



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## EXPERTS' REPORT

# UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN INDONESIA CLUSTER ELEMENTARY EDUCATION

EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)

ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)

EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION (MASTER)

ELEMENTARY EDUCATION (MASTER)

ELEMENTARY EDUCATION (PHD)

August 2022



## Content

---

<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>I. Preamble .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>II. Accreditation procedure.....</b>	<b>7</b>
1. Criteria.....	7
2. Approach and methodology .....	7
<b>III. General information on the university .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....</b>	<b>9</b>
1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme .....	9
2. Procedures for quality assurance .....	18
3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students .....	20
4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification .....	23
5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff .....	25
6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment.....	27
7. Information / Public information.....	29
<b>V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....</b>	<b>31</b>

## DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- **EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)**
- **ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)**
- **EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION (MASTER)**
- **ELEMENTARY EDUCATION (MASTER)**
- **ELEMENTARY EDUCATION (PHD)**

### OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN, BANDUNG, INDONESIA

**Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting on 29 August 2022, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:**

1. The study programmes “Early Childhood Teacher Education” (Bachelor), “Elementary School Teacher Education” (Bachelor), “Early Childhood Education” (Master), “Elementary Education” (Master) and “Elementary Education” (PhD) offered by Universitas Pendidikan, Indonesia are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD).

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 September 2023**. The confirmation of the conditions might include a physical site visit within the time period of twelve months.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2028**.

#### **Condition:**

For all programmes:

1. The **course descriptions must be revised** to address the needs of the students and to improve the transparency of the course-descriptions. The intended learning outcomes must be defined individually and precisely and aligned with the content and examination formats. References to academic literature recommended in the course handbooks must be updated.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

For all programmes:

1. The course descriptions should be **provided in English**.
2. UPI should evaluate on a regular basis whether the **number of (generic) intended learning outcomes** should be reduced to the benefit of quality focus on fewer (specific) ones.
3. For further internationalisation, the **English language** should play a greater role in teaching.
4. **Benchmarking with other universities** should take place to sharpen the profile of the programmes.
5. UPI should point out more distinctly which are the **mandatory courses** that build an obligatory theoretically based curricular fundament and which are **electives** that give students the possibility to set individual priorities.
6. In terms of content, more courses should deal with the topic of **sustainable development education**.
7. UPI should better point out **how BA, MA an PhD are interlinked** and build on each other. One initiative could be to implement first steps in the direction of research in the BA programmes and to continue these research approaches in the MA programmes.
8. The curricula of teacher training should continuously be modified with regard to **changing requirements of the labour market and current developments**.
9. It is recommended to **organise cooperation with the labour market even more systematically** and to secure it conceptually and curricular.
10. The **indicators of the tracer studies** should be extended and differentiated.
11. It should be described how the **QA results** are integrated and are used more effectively by management in the planning, decision-making and change processes.
12. More **current and up-do-date literature**, especially in English, should be used.
13. The **functionality of some websites** should be improved.

Additionally for the Bachelor programmes:

14. More **practical components and academically supported internships** should be integrated in the early semesters of the two BA programmes. The number of opportunities for internships in a **wider range of areas** (not only in school and preschool) should be increased. These practical experiences should be prepared and followed up in seminars as to guaranteeing scientific monitoring and evaluation.
15. For the BA programmes it is recommended to emphasise stronger the **aspect of working with parents**, both to suitable reach out to families with younger children and to build educational partnerships to support children's' transition periods between non-institutional and institutional care, and school, respectively.
16. The **imbalance of the amount of content in the BA programmes** which occurs in semesters 6 and 7 should be reflected and be aligned.
17. **Adaption of content** should take place in the BA programmes, especially topics like "transitions", "resilience" and "didactic approaches" should be addressed. The subject "inclusion" should be broadened and include also children with other (social) disadvantages.

Additionally for the Bachelor programme “Early Childhood Education”:

18. The **number of teaching staff** which can represent the discipline in teaching and research should be raised in the BA programme “Early Childhood Education”.

Additionally for the Bachelor and Master programmes:

19. To strengthen the links between the BA and the MA, the panel of experts encourages UPI to evaluate annually and longitudinally the **ratio of students that continue in graduate programmes**.

Additionally for the Master programmes:

20. The **profile of both Masters’ programmes should be sharpened** by either addressing the research aspect (academic labour market perspective) or by strengthening the management aspect and prepare students for leadership tasks (non-academic labour market perspective) date. The focus of the MA Early Childhood Education **in arts** should be made more visible and promoted.
21. It should be explained in more detail **which professional activities** are open with the MA beyond those of graduates with the BA Early Childhood Education.
22. The content of the MA programmes should be distributed in a more balanced way between the semesters and more content should be transferred to semesters 3 and 4.

Additionally for the PhD programme:

23. To align the **PhD programme** with international practice the following steps should be taken:
  - a. If national regulations allow it, it is recommended to give a higher weighting on the scientific thesis (Dissertation).
  - b. Following international standards there should be the possibility for the dissertation to approach it monographically or cumulatively.
  - c. In the methodological orientation, empirical and literature-based approaches should be considered in equal measure.
  - d. For further internationalisation, the English language should play a greater role in teaching and exchange in academic networks.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT****ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- **EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)**
- **ELEMENTARY SCHOOL TEACHER EDUCATION (BACHELOR)**
- **EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION (MASTER)**
- **ELEMENTARY EDUCATION (MASTER)**
- **ELEMENTARY EDUCATION (PHD)**

**OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN INDONESIA, BANDUNG, INDONESIA**

Visit to the university: 17 & 27 – 29 June 2022

**Panel of experts:**

<b>Prof. Dr Janne Fengler</b>	Alanus University of Arts and Social Sciences (Germany)
<b>Prof. Dr Ulrich Wehner</b>	Karlsruhe University of Education (Germany)
<b>Concepcion V. Pijano</b>	Consultant, Former Executive Director Philippine Accrediting Association of Schools, Colleges and Universities (PAASCU), (Philippines)
<b>Peter Hoffmann</b>	Principal of German School Jakarta (representative of the labour market, Indonesia)
<b>Laura Ritter</b>	Master Student of Cognitive Science and Psychology at University of Cologne (student representative)

**Coordinators:**

Doris Herrmann	AQAS, Cologne, Germany
Dr. Sarah Jenischewski	
Vi Le	

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution.

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the study programmes “Early Childhood Teacher Education” (Bachelor), “Elementary School Teacher Education” (Bachelor), “Early Childhood Education” (Master), “Elementary Education” (Master) and “Elementary Education” (PhD) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI).

### 1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master) and the AQAS Criteria for Doctoral Programme Accreditation (PhD). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in February 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In September 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 6 December 2021.

UPI handed in a wide range of appendices, including e.g.:

- National regulations
- Course descriptions
- Admission regulations

- Examination regulations/academic guidelines
- Strategic Plans of the Faculties
- Quality Target Achievement Report
- Examples/templates of diploma supplements and transcripts for each programme

#### *Nomination of the expert panel*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in March 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

#### *Preparation of the site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members in order to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

#### *Site visit*

After a review of the SER, a site visit to the university took place on 17 & 27 – 29 June 2022. Online the experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g. the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching and other staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

#### *Reporting*

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

#### *Decision*

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission discussed the report during its meeting on 29<sup>th</sup> of August 2022 and took its decision on the accreditation under the reservation that the statement of the university will not raise concerns. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In September 2022, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.



### III. General information on the university

In its earliest form, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia (UPI) was established in 1954 as a Teacher Education College and underwent several changes until it became a Legal Entity State University in 2014. According to the SER, the university's vision is to produce educators, education staff, scientists, and experts in all types and programmes of higher education with a focus on global competitive and comparative advantages as well as to produce, develop, and disseminate science and technology with the goal to improve welfare. The so-called tri dharma (three services in higher education which includes education, research, and community service) serve as the basis to implement and achieve this vision.

The university is led by the Rector and four Vice Rectors: Vice Rector 1 oversees academic and student affairs, Vice Rector 2 is in charge of resource and financial management, Vice Rector 3 is in charge of planning, organisation, and information systems, and Vice Rector 4 is in charge of research, international, cooperation, and business affairs.

