



AGENTUR FÜR  
QUALITÄTSSICHERUNG DURCH  
AKKREDITIERUNG VON  
STUDIENGÄNGEN E.V.

## EXPERTS' REPORT

# UNIVERSITAS TELKOM, BANDUNG, INDONESIA CLUSTER BUSINESS

MANAGEMENT (BACHELOR)

BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION (BACHELOR)

August 2022



**Content**

---

<b>Decision of the Accreditation Commission of AQAS .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>I. Preamble .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>II. Accreditation procedure.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>1. Criteria.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>2. Approach and methodology .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>III. General information on the university .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>IV. Assessment of the study programmes.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>1. Quality of the curriculum.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>2. Procedures for quality assurance .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>4. Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification .....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>5. Teaching staff.....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>6. Learning resources and student support.....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>7. Information .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>V. Recommendation of the panel of experts.....</b>	<b>26</b>

## DECISION OF THE AQAS STANDING COMMISSION ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES

- “BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION” (BACHELOR)
- “MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR)

OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS TELKOM, BANDUNG, INDONESIA

**Based on the report of the expert panel and the discussions of the AQAS Standing Commission in its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting on 29 August 2022, the AQAS Standing Commission decides:**

1. The study programmes “**Business Administration**” (Bachelor) and “**Management**” (Bachelor) offered by **Universitas Telkom, Indonesia** are accredited according to the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation.

The accreditations are conditional.

The study programmes essentially comply with the requirements defined by the criteria and thus the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) and the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) in their current version. The required adjustments can be implemented within a time period of twelve months.

2. The conditions have to be fulfilled. The fulfilment of the conditions has to be documented and reported to AQAS no later than **30 September 2023**.
3. The accreditation is given for the period of **six years** and is valid until **30 September 2028**.

### Conditions:

#### For both programmes:

1. The curriculum review must be performed by involving not only internal stakeholders, but the faculty must include external stakeholders including alumni, external academic experts, and industrial representatives.
2. The internal QA system must monitor the quality of assessment methods. The content of each assessment must meet undergraduate level and make sure that the lecturers are marking the different types of final examinations according to the regulations and schemes.
3. A staff development plan must be provided which explains how more fulltime teaching staff (including professors) will be included in BA programmes in the next three years.

#### Additionally for the programme “Business Administration”:

4. To improve the entrepreneurial skills of the students in the Business Administration programme the following content must be offered: Franchising, Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) Management, Business Plan, Company Law, Business Law.

The following **recommendations** are given for further improvement of the programmes:

**For both programmes:**

1. Telkom University should use the information provided by the internal management system as a strategic tool. The process of using the data should be described in a comprehensive way.
2. The course descriptions for both programmes should be provided to the students in an user-friendly way and be oriented on the needs of this stakeholders. Mistakes in the course handbook should be corrected.
3. Assessment methods in both programmes should be verified by external examiners.
4. The grading of the exams in both study programmes should reflect the normal distribution of competencies in the student population.
5. The English-speaking competences of the students should be improved to make them competitive on the international labour market.
6. Academic writing should be trained more intensively and should start in the earlier semester.
7. As a service to the students Telkom University should provide an overview how much credits can be gained in the national workload system and how this corresponds to the European Credit System (ECTS).
8. A “Board of Study” should be appointed which consists of alumni of the programmes, external academics from other universities who are involved in similar programmes in their universities and industrial advisors to evaluate the relevancy and validity of the programmes.
9. External Academician Assessors should evaluate the method and content of assessments.
10. Measures should be taken to support the teaching staff in its research ambitions by offering more time or regular research semesters.
11. Support of staff in internationalization should be intensified to foster the university's vision to become a research university
12. The number of teaching staff with industry background should be raised and the exchange between teaching staff and companies (e.g., practice semester) should be supported.
13. The duration of the internships should be extended.
14. The existing mobility programmes should be extended to other English-speaking countries.

**Additionally for the programme “Management”:**

1. The programme “Management” should be renamed, and the specialisation of the programme should become clear for students and stakeholders. The renaming should consider the international comparability but also pay attention to the frame set by the national regulations.

With regard to the reasons for this decision the Standing Commission refers to the attached assessment report.

