, (7) expand their skills and research careers by enabling high-level dental programmes, (8) consider the legal obligations of medicine in planning treatment and managing patients, (9) understand the relationship between general health status, disability and illness and oral health and make a referral decision, and (10) use the advanced technology to expand their dental skills.

The duration of the programme is five academic years. The pre-clinical phase lasts three years, during which both - the medical and dental faculties - offer the courses. Each year at this level expands students' prior knowledge and builds the understanding necessary to move on to the next level. The following two years represent the clinical phase in which the Faculty of Dentistry offers the courses. This level promotes the development of instrumental, systemic, and communicative skills. The total number of hours required to complete the programme according to the provided records is 4,500 over 150 weeks (108 credit hours in the Egyptian Credit Point System). The number of weeks per academic year is 30-32 weeks. All courses out of 40 courses during the five academic years are compulsory. Both the first and second years have seven courses each. The third and fifth years have eight courses each, while the fourth year has ten courses.

1.2 Bachelor Programme of Clinical Dentistry (BCD)

According to SER, the BCD programme aims to provide biological, medical, and dental subjects and clinical training using a multidisciplinary approach to produce well-educated, highly scientifically and technically qualified graduates who are prepared for clinical practice. The programme also has ten Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs). By the end of the programme, students should be able to: (1) provide patient preventive care and community health promotion services within dental specialities, (2) ensure ethical practice management, (3) Independently and in a multidisciplinary team, provide safe and comprehensive dental care for oral/para-oral and dental dis-eases and conditions, (4) respond professionally to any patient category or age group, (5) recognise different socioeconomic levels and take into account the patient's behavioural changes, (6) work in a safe, clean, and controlled environment. (7) Strive for continuous professional development, research, and clinical experience, (8) observe the medical-legal obligations towards patients, (9) Assess their clinical skills and limitations and decide on referrals to other specialities as needed and (10) Interact with advanced technology related to dentistry.

The duration of this study is five years of ten semesters and is divided into (i) the pre-clinical phase (5 semesters), in which courses are offered by the Faculty of Medicine and the Faculty of Dentistry in the primary and medical sciences and (ii) clinical Phase (5 semesters) in which the Faculty of Dentistry offers the courses. The total hours required to complete the programme according to the provided records is 5,760 over 150 weeks (189 Egyptian credit hours). The number of weeks per academic year is 30 (15 weeks per semester). The summer semester is optional and lasts eight weeks (a maximum of two courses in the summer semester). All courses and hours are compulsory, totalling 51 courses over the five years of study. The first year has nine courses; the second year has thirteen courses; the third year has eight courses; the fourth year has ten courses, and the fifth year has eleven courses. The distribution of credit hours in the programme: Basic Sciences (53 credit hours), Medical and Dental Sciences courses (126 credit hours), Didactic (54 credit hours), Lab & Clinical (72 credit hours), and Complementary Sciences (10 credit hours). Specific courses exclusive to this programme are offered during the fourth and fifth years, namely Occlusion I and II in the 4th year and Comprehensive Implantology and Aesthetic Dentistry in the 5th year.

The graduates of both programmes must complete a mandatory twelve-month continuous internship programme as a prerequisite to dental license and registration as a dentist through the Egyptian Dental Syndicate.

The internship programme includes clinical training, patient management and treatment, staff administration and practice management under the direction of faculty and senior staff. The internship is obligatory and supervised by the Faculty, but nevertheless not part of the study programme itself.

Experts' evaluation

The application documents of the Faculty of Dentistry are transparent and clear, however some information on the programmes and their differences were lacking but most of these information gaps could be closed during the site visit. Due to the similarities between the programmes, the panel of experts assesses both programmes jointly:

Both study programmes are shaped according to regular dental curricula comparable to most dental schools in Europe. In the preclinical stage basic sciences like chemistry, physics and biology are no dedicated courses however applied knowledge in these subjects is provided e.g. by the Department of Oral Biology and the Department of Oral Medicine, diagnosis and periodontology.

The Faculty of Dentistry is equipped with 378 dental units, sufficient lab rooms and lecture halls including a PhD defending hall for altogether approximately 2,700 students. The programmes have a specific orientation (e.g. stem cell Lab, LASER Lab, digital center) which is beneficial for promoting research activities of graduates, Master and PhD students. Undergraduate students have the possibility to get in touch with these advanced techniques and can be attracted to further qualify scientifically. There is no Department of Material Science however a Department of Biomaterials which considered to be a future-oriented setting.

Simulations labs are a valuable tool in undergraduate dental training. The faculty administration has introduced labs for the conservative, endodontics and prosthodontics department. A lab to train basic surgical skills e.g. suture technique should also be implemented (**Finding 1**).

