AQAS AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI PADANG

CLUSTER EDUCATION

ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION
(BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

SPECIAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

NON-FORMAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

EDUCATIONAL TECHNOLOGY (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

EDUCATIONAL SCIENCE (DOCTOR)

TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (DOCTOR)

December 2022

Q

Content

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **SPECIAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **NON-FORMAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **EDUCATIONAL TECHNOLOGY (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **EDUCATIONAL SCIENCE (DOCTOR)**

- **TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (DOCTOR)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI PADANG, PADANG, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the comments by the university and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 15th meeting on 5 December 2022, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes "**Elementary School Teacher Education**" (Bachelor of Education), "**Special Education**" (Bachelor of Education), "**Non-Formal Education**" (Bachelor of Education), "**Educational Technology**" (Bachelor of Education), "**Educational Science**" (Doctor) and "**Technical Vocational Education**" (Doctor) offered by **Universitas Negeri Padang**, **Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

   The accreditations are conditional.

   The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **31 December 2023**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.

3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **31 December 2028**.

Conditions:

For all study programmes:

1. UNP must provide evidence on the Act-stage of its quality assurance procedures by providing English summaries of the tracer studies for each study programme at least of the last three years and by demonstrating how this and other data is used and analysed to improve the study programmes.

2. UNP must provide evidence on the implementation of a student-centred approach to learning and teaching by providing full lesson plans (RPS), evidence of the active and experiential teaching and learning

processes, and evidence of teaching and learning facilities specifically supporting a student-centred approach.

3. The course descriptions must be improved; the difference between "content" and "learning outcomes" must be made clearer and the level of details must be comparable between different courses.

For the study programme "Education Technology" (Bachelor):

4. UNP must present a development plan, linked to the results of the quality assurance evaluations, to improve the quality of teaching and learning approaches in the next years focusing on the improvement of teaching and learning facilities and on the improvement of lecturers' quality and competencies (including refresher courses, seminars, benchmarking, study abroad scholarship, etc.).

For the study programme "Educational Science" (Doctor):

5. UNP must present different pathways to complete the PhD programme in Educational Science for the different types of students (gifted Bachelor's graduates with the fast-track procedure, Master's graduates, employed teachers).

For the study programme "Technical Vocational Education" (Doctor):

6. The curriculum of must cover more scientific issues of VET research including theories, comparative analysis of VET systems, etc.

7. UNP must provide additional information regarding the attainment of the intended Programme Learning Outcomes by providing additional student works and additional examples of publications.

8. UNP must show the fitness for purpose of the curriculum for the student body by providing information on the make-up of the student body (including previous Master's degree, previous university, GPA etc.) and an overview of the curriculum of UNP's VET Master's programme. Changes to the curriculum and/or the entry requirements might be necessary.

9. UNP must provide a *full* list of all teaching staff involved, including details on their academic qualification, their research and other relevant qualifications related to VET, the number of teaching hours, and the duration of employment.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all study programmes:

1. The study programmes should strengthen their interdisciplinary approach and develop more cooperation between departments and subjects.

2. The curriculum development process at UNP should make sure to constantly review and include fast-paced changes in industry and science related to the defined graduate profiles. Corresponding opportunities for staff development should be provided.

3. UNP should improve the teaching and learning processes further and provide even more active and experiential learning to its students. Staff should be supported by other staff as role models/champions in implementing new learning and teaching approaches.

4. UNP should actively and resolutely improve the English competencies of both staff and students.

5. In line with its internationalisation goals, UNP should develop an internationalisation plan for its Education study programmes. It should include steps to substantially raise the internationalisation of the study

programmes and address academic and student exchanges, PhD and research cooperation, language competencies and the involvement of internationally trained lecturers.

6. In line with its internationalisation goals, UNP should provide complete information on its study pro-grammes online fully in English (including admission requirements).

7. UNP should hire more teaching staff with an international background and provide opportunities to current teaching staff to gather international experience.

8. Teaching staff should be given more time to conduct research and to gain additional qualifications, includ-ing completing a Doctorate for junior staff.

9. Additional funding should be provided to the university and faculty libraries in order to have a larger access to international literature.

For the Bachelor's study programmes:

10. Bachelor's students should receive additional training on academic writing prior to their final project, e.g., by including more essays as assessment form.

11. More senior teaching staff (up to full professors) should be involved in the Bachelor's programmes.

For the study programme "Special Education" (Bachelor):

12. In the next review of the curriculum, the programme leaders should emphasise the aspects of participation and inclusion considering the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.

13. The fact that all levels and all kinds of disability are dealt with in the Special Education curriculum should be highlighted in the relevant study programme documents.

14. The Special Education study programme should consider theoretical references as well as international input and developments more often, e.g., by providing access to and referring to more international litera-ture and by supporting international cooperations.

For the study programme "Non-Formal Education" (Bachelor):

15. In the curriculum, more emphasis should be put on theoretical aspects such as learning theory and con-cepts of non-formal education.

For the study programme "Educational Technology" (Bachelor):

16. The curriculum should be adapted to include topics related to emerging technologies for education such as the application of contemporary learning theories for learning, including the contemporary information and communication technological developments such as artificial intelligence, internet of things, big data, augmented reality, virtual reality, extended reality (metaverse) etc.

For the study programme "Educational Science" (Doctor):

17. The fact that PhD candidates in Educational Science are trained in various methodologies and that they gain research competencies should be highlighted in the relevant study programme documents.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

EXPERTS' REPORT

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **SPECIAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **NON-FORMAL EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **EDUCATIONAL TECHNOLOGY (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **EDUCATIONAL SCIENCE (DOCTOR)**

- **TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (DOCTOR)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS NEGERI PADANG, PADANG, INDONESIA

Virtual visit to the university: 19-23 September 2022

Panel of experts:

Assoc.Prof. Dr. Uwes Anis Chaeruman, M.Pd	Universitas Negeri Jakarta (UNJ), Postgraduate Program, Area Educational Technology (Indonesia)
Prof. Dr. Dietmar Frommberger	University of Osnabrück, School of Educational and Cultural Studies, Institute of Education, Department of Research in Vocational Education and Training (VET) (Germany)
Univ.-Prof. Hon.-Prof. Dr. Reinhard Markowetz	LMU Munich, Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Department of Educational Sciences and Rehabilitation (Germany)
Prof. Dr. Anja Seifert	Justus Liebig University Giessen, Institute of childhood and school pedagogy (Germany)
Andrea Zöll	vhs-learning portal, German Adult Education Association (DVV e.V.), Bonn (Germany) (labour market representative)
Martin Schleef	Student at the Technical University of Dortmund (Germany) (student representative)

Coordinator:

Alexandre Wipf, Patrick Heinzer	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation supported by more than 90 universities, universities of applied sciences and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been recognised by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is, therefore, a notified body for the accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of academic studies and higher education institutions' teaching. In line with AQAS' mission statement, the official bodies in Germany and Europe (GAC and EQAR) approved that the activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor a particular type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the study programmes "Elementary School Teacher Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Special Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Non-Formal Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Educational Technology" (Bachelor of Education) as well as "Educational Science" (Doctor) and "Technical Vocational Education" (Doctor) offered by Universitas Negeri Padang, Indonesia.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD) respectively. The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in September 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In January 2022, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 21 February 2022. The final version of the SER was handed in June 2022.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in May 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a virtual site visit to the university took place on 19-23 September 2022. Online, the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 5 December 2022. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In January 2023, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Negeri Padang (UNP) was founded in 1954 as the Padang Teachers Training and Education Institute. It is a multi-campus university located in Padang, West Sumatra, Indonesia. UNP follows the principles of *Tri Dharma* or the three pillars of higher education being education, research and community service interlaced. The vision of UNP is to "Become an Internationally Dignified and Reputable University". Its missions are defined as 1) implement international quality education, 2) conduct innovative research and global publications, 3) perform community service to solve problems and contribute to the development of the Indonesian nation, 4) implement world-class university governance, and 5) implement international cooperation.

UNP has nine faculties (Education, Language and Arts, Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Social Sciences, Engineering, Sciences, Economics, Tourism and Hospitality, Psychology and Health) and offers a total of 107 study programmes: 17 Diploma III programmes, 4 Diploma IV programmes, 53 Bachelor's degree programmes, 23 Master's degree programmes, 8 doctoral programmes as well as 2 teacher certification programmes. Interdisciplinary Master's and doctoral programmes are offered by the Postgraduate School of UNP. UNP has close to 44,000 students and employs 1,245 lecturers and 695 staff.

The Faculty of Education is home to about 7,100 students and offers 13 study programmes including the Bachelor's programmes under review "Elementary School Teacher Education", "Special Education", "Non-Formal Education", and "Educational Technology". The doctoral programme "Educational Science" is offered by the Postgraduate School of UNP, which coordinates 3 Master's and 2 doctoral programmes in total. In the last academic year it had 186 Master's students and 192 PhD candidates. The Faculty of Engineering is responsible for the doctoral programme "Technical Vocational Education" next to 6 Diploma III programmes, 2 Diploma IV programmes, 10 Bachelor's programmes, one Master's programme. In total the faculty enrols 5,780 students.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*
>
> *The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*
>
> *[ESG 1.2]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
>
> *The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.*
>
> *The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*
>
> *[ESG 1.2]*

General information

UNP uses the national credit system for higher education, SKS or Semester Credit System. 1 SKS corresponds to 170 minutes of studies (for theory courses this includes 50 minutes of face-to-face meetings, 60 minutes of structured assignments and 60 minutes of independent activities; for practical courses this includes 100 minutes of face-to-face meetings and 70 minutes of independent activities). UNP converts SKS into ECTS on the basis of 1 SKS being equivalent to 1,51 ECTS. According to UNP's general academic guidelines, Bachelor's programmes should at least consist of 144 credits with a maximum length of studies of 14 semesters. PhD programmes usually cover 6 to 14 semesters with a workload of 42 to 48 credits.