**EXPERTS' REPORT****ON THE STUDY PROGRAMMES**

- **“BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION” (BACHELOR)**
- **“MANAGEMENT” (BACHELOR)**

**OFFERED BY UNIVERSITAS TELKOM, BANDUNG, INDONESIA**

Visit to the university: 11. - 13.04.2022

**Panel of experts:**

<b>Prof. Dr Zulkiflee Daud</b>	Universiti Utara Malaysia, School of Business Management
<b>Prof. Dr. Ute Merbecks</b>	Rhine-Waal University of Applied Sciences, Faculty of Society & Economics
<b>Dr. Hans-Dieter Schinner</b>	International Industrial Consult IIC AG (representative of the labour market)
<b>Tobias Burk</b>	Student of Management (M.Sc.) at the Universität Hohenheim (Germany) and Université de Liège (Belgium) (student expert)
<b>Coordinator:</b> Doris Herrmann	AQAS, Cologne, Germany

## I. Preamble

---

AQAS – Agency for Quality Assurance through Accreditation of Study Programmes – is an independent non-profit organisation, supported by more than 90 member institutions, both higher education institutions (HEIs) and academic associations. Since 2002, the agency has been accredited by the German Accreditation Council (GAC). It is therefore a notified body for accreditation of higher education institutions and programmes in Germany.

AQAS is a full member of ENQA and also listed in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR) which confirms that our procedures comply with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), on which all Bologna countries agreed as a basis for internal and external quality assurance.

AQAS is an institution founded by and working for higher education institutions and academic associations. The agency is devoted to quality assurance and quality development of both academic studies and teaching in higher education institutions. The activities of AQAS in accreditation are neither limited to specific academic disciplines or degrees nor to a certain type of higher education institution.

## II. Accreditation procedure

---

This report results from the external review of the Bachelor programmes “Management” and “Business Administration” offered by Universitas Telkom.

### 1. Criteria

Each programme is assessed against a set of criteria for accreditation developed by AQAS: the AQAS Criteria for Programme Accreditation (Bachelor/Master). The criteria are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) 2015. To facilitate the review each criterion features a set of indicators that can be used to demonstrate the fulfilment of the criteria. However, if single indicators are not fulfilled this does not automatically mean that a criterion is not met. The indicators need to be discussed in the context of each programme since not all indicators necessarily can be applied to every programme.

### 2. Approach and methodology

#### *Initialisation*

The university mandated AQAS to perform the accreditation procedure in April 2021. The university produced a Self-Evaluation Report (SER). In July 2021, the institution handed in a draft of the SER together with the relevant documentation on the programmes and an appendix. The appendix included e.g.:

- Course descriptions for both programmes
- statistical data of the student body (e.g. number of applications, beginners, students, graduates, student dropouts),
- list of the teaching staff
- information on student services,
- academic regulations and
- Diploma Supplements.

AQAS checked the SER regarding completeness, comprehensibility, and transparency. The accreditation procedure was officially initialised by a decision of the AQAS Standing Commission on 30<sup>th</sup> August 2021. The final version of the SER was handed in February 2022.

*Nomination of the expert panel*

The composition of the panel of experts follows the stakeholder principle. Consequently, representatives from the respective disciplines, the labour market, and students are involved. Furthermore, AQAS follows the principles for the selection of experts defined by the European Consortium for Accreditation (ECA). The Standing Commission nominated the aforementioned expert panel in February 2022. AQAS informed the university about the members of the expert panel and the university did not raise any concerns against the composition of the panel.

*Preparation of the site visit*

Prior to the site visit, the experts reviewed the SER and submitted a short preliminary statement including open questions and potential needs for additional information. AQAS forwarded these preliminary statements to the university and to all panel members to increase transparency in the process and the upcoming discussions during the site visit.

*Site visit*

Due to the pandemic situation, the site visit to the university took place online on 11<sup>th</sup>-13<sup>th</sup> April 2022. The experts interviewed different stakeholders, e.g., the management of the higher education institution, the programme management, teaching staff, as well as students and graduates, in separate discussion rounds and consulted additional documentation as well as student work. The visit concluded by the presentation of the preliminary findings of the group of experts to the university's representatives.

*Reporting*

After the site visit had taken place, the expert group drafted the following report, assessing the fulfilment of the AQAS Criteria. The report included a recommendation to the AQAS Standing Commission. The report was sent to the university for comments.

*Decision*

The report, together with the comments of the university, forms the basis for the AQAS Standing Commission to take a decision regarding the accreditation of the programmes. Based on these two documents, the AQAS Standing Commission took its decision on the accreditation on 29<sup>th</sup> of August 2022. AQAS forwarded the decision to the university. The university had the right to appeal against the decision or any of the imposed conditions.

In September 2022, AQAS published the report and the result of the accreditation as well as the names of the panel of experts.