According to the SER, the workload calculation follows the national legal requirements for Undergraduate Programmes in Egypt. For the BDS Programme the provided records give a workload of 4,500 hours over 150 weeks (108 credit hours or 216 ECTS). For the BCD Programme total hours required to complete the programme according to the provided records is 5,760 over 150 weeks (189 credit hours or 378 ECTS). This does not meet the Bologna Criteria with a relation of 1 ECTS equivalent to 25-30 hours. During the site visit it became clear that the faculty is able to calculate the Egyptian workload in a way which makes it comparable to the ECTS system. But till now there are no experiences how this alignment works out in practice. To foster the international mobility of students a clear table which allows the comparison of workload between the Egyptian Credit Point System and the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS), e.g. in a transparent Transcript of Records, must be adapted and differences between the tables used in the SER corrected (**Finding 2**).

It is a national regulation that a programme of Dentistry ends after 5 years with a Bachelor degree. A Bachelor thesis is not required. The graduates of both programmes will be able to work as a general dental practitioner after 6 years following the completion of one year internship and registration in the Dental syndicate in Egypt. The internship is not accompanied by courses of the University and is not credited. The advantage of the internship is that the clinical abilities of the graduates are strengthened. Although it is not a decision which lies in the hands of the University, the entry in the dental profession one year later compared to graduates in Europe is a disadvantage in a globalized world and should be considered as a reason to develop the programmes further. In the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) the Egyptian Bachelor Degree would correspond due to the duration of study and level of studies required – to a Master Degree. In the panel's opinion the educational pathways of Dentists in Egypt are quite long because a 6 year undergraduate education is the basis for a Master's programme of additional 2 years. In Europe the duration of a consecutive BA and MA programme lasts according 5 years. Ain Shams University is not in charge to influence the national regulations

but the panel of experts recommends to the Ministry of Education that it should be considered to shorten the educational pathway of Dentists in Egypt of 6 years undergraduate education to five years with 300 ECTS.

Most desired qualifications to be achieved are presented as intended learning outcomes (ILOs), also preventive and cross section elements e.g. pain management as well as interdisciplinary elements like computer science and communication are part of the curriculum. Although Communication and presentation skills, social science (BDS) and Preventive Dentistry and Comprehensive Dentistry (BCD) are present in the curricula, these profile should be extended to align the curricula to future upcoming demographic requirements. Therefore, more content of preventive dentistry subjects and more interdisciplinary teaching should be implemented, e.g. geriatric dentistry, multimorbidity/multimедication as cross section lecture together with teaching staff from internal medicine and pharmacology and pain management as cross section lecture together with pain therapists, neurologists, neurosurgeons and psychosomatic experts should be implemented in the curriculum and the intended learning outcomes. Also, methodological and general skills should be considered (**Finding 3**).

The ILOs address both academic/scientific and labour market requirements, but nevertheless some aspects should be made more explicit to inform the students and to sharpen the profiles of the programmes (**Finding 4**). It became quite clear during the site visit that these two areas are covered but they are not transparent for students and stakeholders due to a lack of description in the programme handbook. The students are also interested in more research related input in undergraduate training. Therefore, the ILOs should be revised in order to sharpen the profile of the programmes.

Feedback from the labour market is collected by the Faculty. The labour market representatives which discussed with the panel of expert during the site visit explained that there are hardly any complaints about the graduates of Ain Shams and they perform well in the different areas of the labour market. The cooperation with the syndicate is very smooth. The syndicate considers the education at Ain Shams as very appropriate. It would be favourable to summarize data and information on the graduates and inform the public about the success of the graduates. It would be important to know who of the graduates is employed in which area of the labour market and how many graduates stay in Egypt respective work abroad (**Finding 5**).

The curricular structure of the programmes is clear and pays attention to the learner's progression. There is no doubt that the learning outcomes of the programmes can be achieved. It is very helpful that every student an academic adviser is assigned. However, the dropout rate must be clearly outlined and should also be specified. The dropout rate should be presented as the difference in a distinct cohort at the very beginning and at the end of the programme or the figures must be explained in case a different calculation is used (**Finding 6**).

During the pandemic years, online education was offered. Beside this no specific elements are included in the curriculum. The mandatory internship is mentioned above. All curricular elements (courses) including their functions, their compulsory or elective character and their usage are documented. An idealised typical course plan is available.

Specific Comment on BDS: see above.

Specific Comment on BCD: The annual fee of is 50.000- 65.000 EGP. The faculty should specify which factors are relevant for individual charge.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

Bachelor's degree

The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.

A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.

The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.

Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

Description

Ain Shams University and the Faculty of Dentistry followed the National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAA) framework to provide the necessary training and technical support to ensure a continuous quality improvement policy. On the central level there is a Quality Unit which publishes aggregated results of the internal QA system and exchanges with the QA units at the faculties.