According to information in the self-evaluation report, UNP follows the requirements of the Indonesian Qualifications Framework (KKNI) (Bachelor level 6, PhD level 9) - the Indonesian Qualifications Framework having been aligned to both the ASEAN Qualification Reference Framework (AQRF) (Bachelor level 5, PhD level 8) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) (Bachelor level 6, PhD level 8).

Generally, UNP states that it follows the principles of Outcome-Based Education (OBE) and thus considers the demands and needs of stakeholders in the science community and from the world of work. Learning outcomes at the level of the programmes are defined on the basis of Graduate Profiles/Programme Educational Objectives (PEO). Learning outcomes are divided in four categories: attitude, knowledge, general skills, and special skills. Course learning outcomes are developed to cover the learning outcomes at programme level. For each study programme there is a programme coordinator. In the 4 Bachelor's programmes UNP has implemented the national Independent Campus/Freedom to Learn (MBKM) policy, according to which, students can take courses and conduct activities outside of their own study programme (at other faculties, other universities, or off campus).

Elementary School Teacher Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The study programme "Elementary School Teacher Education" covers a total of 147 SKS over 7 semesters. The number of enrolments per year is set at 298 students. Upon completion students are awarded a Bachelor of Education degree or S.Pd.

According to the Programme Educational Objectives, students should be trained to develop into professional primary school teachers, be able to solve complex problems related to the field of elementary schools, show professional performance in the field of elementary schools, and develop their potential by continuing their education to a higher level.

UNP states in its self-evaluation report that the learning outcomes at programme level have been formulated considering the recommendations of the Indonesian Primary School Teacher Education Lecturers Association (HDPGSDI). The programme leaders have defined a total of 9 learning outcomes. Graduates should thus, among others, master the theoretical concepts of education which include curriculum development, educational learning theories and principles, approaches, strategies, models, methods, techniques, teaching materials, innovative learning media and resources, process evaluation techniques and learning outcomes, and counselling and guidance services in elementary schools. Graduates should also master basic concepts and research procedures that can help in solving educational problems in elementary schools. Students are to be trained to apply logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking in the context of the development or implementation of science and technology that pays attention to and applies humanities values in accordance with the field of elementary schools. They should also be able to apply knowledge across subjects in elementary schools which include Indonesian, Mathematics, Natural Sciences, Social Sciences, Pancasila and Citizenship

Education, and Cultural Arts and Crafts in depth in accordance with the development of science and technology by paying attention to local wisdom through design and implementation learning.

The curriculum is composed of 12 general courses (e.g. Indonesian, Pancasila Education), 3 pedagogical courses (Curriculum and Learning, Philosophy of Education, Education Inclusion), 38 courses on elementary teacher education content (e.g. Global Perspective, Mathematics Basics, IPS Learning Elementary, Classroom Management Fundamentals, Micro Teaching), 2 courses on integrated elementary teacher education content (Real Work Lecture, Practice Field Education), as well as 5 research courses (Research Education, Seminar Elementary School, Education Statistics, Writing Scientific, Thesis).

Experts' evaluation

From the students' point of view, the study programme is well-structured and the learning outcomes refer to their expectations. The number of courses is manageable and counselling lessons are available, especially while writing academic papers. Universitas Negeri Padang's Bachelor's programme of Elementary School Teacher Education offers a wide range of fields related and relevant subjects. This corresponds to the requirement of the field; yet interdisciplinary elements could be added to broaden the offer.

The curriculum is based on the Indonesian Qualifications Framework (IQF), which is related to the ASEAN Qualification Framework (AQRF) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The curriculum is well-structured, and the programme of courses is manageable. The curriculum is understood to be output-oriented and refers to the needs of the Indonesian labour market. Practice is evaluated as being very important. Especially, there is a good preparation before the internship for the teacher-students. Practice in teacher training focusses on the idea of providing a good preparation for their future job. There are specific preparation courses for the internships in which the students have to learn teaching methods. In these specific microteaching classes, the students can gather experience and receive detailed feedback which is a basic element of the preparation for the work with elementary school pupils. How to deal with heterogeneity is a big leading topic referring to differentiation and innovative teaching methods in teacher training and schooling. This refers to the academic "state of the art" and focusses on the need of contemporary schools. The internships are a relevant part of the curriculum.

UNP's elementary school teacher training refers to the specific school type of elementary school, which is the first level of the Indonesian educational system. Graduates only teach in Indonesian elementary schools, not in junior or senior high schools. There is no (previous) degree required for the admission. The programme BPESTE is very popular in Indonesia. A range of relevant subjects (from mathematics to Pancasila) for future classroom teachers (who are teaching nearly every subject) is obligatory for all students. The reference to theory and practice in the courses and the close relationship between theory and practice are very positive aspects. Also, UNP has collaborations with other universities nearby and visiting scholars are invited. Joint courses with other universities could be established (also digitally).

Besides the obligatory part of the curriculum, which is based on the ministry guidelines, students are free to choose courses from other universities. They also have the opportunity of extracurricular activities (e.g. they learn how to teach dance) and free phases of learning. The students seem to be very well prepared for practice and in practice. Also, the e-learning system and technical tools are part of the learning environment of the future elementary school teachers on campus. The structure and content of the Bachelor's programme are well described and were well explained by the staff members during the online site visit.

There are many facilities to support students' learning, above all the digital library, integrated laboratories, the language centre, and information and technology support. The programme offers specific elements such as the microteaching rooms, microteaching classes, and the community work. Before going to school to teach on their own as elementary school teachers, the students do peer-to-peer teaching in small groups guided and

counselled by an experienced lecturer. These elements are named in the curriculum. These are positive aspects.

More students apply for this Bachelor's programme than are accepted. In 2019, there were 10,446 applicants and 331 accepted; in 2021, there were 8,060 applicants and 529 accepted. There is also a high graduation rate for this Bachelor's programme. According to the positive feedback from the labour market, the future teachers bring the needed soft skills and hard skills. They show communication skills and knowledge of innovative teaching methods and approaches on a high level. Regular surveys are conducted on students' expectations and experiences, and stakeholders exchange information. The graduates of Padang University receive a high reputation and the students seem to perform well. The programme is experiencing a high demand. The elementary school teachers have no significant problem to find a job. The requirements of the labour market therefore seem to be fulfilled. The Bachelor's degree is sufficient for the regional labour market (school-teacher). Hence, there is no special need to continue with a further academic career (Master's degree).

The credit points are distributed among different relevant subjects and contents. Active and innovative approaches (e.g. case studies) are mentioned. New teaching and learning methods are used, as well as online platforms, different learning methods, learning in groups and self-learning phases. A course description (lesson plan) is available for each course for each semester. Information on the programme is provided online: The website is divided into a main website and a specific study programme website; yet more information in English would be helpful (see Chapter 7, **Finding 27**). The grading system seems to be clear and transparent for the students as well as for the staff. The relationship between lecturers and students within the programme seems to be very good, also the counselling system is very positive. The students receive support and guidance in many ways from the beginning of the study programme up to the end. The process of pedagogical professionalism is well guided by the staff. Further, the experts consider that the supervision is good and the recruitment process is described as transparent and fair.

The structure and workload are named and described transparently for the applicants. The workload is sufficient. The application and admission processes are also clear – for Indonesian secondary school students. Yet, it seems to be very complex, especially for applicants from outside Indonesia. There is the direct procedure after secondary school and a test procedure. Besides the national final exam (Hasil UAN), there are specific test procedures driven by the university. The admission could be better explained for foreigners from abroad who would like to apply in English for the programme (see Chapter 7, **Finding 27**).

In the view of the experts, the lack of qualified lecturers with own research experiences might be a problem. Many lecturers work without a doctorate, most have a Master's degree (many teachers in schools only have a Bachelor's degree). Even though this is broadly in line with Indonesian regulations, the experts believe that more senior staff is required, as well as more external staff (persons who have not completed their Bachelor's and/or Master's and/or PhD at UNP). In terms of internalisation it would help to put more emphasis on further qualifying UNP's own staff, referring to international standards in teacher training. Cooperation with teacher training programmes from outside Asia could be helpful for the process of qualification and curriculum development in Elementary school education and research (see Chapter 4, **Finding 20** and Chapter 5, **Finding 24**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Special Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The study programme "Special Education" covers a total of 145 SKS over 7 semesters. The number of enrolments per year is set at 174 students. Upon completion students are awarded a Bachelor of Education degree or S.Pd.

The overarching aim of the programme is to train students to become excellent teacher candidates and developers of learning technology in the field of education for children with special needs. Graduates should, first of all, be able to continue their education at reputable universities locally and abroad in the field of special education and scientific fields. Secondly, graduates should be able to advance their careers as professional teachers and become excellent educational resources. Thirdly, graduates should be able to use advances in technology and information to solve problems for children with special needs creatively and innovatively as a professional accomplishment. Fourthly and finally, graduates should be able to create a variety of business opportunities and jobs in the field of special education and other businesses as a social accomplishment.

UNP states in its self-evaluation report that the learning outcomes at programme level have been formulated considering the recommendations of the Indonesian Association of Special Education Professions. The programme leaders have defined a total of 10 learning outcomes. Graduates should master concepts, theories, principles, philosophy, foundations, and facts about education for children with special needs to become lifelong learners. They should also master the concepts, theories, philosophies, principles, and procedures of special education management and inclusive education for children with special needs. Graduates should, among others, be able to demonstrate independent, qualitative, and measurable performance, apply logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking, implement science, information and communication technology, and examine the implications of developing science, information and communication technology. They should also be able to conduct research, assessment or development of innovative work and disseminate it to improve the quality of learning and the development of special education.