### III. General information on the university

---

Telkom University (Tel-U), located in Bandung, Indonesia, was founded in 2013 as a result of the merger of 4 higher education institutions under the Telkom Education Foundation, namely the Telkom Institute of Technology (established in 1990), Telkom Institute of Management (established in 1990), Telkom Polytechnic (established in 2007), and Telkom Indonesian College of Art and Design (established in 2010). The university consists of 7 faculties and 38 programmes for undergraduate and graduate studies. The **seven faculties** are as follows: School of Electrical Engineering, School of Industrial and System Engineering, School of Computing, School of Economics and Business, School of Communication and Business, School of Creative Industries, and School of Applied Science.

According to the SER, there are currently 30,357 **students** at Telkom, including international students from 63 countries (e.g. from Timor Leste, Malaysia, Thailand, South Korea, Cambodia, Vietnam, The Netherlands, Germany, Croatia, Jordan, Sudan). In addition to offering regular classes, Telkom University also offers international class programmes using English as the instruction language. The programme provides international short-term visit, exchange, or double degree with university partners such as Kumoh Institute of Technology (Korea), Kumamoto University (Japan), Saxion University (the Netherlands), University Utara Malaysia and others.

According to SER, there are wide **areas of research** covered by 31 research groups and 130 laboratories. Furthermore, Telkom University states to conduct over 900 research studies and over 180 community services. The available Research Centres at Telkom University are: Advanced Wireless Technologies (Adwitech), Internet of Things Center (TIC), Digital Business Ecosystem (DBE), Human Centric Engineering (Humic Engineering), and Advanced Creative Network (AdCNet).

An Innovation Centre, called **Bandung Techno Park (BTP)**, is actively involved in developing and mentoring start-up companies, business incubations, and providing technology solutions in ICT areas. The centre was inaugurated directly by the Indonesian Minister of Industry as a form of a strategic plan for the development of 100 techno parks throughout Indonesia which was initiated by the government. According to the SER, Telkom University has developed an innovation and entrepreneurship curriculum via BTP supported by 560 non-academic partners and has organized non-academic activities including the Innovation Scheme Internship.

Tel-U has been **certified with ISO 21001: 2018** (Educational Organizations - Management System for Educational Organization) and ISO 9001: 2015 (Quality Management System) and ISO 20000-1: 2018 for IT Services and has obtained an "A" from the National Accreditation Board for Higher Education (BAN-PT).

The Management programme falls under the **School of Economics & Business (SEB)**, which was established in 1990. The Business Administration programme falls under the **School of Communication and Business (SCB)**, which was established in 2008.

The **School of Economics & Business** currently offers four study programmes: **Management (Bachelor)**, Management (Master), Management Distance Education (Master), and Accounting (Bachelor). The school has 3383 active students supported by 113 academic staff and by support staff, of which 2069 students and 60 academic staff fall into the Management Bachelor's programme. SEB has three research groups focusing on the fields of strategy, entrepreneurship and economics, ICT-based management as well as finance and accounting studies.

The **School of Communication and Business** currently offers three undergraduate programmes: **Business Administration**, Communication Science, and Digital Public Relations. The school has about 3770 active students supported by 100 academic staff and by support staff. The Business Administration programme itself has about 1490 active students with the support of 43 academic staff as well as four research groups that focus on research in the fields of business & organisation sustainability, humanities & media studies, public relations & marketing communication, and business innovation & development.

Structurally, the schools are led by a Dean, who is supported by two Vice Deans (Vice Dean for Academic Affairs and Research Support and Vice Dean for Finance, Resources & Student Affairs) and the support staff.



## IV. Assessment of the study programmes

### 1. Quality of the curriculum

#### **Bachelor degree**

*The intended learning outcomes of the programme are defined and available in published form. They reflect both academic and labour-market requirements and are up-to-date with relation to the relevant field. The design of the programme supports achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*The academic level of graduates corresponds to the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework.*

*The curriculum's design is readily available and transparently formulated.*

[ESG 1.2]

#### **Description**

The SER outlines the **general curriculum evaluation** at Tel-U through the development of science and technology in the relevant fields, the needs of the job market, as well as the vision and values developed by each institution. **Learning outcomes** are formulated based on the results of evaluations of the study programme curriculum, tracer studies, input from graduates, alumni, and labour market representatives. The process is described in the SER as follows: the graduate profiles are based on the results of governmental and business studies of the labour market needs as well as the needs concerning the development of science and technology. Tel-U describes that based on this graduate profile, learning outcomes are formulated by the respective study programmes, considering input from stakeholders, professional associations, scientific consortia, trends in future scientific/skill developments, and the results of curriculum evaluations. The items of learning outcomes are then selected as the basis for the formulation of courses. Each course contains elements of each learning outcome category: knowledge, skills, and attitudes. Tel-U describes that through the evaluation process, learning outcomes, courses, and course learning outcomes are formulated in accordance with the industry demands.