As stated in the SER, the faculty of dentistry adopts the minimum competencies for undergraduate programmes (NARS). The Faculty of Dentistry was evaluated in terms of its mission and declared strategic goals based on the criteria for the accreditation of colleges and universities (version 2015) established by the NAQAA. National reaccreditation was obtained again in 2021 (postponed due to the Covid-19 lockdown pandemic). In the Egyptian system, re-accreditation takes place every five years. To achieve a comprehensive quality management system, the Faculty of Dentistry (i) established a Quality Assurance Unit (QAU) in 2009, an independent entity reporting directly to the Dean of the Faculty. (ii) assignment of representatives of different categories, (iii) establishment of a quality assurance culture and (iv) establishment of an executive council of the QAU. The executive council consists of the executive director of the quality assurance unit, the deputy executive director, heads of executive committees, quality coordinators of the scientific departments, standards coordinators, administrators, students, and a graduate. The QAU is headed by a president and 12 vice presidents responsible for 12 standards that are reviewed during the accreditation process: strategic planning, leadership and governance, quality management and development, faculty and support staff, administrative staff, financial and material resources, academic standards and educational programmes, teaching and learning, students and alumni, scientific research and scientific activities, postgraduate studies, and community participation and environmental development.

In addition to the quality coordinators of the scientific departments, four committees emerged from the unit to enable implementation: the committee of internal audit, the committee of training and publication for quality culture, the committee of questionnaire design and execution and analysis, and the committee of student participation. The unit's board of directors meets monthly to discuss the unit's tasks and committee reports. Students, faculty members, alumni, physicians of hospital internships, and patients visiting the college clinics carry out surveys on improvement, satisfaction, and workload annually. All surveys are analysed and sent to faculty administration for discussion and for implementing necessary modifications. Members of the labour market, including some representatives of health institutions and various social parties, participate in the decisions of the faculty council: chief physician of the armed forces, member of the dental syndicate, director of the central department of dentistry in the Ministry of Health, head of the central administration for the dental sector, and consultant of clinical dentistry programme. Each programme and course has an external auditor and reviewer

who reports annually on that programme and participates in its specifications and changes as necessary. The annual reports and results of the quality assurance process are published after they have been passed and approved by the faculty council and made accessible to all those involved in the faculty.

The faculty also has an Ethics Committee, FDASU, responsible for the faculty code of ethics and a policy formulated and approved by the faculty. The committee considers students, staff, and applicants for admission or employment based on individual ability and achievement.

Experts' evaluation

After a careful review of the available information and an on-site visit, it is evident that the quality assurance procedures at the Faculty of Dentistry of Ain Shams University exhibit several positive aspects. However, there are opportunities for further improvement to enhance the comprehensiveness and transparency of the quality assurance system. It is worth noting that the Faculty of Dentistry has shown alignment with the university's policy and associated procedures, although providing more clarity and documentation would ensure consistency and adherence to university standards. The Quality Assurance System of the Faculty should be described transparently and also the interlinkage between the central QA level and the faculty level should be made more explicit. The results of the QA procedures should be published in an aggregated manner to inform the stakeholders (**Finding 7**).

The current quality assurance system covers various scopes, including course and programme evaluations, student workload assessments, progression and completion rates, and other evaluation tools. This comprehensive approach allows for a thorough assessment of the educational programmes. While there are defined responsibilities and targets for monitoring and revising programmes, further refinement would ensure their effectiveness in supporting continuous quality enhancement. Concrete measures are needed to enhance quality and address identified findings. While some measures are already in place, establishing a systematic approach that includes the development of action plans based on evaluation results and their effective implementation would drive improvements and ensure the delivery of high-quality educational programmes (**Finding 8**).

The involvement of stakeholders, both internal and external, including students, student advisory bodies/groups, labor market representatives, and alumni, is commendable. Collecting feedback through surveys, meetings, and continuous exchanges demonstrates a commitment to inclusivity and continuous improvement. The collection of labour market information from various sources is a positive aspect, although further details are necessary to assess the extent and effectiveness of this data collection. It is crucial to ensure comprehensive and up-to-date information to align programmes with the current needs of the academia on one hand and with the industry on the other hand (see below).

Measures to safeguard academic integrity and prevent academic fraud are acknowledged within the programme, which is commendable.

The analysis of statistical data on students' progression, including study duration, student composition, completion rates, grade distribution, and exam outcomes, is crucial for programme development. However, further information is required to fully evaluate the extent and effectiveness of this analysis. To address this, it is recommended to establish robust systems for data analysis and ensure regular monitoring of key metrics (**Finding 9**). This will provide valuable insights for decision-making and facilitate programme improvement.

