AQAS

AGENTUR FÜR
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH
AKKREDITIERUNG VON
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

FINAL REPORT

UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN INDONESIA

CLUSTER VOCATIONAL EDUCATION

FAMILY WELFARE EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

FASHION EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

CULINARY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)

TECHNOLOGY AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (DOCTOR OF EDUCATION)

September 2022

Q

Content

DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **FAMILY WELFARE EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **FASHION EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **CULINARY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **TECHNOLOGY AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (DOCTOR OF EDUCATION)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN, BANDUNG, INDONESIA

Based on the report of the expert panel, the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 14th meeting on 29 August 2022, and the circulation procedure of 19 September 2022 the AQAS Standing Commission decides:

1. The study programmes "**Family Welfare Education**" (**Bachelor of Education**), "**Fashion Education**" (**Bachelor of Education**), "**Culinary Education**" (**Bachelor of Education**), "**Electrical Engineering Education**" (**Bachelor of Education**) and "**Technology and Vocational Education**" (**Doctor of Education**) offered by **Universitas Pendidikan**, **Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

   The accreditations are conditional.

   The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 September 2023**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.

3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2028**.

Conditions:

For all programmes

1. The **workload in the course descriptions** of all programmes must be presented coherently and consistently. In addition, the workload of the thesis defence in the Bachelors' programmes has to be taken into consideration.

For the study programmes "Family Welfare Education" and "Culinary Education"

2. UPI must check and **adapt the level of exams** in the programmes Family Welfare Education and Culinary Education. Exams must be varied to measure students' competences in analysis, synthesis, and evaluation, not only knowledge.

For the study programme "Fashion Education"

3. UPI must hand in a **staff development plan** which describes how the number of teaching staff in the Fashion Education programme shall be increased in the next five years and how it can be guaranteed that there will also be professors teaching future students.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all programmes

1. After students have provided online feedback on a course, UPI should provide **opportunities for a dialogue between the lecturers and their students**.

For the study programmes "Family Welfare Education" and "Culinary Education"

2. Students and lecturers in Family Welfare Education and Culinary Education should expand their English **language competencies**, e.g. by offering relevant electives taught in English.

3. It is recommended to **update the references in the course handbooks**.

For the study programme "Electrical Engineering Education"

4. It is recommended that **lessons learned** from the pandemic will be implemented in the lab education in Electrical Engineering Education.

5. A concept including an action plan should be handed in which describes how the labs for Electrical Engineering Education will be **updated continuously** in the next five years.

6. In Electrical Engineering Education, it is recommended to consider **increasing the weight of the industry internship** within the curriculum.

For the study programme "Technology and Vocational Education"

7. It is recommended to address **approaches of qualitative research** in a compulsory module for doctoral candidates.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

EXPERTS' REPORT

ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **FAMILY WELFARE EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **FASHION EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **CULINARY EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING EDUCATION (BACHELOR OF EDUCATION)**

- **TECHNOLOGY AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION (DOCTOR OF EDUCATION)**

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN INDONESIA

Online visit to the university: 16 – 20 May 2022

Panel of experts:

Prof. Dr. Frank Bünning	Otto-von-Guericke-Universität Magdeburg, Germany, Faculty of Humanities, Department Education, Vocation and Media
Prof. Dr.-Ing. Thomas Fuhrmann	Ostbayerische Technische Hochschule Regensburg, Germany, Faculty of Electrical Engineering and Information Technology
Ass. Prof. Dr. Adhi Kusumastuti	Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia, Family Welfare Education Department
Prof. Dr. Waltraud Rusch	Pädagogische Hochschule Karlsruhe, Faculty of Natural and Social Sciences, Institute of Culture and Health
Barata Antariksa	TVET school Bekasi 1, Bekasi, Indonesia (Labour market representative)
Dominik Kubon	Student at RWTH Aachen University (Student representative)

Coordinator:

Dr. Dorothee Groeger, Doris Herrmann	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

I. Preamble

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution.

II. Accreditation procedure

This report results from the external review of the study programmes "Family Welfare Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Fashion Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Culinary Education" (Bachelor of Education), "Electrical Engineering Education" (Bachelor of Education) and "Technology and Vocational Education" (Doctor of Education) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.

1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

2. Approach and methodology

Initialisation

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in November 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In November 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:
- an overview over statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- the CVs of the teaching staff/supervisors,
- information on student services,
- core information on the main library,
- as well as academic regulations.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 6 December 2021. The final version of the SER was handed in April 2022.

Nomination of the expert panel

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in April 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

Preparation of the site visit

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

Site visit

After a review of the SER, a virtual site visit to the university took place on 16 – 20 May 2022. The experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

Reporting

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

Decision

The report, together with the statement of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. The AQAS Standing Commission discussed the report during its meeting on 29 August 2022 and took its decision on the accreditation based on the report and the statement of the university in a circulation process on 19 September 2022. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In October 2022, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

III. General information on the university

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI) is a multi-campus university located mainly in Bandung, West Java. The higher education institution was founded in 1954 as a teacher education college and has since been further expanded and developed into its current status as a state university. UPI offers a wide range of Bachelor's, Master's and doctoral programmes for both teacher education and other employment fields along 6 campuses. On its main campus, UPI runs 8 faculties and 1 postgraduate school. In total, the university offers programmes for about 50.650 students.

According to UPI, the university strives to implement a "Tridharma" of higher education, that is education, research and community service interrelated. Research aims to develop educational sciences, educational disciplines, and other discipline programmes in a cross-fertilization approach.

Its strategic development has been defined by UPI in a Strategic Plan 2021-25. In particular, UPI formulates the following aims: 1) producing educators and educational staff, scientists and experts in all types and programmes of higher education, who have global competitive and comparative advantages; 2) producing, developing, and disseminating knowledge and technology to improve the welfare of the community; 3) creating community service programmes based on research results of vocational, technological, and engineering education and 4) developing both national and international collaborations with higher education institutions, research institutions, industrial services, professional associations, the government, and other scientific societies.

The Bachelor's programmes in this accreditation cluster are affiliated with the Faculty of Technology and Vocational Education located in Bandung, which offers 15 programmes. 4.519 students are enrolled (2020/21). The faculty's research fields are defined as economic education, management, strategy, entrepreneurship, accounting, and Islamic finance. The doctoral programme is run by the School of Postgraduate Studies. A chairperson/ head of study programme is allocated for each programme.

IV. Assessment of the study programmes

1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

Bachelor/Master degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

Doctoral degree

The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.