UPI has 8 faculties (Faculty of Education, Faculty of Language and Literature Education, Faculty of Economics and Business Education, Faculty of Social Science Education, Faculty of Mathematics and Science Education, Faculty of Sports and Health Education, Faculty of Arts and Design Education, and Faculty of Technology and Vocational Education), one Postgraduate School, one Teacher Professional Education as well as 5 District Campuses. Currently, UPI offers a total of 169 study programmes with 34,942 students, 1,250 permanent lecturers, 266 non-permanent lecturers, and 1,203 academic staff.

The five study programmes to be accredited are part of different Faculties: 1) Faculty of Education with a total of 13 study programmes (among them Early Childhood Teacher Education (henceforth, BP-ECTE)), 2) Tasikmalaya District Campus with a total of 6 study programmes (among them Elementary School Teacher Education (henceforth, BP-ESTE)), and 3) the Postgraduate School with a total of 43 Master programmes and 21 doctorate programmes (among them: a) Early Childhood Education Master (MP-ECE), b) Elementary Education Master (MP-ECE), and c) Doctorate Programme of Elementary Education (henceforth, DP-EE)).

### IV. Assessment of the study programmes

#### 1. Quality of the curriculum / Aims and structure of the doctoral programme

##### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

##### **Doctoral degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to with the requirements of the appropriate level of the national qualifications framework or the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

## Description of the Bachelor programmes

### Early Childhood Teacher Education – BP-ECTE (Bachelor)

There are four profiles of BP-ECTE graduates, namely: 1. early childhood teachers/educators who have noble and competent character; 2. early childhood education institution managers who have professional managerial and leadership abilities; 3. early childhood education development consultant assistant who can become early childhood education empowerment in various national and international non-governmental organizations (NGOs), early childhood education development training service, providers; 4. Teaching media developer who has professional capabilities in developing and producing various learning media/educational game tools that support early childhood development.

The curricular structure of the programme consists of a core curriculum (approximately 85 % of the total credits) to develop the main competencies of graduates and an elective curriculum (approximately 15 % of the total credits) to strengthen the main competencies. Courses are divided into general courses (14 SKS), fundamentals in education courses (8 SKS), faculty-based professional courses (4 SKS), study programme-based core professional courses (85 SKS), study programme-based instructional skill courses (12 SKS), study programme-based elective professional courses (17 SKS), introduction to the field of education units courses (4 SKS), and the final thesis (6 SKS), amounting to a total of 150 SKS (equivalent to 237 ECTS).

Credit load of students is calculated with 50 minutes of face-to-face activities, 60 minutes of structured assignments, 60 minutes of independent activities, which are carried out per week per semester for a total of 170 minutes with 14 meetings. Learning tools include a syllabus, modules, and lecture handouts which are said to be updated and evaluated yearly with the needs of the field as well as policy changes in mind. Evaluations include assignments, mid- and final-semester exams, participation, and practice. In order to achieve the programme profile, there are internships, trainings, seminars, conferences, public lectures, workshops, research assistances, and publications in place as well as other programmes.

According to the SER, learning outcomes of the programme put an emphasis on attitude, knowledge, general skills as well as special skills in accordance with level 6 of the National Qualification Framework.

The SER identifies four graduate profiles for the programme, namely that of early childhood teachers/educators, early childhood education institution managers, early childhood education development consultant assistants for national and international NGOs, as well as teaching media developers.

The head of programme is assisted by the study programmes' staff in carrying out all activities related to the programme. As per the SER, the programme currently has 367 students and 900 alumni who have worked as kindergarten/early childhood education teachers, school principals, and school supervisors.

### Elementary School Teacher Education – BP-ESTE (Bachelor)

There are regulations how to conceptualize the curricula of study programmes in Indonesia. In this case, the BP-ESTE curriculum refers to the Higher Education National Standard No. 44/2015 and refers to the National Qualification Framework Level 6. The profile of graduates of the BP-ESTE is directed to produce graduates who have the expertise as 1) elementary school educators; 2) elementary school digital learning practitioners; 3) elementary school education entrepreneurship practitioners.

The following are the Learning Outcomes of the BP-ESTE (simplified): 1. Mastering the objectives, content, learning experiences, and assessments in the curriculum of elementary school education units; 2. Mastering scientific concepts and methods that cover the substance of learning in elementary schools; 3. Applying information and communication technology in lesson planning, learning implementation, learning evaluation, and learning management in elementary schools; 4. Creating a safe, comfortable, fun, challenging, and creative

elementary school learning environment; 5. Develop digital technology-based learning tools for learning in elementary schools; 6. creating and implementing entrepreneurial traits in elementary school education.

The eight-semester programme refers to the National Qualification Framework level 6. The curriculum structure is divided into general courses (14 SKS), fundamentals in education courses (8 SKS), faculty-based professional courses (6 SKS), study programme-based instructional skill courses (12 SKS), study programme-based core professional courses (86 SKS), study programme-based elective professional courses (18 SKS), and the introduction to field practice course (4 SKS), amounting to a total of 148 SKS (approximately 234 ECTS).

The SER identifies the general intended learning outcomes for the programme as emphasising affection, cognition, general skills, and special skills, including mastering objectives, content, learning experiences, and assessment in the curriculum of elementary school education units; mastering scientific concepts and methods; applying information and communication technology in the practical field; creating a safe, comfortable, challenging, fun, and creative working environment; developing digital technology-based learning tools; and creating and implementing entrepreneurial traits in elementary school education.

Lecture tools include lesson plans/syllabus, handouts, and learning resources as well as micro-teaching labs to support the teaching and learning process. According to the SER, tools and facilities relevant to the study programmes are developed through a needs analysis and evaluated accordingly every new academic year.

Assessment methods include mid- and final-semester exams, assignments, and practices and the programme provides facilitation of trainings, seminars, conferences, workshops, and competitions.

## Experts' evaluation

*Aspects that refer to both programmes:*

It is obvious that UPI has gathered many years of experience with the BA Early Childhood Education and the BA Elementary Education. Therefore, generally, both BA's programmes are reasonable in their structures and clearly in their different profiles. The curricula support the addressed learning outcomes and the intended graduate profiles for the according educational occupation areas. The feasibility and attainability of the study programmes seem to be given.

The panel of experts discussed the content of the curricula during the online site visit with the staff members of UPI and received many fruitful insights. However, the content which was discussed is only shown to a limited extent in the course manuals. The course descriptions usually have the target to inform the teaching staff about the intended learning outcomes (ILOs), are used for informing the teaching staff and are an important tool of the internal management of UPI, but they are in their complexity less useful for the other stakeholders, especially the students. In conclusion, it is a condition that course descriptions are revised to address the need of the students and to improve the transparency of the course descriptions. The intended learning outcomes must be defined individually and precisely and aligned (competency vs. knowledge vs. attitude respectively) with the content and examination formats (teaching / didactics, learning activities / methods, assessment procedures). References to academic literature recommended in the module handbooks must be updated. **(Finding 1)** The course descriptions should be provided in English. **(Finding 2)** UPI should evaluate on a regular basis whether the number of (generic) intended learning outcomes should be reduced to the benefit of quality focus on fewer (specific) ones. **(Finding 3)**

For further internationalisation, the English language should play a greater role in teaching. **(Finding 4)**

Conceptually it should be clearly shown and explained in which regard the study programmes are comparable to those of other universities and in which regard they differ (Unique Selling Points). Due to the high number

of programmes in Indonesia and the national regulation given by the Ministry of Education which prescribes the curriculum to a certain extent, it might be that in these BA programmes the similarities outweigh the difference. Still, as to contribute to the university's profile, strategy, mission and vision, a kind of benchmarking with other Higher Education Institutions should take place to sharpen the profile of the programmes of UPI. **(Finding 5)**. To allow the students to gain a more individual qualification profile, the panel of experts recommends to point out more distinctly which are the mandatory courses that build an obligatory theoretically based curricular fundament and which are electives that give students the possibility to set individual priorities. **(Finding 6)** In terms of content, more courses should deal with the topic of sustainable development education. **(Finding 7)**

The panel of experts recommends to better point out how BA, MA and PhD are interlinked and build on each other (both in conceptual regards and empirically with longitudinal data of internal students in terms of continuance / consecutive studies, assessment of backgrounds and study ambitions of students from other universities). Regarding the two Bachelor programmes this specially means to implement first steps in the direction of research within the curriculum, which are specifically continued in the MA programme. **(Finding 8)** The panel encourages the efforts of UPI concerning the implementation of research tandems and involving students in research aligned to the research umbrella and research roadmap topic wise and research guidelines methodically.