In conclusion, the evaluation of the quality assurance procedures at the Faculty of Dentistry of Ain Shams University identifies several positive aspects. However, there is still room for improvement to enhance the overall effectiveness of the system. Recommendations include focusing on enhancing documentation and

clarity in processes, publishing results in an aggregated manner, strengthening data analysis, and embracing evidence-based practices. By implementing these recommendations, the faculty can further enhance the effectiveness and transparency of its quality assurance procedures, ensuring continuous improvement in dental education. It is crucial to align the procedures with EU and Bologna standards to ensure compatibility and maintain high-quality educational programmes for students.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

Bachelor's degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

The Faculty of Dentistry has a teaching, learning and assessment concept that was regularly reviewed, further developed, and approved by the Faculty Council in 2012 and updated and accredited by the Council in 2019. According to SER, various methods of teaching and learning are used, including traditional direct methods such as lectures and practical lessons, interactive education, experimental education (field training), and self-learning (e.g., using instructional videos and oral and maxillofacial surgery to practice various surgical suturing methods on a sponge). The faculty administration has introduced simulation labs for the conservative, endodontics, and prosthodontics departments. These labs aim to increase the training efficiency of the students before they work in the clinics as an example of experiential education. Students are trained in treating patients with modern equipment and methods to provide the graduates with the necessary skills as one of the desired learning outcomes. Each course in the programme specifies its clinical requirements and the number of cases to be treated under the direct supervision of the teaching staff. Students with special needs, e.g., mental, visual, hearing and motor disabilities, do not participate in the programmes. The faculty considers the existence of reasonable opportunities for people with minor disabilities.

The faculty uses different methods to evaluate students, such as written, practical, clinical, oral, etc. Additional theory exam questions, such as short essays and single-best answer questions (MCQs), are used. To implement evaluation transparency in oral examinations, most departments use the examination card system to form examination boards consisting of two faculty members for each student. The practical and clinical exams follow the approach of marking points and rubrics announced and known to the student before the exams. In addition, there is an assessment by an external faculty examiner for the oral and practical examinations in various departments.

The faculty follows specific mechanisms to ensure the compatibility and linking of exams to Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) and to balance the distribution of grades across different subjects using blueprints. ILOs measure students' knowledge and understanding, intellectual abilities, practical and clinical skills, and general and transferable skills through two or three tests/semester, midterm exam, clinical/laboratory work and final oral, practical and written exams. The examination dates and times are announced to the students according

to the study plan examined by the University Council and communicated to the students at the beginning of the academic year. The faculty issues the examination management manual, which regulates the examination procedure, the working methods of the examination supervisors and other regulations for the publication of the results and transmission of the grades.

Experts' evaluation

The University provides a range of learning and practice opportunities to help students achieve their learning outcomes. In addition to lectures, students are offered practical exercises with high-quality equipment and materials. The University also has an online learning platform where students can complete study tasks and practice independently. The panel of experts had the chance to test the website at the on-site visit and found it informative and beneficial.

Depending on the subject, the University offers different facilities for practical learning under supervision, such as Conservative, Endodontic, and Prosthetic dentistry. The panel of experts noticed that the theoretical learning content is well-organized and complements the practical exercises. In addition to practical and oral examinations during the semester, there is an annual final examination that can be retaken during the summer or autumn. These exams usually consist of single or multiple-choice questions. If a student fails multiple times, they may not be able to progress to the next semester. This type of final exam format is common in European medical and dental schools.

Students receive information about their courses and exams through both in-person communication and online channels. At the on-site visit the panel of experts founds that students are well-informed about their studies. The University also takes special care of students with specific needs, such as left-handers, socially disadvantaged individuals, and those with medical problems. Both the teaching staff and students confirmed that the faculty is responsive to special cases and provides support. However, it is worth noting that this information is not written or documented. The university should have transparent and published regulations or mitigating circumstances to compensate for disadvantages, illness, or absence and address also students with special needs (**Finding 10**).

Overall, the panel of experts observed that both programmes effectively communicate their knowledge. However, some of the learning content may not be up to date (see above). The University employs various theoretical and practical teaching methods that adequately prepare students for their future work as dentists in clinical settings.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification

Bachelor's degree

Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.

[ESG 1.4]

Description

According to the SER, enrolment in the Faculty of Dentistry requires the student to have the Egyptian General Secondary Education Certificate or equivalent certificates or degrees (American Diploma, French Baccalaure-

ate or IGCSE) recognised by the Egyptian Ministry of Higher Education with qualification grades according to the guidelines issued annually set by the Ministry of Higher Education. The qualification degrees are published in the official newspapers and websites of the Ministry of Higher Education. There are no additional prerequisites for participation in the programmes. Students are selected based on the number of places available and the best grades. For the Clinical Dentistry major, all students should pass the TOEFL certification by the educational authorities and the medical exam required by the faculty council.