[ESG 1.2]

General Description

The curricula of all Bachelor's programmes are classified into different groups of courses. Mandatory for all Bachelor students are *general courses* covering 14 SKS and which include "Civics Education", "Bahasa Indonesia", "Community Service" and "Pancasila Education". The latter addresses the official, foundational philosophical theory of Indonesia. Furthermore, a *university-based professional course* on "Introduction to Education" is mandatory for all Bachelor students.

The duration and the number of credits are presented in these overviews:

Programme	Family Welfare Education	Fashion Education
Degree	Bachelor of Education	Bachelor of Education
Extent	144 SKS credits (=217 ECTS)	144 SKS credits (= 217 ECTS)
Length of studies	8 semesters	8 semesters
Language	Bahasa	Bahasa

Programme	Culinary Education	Electrical Engineering Education
Degree	Bachelor of Education	Bachelor of Education
Extent	144 SKS credits (=217 ECTS)	148 SKS credits (=223 ECTS)
Length of studies	8 semesters	8 semesters
Language	Bahasa	Bahasa

The thesis in the Bachelor's programmes covers 6 SKS credits. UPI uses the national credit system based on the tertiary education system in Indonesia, called a Semester Credit Unit, SKS. One SKS for a theory course is said to have a workload of 170 minutes per week with 16 meetings per semester. One SKS for a practicum amounts to 290 minutes of workload per week.

Fashion Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

By completing the programme, graduates are supposed to be able to carry out professional duties as an educator, to formulate learning indicators, to master the teaching materials of fashion, to design learning by applying the principle of technological pedagogical and content knowledge, to carry out learning by mastering the principles and techniques of using information and communication technology and to evaluate input, processes, and learning outcomes.

The 144 SKS credits are spread among General Courses (14 SKS credits), Basic Education Courses (8 SKS credits), Faculty Expertise Courses (4 SKS credits), Subject Learning Expertise Courses (12 SKS credits), Introductory Courses in The Education Unit Field (4 SKS credits), Core Courses of Study (80 SKS credits) as well as Study Group Expertise Courses (16 SKS credits). The thesis, as mentioned earlier, covers 6 SKS credits.

UPI emphasizes that some of the courses reflect the Industrial Revolution 4.0, such as "CAD Clothing Pattern Making", "Fashion Applied Computer" or design technology courses, as well as Fashion and Society 5.0, namely "Fashion Business Management", "Entrepreneurship" or "Textile Craft".

Experts' evaluation

The course is very well structured. The desired qualifications and learning outcomes to be achieved are presented transparently in the course handbook. The programme contains disciplinary and interdisciplinary elements which meet both academic and labour market policy requirements. Feedback from employers in business and science is recorded. The contents of the programme are regularly evaluated and updated.

Students and employers are very satisfied with the learning outcomes and skills achieved.

Students achieve learning outcomes and requirements that meet national, European and international qualifications frameworks. Proof of competence in specialist knowledge and didactics are sustainably integrated into the examination culture. Specialist internships in schools and business promote students' competence to act, i.e., general personal skills. Students develop their own personal attitude.

The curriculum structure is very good. The high proportion of professional practice is appreciated by the panel members because it gives students a chance to get into contact with specific knowledge and subject didactics. This leads to both, a high level of theoretical reflection and the practical feasibility of projects. In total the study programme corresponds to Indonesia's political requirements. The distribution of credits between the different modules is correct. The curriculum leaves room for organising individual studies. The organisation of studies is supported by advice from lecturers (academic advisors). The specialisation within the course of studies determines inclination and career choice.

Lecturers and students work with great time commitment. Both groups of stakeholders consider the human and material resources are sufficient but the panel of experts sees room for improvement (see Chapter on Teaching Staff). The stakeholders also consider the equipment with labs as adequate.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Family Welfare Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The aim of the programme is to qualify professional teachers for vocational high schools. Thus, students shall acquire the competencies to develop and manage a family welfare education learning programme in accordance with pedagogical principles of vocational high school in the fields of expertise of social work, hotel accommodation, and craftsmanship.

In particular, the learning outcomes for special skills comprise the following abilities: 1) to apply various approaches and teaching methods for family welfare education in vocational school, 2) to utilize ICT-based learning media in the teaching of family welfare education in vocational high school, and 3) to disseminate innovative ideas that develop and improve the quality of family welfare education at local, regional and national levels.

The curriculum structure consists of 14 SKS credits of the above-mentioned general courses which shall foster social and personality competencies, 8 SKS of professional foundation courses, 4 SKS of faculty competency courses, 12 SKS of professional competency courses, 86 SKS of core expertise courses, 16 SKS of electives, and 4 SKS covering the field experience programme.

It is stated that the programme undergoes regular evaluations, such as conducting surveys of graduate users, focus group discussions involving representatives of vocational teachers, and collegial meetings with similar study programme associations and professional associations.

Experts' evaluation

The profile of the Family Welfare programme's staff as well as the annual numbers of applicants and enrolled students were presented during the online site visit by UPI. It was presented that the study programme prepares its curriculum based on the comments of lecturers, students, alumni, and representatives of the labour market.

In Indonesia, many core elements of the study programmes are prescribed by national regulations. UPI explained during the visit that the curriculum has been adjusted to the desired qualifications by referring to Indonesia's National Framework (KKNI) and national curriculum reference. Nevertheless, the Faculty adapts the curriculum also to most recent developments on the labour market and society which are discussed in the university. The courses are derived based on the curriculum, then the learning outcomes of each course were determined by considering intended graduates' competences.

To ensure that students perform in both vocational and didactic trainings, the interests are organised in subject groups, i.e. family welfare, learning media, lesson planning, and micro teaching. This policy should equip students with professional and pedagogical skills. Considering recommendations from the labour market, the intended learning outcomes fulfil the requirements of the schools and society as indicated by graduates' competences. However, at this current stage, the level of English for both, lecturers and students, needs improvement **(Finding 1).**

A tracer study filled-out by alumni and labour markets indicates the achievement of intended learning outcomes. Another tracer study, in which 156 alumni participated, revealed that alumni work as teachers, instructors, and entrepreneurs. Representatives of the labour market in the West Java area revealed that 50% of all teachers at their school come from UPI with good and relevant skills and knowledge.

The current curriculum dates to 2018 and was developed from the 2013 curriculum by incorporating some subjects related to the application of information technology and applied computers. To support curriculum development, regular focus group discussions with alumni, experts and labour market representatives have been held. On the micro level, discussions about the curriculum are also held among the teaching staff before every semester, while on the macro level, a curriculum revision of the study programmes is carried out every 5 years at university level. Documents show the development of the study programme.