From the point of view of the representatives of the professional practice of kindergartens and schools, it is important that graduates of UPI, who graduate with a Bachelor's degree, have both basic scientific skills with regard to education and learning, and as much practical experience as possible, which usually can be acquired from internships in the field at kindergartens and elementary schools. Regarding the qualifications for professionally working in the field, the panel members recommend establishing more practical components and academically supported internships, not only in the second half of the study programmes, but also in the early semesters. It should be possible to prepare and follow up on these practical experiences in seminars as to guaranteeing scientific monitoring and evaluation. **(Finding 9)** The panel encourages the colleagues from UPI to apply the method of microteaching in this context even more.

The curricula of teacher training should also be modified regularly in regard to changing requirements of the labour market and current developments should be taken into account. **(Finding 10)** This is of particular importance because in Indonesia there seems to be no official second phase of in-service teacher training.

Furthermore, it is usually a major challenge for new teachers in kindergartens and elementary schools that individual requirements of the children and also learning conditions in different locations in the country can vary greatly. The conditions in rural areas are completely different from those in metropolitan regions such as Jakarta, and the conditions at state schools are different from those at (international) private schools, especially in regard to the heterogeneity of the children. As a result, a university education that is as flexible as possible is desirable, which enables graduates to analyse learning conditions and train diagnostic skills, so that individual access to the respective child and its needs is always possible.

Based on this data situation, it can be stated that the requirements of the labour market are adequately considered in the context of university education for students of the above-mentioned courses. There are diverse contacts and partnerships between the university and the labour market, which help students to experience themselves in professional practice and to be prepared for the requirements. However, students would like to have even more practical work experience during their studies.

The impression also arises - possibly due to a lack of data - that the possibilities offered by internships and other forms of cooperation could be exploited even more systematically, since the curricular anchoring is obviously still in the development phase. It is recommended to organise cooperation with the labour market even more systematically and to secure it conceptually and curricular so that the learning and development opportunities contained therein can be optimally used. **(Finding 11)**

In discussions with the students, it became obvious that even more practical training and internship opportunities are desired, especially not only within schools, but also in other institutions. The representatives of the labour market definitely want more research projects by the schools in cooperation with the university, as well as closer and more systematic cooperations with the partner schools, since this can strengthen mutual learning from one another. UPI generally presents itself as an open university, offering conferences and workshops and inviting politicians (in addition to UPI researchers/students and teachers) as speakers. There is also a good exchange between teachers and UPI, which results in many activities and workshops.

*Specific remarks on the two different programmes:*

#### Remarks on the BA Early Childhood Education

This eight-semester BA programme provides a basic qualification (Level 6) for professional fields of activity in the field of Early Childhood Education (ECE). With the number of credits acquired, there is a good possibility of connecting to the relevant Master's degree. To strengthen the links between the BA and the MA, the panel of experts encourages UPI to evaluate annually and longitudinally the ratio of students that follow this path and with which motivation they do this. **(Finding 12)**

The programme prepares students primarily for work in day-care centres for children before school readiness. The content of the course takes account of the fact that in Indonesia day-care centres for children under 3 years play a clearly subordinate role compared to the care institutions addressing 5 - 6 year old children. The panel of experts recommend a stronger emphasis on working with parents, both to suitably reach out to families with younger children and to build educational partnerships to support children's transition periods between non-institutional and institutional care, respectively school. **(Finding 13)**

With the revision of the course descriptions (see above) it should also be made clear, which contents/competences are part of the study programme that qualify students for professional activities beyond the kindergarten as field of professional action.

UPI highlights as a strategic target to be a research oriented Higher Education Institution. To strengthen the academic research focus in teaching, the panel of experts recommends increasing the number of staff which can represent the discipline on the level of full professorship in this BA. **(Finding 14)** There is currently a clear gap compared to the BA Elementary School Teacher Education.

To promote professionalization, as well as to inspire areas for academic research, the panel encourages UPI to increase the number of opportunities for internships in more areas (not only in school and preschool). **(Finding 9)**

#### Remarks to the BA Elementary School Teacher Education

The eight-semester BA programme, which exists since 2006/07 and accepts 200 students per year, provides a basic (Level 6) and transparent qualification for the teaching profession at primary schools. What strikes attention in the curriculum is that semesters 6 and 7 have proportionally more content than the others. The panel of experts recommends reflecting upon this imbalance and maybe in consequence to distribute the content more homogeneously. **(Finding 15)**

Regarding the content, the panel recommends paying attention to the subjects matters "transitions", "resilience" and "didactic approaches". Another recommendation is that the subject "inclusion" should not only focus on children with handicaps, but to broaden the perspective regarding sensitivity for diversity including consideration of children living in poverty and children with parents from various e.g. ethnic and religious backgrounds. **(Finding 16)**

Depending on the ideas of UPI for further development of the programmes, it could be considered to create synergies between study programmes such as combining parts of the programme with courses in social work.

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## Description of the Master programmes

### Early Childhood Education – MP-ECE (Master)

According to the SER, graduates of the MP-ECE will have the ability to 1) perform critical analysis of PAUD learning theories and models Able to develop PAUD principles through inter and multidisciplinary approaches; 2) conduct research in the field of early childhood education through an interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary approach; 3) solve early childhood problems, especially inter or multidisciplinary; 4) conduct PAUD studies through inter and multidisciplinary approaches; 5) develop PAUD theory and practice to solve PAUD problems.; and 6) disseminate ideas and research results in the field of early childhood education in the form of publications in journals at least at the national level or presentations in innovative national seminars.

The curriculum structure of the programme is divided into *aanvullen* courses (12 SKS), postgraduate expertise courses (7 SKS), study programme core expertise courses (15 SKS), study programme expertise elective courses (6 SKS), as well as the final thesis (8 SKS), amounting to a total of either 36 or 48 SKS (depending on whether or not students have to take the *aanvullen* courses, approximately 57/76 ECTS). *Aanvullen* courses are for students whose prior educational background differs from the field of the study programme and include “Fundamental Concepts of Early Childhood Education”, “Development Psychology”, “Early Childhood Education Models”, and “Early Childhood Curriculum”.

The aim of the programme is to produce graduates with pedagogic, social, and professional competencies in early childhood education and the graduate profile is mentioned to be of educators in universities, researchers, and consultants/experts in the early childhood education field. The programme aims to produce research, studies and solutions to problems in early education through an inter- and multidisciplinary approach.

In the SER UPI states that the syllabus is updated with regards to latest research results and students are involved in research conducted by their lecturers as research assistants, which is usually part of the students’ thesis and a joint publication between students and lecturers. Students are offered courses on academic writing and most course outcomes or assignments are research-based. The programme furthermore offers out-of-class activities (e. g. conferences, workshops, internships etc. and has a collaboration with international universities. The programme is in accordance with level 8 of the national qualifications framework in Indonesia.

UPI offers the chance of gaining international recognition, several MP-ECE students have the opportunity to participate in Double Degree activities with Hiroshima University Japan and National Dong Hwa University Taiwan.

### Elementary Education – MP-EE (Master)

Graduate of MP-EE can work in the following areas according to the SER: 1) as educators (lecturers, teachers, supervisors), graduates can implement the knowledge gained from lectures in their workplace; 2) as problem solvers, graduates can think critically and creatively in the field of elementary education so that they can explore various problems critically and be able to solve problems creatively; 3) as researchers, graduates can research the field of elementary education and produce new ideas and scientific works that are recognized at the national, regional, or international level and to disseminate them for the development and improvement of



the quality of elementary education; and (4) practitioners, graduates can participate in the practice in the field of Elementary Education, as a source teacher (master teacher), trainer/tutor.