No transfers are accepted from relevant faculties with regulations other than those of Ain Shams University Faculty of Dentistry. Transfers are restricted to first and second years and are only accepted by Ain Shams University Faculty of Medicine and Faculty of Pharmacy. To reduce alienation, 5% of Egyptian high school graduates admitted by the Egyptian Coordination Office in the same year are nominated for the first year only. The faculty accepts student transfers from other universities within Egypt and abroad. Applicants transferring from other educational institutions must provide an official transcript from the applicant's former faculty detailing the curriculum and official grades achieved. Students who have been academically discharged from a state or private University cannot enrol in the programmes. For the Bachelor of Clinical Dentistry, the transferred student should study at least six semesters in this programme to obtain the degree. Transfer to the Bachelor of Dental Medicine and Surgery programme will be accepted if at most 60% of the total number of credit hours and meeting the admission requirements in that academic year. The reversal is also taken after the calculation of the study credits.

Students who are unable to attend specific courses or examinations due to an emergency, prolonged illness or sudden disability are supported during their studies by postponing coursework and catching up on missing teaching and examination content after submission of the necessary forensic and medical documents. In general, students must attend at least (75%) of the practical/clinical sessions and submit the requirements for each course. Students who do not achieve this minimum attendance rate can be excluded from taking part in examinations in this specific degree programme on the recommendation of the faculty and department councils. The grade for this course is "failed" unless the student excuses the absence as "acceptable absence", whereby the grades of the immanent examinations are included in the overall grade after the catch-up examination. Students must pass all subjects of the academic year to advance to the following year. Students who fail in one or at most two subjects in the first semester of the academic year can take the repeat examination in the second semester. If the repeat examination is not passed in one or both courses, the student fails the following year, keeps the same grade for the next year and repeats the examinations in the failed courses.

To pass a course in the Dentistry and Surgery Bachelor's programme, the grades must be above the pass rate (60%), provided that at least 30% of the grade in the final written exam is achieved. Students who achieve less than 30% of the grade in the final examination will not be graded in this course, and they will be considered "failed" with an overall grade of "very weak" in this course.

The non-technical courses required by the University in the 1st year are: English language 1, computer operation, professional ethics; in year 2: human rights, first aid and infection control; in the 3rd year: research and analytical skills, communication, and presentation skills; in the 4th year: social science, English language 2, with a passing grade of 50%. The grades are not added to the total rate.

The Clinical Dentistry programme follows the Egyptian credit hour system. Two or more lab hours may count as one credit hour. As a rule, academic success results from combining a grade for the class work (requirements and course-related examinations) and a final grade exam (written, oral and practical). The distribution of grades depends on the type of course. The pass rate in each course in the written exam is 30%. A student's academic performance for a semester is expressed by the grade point average (GPA). Graduates should have a cumulative grade point average (CGPA) of no less than 2.00 and attend at least six semesters.

The academic year is divided into three semesters: 2 semesters of 15 weeks each and a summer semester of 8 weeks each for failed students who, after consultation with the study advisor and faculty council, have to raise their average grade; however, it should not exceed two courses for one student. The maximum academic load for each student in each semester is between a minimum of 12 credit hours and a maximum of several credits as specified in the programme curriculum. However, the maximum load depends on the student's academic performance. If the student's CGPA is decreased, the load is lowered until the student can raise it to the accepted standard. Students can deregister from a specific course (or courses) if they cannot complete it within the first eight weeks of the semester after submitting the withdrawal form after consultation with the academic advisor.

For full registration as a dentist through the Egyptian Dental Syndicate it is required, that upon completing all five years of study, the graduate of the dentistry programmes must complete a twelve-month continuous internship which is not part of the study programme. The internship includes didactic and clinical training, patient management and treatment, personnel administration, and practice management under mentor guidance. After completing the twelve-month practical year, graduates of both programmes receive a Bachelor's certificate with an official transcript of the individual courses and the respective grades of the five-year study period, as well as a practical training certificate of the internship.

Experts' evaluation

The formal requirements for admission and the specific prerequisites for individual study programmes are clearly defined and made available to prospective students. The prerequisites for enrolment in the Faculty of Dentistry at Ain Shams University include having the Egyptian General Secondary Education Certificate or equivalent certificates or degrees (American Diploma, French Baccalaureate or IGCSE) recognised by the Egyptian Ministry of Higher Education with qualification grades according to the guidelines issued annually by the Ministry of Higher Education.

The selection criteria are also explicitly stated. Students are selected based on the number of places available and the best grades. For the Clinical Dentistry major, all students must pass the TOEFL certification and a medical exam.

The information on these requirements is disseminated through the official newspapers and websites of the Ministry of Higher Education, making it accessible to prospective students. Transfers from other institutions follow defined criteria and steps as well.

Moreover, students in the Clinical Dentistry programme are required to pass a medical exam. This prerequisite may be significant for ensuring that students can handle the physical demands and rigors of the profession, as well as for safety reasons, both for the students and for the patients they will handle in the course of their study.