The curriculum is composed of 12 general courses (e.g. Introduction Coding, Administration and Supervision Education), 3 pedagogical courses (Pedagogy/Community Education/Curriculum and Learning, Inclusive Education, Educational Philosophy), 37 courses on special education content (e.g. Perspectives on Education and Learning of Blind, Children with Autism, Build Communication, Sound Perception and Rhythm, Building of Movement, Management of Special Education), 2 courses on integrated special education content (Community Service Program, Educational Field Practice), as well as 4 research courses (Research Methods in Special Education, Statistic of Education, Scientific Writing, Thesis).

Experts' evaluation

The team responsible for the Special Education study programme is very engaged and well equipped to support the students and guide them in the learning process. Teaching staff includes lecturers with a PhD degree as well as professors who are capable to meet the demands of a research-based study programme. This is a positive aspect in the view of the experts. The intended learning outcomes correspond well with the expected competencies of Bachelor graduates according to the national and European qualifications frameworks.

The curriculum seems to be largely technology oriented. In the view of the experts, it would be desirable for the programme leaders to emphasise more strongly the aspects of participation and inclusion considering the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in the next programme review (**Finding 1**). This would bring added value for practice and address the real needs in and of society and schools. In this way, UNP could become a role model for other higher education institutions in Indonesia, as it is currently one of the few public universities to offer such a study programme. It would also visibly contribute to the goals of the UN Convention, which Indonesia ratified.

Generally, there is an emphasis on physical and sensory disability in the curriculum. The experts believe that the programme leaders could make more transparent and clearer that all types of disability and all degrees of disability are included and dealt with equally in the programme – and that students are thus trained in these various areas as well (**Finding 2**).

UNP could also improve the teaching and learning approaches used in the programme with a lesser focus on technical handling. This and the didactical approach of the lecturers in their lessons and in conveying the programmes' content could be depicted more clearly.

As mentioned in other parts of this report, the experts believe that more cooperation between the departments would be very beneficial. UNP should consider developing interdisciplinary cooperations between its different departments, so that the expertise of each department can support and expand the knowledge of the students of all study programmes under review in both directions (in this case, input from other departments for the students of Special Education, but also contributions from the Special Education department to other pro-grammes). This would be a qualitative improvement of the programmes (**Finding 3**). The programme leaders should exchange, for example with the department of Non-Formal Education, and compare their courses so that connections can be established, and synergies used.

The programme leaders should generally further improve the aspect of internationalisation. Study mobility is limited in this study programme. Students should be given more opportunities to study abroad for a period – which is then fully recognised in their programme. The overall framework at the university is adequate, but the experts believe that additional and new ideas and concepts are needed (see Chapter 4, **Finding 20**).

Since the students are trained for Indonesian schools and the Indonesian labour market, it is logical that there is a practical and a national focus in the department and in the studies. Nevertheless, the experts recommend that the department and the lecturers should consider not only more theoretical references as well as interna-tional expertise in both the studies and the curriculum (i.e. literature), but also consider developing coopera-tions. International input and cooperations in the region and with other continents would be beneficial for the further development of the programme (and of the discipline itself) (**Finding 4**). Practically, this would mean more international reference works in the library, more incoming students and lecturers, and more outgoing students and lecturers.

In conclusion, the experts have a very positive view of the programme. It is an attractive study programme with a high demand from the side of the students. Due to this success, only a third of the demand can be satisfised with the available study places.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Non-Formal Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The study programme "Non-Formal Education" covers a total of 148 SKS over 7 semesters. The number of enrolments per year is set at 100 students. Upon completion students are awarded a Bachelor of Education degree or S.Pd.

UNP states that graduates of the programme are expected to become educators in non-formal education, be creative and innovative, and able to use information technology in carrying out their duties and functions in various community empowerment activities. According to the graduate profiles, graduates should be able to develop their potential to become non-formal education academics who are actively involved in various studies

and research so that they can find various formulas, designs, models, and innovative strategies in the implementation of non-formal education and publish them in scientific forums. They should also be graduates who can develop their potential and demonstrate performance in managing non-formal education programme activities at institutions/companies as well as create various business opportunities and employment opportunities in other non-formal education sectors.

UNP states in its self-evaluation report that the learning outcomes at programme level have been formulated considering the recommendations of the Academic Association Educators (IKAPENFI). The programme leaders have defined a total of 11 learning outcomes. Students should thus master the theory and concept of non-formal education, master the theory and concept of managing non-formal education, and master the theory and concept of non-formal learning. Graduates should be able to implement logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking in the context of development and implementation of science and technology complying with and applying value of humanities in line with areas of expertise of non-formal education. They should also be able to apply the theory and concept of managing unit, programme, and activities of non-formal education and be able to apply learning theory and the concepts of non-formal education.

The curriculum is composed of 12 general courses (e.g. Psychology Education, Introduction to Entrepreneurship), 3 pedagogical courses (Educational Philosophy, Curriculum and Learning, Inclusive Education), 42 courses on non-formal education content (e.g. Early Childhood Education Development Seminar, Educational Game Tools, Nonformal Education for Disabilities, Nonformal Education Program Planning, English in Non-Formal Education Context), 6 courses on integrated non-formal education content (e.g. Real Work Lecture, Internship Training), as well as 5 research courses (e.g. Writing Scientific Writing, Statistic, Thesis).

Experts' evaluation

The Bachelor's programme on Non-Formal Education represents a well-curated programme offering a wide range of subjects in the field of non-formal education from early childhood education to family literacy and andragogy. The programme thus covers the whole range of lifelong learning. This is reflected in the modules which also include interdisciplinary subjects e.g. in the field of sociology and psychology. Generally, the intended learning outcomes correspond to international standards for Bachelor's programmes.

Concerning the teaching staff engaged in the study programme on Non-Formal Education, staff resources are adequate with 2 full professors and 7 members of staff holding a doctoral degree. In general, the staff can be described as very engaged.

A Bachelor's programme specialised in non-formal education requires the inclusion of a wide range of practical aspects in order to prepare the students well for their future tasks. UNP integrates an adequate amount of practice-related study content into this Bachelor's programme – this also includes a fair amount of community work and cooperation work with villages. However, students should also be able to apply a profound command of learning theory and concepts of non-formal education in their future jobs (**Finding 5**). On the one hand, this applies to students who seek employment directly after graduating from the Non-Formal-Education Bachelor's programme. On the other hand, this is especially important for those students who strive to continue their academic path and join a Master's or even a PhD programme. In this context, Bachelor's students should also receive additional training on academic writing prior to their final project, e.g. by including more essays as an assessment form (**Finding 6**).

UNP explained during the site visit that the department cooperates with other departments in the field of education, e.g. with the department of Special Education. The experts recommend strengthening the interdisciplinary approach and establishing a cooperation also with other relevant departments such as the department of Vocational Education Training (**Finding 3**).

Transparency is crucial for all stakeholders, especially for students interested and enrolling in the programme. The experts therefore suggest showing the content and structure of the programme in the documentation of the modules even more transparently than it is currently the case. One aspect that should be mentioned even more clearly is e.g. the inter-relation with other Bachelor's programmes offered at UNP (see Chapter 7, **Finding 27**).

UNP states that this Bachelor's study programme offers the opportunity to continue with a wide range of Master's programmes. However, UNP does not yet offer such a programme but according to UNP representatives, a Master's programme designed for non-formal education is being planned. The experts recommended to put this into action (**Finding 7**).

Student mobility is supported, and exchange programmes enable students to go abroad. Both the government and UNP offer mobility programmes free of charge. In order to enhance the intended internationalisation process and to bring in new input from abroad, it is recommended to continue to ask a growing number of students to go abroad and support them sufficiently (see Chapter 4, **Finding 20**).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Educational Technology (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The study programme "Educational Technology" covers a total of 148 SKS over 7 semesters. The number of enrolments per year is set at 100 students. Upon completion students are awarded a Bachelor of Education degree or S.Pd.

According to information in the self-evaluation report, the main graduate profile for the programme is Educational Technology Developer. Graduates should be able to analyse, design, develop, manage, implement, and evaluate various learning resources and learning programmes adapted to information and communication technology development by upholding religious, nationalist, integrity, independent, innovative, creative, responsible values of character. Graduates should be able to compete regionally and globally. The graduates should be able to increase their competence in the field of educational technology and continue to higher levels of education both locally and abroad. Following their studies they should be graduates who can show professional performance in the field of educational technology, and who can develop their potential themselves in the field of educational technology by developing an entrepreneurial spirit.

UNP states in its self-evaluation report that the learning outcomes at programme level have been formulated considering the recommendations of the Indonesian Educational Technology Study Program Association. The programme leaders have defined a total of 9 learning outcomes. Specifically, students should understand the concepts of educational technology as well as the domains of educational technology namely design, development, implementation, management, and evaluation. They should also understand the concepts of research methodology in the scope of educational technology. Graduates should, among others, be able to innovate, integrate the learning and life skills, and master information, communication, and technology related to Educational Technology. They should be able to conduct the activities of design, development, implementation, management, and evaluation in the scope of educational technology.

The curriculum is composed of 12 general courses (e.g. Fundamental of Education, Guidance and Counselling), 3 pedagogical courses (Educational Philosophy, Inclusive Education, Pedagogy), 36 courses on educational technology content (e.g. Basics of Curriculum, Human Resources Development, Media and Digital Literacy, E-Learning Development, Educational Technology Seminar), 3 courses on integrated educational

technology content (Community Service Program, Educational Technology Internship, Educational Field Practice), as well as 6 research courses (e.g. Scientific Writing Methods, Inferential Statistic, Thesis).