Telkom uses a **matrix to allocate courses** to their respective learning outcomes. The study programme curriculum is mapped into courses and each course is described in more detail in the **Semester Learning Plan** (RPS). The components of the courses offered are: 136 credits of classroom/sit-in courses, 2 credits for internship and community service, 2 credits for seminar proposal and 4 credits for the final project. Learning outcomes are implemented in general courses that can be taken across study programs as well as in courses offered exclusively in the study programmes of Management and Business Administration.

The **Programme Learning Outcomes (PLOs)** are divided into general as well as specific skills. Telkom uses a matrix to allocate courses to the respective learning outcomes and courses are divided into compulsory and elective courses, the latter of which can be taken starting with semester five.

As per the SER, the programmes aim to ensure the quality of the curriculum by determining the learning outcomes that are arranged based on the profile of graduates. Based on the graduate profiles, the learning outcomes are then adjusted to the **Indonesian National Qualifications Framework** (KKNl). Furthermore, the learning outcomes are used to develop the curriculum. Each item of learning achievement is derived as the learning achievement of the subject.

According to SER, the Bachelor programmes of Management and Business Administration have **integrated research into teaching** through several research schemes and the independent campus work-ready

programme called WRAP. WRAP involves students as researcher in a research centre or group where they are involved in research projects for one semester (extendable to add another semester).

### **Management (Bachelor)**

The Bachelor's programme "Management" is an 8-semester-programme with 144 SKS (semester credit system). The programme identifies ten PLOs concerning Attitude (such as internalising academic values, norms and ethics and contributing to the quality of social life, society, nation, state and civilisation), the Mastery of Knowledge (such as mastering and applying theoretical concepts in management science and research methodology), General Skills (such as the ability to apply logical, critical, systematic, and innovative thinking in the context of the development of science and technology), and Specific Skills (such as problem-solving, and formulation and implementation of strategic plans into operational plans).

As mentioned in the SER, some courses are cross-educational (such as "Business Statistics" or "Interpersonal and Business Communication"), while others are subject-specific (such as "Digital Business Regulation" or "Project Management"). The curriculum also features compulsory as well as elective courses. Compulsory courses include "Research Seminar", "English Language", "Marketing Management" or "Consumer Behaviour", while there are 27 elective courses available that include "Corporate Development", "Platform Strategy", "New Business Management" or "Artificial Intelligence for Business", depending on students' interests and goals.

### **Business Administration (Bachelor)**

The Bachelor's programme "Business Administration" is an 8-semester-programme with 144 SKS. The programme identifies six PLOs concerning Attitude (such as demonstrating ethical values and professional attitudes), General Skills (such as teamwork, technology, analytical thinking and problem-solving), and Specific Skills (such as demonstrating and applying an understanding of basic business functions in the area of business administration). The graduate profile of the programme lists entrepreneurs, business analysts and intrapreneurs.

Courses are both cross-educational (such as "Value Creation") as well as subject-specific (such as "Finance", "Service Marketing" or "Business Law") and are divided into compulsory and elective courses. Elective courses include e.g. "Marketing Research", "Performance and Remuneration", "Marketing Research" or "Digital and Technology Marketing". Overall, there are 11 elective courses available to choose from.

### **Experts' evaluation**

#### **General**

The learning outcomes of the study programmes are clearly derived from the missions and visions of the Telkom University. The university and faculty are closely monitoring the Programme Learning Outcomes (PLO) by an academic information system called iGracias: The achieved level for the defined course PLO is shown and controlled for each student. The tool is an impressive and convincing measure for the continuous check of the appropriateness of the PLO as well. The panel of experts recommends using the information provided by the system as a strategic tool: e.g., data generated can be used for the regular review of the curriculum. **(Finding 1)** The process of using the data should be described in a comprehensive way. Additionally, the proof of the appropriateness of the PLO is provided in a structured way by yearly formal meetings with practitioners and a letter of agreement. Informal exchange seems to be even more important.

An idealised typical course plan is available for both study programmes. Different colours are used to inform students on the responsible unit of the university. Moreover, arrows are clearly indicating prerequisites for some of the course.