The Master's programme in Elementary Education consists of *aanvullen* courses (12 SKS), postgraduate expertise courses (7 SKS), study programme core expertise courses (15 SKS), study programme expertise elective courses (8 SKS), as well as the final thesis (8 SKS), amounting to a total of 38/50 SKS (depending on whether or not the *aanvullen* courses must be taken, approximately 60/79 ECTS). Elective courses can be chosen by students according to their interests and research fields such as Mathematics Education in Elementary School, Science Education in Elementary Schools, Social Studies Education in Elementary School, Civics Education in Elementary School, and Language Education in Elementary School.

Learning outcomes are focused on aspects of attitude, knowledge, general and specific skills. Attitude aspects include religious, academic, and social attitudes. Aspects of knowledge include mastery of various theories, concepts, policies, and their implementation to improve the quality of learning and produce creative works tested in primary education. Aspects of general skills include the mastery of academic, managerial, and social skills in carrying out their expert duties as a master in basic education.

The graduate profile presented in the SER includes educators (teachers, lecturers, supervisors), researchers, and tutors. The programme carries out tracer studies to obtain information on graduate performance and profile in order to improve and evaluate the quality of the programme contents and materials.

The programme is in accordance with level 8 of the national qualifications framework in Indonesia and teaching materials are adjusted according to field needs, curriculum demands, and target characteristics. The SER states that students are actively involved in research activities through joint research programmes with their lecturers and develop their own research results with regards to their final project/thesis.

### Experts' evaluation

Concerning the MA Early Childhood Education and the MA Elementary Education it is obvious that UPI has gathered many years of experience.

Generally, both MA programmes seem to be reasonable in their structures and clearly distinct in their different profiles. The curricula support the addressed learning outcomes and the intended graduate profiles for the according educational occupation areas. The subject of learning management is carried out using critical analysis, inquiry-based learning, project-based learning, mini-research, collaborative learning, presentations, discussions, seminars, report writing, independent learning, and field studies. The feasibility and attainability of the study programmes seem to be given.

However, the red thread is only shown to a limited extent in the course manuals. In conclusion, the panel of experts requests improving the transparency of the course handbooks and recommends that they are all provided in English – not only in the special context of an international accreditation. **(Finding 1, 2 and 4)** It would be interesting to more pronouncedly work out up to which aspects of the study programmes are comparable to those of other universities and in which regard they differ (USPs; see Finding 5). The panel of experts understands that due to the high number of similar MA programmes in Indonesia in these academic disciplines and associations cooperating the similarities outweigh the difference. Still, in order to contribute to the university's profile, strategy, mission and vision, a more defined, unique profile would be recommendable.

The intended learning outcomes must be defined precisely and aligned with the content and examination formats. **(Finding 1)** The experts find it difficult to assess how and to which degree the interlinkage between the elements of academic competency development as central task of universities is achieved in real life.

The experts recommend working out and pointing out more precisely how BA, MA and PhD build on each other. **(Finding 8)** Regarding the two MAs, one content-related measure could be to provide courses on research which are specifically continued in the PhD programme. Overall, it should be specified in which areas of the labour market graduates from the different academic levels can find jobs (longitudinal whereabouts-studies / tracer studies as part of the Q&A-concept throughout the study programmes and in interlinkage). The panel of experts encourages UPI to extend and differentiate the tracer studies beyond the three indicators that have been assessed to date. **(Finding 17)**

The profile of both Masters' programmes should be sharpened by either addressing the research aspect (academic labour market perspective) or by strengthening the management aspect and prepare students for leadership tasks (non-academic labour market perspective) date. **(Finding 18)** In terms of content, more courses should deal with the topic of sustainable development education (SDG goals) (see Finding 7).

*Based on the mentioned aspects that affect both courses, to some remarks concerning the distinct profiles.*

#### Remarks on the MA Early Childhood Education

The curriculum refers to the INQF at the level 8. It prepares students for working in the field of early childhood education. Therefore, a recommendation is to explain in more detail which professional activities are open with the MA degree beyond those of graduates with the BA Early Childhood Education degree. **(Finding 19)**

Different to BA programmes, MA programmes could develop own profiles. Conceptionally, this MA has a strong focus on art. A recommendation is to make this more visible and proactively promote this (see **Finding 18**).

For further development of the spectrum of programmes offered by UPI and to address the labour market needs it could be discussed if there is the possibility for a PhD programme of Early Childhood Education. This could be an important step to improve the quality into the field of professional Early Childhood education and to strengthen the scientific discipline.

#### Remarks on the MA Elementary School Teacher Education

The curriculum of the four-semester MA is in accordance with the level 8 of the National Qualification Framework and teaching materials are by all appearances adjusted according to field needs, curriculum demands, and target characteristics.

A recommendation is to explain in more detail which career opportunities / professional activities are available for graduates from this MA as opposed the graduates of the BA Elementary School Education (see Finding 19). Concerning the curriculum, it is noticeable that semesters 1 and 2 have proportionally more content than the others. Therefore, the recommendation is to argue this clearer and to distribute some contents to the semesters 3 and 4. **(Finding 20)**

While BA courses mostly serve compulsory modules, the Master offers the opportunity to develop a distinct profile. This MA could conceptually take more advantage use of this possibility.

### **Conclusion**

The criterion is partially fulfilled.



## Description of the PhD programme

### Elementary Education – DP-EE (PhD)

As laid out in the SER, the learning outcomes of the programme refer to the competency standards required in for level 9 of the national qualifications framework in Indonesia. Learning outcomes include aspects of attitudes, knowledge, and skills, both general and specific. Attitude aspects include religious, academic, and social attitudes. The knowledge aspect includes mastery of educational philosophy and learning theory in elementary schools as a basis for researching elementary education and producing creative works. Aspects of general skills include the mastery of academic, managerial, and social skills in carrying out his professional duties as a doctorate in the field of elementary education. The specific skills include developing knowledge, solving problems, and producing creative works that are tested in the field of elementary education comprehensively and contextually through research with interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, and transdisciplinary approaches.

Courses in the programme are divided into postgraduate expertise courses (7 SKS), study programme core expertise courses (12 SKS), study programme expertise elective courses (max. of 8 SKS), and the aanvullen courses (12 SKS) as well as the dissertation (15 SKS). Students are classified into different groups, depending on their former educational background (i. e. regular students with the minimum credit load and similar educational background as well as having taken the postgraduate expertise courses at Master's level at UPI versus aanvullen students with a maximum credit load and different educational backgrounds). Therefore, the total amount of credits is between 44 and 60 SKS (approximately between 70 and 95 ECTS).

All courses in the curriculum structure are compulsory with the exception of the elective courses from which students can chose 4 of 24 courses offered according to their field of interest and research. The electives offered are elementary school education, elementary science education, social studies education, elementary citizenship education, elementary language education, and elementary mathematics education. The SER includes an ideal study plan for completion of studies within 6 semesters, with semester 5 and 6 being laid out for the dissertation.

Stadium general, sandwich programme (a research internship programme at universities abroad), and guest lectures are implemented as curriculum elements with students being encouraged to improve their communication skills, analytical skills, and synthesis and develop relationships with experts both from within and outside the country. Students can use the internship programme to accelerate study completion by making research results a condition for completing studies.

According to the SER, teaching and research are treated interrelatedly with research becoming a form of implementation of the competencies obtained from the learning process. Research results are also used to update learning materials in the classroom. Doctoral students participate in research projects under the umbrella of research managed by lecturers, which will finally result in a dissertation project. Doctoral grants are available for research collaborations.

## Experts' evaluation

The panel of experts appreciates that UPI offers not only two MA programmes matching with the two BA programmes but that there is also a PhD programme of Elementary Education. With the PhD programme the university makes an important contribution to the further development of quality in fields of professional action. In addition, the university makes a significant contribution to the further development of the scientific discipline and the recruitment of young scientists.