Experts' evaluation

Based on the self-evaluation report, the material provided and the online interviews, it is clear to the experts that the curriculum of the Educational Technology study programme at the macro level has referred to the National Qualification Framework as well as the ASEAN and European Qualifications Frameworks. Yet, in particular, there are several other aspects of the curriculum that can be further specified in accordance with the study programme. UNP has formulated the expected graduate qualifications which, in the opinion of the experts, are relevant to the essence of educational technology: to be able to analyse, design, develop, implement, and evaluate various instructional programmes and resources. Based on the online site visit and the video profile UNP showed to the experts, it seems that it would be better if UNP makes some adjustments and reorientations of curriculum structure as well as in course content to make sure that the intended qualification is well achieved by the students. The experts therefore suggest that UNP include trends and issues related to the emerging technology for education such as the application of contemporary learning theories for learning, including the contemporary information and communication technological developments such as artificial intelligence, internet of things, big data, augmented reality, virtual reality, and extended reality (metaverse) in the curriculum (**Finding 8**).

The experts were glad to hear during the discussion with alumni and the labour market representatives that UNP has conducted curriculum reorientation regularly by inviting some relevant stakeholders, including the labour market and alumni. Testimonials from labour market representatives and alumni show that in some extents the qualification of educational technology graduates meet the needs of the labour market. This is a good opportunity for UNP to take advantage of this partnership with the labour market. The experts suggest that it would be good for UNP to improve its partnerships with the labour market and to send prospective graduates to apply educational technology in the workplace through various schemes such as internships, job training, research, knowledge sharing from practitioners, etc. Based on this information, the experts concluded that there have been curricular adjustments and modifications and that these changes have made some contributions to improve the quality of the study programme. In the future it would be better for UNP to provide additional documentation related to this matter (something like an annual report showing the progression then, now, and future predictions based on input from the labour market – UNP did not provide such a document).

Based on the online interviews with study programme coordinators and lecturers it is very clear that they have adjusted their curriculum and learning outcomes to the European and National qualifications framework as written in the self-evaluation report. In the view of the experts, the academic degree already corresponds to the learning outcomes and the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework and the Indonesian National Qualifications Framework.

The experts concluded that the curricular structure of the programme supports the achievements of the intended learning outcomes and the learner's progression. The total programme workload is correctly and transparently allocated to the different courses/modules. The number of credits assigned to all elements of the curriculum is adequate. The implementation of each credit on each subject/course highly depends on the lecturers. So, the competency of the lecturers is what matters. Due to the specific focus on educational technology and the fast-changing environment, the experts believe that in this case, UNP must improve the quality of teaching and learning approaches further. For this UNP must improve: 1) the quality of teaching and learning facilities; and 2) the quality of lecturers and their competency in some specific extents through refreshment, workshops, seminars, research, benchmarking, comparative study, study abroad scholarship, etc. UNP should prepare a development plan for the next years. The improvement of the quality of teaching and learning should be linked to the quality assurance process and its results (**Finding 9**). Based on the online interviews, it is

clear that UNP already has quality assurance units at the level of university, faculty, and study programme (which is positive) and that it has working quality assurance mechanisms. Improvements are of course always possible (see also Chapter 2).

The Merdeka Belajar dan Kampus Merdeka (MBKM) programme requires all Indonesian universities to implement a more experiential and active teaching and learning approaches in higher education. The experts concluded that the Educational Technology study programme already implements some specific elements such as distance education (applying e-learning, hybrid, blended learning modes) as well as some experiential learning activities such as internship, part-time studies, community empowerment, student exchanges, etc. These activities have become key performance indicators for Indonesian universities as required by the ministry of education. In this respect, UNP achieved a high ranked in the implementation of the MBKM scheme nationally. Generally for UNP, it would be better to apply even more experiential and active learning approaches – including in its learning assessment (including theses/final exams/assignments). This strategy would improve further the quality of the graduates (see Chapter 3, **Finding 17**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Educational Science (Doctor)

Description

The PhD programme "Educational Science" covers a total of 42 SKS over 6 semesters. The number of enrolments per year is set at 20 PhD candidates. Upon completion students are awarded a Doctor degree or Dr.

UNP states in its self-evaluation report that emphasis is put in the PhD programme on training students to understand the strengths and weaknesses of research methods and on appropriate methods to generate new knowledge in education. They should also be able to develop new scientific theories/concepts/ideas and contribute to the development and practice of science and technology. The goal of the programme is to train professionals who are able to develop new knowledge in the field of education, develop research in solving problems in the field of education and have a leadership and responsible attitude to work together and a spirit of independence.

The programme leaders have defined 6 learning outcomes. Graduates should demonstrate scientific, educative, responsible, independent, and religious attitudes and behaviour to improve the quality of life in society, nation and state based on academic norms and ethics. They should be able to develop various theories, concepts, and educational approaches in line with the development of science and technology in order to produce innovative work oriented to solving educational problems. Students should be trained to be able to develop various approaches, models, methods, learning strategies based on the philosophy of education in solving learning problems and to develop innovative, effective, up-to-date, advanced research for the benefit of society through an interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, or transdisciplinary approach, in accordance with the developed research roadmap. Graduates should be able to communicate scientific work orally and in writing at national and international levels. Finally, they should also be able to formulate and develop educational innovations and policies by utilising educational theories, concepts, and approaches.

The curriculum is composed of 2 general courses (4 credits, Science philosophy, Statistical), 4 basic pedagogical courses (9 credits, Theory and foundations of educational science, Development of counselling services and guidance, Psychology of education and learning, Development of model design and evaluation of learning), 4 doctoral educational sciences content courses (9 credits, Evaluation of educational programs, Comparative education, Analysis and curriculum development, Analysis of educational management and

policy), and 8 research courses (20 credits, Methodology of Research, Education Problems, Literature review, Dissertation proposal seminar, Kajian Mandiri, Publication I and research results seminar, Publication II and closed exam dissertation, Open exam dissertation).

According to information in the self-evaluation report, PhD candidates can choose between completing the programme through a research track or through a course track. Students with a non-educational background must take additional compulsory general education courses. The dissertation exam covers four stages: 1) research proposal seminar, 2) research results seminar, 3) closed session, and 4) open session/doctoral promotion. Students must present a TOEFL certificate issued by the UNP Language Centre, publish scientific articles in reputable international proceedings as well as scientific articles in reputable international journals prior to graduation.

Experts' evaluation

The PhD programme has a clear structure and is based on level 8 of the European Qualifications Framework. Based on the material provided and the discussions with UNP, the experts can conclude that the desired qualification to be achieved fits well with the presented intended learning outcomes, including subject-specific and interdisciplinary elements. The academic degree corresponds well to the requirements of the National and European Qualifications Frameworks.

It is positive that in the first two to three semesters a lot of content is offered to the PhD students. After this transition phase to become a doctoral student, the students have more possibilities and independence for their own professional development as a researcher. The programme is clearly designed for a duration of three years or six semesters: The study plan refers to an ideal structured process of writing a PhD thesis in three years. Many students are working, and the approximate writing process normally takes between 5 to 7 years. After 7 years, the candidate will no longer take part in the programme according to the supervisors.

The labour market needs qualified educational scientists within and outside elementary or secondary schools as part of the educational system. A high number of graduates of UNP's programme do not go to school or stay in school after their studies. They work as lecturers in teacher training and stay within the academic system e.g. as an assistant lecturer. If their studies lead them directly from a Bachelor's study programme to the PhD programme via the fast-track option, students remain in their own university, UNP. They have limited opportunities to see another university or academic workplace fully besides short research stays abroad. This means, the knowledge stays within the system. This is a missed opportunity in the view of the experts.

The feedback given by the labour market representatives during the online site visit was very positive. Doctoral degrees are highly recognised inside and outside the university, although many doctoral students are already working before they graduate. In this sense, the programme is successful. The members of the labour market mentioned the high skills and competences of the graduates of Universitas Negeri Padang. The experts hope that it would be possible to accept more applicants in the future, because PhD graduates in Education Sciences are needed indeed.

The monitoring process and supervision of doctoral students is well structured. The format of a cumulative dissertation is the preferred form by the students. The aim of the intense phase of support in the beginning of the PhD programme is to enable the PhD students to write their first academic articles. In the end there is more time for the own development and own research and writing process. The (cumulative) dissertation is the successful end and product of the successful study programme. The educational research topics of the students closely refer to the field of practice (teaching knowledge, subject teaching) – yet they could be broadened by other relevant more interdisciplinary topics related to school, pupils, teachers, and parents. Generally, interdisciplinary elements (e.g. philosophy, sociology, political sciences) could broaden the learning outcomes and the range of topics for the students' articles and research topics (**Finding 3**). In the programme there is

only one specific seminar mentioned which directly refers to research methodologies. This is offered in semester 1. Further seminars focussing on qualitative and quantitative research methods could be useful. UNP stated during the online site visit that PhD candidates are trained in various methodologies and that they gain research competencies. This fact should be highlighted in the relevant study programme documents (**Finding 10**).