The University makes internal use of very detailed course descriptions so that the teaching staff is well informed in case it has to take over courses from colleagues. Although the Course Descriptions Handbooks are very transparent and detailed (500 pages), mistakes such as stated below should be removed:

- No table of contents is given. This is not user friendly.
- Pages are not numbered.
- The pagination is confusing.
- Courses are not numbered. Coding them appropriately would help students to find out which course is studied in which semester.
- The references given in some courses are occasionally outdated (Handbook “Management”, p. 71) or not given given in English (Handbook “Management”, p. 422). In some courses no references are given at all (Handbook “Management”, p. 210).
- Some citation mistakes occur in the course descriptions. Citation style is not consistent for all courses.

These errors in the course descriptions should be corrected. Although the course descriptions are useful for the internal management of teaching and learning, the descriptions are too extensive and do not provide additional information for the students. The handbook is an important document for students and at the same time important for the reputation of the programme. It would be advisable to provide them with a condensed version of the course descriptions. **(Finding 2)**

Regarding the assessment of the courses, a clear structure is given in the course descriptions and different forms of examinations are allowed. The experts recommend that the assessment methods be reviewed by external examiners. **(Finding 3)** Furthermore, the grading of examinations in both courses should reflect the normal distribution of a student population. **(Finding 4)**

### **Management (Bachelor)**

The objective of the study programme of the School of Business and Economics focuses on preparing students to become a professional in the field of management in digital businesses or start-up companies. The panel of experts was informed that the national regulations given by the Ministry of Education limit the designation of the names of the programmes and the degrees in Indonesia. The very general naming of the programme (“Management”) is not in line with the focus of the programme. The panel of experts strongly advises to rename the programme to improve the transparency for students and stakeholders and to strengthen the international comparability. The renaming should happen in line with the national regulations. **(Finding 5)**

The curriculum supports the achievement of the learning outcomes in a balanced manner. According to the importance of subject-specific programme learning outcomes (PLO), the curriculum clearly focuses on subject-specific courses (70% of the ten PLOs), especially in the higher semesters. Moreover, the programme offers many interdisciplinary elements that addresses economic and technological elements. Cross-subject knowledge is in the focus of the first two semesters by courses given from the university (e.g., Indonesian civics, Religion and ethics, ICT). In addition to the clearly mentioned development of subject-related and methodological skills in many courses, students have the chance to development general skills: E.g., Social Community Service is accepted instead of internship, and project management is a compulsory course in the higher semester. Additionally, English courses are mandatory in the earlier semester. In the discussion

with the representatives of the labour market the need to improve the students' competences to *speak English* was highlighted because many companies also work on international level. **(Finding 6)**

The achievement of the three specific skills (PLO 8-10) is clearly shown in the study plan. First, students should be able to solve functional problems that occur in a digital-based organization (e.g., financing, marketing). Therefore, the curriculum is convincingly structured as follows: In the earlier semester courses provide basic insights into theoretical foundations of the digitized economy (ICT/Technology Literacy; Statistics and Data Management). Based on this, courses in the higher semester help students to become more familiar with practical issues of digitized organisations (e.g., Big Data and Data Analytics, Digital Regulation). This structure of the curriculum enhances the employability of the students and was approved by the representatives of the labour market.

Second, students should be educated to conduct their own theoretical and empirical research with digital content. Accordingly, students start in the first semesters with statistical and business mathematic course. In preparing the mini thesis in the last semester, students have to register for courses that provide deeper insights into research methods and academic writing step by step. This part of the curriculum is clearly structured as well. However, applying research methodologies and academic writing in only one research seminar might not be sufficient. This is clearly verified by the heterogeneous quality of the handed in thesis examples. Academic writing should be trained more intensively in the programme and should start in the earlier semester. **(Finding 7)** In addition, the compulsory colloquium *before* the mini thesis is extraordinary compared to European standards.

Third, students should be able to master the principles of entrepreneurship. In line with this PLO two courses address creativity techniques and are compulsory for the entrepreneurial project that has to be performed in the fifth semester. Besides, one course is on entrepreneurship in general. The desired qualifications are basically achieved.

The intended PLOs of the study programme are reflecting both academic and labour market requirements. This was clearly pointed out by the representatives of the labour market. Students from the BA Management have interdisciplinary competencies in the field of Finance and Marketing because of the provided courses in technological literacy and quantitative research methods, especially Big Data and data analytics. Current research topics of digital businesses (e.g., digital marketing, fintechs, corporate digital responsibility) are not specifically addressed in the name of many courses. However, the supply chain management course was updated to current issues in digitization, and the Big Data and Data Analytics course was integrated into the curriculum recently. Therefore, the PLO are only basically updated according to current developments.

The panel of experts has no doubts that the targets as well as the content of the programme corresponds with the requirements of the appropriate level of the National and the European Qualifications Framework and that the Bachelor degree is adequate for the programme.