The institution accepts student transfers from other universities within Egypt and abroad. Applicants transferring from other educational institutions must provide an official transcript from their former faculty detailing the curriculum and the official grades achieved. This indicates a process of recognizing previously acquired knowledge and skills. However, no transfers are accepted from relevant faculties with regulations other than those of Ain Shams University Faculty of Dentistry. Transfers are restricted to first and second years and are only accepted by Ain Shams University Faculty of Medicine and Faculty of Pharmacy.

For the Bachelor of Clinical Dentistry, a transferred student should study at least six semesters in the programme to obtain the degree. Transfer to the Bachelor of Dental Medicine and Surgery programme will be

accepted if at most 60% of the total number of credit hours have been covered elsewhere and the admission requirements for that academic year are met.

There are several mechanisms in place at the Ain Shams University Faculty of Dentistry that could facilitate student mobility:

1. Transfers: The university accepts student transfers from other universities within Egypt and abroad. Transfers are typically restricted to the first and second years of the programme and are primarily accepted from Ain Shams University's Faculty of Medicine and Faculty of Pharmacy.
2. Credit Transfer: The university allows the transfer of credit hours from other institutions to certain programmes. This is contingent on the student meeting specific conditions, such as not exceeding 60% of the total number of credit hours for the Bachelor of Dental Medicine and Surgery programme.
3. Internship: The university requires students to complete a twelve-month continuous internship programme as a prerequisite for full registration as a dentist through the Egyptian Dental Syndicate. This could potentially facilitate mobility, as students might have the opportunity to undertake this internship in different locations.

Upon completion of their studies, graduates from the Faculty of Dentistry, Ain Shams University receive the following documents:

1. Graduation Certificate (Arabic / English) - This is likely a formal confirmation of the completion of the study programme and the degree awarded.
2. Detailed Transcript of Records (Arabic / English) - This document lists the individual courses taken and the respective grades achieved over the course of the five-year study period. It provides a detailed record of the student's academic performance.
3. Certificate of Good Conduct (English only) - This document typically attests to the character and behavior of the graduate.
4. Diploma Supplement - This document usually provides detailed information about the degree programme completed, including learning outcomes, the level of the studies, and the national academic context. It facilitates the recognition of qualifications and promotes transparency.
5. Cumulative Ranking Certificate (Arabic / English) - This document could represent a graduate's rank in relation to their cohort or a cumulative grade point average (GPA) for their degree programme.

Also, after completing the twelve-month practical internship, graduates receive a practical training certificate of the internship. This likely documents the skills and experience gained during this period.

In the opinion of the panel of experts, these documents seem to provide transparent information on the qualification gained, including learning outcomes, national context, level, and status of the studies.

The panel of experts comes to the conclusion that Ain Shams University/Faculty of Dentistry has mechanisms in place for student admission, progression, recognition, and certification. These mechanisms are detailed and follow defined criteria. They include an admission process, transfer rules, support for students facing emergencies, assessment and grading systems, and the provision of several documents upon graduation.

However, there are areas that should be improved or more detailed information are needed:

The university should implement a policy how prior learning or/and informal learning is recognized, which is important for facilitating student mobility and broadening access to education (**Finding 11**).

The university's practices regarding credit transfer and recognition of qualifications from national and international universities should be compared with other institutions and where possible aligned with international principles like the Lisbon Recognition Convention (**Finding 12**).

However, it is recommended to support the mobility of the students with a clear table which allows the comparison of workload and credits between the Egyptian Credit Point System and the European Credit System. By showing the ECTS points, for example also in the graduation documents, the university would further enhance transparency and facilitate international recognition of the qualification (see **Finding 2**).

Therefore, while the university fulfils many aspects of the criterion, there are aspects that could be enhanced or require further information.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff

Bachelor's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

The number of scientific employees in 2022/2023 is 49 plus 154 teaching assistants, as stated in the SER. For the academic years 2021-2022 the number of students in the BDS was 2,381 and 300 for the BCD. Assistant lecturers are promoted after earning a Master's degree in the speciality in less than five years after being hired by the faculty. The regulations stipulate that the previous position must be held for at least five years before an assistant professor or professor appointment can occur. The promotion requires a scientific committee to evaluate five to eight published research articles. However, staffing shortages can still happen due to leave, deputations, and the ever-increasing number of students enrolling in the faculty programmes.

External lecturers are often invited for some courses that may require specialised speakers. The Faculty of Dentistry approaches national research centres and other dental and medical faculties which are important sources of experts in various related fields. Through the University Organization Act, teaching assistants are regularly selected from highly graded and qualified graduates from the Faculty of Dentistry at Ain Shams University.

The number of students determines the demand of staff and teaching assistants. Required staff must be contracted (represented) by other dental teaching organisations (faculty), and new teaching assistants must be hired as part of new graduate recruitment processes. Staff recruitment is expected to keep pace with the faculty's five-year plan. Positions are usually advertised on the faculty's official website and in national media. The selection procedure includes a pre-selection of all candidates who have been objectively evaluated against criteria, fair-scoring interviews for a subsequent comprehensive evaluation, evaluation and comparison, and final decision-making and announcement.