The interviews conducted during the online site visit showed that, in term of the time plan of the research conducted by the students, the study programme provides intensive orientation and guidance. It includes the opportunity for the students to have international experience, for example through the requirement of the students to follow international seminars and submit their articles in a reputable international journal. This requirement is compulsory for the doctoral students. Otherwise, they will not have eligibility to pass the final exam (dissertation exam). This is a positive aspect – yet internationalisation efforts could still be improved. The staff also referred to an initiative to invite guest lecturers conducting workshops on methods and methodology with the students e.g. from the University of Cologne a couple of semesters ago. It would be good to invite more scientists from abroad and to focus more on scientific cooperation. Comparative and international studies could be an option for the implementation of mobility elements and cooperation projects with partner universities from different countries, not only Asian countries. More emphasis on students' (physical or virtual) mobility would be helpful in terms of internalisation. The experts recommended to go ahead with the first steps of international collaboration in the scientific field. Recent scientific education and educational research need an international orientation. Especially, methodological training is very important. Suggestions for the curriculum development here are physical and virtual exchange programmes of scientists and students focussing on comparative educational topics, research methods, and research activities (e.g. summer school/Winter school for PhD students) (see also Chapter 4, **Finding 20**).

Overall, the experts concluded from the online interviews that there are some weaknesses from the side of the students in academic writing. The coordinators of study programme and the lecturers stated that they already provided some remedies such as intensive guidance with professors (promotors), specific training in article writing for the students, and academic writing coaching. The experts believe that these remedies are useful and helpful. One possible additional measure could be to extend the scope of the dissertation proposal that is required as part of the registration and admission process. Thus, this procedure could eliminate the possibility of prospective students who do not have adequate academic writing skills at all.

The admission to the PhD programme is described in the self-evaluation report as a clear process. Yet, for students from abroad it would be helpful to find more information on the website in English (see Chapter 7, **Finding 27**). There are different types of students: Gifted Bachelor's graduates with the fast-track procedure, students from Master's programmes, as well as teachers from the outside. Current teachers with contracts in schools can only study on Fridays and Sundays. In the view of the experts, the different student groups need different offers in the structured PhD programme (**Finding 11**). The implementation of a part-time study programme could be useful to face the challenges to work fulltime or most of the week and to focus on a research-projects only on two days a week and in holidays. Generally, it would be helpful, especially for the teachers working in schools and studying at the weekend to define milestones in between, to work on small packages and to do work on theory-practice-research projects, not in their role as a teacher, but rather as a researcher focussing on practice.

UNP updated their curriculum and intended learning outcomes according to the current developments with relevant stakeholders including the labour market. Since most students of the doctoral programme are employed already, it seems that their knowledge, skills, and attitudes gained from doctoral degree can be applied in their workplace. The graduate surveys also confirm that the intended learning outcomes meet the needs of labour market. During the online interviews alumni and representatives of the labour market mentioned that they were involved in the modification of the curriculum. It is visible and transparent that regular curricula modification and adjustment for the Educational Science doctorate took place. The experts, however, suggest

in the future to consider developing a strategy to better measure whether these modifications worked or not – and to document it accordingly.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

Technical Vocational Education (Doctor)

Description

The PhD programme "Technical Vocational Education" covers a total of 43 SKS over 4 semesters. The number of enrolments per year is set at 20 PhD candidates. Upon completion students are awarded a Doctor degree or Dr.

UNP states in its self-evaluation report that in the PhD programme emphasis is put on the philosophy of understanding vocational education, developing vocational education in Indonesia, generating new knowledge about vocational education, developing theory and practice of vocational education, and appropriate research methods to produce new knowledge and problem-solving in vocational education. According to the graduate profiles, the graduates should be able to become excellent professional educators in the field of Technology and/or Vocational education, master educational disciplines, and be competent in developing science and technology through research with a multi-/transdisciplinary approach to provide comprehensive and integrative solutions. They should also become researchers who are able to analyse and use various research methodologies in generating innovations and solutions to complex problems in the fields of technology and vocational education, and have the ability to plan, design, manage, and carry out research to develop models/media/assessments/inventory through systematic, creative, original and scientifically tested research. Furthermore, they should be able to publish research results through reputable scientific forums and media. Finally, they should be able to become consultants and professional practitioners in the fields of Technology and/or Vocational education, produce innovative solutions through research, develop entrepreneurship, and be skilled in solving complex problems.

The programme leaders have defined 10 learning outcomes. Graduates should, among others, master the philosophy of the field of technology and/or vocational education and master the principles and applications of technology to support research in the field of technology and/or vocational education. They should be able to find, create, and develop innovations and new ideas in the field of technology and/or vocational education and to build collaborative networks with various educational institutions and the world of work that are relevant to the field of technology and/or vocational education sciences. The graduates should also be able to formulate policies and develop strategies with interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, and transdisciplinary approaches to contribute to solving educational problems.

The curriculum is composed of 3 general courses (Philosophy and principles TVE, Multivariate Analysis, TVE Leadership Management and Policy), 3 pedagogical courses (Curriculum Management, TVE and Multimedia Learning Model, TVE program evaluation), 3 doctoral TVE content courses (Technical and Vocational Education Leadership Management and Policy, Career development, Entrepreneurship), and 6 research courses (Advanced Research Methodology and Needs Analysis, Individual and Project Studies (Engineering Only), Proposal seminar Dissertation, Publication I and Result seminar dissertation, Publication II and Closed exam dissertation, Open exam dissertation).

According to information in the self-evaluation report, PhD candidates can choose between completing the programme through a research track or through a course track. Students with a non-educational background must take additional compulsory general education courses. The dissertation exam covers four stages: 1)

research proposal seminar, 2) research results seminar, 3) closed session, and 4) open session/doctoral promotion. Students must present a TOEFL certificate issued by the UNP Language Centre and publish scientific articles in reputable international proceedings as well as scientific articles in reputable international journals prior to graduation.

Experts' evaluation

Further academic qualification in the form of a PhD programme, and on the basis of a relevant Master's degree, is of great importance for the field of vocational education and training in general. So far, there are only very few of these offers in Indonesia and in the world. UNP is taking the right path by offering this PhD programme.

Generally, the overall structure and different milestones of the programme are clear and appear adequate for the students. The modules that relate to the methodological aspects of research are to be positively highlighted; these courses should be kept and continued when further developing the programme.

However, based on the submitted material and the discussions during the online site visit, the experts concluded that the objectives and contents of the programme have so far not been specifically directed towards the scientific issues of vocational education and training (VET) research. Topics of theoretical and empirical relevance are only rudimentarily included in the curriculum. The main topics of the various modules appear arbitrary to the panel of experts. Unfortunately, the answers to the questions of the experts during the digital site visit did not provide a specific reasoning or a clear strategy beyond the set-up of the curriculum. Even within the modules, only rudimentary relevant topics and questions of VET research are mentioned. Furthermore, the experts consider that the learning outcomes only rudimentarily correspond to the level of a doctorate in international comparison.

Additionally, even though UNP states that "non-linear" students (who have not studied VET subjects previously) can enrol, it remains unclear for the panel of experts which Master's degrees can be used for access to the doctoral programme.

The persons responsible for the programme and involved in its teaching/supervision come only in part from the field of vocational education and training research. It is unclear why the programme is provided by the Faculty of Engineering. In the discussions during the site visit UNP mentioned historical reasons, which are not entirely convincing for the experts. In the view of the experts, the PhD programme should be more closely linked to the Faculty of Education. Generally, the experts also believe that there is a lack of academic staff to implement the programme and to supervise all the students towards their thesis.

In order to further develop the doctorate into a successful programme, the experts see the following aspects as necessities to remedy the current situation:

- The curriculum of the PhD programme Technical Vocational Education must cover more scientific issues of VET research including theories, comparative analysis of VET systems, etc. (**Finding 12**).

- UNP must provide additional information regarding the attainment of the intended Programme Learning Outcomes for the PhD programme Technical Vocational Education by providing additional student works and additional examples of publications (**Finding 13**).

- In order to assess the previous knowledge of the students and the fit of the curriculum with the entry requirements of the PhD programme Technical Vocational Education, UNP must provide information on the make-up of the student body (including previous Master's degree, previous university, GPA etc.) and an overview of the curriculum of UNP's VET Master's programme (**Finding 14**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*
>
> *A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*
>
> *The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*
>
> *Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*
>
> *[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
>
> *The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*
>
> *A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*
>
> *The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*
>
> *Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*
>
> *[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*

Description

Quality assurance at UNP is based on policies and planning defined by the Rector and set out in a Quality Policy, a Quality Manual, Quality Standards, and several standard operating procedures. External quality assurance takes the form of national compulsory accreditation as well as voluntary international accreditation. At UNP there is a central, university-level Internal Quality Assurance Agency/Quality Assurance Centre as well as Quality Control Units at faculty level, and Quality Control Groups at the level of the study programmes. In the Postgraduate School of UNP there are also additional bodies such as the Thesis and Dissertation Quality Assurance Commission Unit and the Scientific Publication Verification Team to support academic quality.

The quality management system is based on the PPEPP model with five stages, namely Determination, Implementation, Evaluation, Control, Improvement. Evaluation measures include the monitoring of the workload of lecturers, the number of credits taken by students, and the ratio of lecturers to students. Additionally, student satisfaction and study periods, as well as lecturer satisfaction are monitored. The implementation of the learning process as defined centrally is also checked, partly by the head of each study programme in cooperation with the Quality Control Group, evaluating all activities related to teaching and learning within the study programme. According to information in the self-evaluation report, there are regular inspections and supervisions of learning activities. The learning platform and information system of UNP can be accessed to monitor students' progress and completion of activities. Student satisfaction about the success of their lectures, lecturers' learning implementation, and facilities as well as study periods are evaluated at the end of each semester using a survey. Lecturer satisfaction is also checked using a survey. UNP also indicates that a survey of stakeholder satisfaction with the academic services (including the aspects of excellence, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and availability) has been carried out.

Every year, there is an Academic Quality Audit carried out by internal auditors; a report is compiled at the end of the process. The central Career Development Centre of UNP is tasked with monitoring output quality by

measuring the satisfaction of graduates, graduate users, and institution partners; the centre conducts a tracer study.