During the online site visit, it was mentioned that learning materials are enriched with lecturers' research and publications to respond to global issues within the programme. However, the references listed in the module handbooks are out of date, particularly the textbooks. Therefore, updating the references of academic literature which should be read by students is of high importance **(Finding 2).**

To enhance its internationalisation, the study programme sends lecturers and students to some international events such as conferences and competitions. The Faculty also strives to foster international student exchange shown by a Japanese student currently taking part in this study programme. Moreover, lecturers have also participated in research collaborations, trainings, lesson studies and as keynote speakers.

With regard to supporting students' competencies, the study programme runs four specialisations, i.e., Hotel Accommodation, Handicraft, Social Working and Family Welfare. Lecturers are distributed to the respective specializations by considering their academic backgrounds.

The success of the learning process is assessed through quizzes, assignments, mid-semester and end-of-semester tests. According to the information given to the panel of experts, the exam questions can measure students' abilities according to the learning outcomes of the subjects and the learning outcomes of graduates according to their level of study. The Faculty described in the SER that the level of learning difficulties in related aspects such as cognitive, affective and psychomotor areas is taken into account. The panel of experts

requests that UPI checks and adapts the level of exams because on the basis of the documents it got the impression that the exam questions mainly measure the aspect of C1 (knowledge) **(Finding 3).**

Considering that alumni of this study programme can work as vocational schoolteachers, the specialization of Family Welfare Education is less promising because at the vocational school level, there are very few study programmes for social workers, thus the need for teachers is also very limited. Hotel Accommodation is among the most popular study programmes at the vocational school level. Graduates of Home Economics and crafts-manship specifications could become schoolteachers in Middle and High Schools.

To increase the interest of applicants, a road show was held by distributing brochures to schools. In addition, complete information about the study programmes and the registration process is also posted on the website. The study programme also held seminars involving vocational school students of UPI.

Industrial internships are the embodiment of partnership between study programmes and industry. In the Family Welfare Education programme, the industrial internship has the objective to provide work-learning opportunities. In addition, it is hoped that industrial internship will foster business learning opportunities in large and medium-sized industries with the principle of learning to work. Students are expected to be able to understand the constraints and problems faced by large and medium-sized industries and understand their business principles. The industrial internship is carried out over a period of 3 months with a load of 3 credits. The internship loads and duration are under university regulation. Students are accompanied by supervisors and field supervisors during the implementation of these activities. At the end of the programme, students are required to submit activity reports.

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

Culinary Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The programme aims to produce graduates who carry out their profession as educators in the culinary field at vocational high schools. Accordingly, pedagogic, personal, social, and professional competences shall be conveyed.

Among the programme learning outcomes defined by UPI are the abilities to understand the theoretical concepts of educational science, strategies, lesson planning, media, learning methodology and evaluation as well as the psychology of culinary education, to understanding the theoretical concepts of research methods in the field, to plan, implement and assess learning outcomes in culinary education and to apply Information and Communication Technology including Literacy in planning. Additionally, graduates are supposed to be trained in creating innovative culinary products.

As outlined by UPI, the outlined competences are addressed in the curriculum: pedagogic competence is manifested in basic education subjects (8 SKS credits) and the field experience programme (4 SKS credits). Personality, social and professional competences are facilitated in 14 SKS credits of general subjects, 4 SKS credits of faculty expertise courses, 12 SKS credits of professional subjects, 86 SKS credits of core expertise subject courses. Students can focus on one expertise by choosing 16 SKS credits among the areas of expertise (1) culinary services, (2) patisserie and (3) culinary nutrition.

The curriculum is said to follow a learning pyramid: Subjects that are given in semester 1 and 2 are general and basic education subjects such as "Religious Education", "Pancasila (Indonesian Five Pillars of Ideology) Education", Indonesian and English Language Education, Sports/Arts or "Foundation of Education" and

"Educational Psychology and Counselling". The next semesters contain core expertise subjects such as "Entrepreneurship", "Applied Natural Sciences", "Consumer Education", "Tourism Gastronomy", "Computer Applications", "Bakery", "Pastry", and "Diet Therapy". In semester 6, students have to participate in the "Community Service Programme" in which students are actively involved in community empowerment and teach at schools. In Semester 7, students conduct the" Field Experience Programme" at a vocational school. In semester 7 or 8 students take on a job training (industrial practices) in e.g. the culinary service industry, in nutritional installations at hospitals or the bakery industries to gain learning experience at work.

According to UPI, the programme provides learning opportunities to gain professional and international experience by e.g. organizing a student exchange programme. Other programme activities, as an effort to support student work orientation in the future, include on the job training in Kuala Lumpur, academic visits to domestic universities, namely Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Universitas Negeri Jakarta and Universitas Negeri Semarang, visits to various food industries, visits to international food expos, and visits to tourism vocational schools. Furthermore, students are said to be involved in lecturers' research.

Experts' evaluation

During the online site visit, the department presented profiles of the teaching staff as well as the annual enrolled students, average study period, graduate profile and intended learning outcomes. The curriculum structure for the programme includes nationally prescribed courses and discipline-specific courses that lay good foundations for Culinary Education studies. Moreover, it became evident during the discussions that the programme focuses on patisserie, culinary service, and culinary nutrition, where the programme clearly has its strengths. This provides students with essential skills, knowledge, and competencies on level 6 of the National Qualification Framework (Sarjana I). Thesis writing is a requirement to complete the study. Upon completion of the thesis, students need to pass a thesis examination. The workload of this final thesis examination is included in the thesis credits (6 credits).

The curriculum ensures the achievement of pedagogical, personality, social, and professional competences in a total of 144 credits. The entire curriculum, lesson plans, and intended learning outcomes are posted on the study programme's website. Each competence is manifested in some subjects, for example, pedagogical competences will be achieved through pedagogical subjects and a school teaching internship. Professional competences are gained through culinary programme expertise courses. Basic pedagogical skills are accomplished through some subjects e.g., Foundation of Education and Curriculum and Instruction, while applied pedagogy can be achieved through subjects of lesson planning, learning strategies, and ICT literature. During the last year of study, students engage in a school internship. Those subjects ensure the acquirement of pedagogic skills. The discussions with the labour market and alumni clarified that graduates are employed as schoolteachers, in the food sector, and as entrepreneurs. At this moment, the intended learning outcomes on the programme level cover a general description of a culinary education programme.