The training and development needs of staff and teaching assistants are regularly reviewed through annual meetings and questionnaires. Ain-Shams University's Training and Development Unit (TDU) focuses on developing junior professionals' teaching skills and improving senior members' teaching skills. TDU provides faculty members with targeted expertise and training to incorporate updated technologies into their teaching strategies and assessments to achieve research excellence (e.g., e-learning, presentation skills, etc.). Every staff member attends at least one workshop per year. The continuing education unit offers many advanced courses in dental specialities (implantology, fixed prosthodontics, endodontics, etc.). Infection control and first aid courses are also offered. The Faculty of Medicine, Ain-Shams University, provides a one-year diploma in infection control, quality assurance, hospital management, and healthcare quality excellence.

Experts' evaluation

The leadership of the Faculty of Dentistry at Ain-Shams University together with its staff is well interacting with the Faculty of Medicine and the University institutions.

The number of teaching staff and teaching assistants is appropriate to serve the needs of the student body. The teaching staff also appears appropriately qualified with regards to the intended learning outcomes of the programmes. Several members of the teaching staff are also teaching at other universities or have a private clinic. The staff student ratio works out well but if the number of admitted students will rise it might be to a shortcoming of teaching staff. A deficiency of the quality of teaching should be avoided in the future.

The Faculty of Dentistry has provided a full list of all teaching staff involved in the programmes, including their academic qualification but not their fields of research or other relevant qualifications, the number of teaching hours and the duration of future employment. Should contracts expire to a high amount teaching would be endangered.

The qualification process of the teaching staff is clearly described. As a part of an ongoing process all staff members undergo at least one meeting per year to explore their training and developmental needs including a questionnaire. The workload of the staff which is involved in teaching, research, student consultancy and administration is high. The recruitment process for teaching staff is aligned to an annual analysis of the teaching load which was provided in the SER as reference percentage. However, in the recruitment process of teaching staff especially the process of decision making should be more specified concerning transparency and composition of the decision-making body (**Finding 13**). The process of acknowledgment of qualification in academic teaching of external/guest lecturers involved in the study programme for specialized topics should also be specified, e.g. is there a conformation body of the Faculty or is the confirmation given by the individual academic representative of the speciality (**Finding 14**). This should also include how external lecturers are made familiar with the requirements of the study programme.

The Faculty of Dentistry has provided a concept for staff development and established a designated Development and Training Unit (DTU). It should be specified to which extent the various staff members including administrative and supporting staff used short term and long term training programmes and if there is an evaluation procedure (**Finding 15**). For a targeted academic staff development research aspects should be taken into consideration to a greater extent. Ideally the research profile of the Faculty of Dentistry should in part match the research profile of the Faculty of Medicine, however additional specific dental research focuses can also help to demonstrate a more visible research profile. This could help to attract academic staff from other universities and also from foreign countries.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support

Bachelor's degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

According to the SER, the faculty provides learning resources such as adequately equipped lecture halls, laboratories, and clinics. These resources are revised annually to reflect the number of students. The faculty has a state-of-the-art digital centre, a laser unit, a stem cell research centre, a simulation laboratory, an implantology centre and a cleft care centre. In addition to a central sterilisation unit, an operating room for general anaesthesia, and a radiology centre with state-of-the-art cone beam computed tomography (CBCT) radiography; there is also a radiological panoramic and lateral cephalometry machine. Various purchasing companies offer regular maintenance contracts in addition to the daily maintenance teams of the faculty. Internal and external audits are conducted annually to ensure the efficiency of all clinical and laboratory units.

The faculty library includes several original textbooks and internet servers connected to the Egyptian Knowledge Bank (EKB), which every student can access via faculty email. The EKB is an online library archive and resource that provides educators, re-searchers and students with learning resources and tools.

Every 25 students have an academic supervisor supporting them with their educational needs. At the beginning of the year, students receive a handbook with information on the course descriptions and a clear explanation of the study regulations. The manual is updated annually and serves as a guide. A student advisory Unit has been set up to provide students with academic, mental and psychological support, especially for students in exceptional circumstances such as international students, exchange students, students with children, students in extraordinary emergency or accident situations, certain illnesses or disabilities during their studies, etc.

Experts' evaluation

Based on the evaluation by the panel of experts, the resources and equipment provided by Ain Shams University are of a high standard and more than sufficient to support the programmes and patient treatment. The well-maintained 378 units and the utilization of CAD/CAM technology are appreciated. The teaching staff is well qualified, motivated, and contributing to a positive overall impression of the human resources available in both programmes.