UNP states that it uses the results of the audit as well as the feedback by students, lecturers, graduates, and stakeholders to improve the quality of learning and academic services. UNP also mentions that each study programme undergoes a benchmarking exercise with other universities in Indonesia and abroad.

Experts' evaluation

UNP strives to become an excellent university on an international level and takes various measures to assure quality including a voluntary international accreditation, in addition to the compulsory national accreditation. Quality assurance takes place on both university and faculty levels. Moreover, stakeholders' satisfaction is regularly monitored, e.g. by conducting surveys asking students for their feedback on learning and academic services. The overall quality management framework at UNP is therefore adequate as it includes all necessary tools, gathers feedback, reviews the relevant aspects of the learning process, and involves all stakeholders.

Generally, the specific review process of the curricula (also mentioned in Chapter 1) is adequate. UNP could provide information during the site visit on the regular cycles of the different feedback-gathering mechanisms. It is clear that internal and external stakeholders are involved in reviewing and developing the curricula. The involvement of the labour market as well as the inclusion of representative trade associations are positive. Yet, the various labour markets of the graduates of the 6 study programmes under review are quite dynamic. The experts therefore suggest that the curriculum development process at UNP should make sure to constantly review and include fast-paced changes in industry and science related to the defined graduate profiles. Corresponding opportunities for staff development should be provided, in order for them to provide the most up-to-date education possible to the students (**Finding 15**).

Despite the information provided during the site visit, it is not evident for the experts in which ways the results of the surveys have an impact on the actual improvement of the quality, i.e. UNP did not provide a lot of evidence on the Act-stage of the Plan-Do-Check-Act cycle. This is an important aspect of a functioning quality assurance system at universities. UNP is therefore asked to provide evidence on the Act-stage of its quality assurance procedures by providing English summaries of the tracer studies for each study programme (not complied for the whole university) of the last three years and by demonstrating how this and other data is used and analysed to improve the study programmes (**Finding 16**).

Other tools, procedures and mechanisms that contribute to high quality studies are regulated in the Academic Rules of UNP, including procedures to safeguard academic integrity and prevent academic fraud.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*
>
> *Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*
>
> *Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *[ESG 1.3]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
>
> *The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*
>
> *Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*
>
> *[ESG 1.3]*

Description

According to information in the self-evaluation report, teaching and learning at UNP uses a blended learning system with online elements. Online learning is carried out on the learning platform of the university, which includes virtual classrooms and standardised learning tools and documents. Generally, lectures are either theory lectures or practice lectures taking place in laboratories. UNP states that its teaching and learning approach is student-centred and uses active approaches including quizzes, case methods, project-based learning as well as field studies and mentoring by lecturers and practitioners. Further examples of teaching and learning methods are discussions, school observations, and teaching simulations. Specifically for the PhD programmes UNP states that case-method learning and project-based learning are used, and that emphasis is put on the development of a healthy academic culture and on the implementation of research conducted by students.

Assessment can take the form of written tests and performance tests, including quizzes. The mid-term exam takes place in the eighth week and the final exam in the sixteenth week. Specifically in the PhD programmes, students are expected to deliver presentations and complete independent assignments, article analysis, and group assignments. Students must also write papers, journal reviews, learning media, practicum kits, mini-research, portfolios, and dissertations.

At the beginning of the academic year students receive an exam schedule. Students can access their grades on the information system of the university. UNP states that there is a procedure for appeals and complaints involving the lecturer and the head of the study programme as well as the vice dean. UNP has developed specific guidelines regarding the delivery of academic services to students with disability. As examples of differentiated methods of assessment UNP mentions oral tests for students with visual impairments or the use of a screen reader on a computer.

Experts' evaluation

In general, the experts recognise the efforts by UNP to implement more active and experiential learning approaches compared to the past. As can be seen in self-evaluation documents, UNP already implements the Merdeka Belajar dan Kampus Merdeka (MBKM) programme which requires all Indonesian universities to implement such a kind of teaching and learning approach. For example, UNP already applies case-based and project-based teaching in its teaching and learning processes as well as in the learning assessment. UNP also reached a high rank (3rd) in achieving the key performance indicators of the MBKM scheme. On this basis, the experts concluded that teaching and learning at UNP (as well as at all universities, public or private) supports

interlacing between theory and practice. As can be seen in the documents submitted, UNP already implements distance education (applying e-learning, hybrid, and or blended modes) as well as some experiential learning activities such as students' exchange/mobility, internship, part-time studies, community empowerment, etc. This is a good point for UNP. But still, the experts recommend that UNP improve the teaching and learning processes further and provide even more active and experiential learning to its students (**Finding 17**). For this purpose, the experts support UNP in further developing a quality assurance system of high quality. As mentioned above, UNP already has the quality assurance units at all levels including the university, faculty, and study programme level. The experts hope that these strategic actions will improve the quality of the graduates to develop competences as set in the national and European qualifications frameworks.

UNP, for example in the Educational Technology study programme, has demonstrated the implementation of e-learning, in this case hybrid/blended learning as well as other teaching approaches such as case-based and project-based learning. But those approaches are relatively new approaches, especially for the lecturers. The experts therefore recommend that UNP pay special attention to the readiness of lecturers in applying those teaching and learning approaches. In this respect, conducting training and workshop for lecturers is not enough. UNP needs role models from some certain outstanding lecturers (champions) as well as benchmarking from other national or international universities (**Finding 17**). The implementation of active and experiential learning approaches has implications for teaching and learning facilities and infrastructure at UNP. The experts believe that it is the time for UNP to pay additional attention to the preparation of the high quality of information and communication facilities and infrastructure such as internet access, high speed and quality of internet bandwidth, information technology infrastructures (such as server and its related peripherals), integrated information management system, as well as related e-learning platforms (such as synchronous learning technology (learning management system) and any other synchronous technology in order to support a broad implementation and use of these approaches).

The experts came to the conclusion that the criteria related to teaching and learning, especially in their relation to student-centred learning are generally fulfilled but they require more evidence. Additional documents must prove the progress/improvement/implementation of student-centred learning in term of 1) full lesson plans (RPS); 2) documents and videos of the active and experiential teaching and learning processes (such as internship, community empowerment, student exchanges/mobility, case-based and project-based learning in face-to-face, hybrid learning, and blended learning), etc.; 3) documents and videos of teaching and learning facilities specifically supporting a student-centred approach, and so on (**Finding 18**).

The examination regulations (incl. appeals) and methods used correspond to the standards at Indonesian universities. The students confirmed in the discussions that the workload was generally manageable. There is some variety in the assignments and examination methods – however, essays could be used more often in all the Bachelor's programmes under review prior to the final project in order to offer students more prior practice with academic writing (**Finding 6**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
> *The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.*
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*

Description

UNP has compiled general Academic Guidelines regarding the learning, assessment, teaching, admission, and review processes at the university. Generally, one semester comprises 16 weeks, including 14 class meetings, 1 mid-term exam and 1 final exam.

Nationally, the admissions at state universities are handled by the University Admission Test Institution. There are 2 pathways for enrolment: national selection based on academic achievement of students in secondary schools (SNMPTN) and national selection based on exams (SBMPTN). Additionally, UNP also conducts an independent student selection (SPMB Mandiri UNP). Applicants to the Bachelor's programmes must be graduates from high school or equivalent. There are no additional subject specific requirements. The admission process to the PhD programmes is codified by a Rector's Decree and is conducted in a coordination meeting with university leaders, leaders of the Postgraduate School and the heads of the PhD programmes. Applicants to the PhD programmes must have a Master's degree and present TOEFL and TPA test results, a CV, a Portfolio (including already produced scientific works), and a dissertation proposal plan. They must also complete an interview.

Students' progression can be monitored on the learning platform and information system of the university. Their progression is also monitored by their academic advisor. According to the semester planning presented in the self-evaluation report, Bachelor's students complete between 12 and 24 SKS per semester, PhD candidates between 2 and 14 SKS per semester.

In the framework of the national Independent Campus policy/MBKM, Bachelor's students can, for a maximum of 2 semesters, take courses and carry out activities outside of their own study programmes. As examples UNP lists student exchanges, internships/practices, teaching assistantship in schools, research, humanitarian projects, entrepreneurial activities, independent studies/projects, and community service. UNP has developed recognition regulations for these activities as well as for informal education activities.

Regarding international exchanges, the students are supported by the International Office of the university – the Postgraduate School also has an International Relations Office. UNP mentions in its self-evaluation report cooperation agreements with universities in Singapore, Malaysia, Taiwan, the United States, Germany, Australia, the Netherlands, as well as participation in the South-East Asia Teacher Program (SEA Teacher) and South-East Asia Technical and Vocational Education (SEA TVET), Student Mobility Program, Student Exchange and other research collaboration.

Upon graduation students receive their diploma, an academic transcript as well as documents describing their achievements during their studies.

Experts' evaluation

The admission system is based on the national framework for university admission. UNP implements this fully and transparently. Information is provided transparently for Indonesian secondary school graduates on the relevant UNP websites. The entry requirements themselves and the procedures for enrolment in the Bachelor's programmes are adequate. For PhD programmes students must present a dissertation proposal plan, which the experts evaluate as a positive aspect. However, in the view of the experts, it is somewhat surprising that the PhD VET programme admits applicants with a very broad background of subjects (see Chapter 1).

At the same time, the experts believe that there is a lack of transparency regarding the entry requirements and the admission procedure for international students. Some information is provided by the International Office, but it remains, in the view of the experts, a complicated system for foreigners. Some information also appears to be available only in Indonesian and not in English (see Chapter 7, **Finding 27**).