During the online site visit the lecturers explained that they try to include the students in their research projects. The students gain the benefits of accelerating their studies as well as receiving research training by collecting data for their thesis under the umbrella research of the lecturers. Outcomes of this research can be publications in a journal or on a conference, monographs, textbooks, and prototypes. The research outcomes enrich the learning materials and ensure the updating of learning materials. However, many references listed in the module handbooks are out of date and mainly come from textbooks. Therefore, updating the references is of high importance **(Finding 2)**. Community service which has to be carried out by lecturers and students on a regular basis is also important for the students, because it provides opportunities for them to gain expertise in other social contexts as well as practice the gained knowledge.

In light of this context, the curriculum has been further developed, taking evaluations by students, graduate surveys, or feedback from the labour market into consideration. The curriculum in the first year is based on a mix of courses and introductory courses (e.g., Basic Culinary Arts) while more advanced courses follow in later semesters. The achievement of the intended learning outcomes is demonstrated with a Bachelor's thesis placed in the last year of the curriculum. Students also need to take an internship in the last year. The curriculum is generally characterised as a strict curriculum with a clear indication of which courses have to be taken throughout the Bachelor's programme. The curriculum offers only a few electives starting in the fifth semester and a more significant emphasis in the seventh semester. As the field of culinary education is becoming more international, a good command of English will be needed to share regional topics with the world. In addition, language skills are valuable in the light of the aspect of lifelong learning. Therefore, room should be given to students and lecturers to expand their English language competencies **(see Finding 1).**

In order to adjust the study programme's curriculum to the demands of the labour market and scientific development, periodical focus group discussions (FGD) are carried out by inviting vocational schools, industry representatives, alumni, and study programme associations. The FGD results are used to follow up on curriculum improvement. A tracer study covering two years after graduation was filled out by 111 alumni (89%). The results reveal that most of the graduates are teachers (57%) while 27% are entrepreneurs and 16% work in the food sector. Labour market representatives state that the graduates are competent and involved in increasing the quality of education. Some graduates succeed in becoming heads of divisions or workshops. Graduates' competencies related to pedagogy and professional skills are well-proven.

In terms of evaluation of students, the study programme uses quizzes, assignments, internship reports, midsemester and end-of-semester tests. According to the documents handed in by UPI, some practical courses only evaluate students' practical competences, however it is also important to evaluate their theoretical competencies. The exam questions should be varied in order to measure students' competences in analysis, synthesis, and evaluation, not only their knowledge **(Finding 3).**

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

Electrical Engineering Education (Bachelor of Education)

Description

The main career of graduates is defined by UPI as educators in vocational high schools or in industries, or as trainers in the field of electrical education. According to the SER, students are trained to be able to plan, implement, manage, and evaluate a learning process as well as enhance the learning method and process applied in vocational high schools and training institution associated with telecommunication, industrial electronic, and power electric. The Faculty describes in the SER that the students will be able to plan and manage human resources during the learning process in the class, school, educational institution under their responsibility, and evaluate the whole activity comprehensively.

The programme offers 3 specializations: Electrical Engineering, Industrial Electronics Engineering, and Telecommunications Engineering. The curriculum contains 18 SKS credits of general course, 24 SKS credits of pedagogical courses and 106 SKS credits of electrical competence courses, which are divided into theory-based and laboratory-based classes. Each specialization consists of 23 SKS of mandatory courses and 16 SKS of elective courses.

Experts' evaluation

Overall, the curriculum is very impressive. UPI is doing a very good job in educating students in Electrical Engineering. During the virtual site visit, all information regarding the study programme was consistent. It showed that all stakeholders are highly motivated to achieve a high programme quality and are highly engaged in improving the study programme quality. The programme was presented thoroughly, and all questions were answered clearly and openly.

The documentation in the SER and appendices is clear and transparent, reflecting the programme in an excellent way. The goal of the study programme, the contents of the curriculum and the workload are clearly described. UPI implements the targeted competencies thoroughly according to the national standards. The panel of experts have no doubt that the desired qualification goals are achieved by the programme.

The teaching staff in the Electrical Engineering programme shows a high scientific qualification and a remarkably high motivation to carry out research and to improve teaching. They know that the financial resources are limited and show innovative ideas to provide a good education even with limited resources. Projects, participation in research, and interdisciplinary elements are included in the programme. Students learn technical skills and soft skills in a combination that is valuable for them in their future career. Teaching and research are connected so that curricular contents can be improved by the results of research projects. The elective course system seems conducive to qualify students for their later career.

It is of great importance that students do a compulsory internship in school and in the industry. There is a high number of exams, but they seem well-managed by the faculty and appropriate for the students. Support opportunities on many levels are available to students who face difficulties during their study programme. The low drop-out rate reflects the high quality of the curriculum and the high level of student support.

The feedback from students is noticeably positive as they are very satisfied with the programme. They appreciate the lectures and are also satisfied with the exam system. As the lab education is very important for the students, it should be further developed based on the lessons learned from the pandemic **(Finding 4).**

Another important aspect is the lecturer - student feedback at the end of each semester. After feedback on a course has been collected via the online platform, an opportunity to meet and exchange in a dialogue should be given to lecturer and students **(Finding 5).**

Labour market representatives are included in the further development of the programme. There seem to be good connections with alumni to keep in contact with companies and schools. The labour market representatives are very satisfied with the quality of the programme.

The technology is changing continuously. This is a big challenge for all universities in keeping the technical state of the lectures up-to-date, especially for practical courses in the labs. The experts strongly recommend to take care that the labs have enough financial resources to deliver a state-of-the-art education. More resources for hardware and software would be helpful to maintain the high quality of the study programme. UPI should hand in a concept including an action plan that shows how the infrastructure of the labs will be regularly updated within the accreditation periods **(Finding 6).**

The industry internship is of high importance as students practice engineering work in the real world. It is also very important for prospective teachers to see and work in industrial practice. This is the only way they can later teach their students about working in the industry. Yet, students only gain 3 SKS by completing the industry internship, which seems too low. It is recommended to consider increasing the weight of the industry internship within the curriculum **(Finding 7).**

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

Technology and Vocational Education (Doctor of Education)

Description

According to the SER, the profile of the graduates of the doctoral programme is either a researcher in technological and vocational education who is able to publish his/ her works on regional, national, and international levels or a professional educator in technological and vocational education.

Graduates are supposed to master the philosophy of theory as well as of approaches, models, methods, media and evaluation in the field of technical and vocational education, to discover or develop new scientific theories/ conceptions/ ideas and contribute to the development, practice of science, technology, art, and application of humanities values in their fields of expertise through scientific research based on research roadmaps with interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, or transdisciplinary approaches. In addition, graduates should be able to improve knowledge in technical and vocational education giving original and scientifically proven contribution through research promoting interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary approaches.