Student support within the faculty is well-organized, encompassing various aspects such as academic support, financial assistance, and psychological consultancy. Students receive guidance and advice on academic matters, and each student has an academic advisor available for weekly consultations. The academic advisors proactively reach out to students at the beginning of the academic year to encourage them to share any problems they may have. The psychology unit is also available to offer support and counselling services. Financial consultancy is provided to address any questions or concerns. The analysis of student complaints demonstrates a commitment to addressing their needs and concerns. Medical support is provided to students when needed. While the library offers a limited space for academic literature, the availability of online resources compensates for this limitation.

The evaluation recognizes the significant number of patients visiting the Faculty of Dentistry. This offers students the opportunity to gain practical experience and apply their theoretical knowledge in a real-world setting.

The interaction between patients and students creates a mutually beneficial relationship, as patients receive free treatment while students acquire valuable clinical skills.

In conclusion, the evaluation by the panel indicates that the Faculty of Dentistry at Ain Shams University provides ample learning resources and comprehensive support for students. The faculty's commitment to maintaining high standards in education and student well-being ensures an enriching and supportive learning environment.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information

Bachelor's degree

Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.

[ESG 1.8]

Description

According to SER, information is presented on the faculty's official website, Facebook page and student handbook. All guidelines of various quality assurance committees are published in paper form in the quality assurance office and online on the faculty's website. The course descriptions of the undergraduate programmes and the credit hours are posted on the faculty homepage and in the respective departments. In addition to the programme specifications, objectives, ILOs, learning and assessment methods, all exams are provided with their sample answers and exam schedules.

Experts' evaluation

The faculty disseminates information through brochures and the internet. The printed guidelines, which are provided in physical form, contain up-to-date information regarding study subjects and workload. However, it seems that the website, which is available in both English and Arabic, is not consistently updated. Unfortunately, no specific details about either programme were found on the website. It is important to ensure that the website is regularly updated and that clear and transparent information about both programmes is readily available (**Finding 16**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the Bachelor programme “Dental Medicine and Surgery” offered by Ain Shams University with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the Bachelor programme “Clinical Dentistry” offered by Ain Shams University with conditions.

Commendation:

The teaching staff is well qualified and motivated so that the panel of experts got an overall very convincing impression of the human resources available in both programmes. The students of both programmes seem to be well trained and prepared to become dental professionals. The support of students is well organized, and this refers to the academic support as well as to the university wide aspects. An overwhelming number of patients visit the Faculty of Dentistry, creating a mutually beneficial arrangement: patients receive complimentary treatment while students gain hands-on training with actual patients.

Findings:

1. A lab to train basic surgical skills e.g. suture technique should also be implemented.
2. A clear table which allows the comparison of workload between the Egyptian Credit Point System and the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) must be provided.
3. More content of preventive dentistry subjects and more interdisciplinary teaching should be implemented, e.g. geriatric dentistry, multimorbidity/multimedication as cross section lecture together with teaching staff from internal medicine and pharmacology and pain management as cross section lecture together with pain therapists, neurologists, neurosurgeons and psychosomatic experts. These issues should also be described in the intended learning outcomes in the course descriptions. Also, methodological and general skills should be considered.
4. The ILOs must be described more explicitly and also include aspects of research and the labour market orientation. The quality of the course descriptions should be aligned.
5. It is recommended to summarize data and information on the graduates and inform the public about the success of the graduates.
6. The dropout rate should be clearly outlined, specified and explained.
7. The Quality Assurance System of the Faculty should be described transparently and also the interlinkage between the central QA level and the faculty level should be made more explicit. The outcomes of the QA system should be presented to the stakeholders in an aggregated manner.
8. A systematic approach that includes the development of action plans based on evaluation results and their effective implementation should be implemented to drive improvements and ensure the delivery of high-quality educational programmes.
9. It is recommended to establish robust systems for data analysis and ensure regular monitoring of key metrics.

10. The university should have transparent and published regulations or mitigating circumstances to compensate for disadvantages, illness, or absence and address also students with special needs.
11. The university should implement a policy how prior learning or/and informal learning is recognized, which is important for facilitating student mobility and broadening access to education.
12. The university should adapt its practices regarding credit transfer and recognition of qualifications from other institutions to what is done at other institutions and, if possible, align its policy with international principles like the Lisbon Recognition Convention.
13. In the recruitment process of teaching staff especially the process of decision making should be more specified concerning transparency and composition of the decision-making body.
14. The process of acknowledgment of qualification in academic teaching of external/guest lecturers involved in the study programme for specialized topics should also be specified. This should also include how external lecturers are made familiar with the requirements of the study programme.
15. It should be specified to which extent the various staff members including administrative and supporting staff used short term and long term training programmes and if there is an evaluation procedure. For a targeted academic staff development research aspects should be taken into consideration to a greater extent.
16. It is important to ensure that the website is regularly updated and that clear and transparent information about both programmes is readily available.