The students' progression during their studies is typical for Indonesian higher education study programmes: a system based on the GPA of the prior semester determines the maximum number of credits allowed in the current semester. The progression overall is tightly tracked using the academic platform at UNP – and academic advisors play an important role in guiding students through their studies. Support and counselling are also provided by the academic advisor and the university central services. The discussions during the site visit confirmed that this system works well.

The usual progression and study plans are available to all students at the beginning of their studies. What is interesting is the fact the faculty offers so-called "fast track" programmes for brilliant students – allowing for a swift progression between semesters and also between different study programmes. This is a positive aspect of studies at UNP which offers students more flexibility.

The award of Doctoral degrees is fully and completely regulated by the corresponding national regulations as well as Rector's Decrees. The process is transparent and clear.

UNP fully implements the national government programme Freedom to Learn/Independent Campus (MBKM) in the Bachelor's programmes. Transparent and clear regulations on the recognition of courses outside the study programme, internships, teaching assistantships, and community services in villages are available. It was confirmed during the discussions of the digital site visit that this system works well. Students also confirmed that periods abroad (internships, courses etc.) are recognised without problems. Support is provided in planning and conducting a stay abroad (scholarship, stipend etc.). The university and the faculty have some partnerships for international mobility; however they are limited in number and in scope. The number of actual stays abroad has been adversely affected by the pandemic, which is understandable. UNP provided examples of online courses that the students have taken abroad. Actual stays abroad are slowly picking up again. UNP has ambitions to become a leading university internationally – internationalisation and exchanges play a key role in this respect. During the site visit, students and staff alike shared the wish for more internationalisation and exchange opportunities. In this context the experts give the following recommendations for further improvement:

▪ UNP should actively and resolutely improve the English competencies of both staff and students (**Finding 19**).

▪ UNP should develop an internationalisation plan for its Education study programmes. It should include steps to substantially raise the internationalisation of the programmes and address academic and student exchanges, PhD and research cooperation, language competencies and the involvement of internationally trained lecturers (**Finding 20**).

Regarding UNP's rules on certifications, it is fully regulated and clear: Students receive complete informative documents upon graduation (a Diploma supplement according to the national template).

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

Bachelor's/Master's degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Doctoral degree

The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.

Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.

[ESG 1.5]

Description

UNP follows set targets of lecturer-to-student ratios for undergraduate (1:20-1:30 depending on the subject) and for doctoral programmes (1:10). Based on the *Tri Dharma* framework lecturers are expected to take part in education, research, and community service. Lecturers must report on their activities each semester through the university online platform. UNP can recruit permanent lecturers as civil servants, non-civil servants, as well as external lecturers – and guest lecturers. To be able to teach, lecturers must have a minimum academic qualification of a Master's degree, a Doctorate is required to teach at Master level, and lecturers must hold a PhD and have the rank of associate professor to teach in a doctoral programme.

In the "Elementary School Teacher Education" Bachelor's programme there is a total of 41 lecturers, including 1 professor, 7 associate professors, and 33 assistant professors. In the "Special Education" Bachelor's programme there is a total of 22 lecturers, including 2 professors, 7 associate professors, and 13 assistant professors. In the "Non-Formal Education" Bachelor's programme there is a total of 18 lecturers, including 2 professors, 10 associate professors, and 6 assistant professors. In the "Educational Technology" Bachelor's programme there is a total of 21 lecturers, including 1 professor, 7 associate professors, and 13 assistant professors. In the "Educational Science" doctoral programme there is a total of 30 lecturers, including 27 professors and 3 associate professors. In the "Technical Vocational Education" doctoral programme there is a total of 18 lecturers, including 8 professors, 5 associate professors, and 5 assistant professors.

UNP states that lecturers are encouraged to continue developing their competencies and skills, among others, through further studies, short courses, or English training courses. Additionally, there are training activities to improve the quality of the preparation of research proposals and service to the community. Support is provided in the preparation of scientific articles and design patents/intellectual property rights. UNP also mentions in its self-evaluation report that workshops are provided to the lecturers regarding teaching methods in blended learning as well as training to help them improve their assessment skills

Research activities can benefit from the support of university-wide and/or national funding schemes. UNP lists in its self-evaluation report international collaborative research conducted in the past years, including cooperation with universities in Japan, Malaysia, the Philippines.

Experts' evaluation

UNP provided information on the general framework related to staff employment and the different steps of the recruitment process. This corresponds fully to the Indonesian framework and regulations for public universities.

Information on the number of staff and on their qualification was provided for the study programmes. Based on this information and on the discussions during the online site visit, the experts came to the conclusion that, generally, staff is sufficient and qualified for most programmes under review and that the national guidelines are respected (student-lecturer ratio), yet the experts also see some limitations.

For the PhD programme on vocational education and training the experts believe that the information provided on the teaching and supervisory staff is insufficient. A full list of all teaching staff involved in the programme, including their academic qualification, their research and other relevant qualifications related to VET, the number of teaching hours, and the duration of employment needs to be provided (**Finding 21**). Due to this missing information and the limitations related to the workload (see underneath), the supervisory staff of the VET PhD programme seems to be not fully qualified to support and advise PhD candidates in the field of Vocational Education Research.

The experts understand the national regulations for lecturers in further qualifying themselves and on progressing from being a lecturer to a full professor. Due to the overall workload for staff (teaching, research, community service and administration) the experts see here limitations in supporting the delivery of the different programmes. It is clear, that the university provides *some* support to its staff for further qualification and for conducting research.

Generally, the experts would like to recommend UNP improve the quality of teaching staff to enhance the quality of teaching and learning. As shown in the self-evaluation report und during the online interviews, UNP has a limited number of full professors and these mostly are domestic or UNP's own graduates. The experts therefore recommend UNP to 1) hire prospective lecturers from the international graduates, not only from domestic one; 2) provide opportunities for the lecturers to have international climates, nuances, horizon, and experience through some activities such as post-doc scholarship, short courses, workshops, seminars, collaborative research, visiting professors, and any other related activities to foster internationalisation of the UNP's lecturers (**Finding 22**).

Regarding research, the time allocated to lecturers to conduct research appears to be limited in the view of the experts. Generally, teaching staff should be given more time to conduct research and to gain additional qualifications, including completing a Doctorate for junior staff (**Finding 23**).

Finally, the experts recommend that more senior teaching staff (i.e. more full professors) be involved in the Bachelor's programmes (**Finding 24**).

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*
>
> *Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*
>
> *[ESG 1.6]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
>
> *Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*
>
> *Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.*
>
> *[ESG 1.6]*

Description

Within an 'Introduction to Campus Life for New Students' students are provided with a campus orientation and introductions to the programmes. For PhD programmes, some activities are carried out directly by the team responsible for each programme. At the beginning of each semester students receive a Semester Learning Plan or RPS detailing the contents, the learning outcomes, the teaching and assessment methods, as well as additional material required for each course. According to information in the self-evaluation report, RPS are reviewed every semester.

Students are assigned an academic advisor/counsellor. At undergraduate level each advisor is assigned up to 20 students, at postgraduate level 4 students. Counselling and coaching can cover academic as well as non-academic issues, including students' GPA. UNP states that coaching sessions/academic guidance are planned at least 3 times per semester. Centrally, students have access to the Guidance and Counselling Service Unit as well as to the Career Development Centre. Further student services include the Student Activities Unit. UNP provides scholarships based on the students' financial means as well as information on external opportunities for scholarships – also at postgraduate level.

Campus infrastructure facilities include, among others, classrooms, laboratories, student dormitories, sports facilities, religious and worship centres, arts facilities, health centre and clinic, student activity facilities. IT support is provided by the Technical Implementation Unit for Information and Communication Technology Development. There is also a Language Centre. In addition to the UNP Central Library there is a digital library with access to digital publications and databases. For future teachers there is also a Micro Teaching Room at UNP.

The Faculty of Education is present on four campuses of UNP. It has a total of 56 lecture rooms, one faculty library, several reading rooms, as well as laboratories for the different study programmes, including the BPET multimedia laboratory, the BPSE laboratory, the BPNFE laboratory, and the BPET multimedia laboratory. Further facilities include a video/cinematography unit room, a photography unit room, a BPET FM radio room, a podcast room in the BPNFE department, and a digital-printing and screen-printing room. The Postgraduate School occupies three building; it has 12 classrooms, seminar rooms and a library of 380 m². PhD candidates in the "Educational Science" programme have a lecture room, a shared workroom with computers as well as individual workspaces. The Faculty of Engineering has libraries for each faculty department. The facilities include study spaces for students as well as laboratories. The doctoral programme in Technical Vocational Education has an independent study room for students, a multimedia room, and a room for data processing.

Research activities are conducted within the framework of a general research master plan for the university, broken down in individual roadmaps, including for the Postgraduate School and for both PhD programmes

under review. UNP provides examples of support for the research environment in the PhD programmes, including: 1) the existence of joint research opportunities between students and lecturers/promoter, e.g. through dissertation grants or external funding; 2) support provided by the Association of Doctoral Studies Study Programs PPSDP, e.g. academic exchanges or workshops; 3) international exchange programmes, including a joint supervision opportunity with a university in Malaysia.

UNP has established standard operating procedures for the maintenance of laboratories and other equipment. It states that its facilities and infrastructure are accessible to persons with disabilities. Students also have access to a disability services study centre which provides guidance and accompanies students with special needs in the lecture process. In 2021, UNP established a Disability Services Development Centre tasked, among others, with early intervention in the field of special needs child intervention training for teachers, parents, caregivers as well as with training and development in the field of training curriculum development workshops, sign language interpreter training, special education teacher training, orientation instructor training and mobility for the blind, ICT training for the blind, students, and teachers.