### **Bachelor of Business Administration**

All curricular elements and their functions are documented. The curriculum covers subject-specific and cross-subject knowledge. All subjects have indicated their Course Learning Outcomes (CLOs) and do the mapping with assigned/appropriate PLO. It is described that if the programme includes specific elements, such as distance education, part-time studies, it will reflect the mode of study. All elements of the curriculum for Bachelor of Business Administration are assigned with a certain number of credits. Upon completion of each element, students will be assessed by final examination and final project. The PLOs are according current national and international development.

Basically, the curriculum of Bachelor of Business Administration's focus is to furnish the students with entrepreneurship knowledge. The curriculum is endorsed by the senate of the faculty which consists of the programme leader, head of department and industrial representatives. The curriculum is aligned with the national programme standard suggested by The Ministry of Higher Education. To enhance the knowledge of practicality in entrepreneurship, the university has given facilities to business incubators to enhance teaching and learning activities. In addition, students are given the opportunity to start up their own business within campus. Furthermore, in enhancing the entrepreneurial skills amongst BBA students, the faculty has implemented a programme that involve the industry and community. The so called ESL programme started in 2020 and has successfully produced 10 start-up business groups.

The structure of the Business programme includes business core, electives, and common subjects with 144 SKS. The curricular structure of the programme supports the achievement of the intended learning outcomes and the learner's progression. One undergraduate cycle has a study load of 144 – 146 SKS which within four years of study. In each semester students must undergo 14 weeks of study with 170 minutes of study per credit per week. The panel of experts recommends to provide a table to students which transparently shows how much credits can be gained in the national workload system and how this can be compared with the European Credit System (ECTS). **(Finding 8)**

The faculty has successfully utilized the Learning Management System (LMS) in teaching and learning activities. The syllabus of each subjects/courses/elements are uploaded in the LMS. The Programme Learning Outcomes (PLOs) and the Course Learning Outcomes (CLOs) are also being uploaded in the LMS. All students can access the LMS without any problem and the Outcome Based Education (OBE) can be organized and assessed through the LMS.

To maintain the quality of the programme not only in regard to the discipline but also to the needs of industry, the curriculum review is performed every 4 years. The curriculum review is performed internally which only involves the senate of the faculty.

Although the panel of experts is satisfied with the overall quality of the Bachelor of Business Administration, it sees the need that the programme is evaluated and updated continuously and regularly. Therefore, a kind of "study committee" should be appointed for the programme, composed of alumni of the programme, academics from other universities involved in similar programmes, and representatives of industry, to assess the relevance and conformity of the professional standards, i.e. the usefulness of the programme. **(Finding 9)** The curriculum review must be performed by involving not only internal stakeholders but the faculty must include external stakeholders including alumni, external academic expert and industrial representatives. **(Finding 10)**

As the programme is designed to produce graduates with entrepreneurial skills, it is strongly recommended that the following subjects/courses/elements are offered: Franchising, Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) Management, Business Plan, Company Law, Business Law. **(Finding 11)**

The panel of experts has no doubts that the targets as well as the content of the programme corresponds with the requirements of the appropriate level of the European Qualifications Framework and that the Bachelor degree is adequate for the programme.

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 2. Procedures for quality assurance

### **Bachelor degree**

*The programme is subject to the higher education institution's policy and associated procedures for quality assurance, including procedures for the design, approval, monitoring, and revision of the programmes.*

*A quality-oriented culture, focusing on continuous quality enhancement, is in place. This includes regular feedback mechanisms involving both internal and external stakeholders.*

*The strategy, policies, and procedures have a formal status and are made available in published form to all those concerned. They also include roles for students and other stakeholders.*

*Data is collected from relevant sources and stakeholders, analysed, and used for the effective management and continuous enhancement of the programme.*

[ESG 1.1, 1.7 & 1.9]

### **Description**

As outlined in the SER, Telkom University has three quality policies:

- a) the principles of ISO 21001: 2018 regarding Educational Organisations Management Systems by aiming to comply with national and international standards,
- b) continuously improving quality with a focus on social responsibility by involving all stakeholders, and
- c) manage intellectual property with the development of technology, science and arts related to research and innovation activities.

These policies are said to be guided by all elements of the university.

The implementation of quality assurance at the university level is carried out by the Quality Assurance Unit and the Internal Audit Unit under the Directorate of Secretariat and Strategic Planning, which are directly responsible to the Rector. Those units are responsible for managing the activities of planning, implementing, monitoring, evaluating, and developing a quality assurance system.