This table summarizes the core information on the programme:

Programme	Technology and Vocational Education
Degree	Doctor of Education
Extent	43 SKS credits (=65 ECTS)
Length of studies	4 semesters
Language	Bahasa

The PhD programme can be studied *by research* or *by course* with different implications for the curriculum. The doctor by course includes postgraduate expertise courses ("Philosophy of Science", "Scientific Data Statistics" and "Pedagogical Studies"), core expertise courses of 15 SKS credits and optional subject courses

The *PhD by research* appeals to students with high potential and it requires a larger amount of research and publication, namely 4 scientific publications. Course work is reduced accordingly (3 courses are mandatory).

Both options contain a dissertation of 15 SKS credits.

The publication requirements for doctor by research are in particular one article accepted by and published in a reputable international journal (Scopus indexed or equivalent), one article accepted/ published in an accredited national journal with a minimum of SINTA or published in the proceedings of an international seminar indexed by Scopus or its equivalent, one article published in the proceedings of an indexed international seminar and one article published in the proceedings of a national seminar with ISBN.

According to UPI, the programme has been conducting collaborations with the industry and other stakeholders to develop curriculum and educational programmes. Some of the involved associations are the Association of Indonesia Technological and Vocational Education and the Association of Teachers and Lecturers of Technological and Vocational Education.

Experts' evaluation

As in any doctoral programme, its quality and attractiveness depend significantly on lecturers'/ advisors' research and publication activities. The lecturers/ advisors involved in UPI's doctoral programme are remarkably

active in terms of research and publication. One example for their activities is the latest publication of a chapter in the highly prestigious handbook "TVET Teacher Education and Training in International and Development Co-Operation – Models, Approaches and Trends" published by Springer Singapore (2022).

In short, the panel of experts is convinced that the lecturers/ advisors involved in UPI's doctoral programme in TVET are highly suitable and can contribute most recent developments and research findings. Due to the close personal supervision by professors, the individual path and the success of the doctorate is guaranteed. The scientific work adheres to international standards. This is ensured by connection to international research or peer review at the international level.

The core of the doctoral programme is based on independent research. In order to support this research, a variety of modules are offered. The doctoral programme as such differentiates between candidates that join with a TVET background (linear track) and candidates with a TVET related background (non-linear track).

For candidates with a non-TVET background, a portfolio of TVET-specific modules is offered, as those students need to be equipped with concepts of TVET and specific insights, including Global Issues in TVET, Quality Assurance in TVET, Public Private Partnership (PPP), etc. The panel of experts sees this approach as very conducive as it opens the programme for a larger clientele, structures the research process and helps students stick to the research schedule. In sum, it can be anticipated that more candidates will finish their doctoral programme within the expected time frame and most likely with solid research outcomes.

Candidates with a TVET background (linear track) are supported with courses/ modules, too. They must take Pedagogical Studies courses, Statistical Data Science, as well as two independent study courses related to the topic of the chosen research areas (according to the advisor's recommendation). Yet, they enjoy more leeway in their research, which is highly adequate.

For both forms of the doctoral programme the course of study, milestones, compulsory modules, timeline, and expected outcomes are well-documented. The research and study processes are transparent and documented in brochures by the School of Postgraduate Studies.

Modern TVET research is, to a great extent, based on qualitative research approaches. Therefore, the experts recommend addressing these approaches in a compulsory module for doctoral candidates **(Finding 8).** Contents of the module could be interview techniques (such as question-guided interviews, problem-centred interviews, expert interviews, focus groups) and qualitative data analysis (such as content-, narrative-, discourse- and thematic analysis, as well as grounded theory).

In general, workload and support are well-balanced. It can be anticipated that graduates from the doctoral programme have acquired profound academic and research competencies in the area of TVET.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

2. Procedures for quality assurance

> **Bachelor/Master degree**
> *The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*
>
> *A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*
>
> *The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

> *Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*
>
> *[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
>
> *The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*
>
> *A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*
>
> *The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*
>
> *Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*
>
> *[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]*

Description

Generally, the quality assurance policies at UPI rest on national and internal regulations, as stated in the self-evaluation report. UPI has implemented a Strategic Plan 2021–2025 in which policies, key performance indicators, annual targets, responsible parties and implementing units are defined and fixed.

With its Strategic Plan UPI wants to become a "pioneering and superior university in the ASEAN region". Indicators for the achievement of this goal are, for example, the number of programmes with international accreditation and the number of students who graduate in time. UPI has defined 57 quality assurance standards which combine national und internal standards. Furthermore, all study programmes are ISO 9001: 2015 certified.

Responsible parties and implementing units are defined on various levels, as outlined in the SER: a Central Quality Assurance Unit on university level, a Quality Control Unit on faculty level or graduate school level, respectively, and a Quality Control Cluster on programme level. These units operate differently: QCU is responsible for management and administrative aspects, while the Quality Control Unit deals with the academic, teaching and learning aspects of programmes (i.e., human resources, facilities, finance, and other administrative works). Teaching, learning, research, and students' learning fall under the responsibility of the Quality Control Cluster.

Procedures are said to follow a PDCA-cycle. Key-performance indicators, for example, will be checked regularly and their achievements are published in a Quality Target Achievement Report.

Internally, UPI applies a so-called Internal Quality Audit instrument to assess the quality of programmes annually. On programme level, Scientific Field Groups have been implemented with the aim of developing allied scientific expertise, encouraging further study for lecturers to takes doctoral degrees, applying active learning and e-learning models, and improving lecturer competence with various training and dedication, strengthening the academic supervisor function, and monitoring and evaluating the academic service process.

Furthermore, UPI conducts several surveys, according to the SER. Among those are student satisfaction and lecturer performance questionnaires at the end of the semester and regular tracer studies of graduates/alumni. UPI outlines that it uses the collected data to further develop the programmes.

UPI claims to involve the feedback of the labour market into the development of its programmes. For example, professional associations and employers shall be involved in curriculum preparation and discussions in developing the latest developments faced by programmes and formulating strategic steps to improve the quality of learning so that graduates have national and global competitiveness.

Experts' evaluation

The quality assurance system used in the study programmes under review is very well developed. The inter-action between the central university-wide Quality Assurance Unit and the Quality Control Units at the faculty level convinced the panel of experts in the online assessment. Responsibilities are clearly defined. Particularly impressive is the clear vision and mission of UPI and of the Faculty of Technology and Vocational Education. All stakeholders at UPI show strong efforts to act in accordance with the self-set goals and mission. Both at the management level and at the level of the faculty, the experts observed a coherent and clear alignment with the self-set goals to continuously develop teaching and learning.