The PhD programme has reasonable structures and a distinct profile. The curriculum supports the addressed learning outcomes and the intended graduate profiles for the according educational occupation areas. The subject of learning management is carried out using critical analysis, inquiry-based learning, project-based learning, mini-research, collaborative learning, presentations, discussions, seminars, report writing, independent learning, and field studies.

However, the red thread is only shown to a limited extent in the module manuals. In conclusion, the panel of experts recommends that the transparency of the course handbooks must be improved and – not only in the special context of an international accreditation – provided comprehensively in English. The intended learning outcomes must be defined precisely and be aligned with the content and examination formats. References to academic literature must be updated. **(Finding 1-3)**

A recommendation is to work out more thoroughly how MA and PhD build on each other (see above). This means specially to explain in direction of research how to build up on the corresponding MA Elementary Education. A rather broadly conceptualised PhD-programme should be balanced pros and cons as opposed to a more specific research profile (professorial chairs vs. faculty, see above: research umbrella, research profile, university strategy). The profile should be sharpened either by addressing the research aspect or by strengthening the management aspect and prepare students for leadership tasks. **(Finding 18)** In case UPI decides to strengthen the management aspect, it should be made clearer in which areas of the labour market the graduates on the different levels can find jobs. Different to the MA programme students need target support in planning their careers. In this regard, it also makes sense so use the good international network that already exists.

UPI should consider to adapt some other aspects of the PhD programme to improve the flexibility of the programme and to align it with international standards **(Finding 21)**:

- a) Currently the scope of the dissertation is 15 credits. If national regulations allow it, it is recommended to give a higher weighting on the scientific thesis (Dissertation).
- b) At the moment, dissertations are written monographically. Following international standards there should be the possibility to approach them monographically or cumulatively.
- c) In the methodological orientation, empirical and literature-based approaches should be considered in equal measure.
- d) For further internationalisation, the English language should play a greater role in teaching, existing international networks, cooperation with guest lectures might be taken advantage of more intensively.

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 2. Procedures for quality assurance

### Bachelor/Master degree

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

#### **Doctoral degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

### **Description**

As stated in the SER, quality assurance policies at UPI are based on national and internal regulations. UPI has implemented a strategic plan 2021-2025 to achieve the university's vision to become a world class university. Nine interrelated standards have been set by a Rector's regulation covering the topics of education, research, community service, student affairs, information systems, facilities and infrastructure, human resources, planning and development, and reporting.

According to the SER, the quality assurance system at UPI is led by the Head of the Quality Assurance Division (QAD or SPM) at the university level, the Head of the Quality Control Unit (QCU or SKM) at the faculty level, and the Head of the Quality Control Group (QCG or GKM) at the study programme level. QAD coordinates all university units in implementing and coordinating both internal as well as external quality assurance audits every five years (through e. g. national and international accreditation procedures). The SER includes an organigram detailing the organisational structure and management at UPI as well as a table on the quality assurance data collection process. UPI conducts tracer studies with alumni and graduates to follow potential fields of employment, and student satisfaction and lecturer performance questionnaires to further develop their programmes. According to the SER, UPI aims to avoid intolerance and discrimination, e. g. through their guidelines for testing student proposals/theses.

On the study programme level, quality assurance policies are described in UPI's Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) including Graduate Competency Standards, Content Standards, Process Standards, Educators and Education Personnel Standards, Education Management Standards, and Education Financing Standards. Some of the quality assurance processes carried out are the preparation and development of the curriculum, the implementation of learning activities, the writing of scientific papers, the determination of lecturers, and the financing of education. The SER furthermore states that data from various stakeholders is collected in order to facilitate analysis and follow-up actions.

### **Experts' evaluation**

UPI has a well-organized and functional QA system in the various study programmes starting with the Head of the Quality Control Group at the study programme level followed by the Head of the Quality Control Unit at the faculty level and coordinated by the Head of the Quality Assurance Division (QAD) at the university level.

It is noteworthy that these five study programmes have superior quality (Level A Certification) as attested by the National Accreditation Agency in Indonesia (BAN-PT). The QAD coordinates all university units in monitoring and implementing both internal as well as external quality assurance audits conducted every five years. The University also has international accreditation from agencies such as ISO, ASIIN, AUN-QA and AQAS. All

these are clear evidence that the QA policies, processes and procedures undertaken by UPI are in place and working well.

University policies, procedures, processes and roles of key players in the QA system of the five study programmes being evaluated are clear, well documented and followed through in a comprehensive manner. The QA system involves both internal and external stakeholders such as the students, lecturers, graduate users, alumni and labour market representatives. There are sufficient tools and mechanisms for collecting data and feedback from the different stakeholders.

To ensure the quality of teaching and learning, satisfaction surveys are done by students twice a year and serve as input on the performance of their lecturers, including an assessment of academic and administrative services, facilities, and other programmes of the University.

Other concrete measures taken to address quality assurance concerns are the monthly meetings of lecturers and tracer studies for graduates which are given twice a year. The tracer studies assess the performance of graduates and how to better respond to the requirements of the labour market. Feedback from the alumni and the labour market are also sought regularly. Information on labour market requirements needs to be collected and analysed. The panel noted that efficient feedback mechanisms exist in the study programmes being visited.

It is not clear however how the QA results are linked with the strategic planning of the University and utilized by management. UPI should describe how it consolidates the QA results so that the data and knowledge generated from QA processes from the different faculties are integrated and used more effectively by management in the planning, decision-making and change processes. **(Finding 22)**

Curricular revisions are done every five years but in view of new curricular requirements mandated by the Ministry, there may be a need to review the current curriculum and align it with the new and up-coming requirements (see Findings above).

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students / Learning and assessment of students

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The form of supervision and/or course structure is adequate and corresponds with the intended learning outcomes.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

## Description

As stated in the SER, UPI uses four forms of lectures: 1) lectures, responses, and tutorials; 2) seminars; 3) field practice, research, community service; and 4) other forms of learning according to the needs in achieving the learning outcomes (e. g. block system learning, modules, dual-mode, hybrid learning). Several methods are used for the teaching-learning process: project-based learning, case studies, discussions, lectures, and presentations in order to encourage students to discuss and think critically to explore various learning resources actively. Continuity in course material and work is ensured with lectures being divided into several semesters, wherein each semester is a continuation of the previous semester. Some courses have a prerequisite such as passing a particular course the previous semester. Students are also encouraged to conduct observations, practice, and internships in educational institutions with the aim of facilitating their problem-solving skills.

To facilitate lecturing online, UPI has developed an Integrated Online Learning System called SPOT and uses this along with the government's Online Learning System (SPADA) with the frequency of lectures per semester at 14 meetings as well as one mid-semester and one final-semester exam. The minimum requirement concerning student attendance in lectures is 80 %. Credit load of students is determined through their corresponding GPA, with the maximum between 16 and 24 credits per semester. UPI states that, in order to achieve learning outcomes, it provides certain facilities such as labs, microteaching, learning corners, self-access centres, and libraries as well as better internet connectivity and online libraries, webmail systems, and learning management systems through the Directorate of Information Technology. Student mobility is said to be encouraged through credit transfer, student exchanges, and national and international student internships.

UPI states that their lecture system begins with preparing lecture schedules and online tutoring and academic guidance by their lecturers. Students then make a study contract via a specifically designed webpage and choose courses provided by the study programme according to their respective semesters. Their academic supervisor then approves the course choices and provides a teaching schedule.

Assessment forms mentioned in the SER are quizzes, group and individual assignments, class discussions, presentations, mid-term tests, and end-of-term tests. The SER furthermore includes a table categorising the assessment criteria. Exams are scheduled in the academic calendar, there are Mid-semester exams and final-semester exams. Exam questions are developed by the lecturers with the learning outcomes applied in the syllabus and can include questions in the form of essays, multiple-choice exams, projects, articles, papers, and multiple-choice questions etc. Since the programmes and faculties/district campuses have obtained ISO certificates in education, exam questions are required to follow the format set according to ISO standards.