The implementation of quality assurance at the structural unit and faculty level is supervised by the University Level Quality Management Representative (QMR), the Vice Rector's office, and the faculty. The QMR is appointed at all three levels and responsible for coordinating the development, implementation, improvement, and effectiveness of quality assurance within the university by formulating policies related to quality management and reviewing results of assessments from both internal and external assessors. They are said to recommend improvements to the Quality Assurance System within the university and to report results on an ongoing basis.

At the study programme level, the quality assurance is carried out by the Quality Control Group (QCG), which is responsible for (1) measuring the achievement of the study programme quality objectives on a regular basis, (2) supervising the implementation of Telkom University's standards, (3) assisting the Head of the study programmes in improving internal quality assurance systems, (4) reporting to the QMR of the faculty concerning the monitoring and evaluation as well as (5) evaluating the performance of the study programme itself. The SER states that the QCG generally consists of a small team that is determined by the Dean and approved by the Head of the study programme as well as the faculty's QMR.

According to the SER, the curriculum is evaluated at three levels: through long-term, medium-term, and short-term evaluations based on the process and results of previous implementations, the capabilities of the study programme itself as well as studies of future needs for the programme. The evaluations built up on one another, with the short-term monitoring and evaluations' results being used as a reference for the medium-term evaluation.



The results of short-term monitoring and evaluation are intended to examine the learning methods of a course syllabus material in the current curriculum. Short-term evaluation consists of an evaluation process and adjustment of learning methods carried out to respond to the dynamics of the learning process in one semester of administering a course. The main output of the short-term evaluation is a plan for learning methods that are more in line with classroom conditions while considering the learning objectives.

Medium-term (annual) evaluation is an evaluation that is carried out as part of the annual cycle of courses in order to review the novelty of the material (module/course book) of each subject with the latest developments, the suitability of learning methods with the characteristics of courses and study program resources, as well as the accuracy in selecting an assessment model with the type and level of competence intended for each course. This evaluation is carried out by a team of course lecturers in coordination with the research groups and study programs. The evaluation of course implementation at the end of a semester is used as a reference in material improvement, selection of learning methods, adjustment of assessment models, and preparation for the implementation in the coming semester. The main instrument used in the evaluation is the course portfolio, which is prepared throughout the semester and includes at least lesson plans, main and supporting materials, examples of previous exams, quizzes, assignments, information on student achievements (list of scores and exit survey results), and evaluation on the implementation of the learning process throughout one semester. The evaluation mechanism is conducted in the form of a lecture evaluation coordination meeting towards the end of the semester and a lecture preparation coordination meeting towards the beginning of the semester for the implementation of a course. The main output of this medium-term evaluation is a better learning plan for each course, including the module and course handbook.

Long-term evaluations take the needs of the labour market into account as well as internal aspects (e.g. availability of resources, fulfilment of educational standards, implementation of the previous curriculum) and external aspects (e.g. tracer studies, national development strategies, science and technology development trends) and is carried out at the beginning of the third year of curriculum implementation. It is also known as “market signal analysis.”

The SER states that curriculum development is also carried out independently by involving internal (e.g. institutional management, lecturers and students) and external stakeholders (e.g. industry, academia, alumni, respective ministries).

Reviews of the performance of programme learning outcomes take place periodically. Tel-U uses an integrated application system called iGracias, like explained above.

Internal and external audits are carried out, with the latter carried out in accordance with the national provisions through national accreditation activities by the National Accreditation Body for Higher Education every 5 years.

According to the SER, the daily behaviour of the academic community is regulated in the student code of the ethics document, the lecturer code of ethics, and employee code of ethics. Regular discussion forums with industry experts from the labour market are said to be used for internal analysis to formulate possible graduate profiles of the study programmes and ensure employability of graduates in accordance with the needs of the labour market.

### **Experts' evaluation**

The university has implemented quality measures at all levels that are documented, interconnected and transparently presented. The quality management system involves various methods of assessment of the quality of teaching, learning, and working at the university and includes all relevant stakeholders in the process. Following standards like the ISO 21001: 2018 is valued by the expert panel. Students are systematically involved in the management of quality at several stages, including course evaluations, meetings with student

representatives and informal channels. The labour market is also actively included in the development of the study programmes, e.g. by giving advice on current topics and megatrends that can be included into the curriculum. In addition, students are able to collect the results of the course evaluations in an aggregated form and discussions about the individual assessment of courses is initiated by lecturers on an informal basis.

Telkom University has also presented reasonable targets for the future development of quality in the study programmes. Therefore, the panel of experts concludes that the responsibilities and targets are well defined and that they are adequate for the monitoring and revision of programmes.