The panel of experts confirms that the quality assurance system itself is subject to a continuous review process and that the University's management assigns great importance to continuous optimization and possible rapid adaptation to new evolving conditions. This is also reflected by the fact that the faculty has been awarded with the ISO 9001:2015 certificate for service quality and academic management. The quality assurance system is reviewed by the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (BAN-PT) in Indonesia every five years. In addition, all study programmes are regularly evaluated both internally on an annual basis and by external evaluators every five years.

The implementation of various evaluations and the coordination of accreditation and certification procedures are ensured by the Quality Assurance Unit and the Quality Control Unit. The panel of experts confirms that surveys are used intensively within the quality assurance system. The evaluation system addresses all phases of study from freshmen to graduates, collects data and evaluates it continuously as part of the quality assur-ance system. The university derives actions from the results of the surveys and attaches clear expectations to them as to when the actions should be completed. In general, it is evident that the data on which the evalua-tions are based is excellent. The visualizations of the statistics available to the panel of experts also show that UPI has a lean but very effective way of quickly identifying optimization needs. The university has provided detailed statistics for all programmes under consideration. In particular, the statistics show the assessment of the success of the students and the employment areas of the graduates.

During the site visit, it became apparent that all lecturers within the programmes care about the results of the module evaluations. During the discussions, the experts heard many examples of optimizations that were carried out because of feedback, which shows that the modules are continuously being developed.

The feedback of employers is also requested on an ongoing basis. The representatives of the labour market show a great attachment to the graduates of the study programmes and to the university itself. Students also appear as partners in the quality assurance system, providing constructive and critical input.

Students of the doctoral programme are intensively supervised by the professors of the faculty. This ensures the quality of research results and the assurance of academic standards.

During the site visit, the experts gained the impression that all stakeholders work together to provide ideal conditions for conducting high-quality teaching and research. The panel of experts assesses the quality man-agement system as robust and future-oriented and has no doubt that the quality management system in place enables UPI to continuously develop itself and its programmes.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

Bachelor/Master degree

The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Doctoral degree

The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.

Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.

Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.

[ESG 1.3]

Description

According to the documents handed in by UPI, the learning process in the programmes is designed to encourage students to think critically, to explore, to be creative, and to conduct experiments by utilizing various sources. The learning design for each course is written in a semester lesson plan, which is supplemented with references and teaching materials/ hand-out/ lecture notes.

In particular, the lecture process in the Bachelor's programmes is described as being carried out in 3 types, namely face-to-face lectures inside or outside the classroom, practicum in the laboratory, and internships (so-called Field Experience Programme). In class, lecturers are supposed to use case studies, team discussions, role playing, simulations, and demonstrations. In addition, digital media is provided via an online learning platform.

Learning facilities and infrastructure are said to be designed to facilitate students with special needs to take part in lecture activities, such as attendance relief. Otherwise, students are expected to participate in 80% of class hours.

As practical elements in the Bachelor's programmes, UPI highlights the community service in the 8th semester, an industrial practice in the 7th semester (e.g. in government agencies or creative industries) and a school internship usually in semester 8.

In the doctoral programme, the teaching and learning methods are described as promoting interactive, integrative, scientific, and collaborative while following student-centred principles. The academic advisor plays a central role in student consultancy for this type of advanced students.

As stated in the SER, the success of the learning process is measured through various evaluations, namely quizzes, structured assignments, performance/practicum, mid-semester and final semester examinations, as well as assessment of structural assignments.

Several instances, such as the lecturer him-/ herself, the head of study programme or the dean, are listed to which students can turn to when they have complaints.

Experts' evaluation

The diversity of learning and teaching methods supports the development of students' competences. It leads to an increasing independence in the acquisition of knowledge and in professionalization. Individual access to the learning and study content is guaranteed. The establishment of an online platform with teaching content

enables a further individualization of studying or a supplement to the teaching (as well as for repetition and deepening). The panel of experts commend the transparent information provided to the students but the workload in the course descriptions of all programmes has to be presented coherently and consistently **(Finding 9)**. In addition, the workload of the thesis defence in the Bachelors' programmes has to be taken into consideration.

The various internships support the transfer and application of knowledge and competence to activities in school, business, or industry. The different forms of examination support students in creatively presenting their motivation, self-reflection, and commitment. The examination formats are already introduced at the beginning of the courses. A variety of projects are carried out that require the entire competence development of the examinee. The implementation of independent projects with problem-solving strategies shows the acquisition, deepening, and transfer in the generation and transmission of knowledge, art, aesthetics, and media of different kinds. It also shows the students' own competence in the professional as well as personality-developing aspects. The examination procedures are transparent and comprehensible. The examination periods are clearly defined and communicated. During the studies, learning successes are determined in the middle and at the end of the semester.

The supportive supervision of the students leads to good or to very good results. The drop-out rate is therefore remarkably low. The evaluation appears objective and criteria based.

The examination modalities are clearly regulated. They include opposition proceedings, repetition of exams, and compensation for disadvantages. Examination and study regulations are published on UPI's homepage. Students are free to submit appeals and objections to the examination office via their lecturer, course director, or dean.

The mentoring and supervision of PhD students are carried out by the academic advisor, the head of the study programme, and the Quality Control Group of the programme. The academic adviser is assigned to provide direction and approval of course contracts every semester. The academic advisor is also assigned to review dissertation proposals proposed by students and giving approval to attend a proposal seminar submitted. The head of study programme and Quality Control Group routinely assist all students during the process of preparing a dissertation proposal through joint guidance activities. The programme also regularly holds meetings to check the progress of each student's academic progress in the joint academic guidance activity forum.

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

4. **Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification**

> **Bachelor/Master degree**
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*
>
> **Doctoral degree**
> *The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.*
> *Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*
> *[ESG 1.4]*

Description

Admission

According to national regulations, admission to Bachelor's programmes is based on different procedures: national selection, joint selection of state universities and independent selection of UPI. National selection to enter state universities is a national admission route for undergraduate education programmes through the selection of academic achievements for students with high achievements. Joint selection to enter state universities is a pathway for admitting new students to undergraduate education programmes which is carried out jointly with other state universities through computer-based written examinations and portfolios. Independent selection for prospective undergraduate students is carried out by UPI itself.

The study programmes determine the quota of students to be accepted each year based on the ratio analysis between the number of lecturers and students and the availability of facilities.