Academic activities and guidance services carried out by both lecturers and students include ongoing academic supervision through academic supervisors, lecturers and practicums, mid- and end-of-semester exams, monitoring and evaluation of student studies, community service and field experience programmes, final assignments/thesis/dissertation preparation, and final exams.

Complaints and general input from students can be submitted directly to lecturers, head of study programmes, head of the faculty or on a higher level (directorate or rectorate) or in writing via a so-called suggestion/input box.

## Experts' evaluation

Overall, the expert committee got a good impression in how UPI supports and organizes their students' learning and assessment within the programmes to be accredited. The experts could follow within the documentation the regulations of the university and government and policies that should be followed in the implementation of the learning processes of the different courses. The programme schedules and course descriptions gave

an overview of the different teaching and assessment principles that the lecturer follow. From what the experts learnt of the students panel and the documentation, this information is made available to all participants and applied consistently.

Considering UPIs efforts to support students in their individual needs (see chapter 6. Learning resources and - student support - / Support and research environment), adapting the study programmes to their needs while considering and updating curricular aspects of the field, the experts could assure themselves, that the programmes organisation and teaching methodologies consider the diversity of students' needs, enable flexible learning paths and stimulate their motivation, self-reflection, and engagement in the learning process.

Different teaching methodologies and assessment tools lecturers use are used within the different programmes. Lectures, presentations, question and answer, group discussions are the most common teaching methodologies used by the academic staff. It is regulated how specific assessments should be carried out and how the grading system of the university works. Aside from the usual assessment tools, graduate students also must do a comprehensive examination in form of a thesis/monographic dissertation. UPI-staff explained during the site visit that the teaching and assessment methods are aligned and the academic staff regularly reviews if the learning experiences and assessments provided are aligned with the course learning outcomes and eventually with the programme learning outcomes within an annual workshop. Further, the assessment is checked through a quality control unit to ensure all syllabus are in line with the intended learning outcomes. During the Covid-19 Pandemic, online assessment was started to be used as a format of assessment. From the point of view of the panel of experts the course descriptions must be revised to address the needs of the students better (like explained in Finding 1) which might also lead to a revision of the examination formats.

Students of UPI in the Cluster Education become mainly teacher, but besides also entrepreneurs or researchers of this field, for which they also have partnerships with companies and universities to develop students' academic and entrepreneurial skills. Their main competence, however, is to learn how to be a good teacher. After some students asked for more practical experiences, the department decided to increase the credits of the practical part. Practical courses like microteaching (beginning of the studies) or practical internships are part of the curriculum. The experts learnt that this adapted curriculum will start in 2022 and has not been visible in the application for accreditation that was handed in, as it is a relatively recent change. During the student field training, UPI works closely with the external supervisors and students will be reflected and given feedbacks from these. The experts learned, that during their studies, community service also plays a fundamental role in the teaching, which is helpful in integrating social work aspects that are also relevant in the studies.

The experts learnt that the inhomogeneity of ECTS distributed from 1<sup>st</sup> to 6<sup>th</sup> semester are necessary to ensure a similar workload between the semesters, as during the first semesters there are mainly introductory and basic subjects to provide students the general ideas and concepts of the programmes and in the last semesters, the level of difficulty of the courses increase so that credits are reduced to help the students with their workload. Like mentioned above, the imbalance of the workload between the semesters should be considered.

The programmes follow to the national qualification frame (the programmes follow the Indonesian National Qualification Framework level of 6 for Bachelor, 8 for Master, and 9 for PhD).

To be admitted to the PhD programme a research proposal has to be handed in. From a European point of view the differences between the MA and the PhD programme are not as wide as it was expected. The teaching staff of UPI pointed out in the discussions during the online site visit that it is expected that the PhD students create their own methods, use them to prove something empirically and publish their results in publication. The research should be more innovative – so there are differences in the breadth and width of the research compared to MA. Because students often write their research while working, the workload is relatively high. They stay in regular contact with their academic advisor who plays a major role for feasibility of studies. The PhD programme included many compulsory courses plus some electives. For the dissertation 15 credits are



given which is in line with the national regulations. The number of students in the PhD programme (15) is highly influenced by the number of scholarships given by the government, most students receive a scholarship. The experts welcome that UPI plans to open also a PhD programme in Early Childhood Education, for that, administrative structures are currently developed.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 4. Student admission, progression, recognition and certification / Legal status, admission and certification

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The institution is entitled to award a doctorate.*

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

## Description

### *Admission*

Admission to undergraduate programmes at UPI is in accordance with national regulations and follows various selection modes: national selection (held through screening for academic achievements at senior high school level), state higher education joint selection (carried out with other state universities via written exams), as well as a selection designed independently by UPI itself. Additionally, UPI also accepts transfer as well as international students by screening the acceptance criteria set by the university itself.

Admission to postgraduate programmes also follows several modes: the regular route, the collaboration route, and the foreign student route. Generally, admission criteria for Master students are a Bachelor's degree or equivalent from an accredited study programme and tertiary institution with a cumulative GPA of at least 3.00, entrance test (English and Potential Academic Test) and requirements set by UPI must be met.

For doctoral programmes, the admission criteria are a Master's degree or equivalent from an accredited study programme and university with a GPA of at least 3.00, entrance test (English and Potential Academic Test), interviews as well as a background in the same field of the doctoral programme by research and meet other requirements.

Detailed information on admission requirements and selection processes are available on UPI's website.

### *Progression*

Monitoring of the student life cycle is carried out through academic guidance by academic supervisors. This occurs online as well as face-to-face. Additionally, the head of programme has access to a webpage to monitor the progression of students. Monitoring processes include compiling information on the number of active students, students who have completed courses, distribution of final grades in all courses. The data serves as the basis for possible consultations regarding difficulties students might face.

### *Recognition and Certification*

According to the SER, UPI offers student exchange and a double degree programme and aims to facilitate student mobility through support offered by the study programme. This includes assistance, motivation to carry out academic and non-academic achievements as well as financial support coming from the study programme fund.

UPI issues a diploma containing the academic title in correspondence with the respective study programme (Bachelor of Education, Master of Education or Doctor of Education), a transcript and a diploma supplement.

### **Experts' evaluation**

Admission requirements and prerequisites for individual study programmes are well defined and made available to prospective students through the new admissions website (<https://pmb.upi.edu>). The various admission pathways (SNMPTN, SBMPTN and SM-UPI) are clearly explained through their respective websites and steps in the admission process are clearly outlined. Selection of students in both undergraduate and postgraduate programmes follow a rigorous process with an explicit set of criteria and entry requirements. Aside from the above-mentioned pathways, UPI also accepts transfer students and international students with specific criteria set by UPI.

The panel of experts noted that the entry requirements for both the MA and PhD study programmes include coming from an accredited study programme in a university, having a GPA of at least 3.00 or its equivalent and passing an entrance exam to determine English proficiency. Doctoral students undergo an interview and a background check pertaining to expertise in research.

All these processes speak well of UPI and its efforts towards ensuring the quality of its students and their successful completion of the programme. Academic requirements are not the only determinant for success in the programme but also include language skills and professional experience. Graduates of UPI are highly regarded in the educational community and institutions in the country.

In addition, the panel further noted the close monitoring and support mechanisms being implemented by having an academic supervisor assigned for each student. In the meeting with the students, the academic guidance offered by the supervisors was mentioned as a strong feature in the study programmes and much appreciated. This is one reason for the zero dropout among students.

During the meeting, undergraduate students also shared their experiences in the student exchange programme with countries such as Thailand, Malaysia, and the Philippines, while the postgraduate students highlighted their experiences with the double degree and sandwich programme at Hiroshima University and the Taiwan Normal University. Monitoring and evaluation systems are in place to gauge the success of these exchange programmes.

In addition, the study programmes also facilitate student mobility through competitions and conferences held at local, national, and international levels. Academic supervisors and lecturers assist students who take part in these competitions. UPI also provides financial support for students participating in these programmes.

Upon completion of their studies, graduates receive their respective degrees, e.g., for BP-ECTE and BP-ESTE a Bachelor of Education, while those in MP-ECE and MP-EE receive a Master of Education. Those in the doctoral programme receive a Doctor of Education in Elementary Education.