Experts' evaluation

Students have access to all study-related content via different channels before and during their studies. The panel of experts particularly liked the informative presentation videos for each individual study programme that were shown during the site visit and that are publicly available. In general, the administrative support offered for students at Universitas Negeri Padang is quite sufficient. Students are involved in the development process of the study programmes on different levels and also have several possibilities to get in touch with the programme leaders and lecturers in case of personal issues related to different aspects of the study programmes. The panel of experts is convinced that the prerequisites for the full support and guidance of the students (both in the Bachelor's programme and in the PhD programmes) are in place, starting from an introduction to the entire study process.

The required documents are largely clearly laid out and contain the necessary information. However, the module handbook needs a revision: The differences between content and learning outcomes in the individual module descriptions must be marked more clearly and the level of detail in the descriptions should also be of the same quality in all modules (**Finding 25**).

In order to ensure adequate use of UNP's premises and to prevent courses from overlapping, internal coordination measures are taken in good time before each semester. The experts have no information that would cast doubt on the effectiveness of this coordination but would have wished to have received some more evidence in this respect. On the other hand, the group of experts is somewhat unsure whether the capacity of the premises will still be sufficient with the targeted increase in student numbers, e.g. in the field of microteaching. Although UNP states that it intends to expand its online teaching and learning activities in the future, there is no concept on how the faculties will face an increasing number of students in an appropriate way. This should be observed in the future.

UNP's technical equipment can be rated as very good and meets high standards as well as the requirements to fully guarantee the learning outcomes. It can accommodate the current and prospective number of students as long as the number does not increase significantly. The panel of experts was not fully aware of the nature and extent of the financial resources needed to maintain the technical equipment. The faculties stated that they have different company cooperations for part of the equipment and receive also central funding by the university. With regard to the rapid technical development and changes in teaching and learning methods, the panel of experts is somewhat unsure whether the technical equipment can be adapted to future challenges in a narrow time frame. This should also be kept in mind in the future (for the specific context of Educational Technology, see Chapter 1, **Finding 9**).

UNP is equipped with an acceptable range of analogue and digital resources for online and offline learning. Besides the university's library there are separate faculty libraries and access to online research tools. For the panel of experts the funds for those resources seem to be quite low, especially when it comes to the vision of UNP to become a world class university. To underline this vision, UNP should see the access to international academic literature as one of the fundamental keys for the development of their students and academic staff. This particularly means long-term access to more and even larger online academic research platforms, a continuity in extending analogue academic literature and keeping it up to date. Therefore, the group of experts recommend providing additional funding for the university and faculty libraries (**Finding 26**).

UNP has an International Office that provides information for various interest groups. On the part of UNP, it became clear that efforts are made to attract international students and that these students are also guided and supported in an appropriate manner. More detailed information was, however, not available to the panel, but the experts are convinced that this is actually taking place. Nevertheless, it is desirable that UNP develops a comprehensive strategy to attract more international students (see Chapter 4, **Finding 20**). UNP has various collaborations with companies and schools to provide internships for their students. The students are adequately prepared and supported by the management and by the lecturers.

The university's extensive scholarship programme deserves special mention. The tuition fees are well adapted to the financial background of the students and there is a wide range of scholarships (15 different programmes). Information is provided through the website and in other forums. Theoretically, students from all social milieus are given access to the university.

In the opinion of the expert group, PhD students generally receive appropriate support, although efforts in particular for international exchange and academic research should be further intensified (see Chapter 4, **Finding 20**). UNP has one press and publishing service called UNP Press. It is registered as a member of the Indonesia Publisher Association. UNP offers scholarships for doctoral theses in collaboration with the academic supervisors and enables PhD students to have national exchanges through workshops and participation in conferences, as well as the opportunity to publish research results. There are 2 cooperation agreements with one university in Germany and one in Malaysia. Unfortunately, the experts could not fully clarify how intensively and for what purpose these agreements have been used so far. Generally, internationalisation efforts should be pursued in the PhD programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

7. Information / Public information

> **Bachelor's/Master's degree**
>
> *Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*
>
> *[ESG 1.8]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
>
> *Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*
>
> *[ESG 1.8]*

Description

Each study programme has its own website embedded within the pages of the faculties and the university. General information is provided on each organisational structure, on study programme activities, on academic regulations, and regarding the work of supporting units as well as on the registration of new students and the selection process. For the programmes, information is provided regarding the learning outcomes, the curricula, and lecturers. UNP also provides information using other channels including print and social media.

Experts' evaluation

UNP's strategy for disseminating public information is largely based on its website, which is also updated regularly. This appears to the panel of experts to be comprehensive and sufficient at national level, as far as they can assess it without sound knowledge of the language. At the international level, however, there is still a need for further improvement. The International Office's website offers some information, but some of it is not fully available in English and some of it is missing entirely (e.g. information on credit transfer). Transparent information on the entry requirements in English for foreign applicants would also be necessary. The English version of the university's central website is also missing a whole range of information – this must be remedied (**Finding 27**). Apart from online publications, however, the presentation videos provided to the experts during the digital site visit gave a complete view of the diversity of the analogue dissemination of information, also in the form of brochures.

Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

V.   Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes "Elementary School Teacher Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Special Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Non-Formal Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Educational Technology" (Bachelor of Education), "Educational Science" (Doctor) and "Technical Vocational Education" (Doctor) offered by Universitas Negeri Padang, Indonesia with conditions.

Findings:

Special Education

1. In the next review of the Special Education curriculum, the programme leaders should emphasise more strongly the aspects of participation and inclusion considering the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.

2. The fact that all levels and all kinds of disability are dealt with in the Special Education curriculum should be highlighted in the relevant study programme documents.

All programmes

3. The study programmes should strengthen their interdisciplinary approach and develop more cooperation between departments and subjects.

Special Education

4. The Special Education study programme should consider more often theoretical references as well as international input and developments, e.g. by providing access to and referring to more international literature and by supporting international cooperations.

Non-Formal Education

5. In the curriculum of the Non-Formal Education study programme, more emphasis should be put on theoretical aspects such as learning theory and concepts of non-formal education.

Bachelor's programmes

6. Bachelor's students should receive additional training on academic writing prior to their final project, e.g. by including more essays as an assessment form.

Non-Formal Education

7. UNP should introduce a Master's degree on Non-Formal Education.

Educational Technology

8. The curriculum of the Educational Technology study programme should be adapted to include topics related to emerging technologies for education such as the application of contemporary learning theories for learning, including the contemporary information and communication technological developments such as artificial intelligence, internet of things, big data, augmented reality, virtual reality, extended reality (metaverse) etc.

9. For the Education Technology study programme UNP must present a development plan, linked to the results of the quality assurance evaluations, to improve the quality of teaching and learning approaches in the next year focusing on the improvement of teaching and learning facilities and on the improvement of lecturers' quality and competencies (including refreshment, seminars, benchmarking, study abroad scholarship, etc.).

Educational Science (PhD)

10. The fact that PhD candidates in Educational Science are trained in various methodologies and that they gain research competencies should be highlighted in the relevant study programme documents.

11. UNP must present different pathways to complete the PhD programme in Educational Science for the different types of students (gifted Bachelor's graduates with the fast-track procedure, Master's graduates, employed teachers).

Technical Vocational Education (PhD)

12. The curriculum of the PhD programme Technical Vocational Education must cover more scientific issues of VET research including theories, comparative analysis of VET systems, etc.

13. UNP must provide additional information regarding the attainment of the intended Programme Learning Outcomes for the PhD programme Technical Vocational Education by providing additional student works and additional examples of publications.

14. In order to assess the previous knowledge of the students and the fit of the curriculum with the entry requirements of the PhD programme Technical Vocational Education, UNP must provide information on the make-up of the student body (including previous Master's degree, previous university, GPA etc.) and an overview of the curriculum of UNP's VET Master's programme.

All programmes

15. The curriculum development process at UNP should make sure to constantly review and include fast-paced changes in industry and science related to the defined graduate profiles. Corresponding opportunities for staff development should be provided.

16. UNP must provide evidence on the Act-stage of its quality assurance procedures by providing English summaries of the tracer studies for each study programme of the last three years and by demonstrating how this and other data is used and analysed to improve the study programmes.

17. UNP should improve the teaching and learning processes further and provide even more active and experiential learning to its students. Staff should be supported by other staff as role models/champions in implementing new learning and teaching approaches.

18. UNP must provide evidence on the implementation of a student-centred approach to learning and teaching by providing full lesson plans (RPS), documents and videos of the active and experiential teaching and learning processes, and documents and videos of teaching and learning facilities specifically supporting a student-centred approach.

19. UNP should actively and resolutely improve the English competencies of both staff and students.

20. In line with its internationalisation goals, UNP should develop an internationalisation plan for its Education study programmes. It should include steps to substantially raise the internationalisation of the study programmes and address academic and student exchanges, PhD and research cooperation, language competencies and the involvement of internationally trained lecturers.

Technical Vocational Education (PhD)

21. UNP must provide a full list of all teaching staff involved in the Technical Vocational Education PhD programme, including their academic qualification, their research and other relevant qualifications related to VET, the number of teaching hours, and the duration of employment.

All programmes

22. UNP should hire more teaching staff with an international background and provide opportunities current teaching staff to gather international experience.

23. Teaching staff should be given more time to conduct research and to gain additional qualifications, including completing a Doctorate for junior staff.

Bachelor's programmes

24. More senior teaching staff (up to full professors) should be involved in the Bachelor's programmes.

All programmes

25. The course descriptions must be improved: the difference between "content" and "learning outcomes" must be made clearer and the level of details must be comparable between different courses.

26. The experts recommend providing additional funding for the university and faculty libraries in order to have a larger access to international literature.

27. In line with its internationalisation goals, UNP must provide complete information on its study programmes online fully in English (including admission requirements).