Admission requirements for the doctoral degree programme are holding a Master's diploma with a minimum GPA of 3.00 (on a scale of 0.00–4.00), the availability of a dissertation research proposal, an interview and the passing of an Academic Potential Test. Additionally, students have to provide proof of a minimum TOEFL score of 525 or minimum IELTS score of 5. Prospective doctor by research students must provide a supervisor letter of support from the prospective promoter.

Information on the admission requirements and procedures is provided on UPI's website.

Progression

Student's progression is monitored via academic supervisors and the student directory system which is accessible to the head of the programme, as outlined by UPI. The number of credits to be taken in each semester depends on the average score obtained by students in the previous semester and must be approved by the academic supervisor.

Recognition and Certification

UPI outlines procedures for credit transfer. At the end of studies, UPI issues a diploma and a transcript.

Experts' evaluation

The formal requirements and prerequisites for individual study programmes are clearly defined and made available, as are the selection procedures. The SER only states for the programme in TVE, that a research project must be completed, but the process for awarding a doctorate seems to be clearly defined. The university has provided tables of the number of applicants and accepted students for the last four years.

The regulations regarding the recognition of competences and transfer of credits were documented in Guidelines for Education Implementation in 2020 and are available in every study programme. The experts believe that the regulations implemented reflect UPI's efforts to provide opportunities for students to study abroad and accept students from other international higher education institutions. The university has implemented recognition mechanisms for informal and non-formal education obtained by students in compliance with provisions that are available through UPI's online learning platform SIAKAD. Meanwhile, the recognition of professional competencies in the culinary sector is recognized through the Professional Certification Agency (LSP).

The study programme facilitates a diverse set of international activities through inter-institutional agreements set out in Memorandum of Understandings (MoUs). There are different mechanisms for accepting students who transfer within one knowledge group and students who transfer between knowledge groups. The recognition mechanism for informal education is described in SKPI provisions based on a Circular of the Vice Chancellor for Academic and Student Affairs from October 2013.

Graduates will receive a Bachelor's Degree, a transcript containing the value of learning achievements each semester, and a Certificate of Companion Diploma containing a description of the skills and achievements/ prestige that graduates have achieved.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

Bachelor/Master degree
The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.
Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.
Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.
[ESG 1.5]
Doctoral degree
The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.
Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.
Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.
[ESG 1.5]

Description

Teaching staff is employed either as civil servants or non-civil servants. Educational staff may hold positions of lecturer, assistant professor, associate professor, and full professor. The number of teaching hours varies between 12 and 16 SKS credits per semester.

For the academic development of its lecturers, UPI encourages lecturers to participate in doctoral programmes. Other than participating in formal education, they can participate in seminars and workshops. In the SER it is stated that UPI has a professional development programme for its lecturers. The university also offers a capacity building programme for administrative staff.

The selection and recruitment of civil servant lecturers and education staff follows national regulations, while UPI carries out the selection and recruitment of non-civil servant personnel internally.

All programmes state that they invite guest lecturers from other universities and the professional practice.

The fulltime teaching staff of *"Family Welfare Education"* (Bachelor of Education) consist of 8 full-time lecturers, consisting of 5 lecturers in the position of associate professor, 2 in the role of assistant professor, and one lecturer in the work of assistant expert. The academic qualifications they have are four doctoral degrees and four Master's degrees with expertise in family science, informal education, sociology, vocational education, and early childhood education. As outlined in the SER, lecturers are involved in professional associations and organizations, such as the Indonesian Vocational Teacher and Lecturer Association, the Indonesian Family Welfare Science Association, the Indonesian Technical Education Association, The Asian Academic Society for Vocational Education and Training, or The Indonesia Society of Approach Education.

16 lecturers teach in the Bachelor's programme of *"Culinary Education"* (10 associate professors, 3 assistant professors, and 3 lecturers). All teaching staff is employed as full time. Among the associations the lecturers

are affiliated with are the Food and Nutrition Society of Indonesia or the Association of Indonesian Culinary Education Study Programme.

In *"Fashion Education"* UPI lists 10 permanent lecturers, of whom 3 hold a doctoral degree, 6 a Master's degree, and one person currently completing his/ her doctoral degree studies. The lecturers are grouped into 4 scientific groups, namely design, boutique, craft, and makeup.

Teaching staff in *"Electrical Engineering Education"* comprises 28 permanent lecturers who are grouped into the scientific fields of electrical power engineering education, telecommunication engineering education, and industrial electronics engineering education. There are 5 lecturers with full professorships. All lecturers are fulltime staff.

For *"Technical and Vocational Education"*, the teaching staff includes 8 professors and 8 associate professors.

Experts' evaluation

The documentation about the lecturers and their qualifications is comprehensive and transparent. The qualifications of the lecturers are very impressive, especially their continuous efforts for further education in research and teaching. UPI provides lecturers with opportunities for further education so their knowledge can be kept up to date.

The recruitment system for lecturers is transparent. UPI encourages lecturers to become a professor by enabling them to further their own qualifications by pursuing a PhD, doing research, and publishing the results.

Except for the Fashion Education programme, the experts consider the qualification and number of lecturers to be appropriate to educate the number of students in their respective programme. The workload of the lecturers depends on their additional tasks in administration, research, and social service. It is appropriate for the programmes.

The number of teaching staff in the Fashion Education programme is quite limited compared to the other programmes. The panel of experts is not convinced that the lecturer-to-student ratio is sufficient to guarantee a good education and support for students. Moreover, the Fashion Education programme is taught only by lecturers, no professor is employed in this programme. The panel of experts requests that UPI hands in a staff development plan which describes how the number of teaching staff in the Fashion Education programme shall be increased in the next five years and how it can be guaranteed that there will also be professors to teach future students **(Finding 10).**

For the PhD programme, all professors hold a PhD title and do active research. They are qualified to supervise PhD candidates. Therefore, the panel of experts states for the programme Technology and Vocational Education that in addition to publication activities, the research activities of the teaching staff are more than adequate. Two examples of research projects highlight UPI's up-to-date research ventures in TVE: "TVET Teaching Strategy during COVID-19: A Comparative Study of Indonesia and Malaysia" and "Implementation of Simulation Software on Vocational High School Students in Programming and Arduino Microcontroller Subject". The research findings of the two example projects were published in the Journal of Technical Education and Training (2021).

There is international exchange of lecturers taking place: teaching staff from UPI go abroad to give lectures and lecturers from overseas come to UPI. This increases international interactions, provides intercultural understanding, and improves the quality of teaching.

Conclusion

The criterion is partly fulfilled.

6.   Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

Bachelor/Master degree

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.

Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

[ESG 1.6]

Doctoral degree

Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.

Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.