UPI is legally entitled to award doctorates. The legal status of doctoral students is clearly defined and laid down in the institution's statutes.



## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 5. Teaching staff / Academic level of supervisory staff

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

### **Doctoral degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

## Description

UPI states in the SER that the number of lecturers is generally determined by considering the ratio of lecturers of students, academic demands, and specific knowledge. Recruitment of lecturers and academic staff take place through national selection, competency tests, interviews, and teaching or work simulations in the respective study programme itself. This follows government regulations. Recruitment is carried out if a lecturer of education staff resigns, passes away, or retires, resulting in a vacant position. In case of lecturer retirement, new positions based on the programme requirements will be proposed to universities and the government for civil servant positions through a recruitment process managed by the government. Study programmes can then complete the recruitment process.

Administrative staff is recruited based on their academic qualifications and competencies through government or university recruitment and is encouraged to further their competencies through training in the fields of e. g. information technology management systems, financial management or quality assurance.

Full-time lecturers are said to be actively involved in research and publishing projects both nationally as well as internationally via joint publications and research collaborations. UPI states that they encourage all faculty staff to undertake scientific activities through on- and off-campus activities such as research grants offered and funded by universities, research grants offered and funded by the government through the Ministry of Education as well as international organisations. Generally, the three services of higher education consisting of education/teaching, research, and community service must be carried out by lecturers regularly.

University guidelines set out staff development and qualification policies with a Master's degree as the minimum educational degree for a lecturer position. Staff with minimum qualifications are then recommended and promoted for higher degree qualifications and can take further studies either at the university or outside of Indonesia with the support of study grants. Staff development is said to be offered to teaching staff, with a buddy programme where a new lecturer is paired with a senior lecturer in organising courses, designing subject units, reporting course results, and evaluating courses.

Teaching hours and workload of lecturers is determined based on their general teaching load, e. g. in cases where a lecturer teaches in both undergraduate as well as postgraduate courses, workload is adjusted accordingly in order to avoid overload or conflicting schedules.

The SER states specific requirements for lecturers of Master programmes, namely a PhD title in the field of science relevant to the respective subject, the minimum academic position of lector, publications, and English written and oral skills.

The Bachelor's programme **Early Childhood Teacher Education** has 16 permanent lecturers, 14 of whom hold a PhD title and two of whom have a Master's degree and are currently undertaking their doctoral studies.

The Master's programme **Early Childhood Education** has 16 lecturers: 2 people with professor qualification and 14 who hold a PhD title (some are associate professors). Moreover, there are many visiting lecturers and some of them are also professors at foreign universities.

The Bachelor's programme **Elementary School Teacher Education** has one professor, two assistant professors, 11 associate professors and 10 full-time lecturers as well as 10 visiting lecturers.

The Master's programme **Elementary Education** has 22 lecturers, all of whom hold a PhD title, as well as 12 visiting lecturers.

The **PhD programme Elementary Education** has 20 lecturers, all of whom hold a PhD title and 17 of them hold positions as professors.

### Experts' evaluation

It is obvious that UPI has gathered many years of experience with all the programmes to be assessed in this accreditation procedure. The number of lectures seems to be appropriate for the number of students, although the experts lack benchmarks. The assessment can only be made on the basis of reported evaluation by university members incl. students. The number of teaching professors is also given in the SER. In the BA Early Childhood a gap is perceived, and the number of teaching professors should be increased (see above).

The curricula support the addressed learning outcomes and the intended graduate profiles for the according educational occupation areas. The subject of learning management is carried out using critical analysis, inquiry-based learning, project-based learning, mini-research, collaborative learning, presentations, discussions, seminars, report writing, independent learning, and field studies.

Fortunately, the university does not lose any students. The absence of dropouts can be interpreted as a strong indication that the programmes can be studied very well. As statistically a certain dropout rate is considered as normal (e.g. 10%), the experts acknowledge efforts by UPI that most likely took place to avoid that situation without lowering the academic standards.

The students are reportedly very satisfied with the teachings staff at UPI and appreciate the support on all levels they get during their studies.

Concerning the PhD, the teaching staff seems to be qualified methodologically to support and advise on doctoral level and the responsibilities of supervisors is clearly defined. International references regarding authorship in international peer-review journals, invited addresses on international conferences and so on would be helpful for more in-depth assessment.

For further internationalisation in all courses, English as a language should play a greater role in teaching and learning. The existing options for exchange of students should be communicated more transparently.

### Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 6. Learning resources and student support / Support and research environment

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

[ESG 1.6]

### **Doctoral degree**

*Guidance and support are available for students which include advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and research activities.*

[ESG 1.6]

## **Description**

UPI is a state-funded university and charges tuition fees for its programmes, with scholarships being available for students as well as scholarship programmes for students who work as lecturers in the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education. Funds are allocated to the respective faculties and programmes.

Shared facilities at UPI mentioned in the SER include classrooms, laboratories (science, social science, language, computer, micro-teaching, digital learning), library with access to books, e-books, national and international journals (both in print as well as online form) as well as online access to these, a language centre, Counselling and Career Development Guidance Agency, Basic Education Study Centre and Directorate of Information and Technology Systems. The campus university also provides student dorms, sports facilities, outdoor theatre, a mosque, canteens, the assembly hall and the Student Centre. Students with special needs or disabilities are supported through consultation, and assistance as well as appropriate infrastructure with a particular parking area, wheelchairs in front of the building including necessary road access, and elevators.

UPI describes that all study programmes at UPI offer continuous guidance and counselling programmes for the entirety of the student life cycle. The Academic advisor who will assist students in choosing courses, in the mentoring process, in writing scientific papers, and in completing studies plays a core role in student counselling. International students are offered consulting and support through the Office of International Relations and Educations.

According to the SER, student support also takes place through regular consultation hours by the teaching staff to discuss academic problems and offer advice on completing studies successfully. Furthermore, UPI details several online support and learning platforms for students and lecturers. Students are paired with an academic advisor and lecturers guide the students in writing their final project. Final assignment guidance is described to be used in several ways, e. g. face-to-face or online. In consultation with the academic supervisor, students firstly write a research proposal in consultation with their advisor, then they must take and take the qualification test (for Master's and PhD programmes), take a thesis proposal seminar exam (after the supervisor approves the thesis proposal) and lastly, students write their actual final project/thesis and are supervised by two thesis supervisors.

Information on the study programmes, courses, facilities, and activities are provided via the study programme website as well as the student orientation programme. For Master and PhD programmes, matriculation activities are provided, wherein all lecturers introduce themselves, present their respective fields of research, and provide information on what each lecturer teaches in his/her courses. In relation to the student's research

interests, they are asked to fill out an academic supervisor form and choose a supervisor in order to facilitate meetings and research early on in their studies.

## Experts' evaluation

### Learning Resources

Extensive learning resources are made available to students such as computer rooms and laboratories for special purposes (science, social science, language, micro-teaching, digital learning). Students during the interview showed much appreciation towards having these facilities. The students also expressed satisfaction with the library and mentioned they had easy access to books, e-books, national and international journals (both print and online). The experts, however, recommend more current and up-to-date literature, especially in English. **(Finding 23)** Recent publications should be used in preparing the syllabus and delivery of courses and also for research conducted by students in the programmes.

The experts also commend the Career Development Centre which equip the students and graduates with skills to prepare them for the workplace, including training in CV writing and job applications as well as providing information on job vacancies and placements. Counselling services for students have also proven to be very effective.

In terms of financial resources, the programmes are stable because UPI is a state funded university and also collects tuition fees from the students. Various types of scholarships are available for students across all levels. The students spoke highly of these scholarships which served as a strong motivation for them to choose UPI. It was further mentioned that students who have difficulty paying tuition fees are given some leeway to be able to raise the needed funds.

### Student support

Overall, the group of experts was impressed by the quality and broadness of student support and services offered by UPI, in particular by the individual support of the student advisors. Every student has an academic advisor, which students describe to be highly accessible and their first contact of choice in any regards. Further, supervising students are used to build research tandems with new students. UPI is supportive in the matter of organisational, financial or study-concerning health issues and students describe that usually a solution is found for also individual personal matters. These services are offered consistently and information on these services is made available to students in an adequate way. UPI further offers many partial to full scholarships that refer to different pronounced capabilities; almost 30% of the students receive a scholarship. Further, the high academic level of the lecturers, which mostly held a PhD, is helpful for the academic support of the students. The experts met committed students and lecturers who cooperate closely. Lecturing staff members offer frequent consultation hours and are available to students.

Course/module descriptions are available to students. These documents contain the intended learning outcomes, methods of learning and teaching, assessment methods, and the expected workload. They can, however, still be improved regarding some aspects (see Finding 1). The experts found that the workload in the programmes was high, particularly considering that many graduate students work part time. The experts received feedback from current and former students that the workload is challenging, but manageable, as the courses of the programme are organized on 2-3 days per week, which allows working on the other days and is highly appreciated by the students.

Procedures are applied to ensure that course offerings are coordinated on both content and organizational levels to avoid overlap. Appropriate links between programmes are planned to avoid repetition. The programmes are implemented in such a way that students can complete their studies within the expected period

of time as defined in the curricula. This is also represented by high number of graduates in the regular time frames of the programmes and the low drop-out rate.

The International Office provides services to home students, who wish to gain international experience. However, this represents also the greatest wish of the students to improve on. They desire for more teaching and research cooperation, more options to engage internationally within summer schools, semesters or internships abroad. As UPI already seems to be highly engaged in improving these possibilities, the focus should also consist on the effort to communicate already existing options properly to the students (see above). UPI helps international students with adapting in Indonesia and to improve their Bahasa outside the classroom, e.g. within Indonesian language courses. The group of experts found a lack of resources and information material in English. Not all parts of the course websites and documentations are available in English (see below).

Students mention that university seminars on job search and special advice offer helpful orientation for the labour market. Contacts are also made with alumni. Graduates usually get a job offer relatively quickly, and the salary for graduate teachers in schools is usually a little above the national minimum wage level (as for teachers in early childhood education).

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 7. Information / Public information

### **Bachelor/Master degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

### **Doctoral degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

## Description

Public information is provided online through UPI's website which contains an information centre with links to all units, faculties, and study programmes.

Information on study programmes, learning outcomes, curriculum, graduate profiles, lecture processes, assessment procedures, student affairs, alumni, journals, collaborations, teaching and administrative staff, guidelines and news are accessible online via the respective study programmes' website.

Additionally, UPI offers printed information in the form of brochures and booklets as well as public lectures, webinars, workshops, campus and school visits aimed at prospective students. UPI also uses social media channels such as YouTube and Instagram to inform the public about new developments and achievements.

## Experts' evaluation

Some parts of the UPI homepage are available in English. The faculties and an overview of the courses offered are easy to find and are quite clearly presented, but not consistently in English. The references to scholarships are good. However, links to the various faculties/degree programmes sometimes lead to pages that are

classified as “not secure” by the browser. The loading times are sometimes considerable. References to tuition fees were not found. Some links, e.g. for the doctoral programmes, lead to pages that cannot be found.

*Elementary School Teacher Education – Bachelor:*

The department declared that the homepage can be accessed in English which is correct in principle but there were difficulties to access all websites. The homepage seems to be updated more or less regularly with the latest news entry published less than three months ago.

*Early Childhood Teacher Education – Bachelor:*

The curriculum structure is presented quite clearly in a scheme. There are more detailed descriptions of individual seminar contents. The information concerning this study programme does not include graduate learning outcomes, but graduate profiles are available. All of this information can be found in Bahasa Indonesia as well as in English. The site seems to be fairly up to date with the latest news being published in late June 2022.

*Early Childhood Education – Master:*

The experts had difficulties to access the website during the site visit but another link was provided later which worked well.

*Elementary School Teacher Education – Master and PhD Programme:*

Contrary to the programmes mentioned above, these study programmes cannot be found through the Faculty of Educational Science, but the School of Postgraduate Studies. However, just as for the Master in Early Childhood Education, the link provided for the programme only leads back to the faculty’s homepage, not to further information.

The functionality of some websites should be improved. **(Finding 24)**

**Conclusion**

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Early Childhood Teacher Education**” (Bachelor) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Elementary School Teacher Education**” (Bachelor) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Early Childhood Education**” (Master) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Elementary Education**” (Master) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the study programme “**Elementary Education**” (PhD) offered by Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia with conditions.

### Findings:

If it is not written specifically, the findings address all programmes

1. The **course descriptions must be revised** to address the needs of the students and to improve the transparency of the course-descriptions. The intended learning outcomes must be defined individually and precisely and aligned with the content and examination formats. References to academic literature recommended in the course handbooks must be updated.
2. The course descriptions should be **provided in English**.
3. UPI should evaluate on a regular basis whether the **number of (generic) intended learning outcomes** should be reduced to the benefit of quality focus on fewer (specific) ones.
4. For further internationalisation, the **English language** should play a greater role in teaching.
5. **Benchmarking with other universities** should take place to sharpen the profile of the programmes.
6. UPI should point out more distinctly which are the **mandatory courses** that build an obligatory theoretically based curricular fundament and which are **electives** that give students the possibility to set individual priorities.
7. In terms of content, more courses should deal with the topic of **sustainable development education**.
8. UPI should better point out **how BA, MA and PhD are interlinked** and build on each other. One initiative could be to implement first steps in the direction of research in the BA programmes and to continue these research approaches in the MA programmes.
9. More **practical components and academically supported internships** should be integrated in the early semesters of the two BA programmes. The number of opportunities for internships in a **wider range of areas** (not only in school and preschool) should be increased. These practical experiences should be prepared and followed up in seminars as to guaranteeing scientific monitoring and evaluation.
10. The curricula of teacher training should continuously be modified with regard to **changing requirements of the labour market and current developments**.
11. It is recommended to **organise cooperation with the labour market even more systematically** and to secure it conceptually and curricular.



12. To strengthen the links between the BA and the MA, the panel of experts encourages UPI to evaluate annually and longitudinally the **ratio of students that continue in graduate programmes**.
13. For the BA programmes it is recommended to emphasise stronger the **aspect of working with parents**, both to suitable reach out to families with younger children and to build educational partnerships to support children's' transition periods between non-institutional and institutional care, and school, respectively.
14. The **number of teaching staff** which can represent the discipline in teaching and research should be raised in the BA programme "Early Childhood Education".
15. The **imbalance of the amount of content in the BA programmes** which occurs in semesters 6 and 7 should be reflected and be aligned.
16. **Adaption of content** should take place in the BA programmes, especially topics like "transitions", "resilience" and "didactic approaches" should be addressed. The subject "inclusion" should be broadened and include also children with other (social) disadvantages.
17. The **indicators of the tracer studies** should be extended and differentiated.
18. The **profile of both Masters' programmes should be sharpened** by either addressing the research aspect (academic labour market perspective) or by strengthening the management aspect and prepare students for leadership tasks (non-academic labour market perspective) date. The focus of the MA Early Childhood Education **in arts** should be made more visible and promoted.
19. It should be explained in more detail **which professional activities** are open with the MA beyond those of graduates with the BA Early Childhood Education.
20. The content of the MA programmes should be distributed in a more balanced way between the semesters and more content should be transferred to semesters 3 and 4.
21. To align the **PhD programme** with international practice the following steps should be taken:
  - a. If national regulations allow it, it is recommended to give a higher weighting on the scientific thesis (Dissertation).
  - b. Following international standards there should be the possibility for the dissertation to approach it monographically or cumulatively.
  - c. In the methodological orientation, empirical and literature-based approaches should be considered in equal measure.
  - d. For further internationalisation, the English language should play a greater role in teaching and exchange in academic networks.
22. It should be described how the **QA results** are integrated and are used more effectively by management in the planning, decision-making and change processes.
23. More **current and up-to-date literature**, especially in English, should be used.
24. The **functionality of some websites** should be improved.