[ESG 1.6]

Description

Learning Resources

UPI is state-funded and charges tuition fees for its programmes. As outlined in the SER, there are several scholarship opportunities for students. UPI funds are allocated to the faculties and programmes and an Annual Activities Budgeting Plan is set up. Programmes are supposed to be independent in using their budget.

The programmes are offered on UPI's campus in Bandung, which includes classrooms, libraries, laboratory rooms, computer labs as well as sports facilities. The facilities are described as accessible for students with disabilities. For example, the campus is described to offer elevators in stories-building, ramps to access places with different heights or wider pedestrian roads.

Each study programme is described to use the following facilities: 4 classrooms, 1 library room managed by study programmes, court rooms, and 1 laboratory room. Other facilities that can be accessed at the faculty level are computer laboratories, microteaching laboratories, sharia banking laboratories, smart classrooms, sharia investment galleries, and digital business laboratories. The facilities that can be accessed at the university level include 1) university library, 2) sports facilities, consisting of a gymnasium, softball field, soccer field, sports hall and swimming pool, 3) other facilities consisting of the Islamic Tutorial Center, Language Center, Polyclinic, Cafeteria, Korean Corner, and Bank Indonesia Corner.

Student Support Services

During their studies, students are assigned an academic supervisor who provides consulting services related to academic and non-academic activities at least twice per semester. Furthermore, support is clustered at the Integrated Service Unit of Guidance and Career Development and Counselling.

New student orientation is held ahead of learning activities. According to UPI, these activities provide information about the university, the faculty, and the study programmes including the academic culture of the programme, introduction to lecturers and staff, and students' code of ethics.

Students with special needs can use the services provided by the Guidance and Counseling and Career Development. International student consultation is provided by the Directorate of International Affairs which is a special unit serving students from abroad which functions to provide information, acceptance, consultation, and assistance for international students.

Experts' evaluation

Based on the evidence given during the online site visit and in the SER, the experts can testify that UPI provides students with outstanding support and sufficient resources to ensure good academic success.

The university has sufficient facilities to ensure that courses are run smoothly. Despite the virtual walk-through, the experts were able to get a good picture of the laboratories available at the Faculty. Within the online site visit, extensive video footage of the premises was shown by the university, based on which the experts were able to discuss the spatial situation. The labs used in the programmes provide sufficient capacity for the current and projected number of students and the equipment in the laboratories is suitable for achieving the practically oriented learning outcomes of the study programmes. The panel of experts can also confirm that the university ensures the maintenance of the laboratories. UPI also provides opportunities for extracurricular activities for all students, such as a dormitory and sports fields. All study programmes are equipped with supporting facilities needed in carrying out academic activities. The literature provided within UPI's libraries is satisfactory. According to the university, the supply of scientific literature is constantly expanding, which is much appreciated.

In addition to the spatial resources, the experts also discuss the support of the students by the university and the faculty. The university provides very intensive support for its students. Both organizational and subject-related questions are usually discussed directly with the academic supervisor assigned to each student. The experts are particularly impressed by this individual support, which ensures that students achieve lasting success in their studies. The students confirmed to the experts during the site visit that they receive exceptionally good support and are generally very satisfied with the level of support. The study organizational information can be found on the university's website for students and interested parties. In particular, the learning outcomes can be found broken down by category on the websites of the programmes of study.

The programme management also supports students with internship placements in vocational schools. In the audit, the experts were also able to talk to the professional representatives of the vocational schools where the students do their internships. The strong bond between the employees of the local vocational schools and the university could be observed here as well.

In the online site visit, the panel of experts discussed the study conditions for doctoral students. Here, too, the expert group concludes that the supervision by the professors of the faculty is excellent. All those involved report a harmonic atmosphere and excellent professional and organizational support. The access to all necessary resources such as literature, archives, laboratories, and technical equipment is ensured.

In summary, the experts consider the criterion to be fully met. The resources and the supervision of the students have a positive effect on the students' success in their degree programme.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

7. Information / Public information

Bachelor/Master degree
Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.
[ESG 1.8]

Doctoral degree
Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.
[ESG 1.8]

Description

Public information is provided online through UPI's website which contains an information centre with links to all units, faculties, and study programmes.

Information on study programmes, learning outcomes, curriculum, graduate profiles, lecture processes, assessment procedures, student affairs, alumni, journals, collaborations, teaching and administrative staff, guidelines and news are accessible online via the respective study programmes' website.

Additionally, UPI offers printed information in the form of brochures and booklets as well as public lectures, webinars, workshops, campus and school visits aimed at prospective students.

Experts' evaluation

UPI has two public information services to promote their programmes, one online and one offline. The official website provides extensive information regarding the programme. Each study programme has its own website containing all information regarding the learning programme, student activities, teaching staff, research activities, selection procedures, and the qualification awarded. In case some information is missing from the online service, there is also an offline service through UPI's public relations centre.

The public information service infrastructure and online learning systems are managed by the university's Directorate of Information and Communication.

The panel of experts is satisfied with the information provided by UPI.

Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme *"Family Welfare Education"* (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia under conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme *"Fashion Education"* (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia under conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme *"Culinary Education"* (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia under conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme *"Electrical Engineering Education"* (Bachelor of Education) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia under conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme *"Technology and Vocational Education"* (Doctor of Education) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia under conditions.

Findings:

1. Room should be given to students and lecturers in Family Welfare Education and Culinary Education to expand their English **language competencies**, e.g. by offering relevant electives taught in English.

2. It is recommended to **update the references in the course handbooks** for the programmes in Family Welfare Education and Culinary Education.

3. UPI must check and **adapt the level of exams** in the programmes Family Welfare Education and Culinary Education. Exams must be varied to measure students' competences in analysis, synthesis, and evaluation, not only knowledge.

4. It is recommended that **lessons learned** from the pandemic will be implemented in the lab education in Electrical Engineering Education.

5. After students have provided online feedback on a course, UPI should provide **opportunities for a dialogue between the lecturers and their students**.

6. A concept including an action plan should be handed in which describes how the labs for Electrical Engineering Education will be **updated continuously** in the next five years.

7. In Electrical Engineering Education, it is recommended to consider **increasing the weight of the industry internship** within the curriculum.

8. It is recommended to address **approaches of qualitative research** in a compulsory module for doctoral candidates.

9. The **workload in the course descriptions** of all programmes must be presented coherently and consistently. In addition, the workload of the thesis defence in the Bachelors' programmes has to be taken into consideration.

10. UPI must hand in a **staff development plan** which describes how the number of teaching staff in the Fashion Education programme shall be increased in the next five years and how it can be guaranteed that there will also be professors teaching future students.