For statistical purposes, the university collects data for student progression, drop-out-rates and evaluation results and uses them to improve the individual performance of lecturers, but also to enhance overall programme development.

From the discussion with the students the panel of experts learned that the teaching staff is open for the students' feedback and reacts quickly to solve potential problems. Therefore, the experts got the impression that measures are taken to enhance the quality or to address identified findings.

Telkom University has procedures in place to safeguard academic integrity and prevent academic fraud within the programmes.

Overall, the expert panel is convinced that the university has an impressive and well-organized quality management system.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

### 3. Learning, teaching and assessment of students

#### **Bachelor degree**

*The delivery of material encourages students to take an active role in the learning process.*

*Students are assessed using accessible criteria, regulations, and procedures, which are made readily available to all participants and which are applied consistently.*

*Assessment procedures are designed to measure the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

[ESG 1.3]

#### **Description**

The SER identifies several teaching and learning methods used in both programmes, e.g. in-class discussion, assignments, practicum, and blended learning using online platforms. Both programmes apply a student-centred learning method with an outcome-based education approach set in accordance with the curriculum design, lesson plan and the course syllabus. Teaching and learning methods are arranged in the course procedure and consist of the description of any activities and the responsibilities of the university, faculties, and the study programmes in preparing, organising, and evaluating the course. The Head of the study programme, the course lecturer, the Head of Academic Affairs Division, and students are involved in the course procedure. By including a description of the terms of process, measurement of the performance and document records Telkom University aims to create processes that strengthen the comparability of its programmes regarding its structures and processes.



According to the SER, both programmes ensure no overlap between the contents of all course materials and scheduling as well as test scheduling. Test guidelines and procedures are accessible online for students and lecturers and provide information regarding e.g. responsibilities, conformity with curriculum and target competency.

As explained above, Telkom University imposes a study load based on a **semester credit system (SKS)** which is national standard in Indonesia. SKS is a unit used to express student study load, lecturer workload, learning experience, and programme implementation load. SKS becomes a measure for the learning experience gained during one semester through scheduled activities per week. Types of activities used are e.g. face-to-face learning, autonomous learning or online learning with one SKS equalling between 50 to 120 minutes per week, depending on the lecture model and type of activity.

Students are scored based on tasks which can include quizzes or small tests to evaluate a module or chapter of a course, learning outcome assessments to improve the teaching and learning process, and homework (individually or in a group) including paper writing, chapter reports, small projects, or a particular skill training.

The type of test is dependent on the learning outcome target and is stated in the full-semester lesson plan for each course. The lesson plan is delivered to students by the course lecturer at the beginning of each course. The lesson plan includes the programme and course learning outcomes.

The process of test items at Telkom University is described as follows: a team of lecturers from a course proposes test items by referring to the lesson plan. Each team has its own course coordinator who assesses and verifies the test items. After verification, the test items will be further diversified by the Head of the study programme. In online teaching and learning processes, all lecturers are required to manage the appropriate learning management systems and are required to pass courses in that field. During the test session itself, the Academic Administration Service of the faculty is responsible for the test process, which has been set in the academic calendar of Tel-U and has been verified by the Vice Rector of Academic Affairs at the beginning of an academic year.

The SER identifies three types of tests: regular tests, make-up tests and special tests. The requirement for taking part in the final test is an attendance of at least 75 % of academic activities. Make-up and special tests are designed to enable students who missed the regular tests. Students must make a request for this and the scheduling lies with the faculty, study programme or the respective examiner.

Appeals and complaints procedures are in place for students through the online information system which is also used to manage IT systems and support services.

### **Experts' evaluation**

Methods of teaching and learning are appropriate and correspond to the intended learning outcomes. Methods of teaching and learning respect and consider the diversity of students and their needs, enabling flexible learning paths.

The lecturers have to teach between 12 to 16 hours per week. However, lecturers who are appointed to an administrative position will teach less than 12 hours per week. The determination of lecturer to teach a subject/course/element is based on his or her academic qualification as well as his or her competency and industrial experiences. All lecturers are encouraged to deliver their lesson by combining the theories with practise and conveying their industrial experiences during lecture. Besides traditional lecture, the programmes also provides various forms of teaching and learning methods including in-class discussion, assignment, practicum and blended learning using LMS platform. The teaching materials are all uploaded in the LMS to make retrieval for students easier. During the Covid-19 pandemic, all teaching and learning activities were performed in online mode. Hence, all the lecturers and students are full familiar with the LMS. The lecturer will record their teaching

through Blackboard application and upload the teaching session in LMS so that the students can revisit the lecture session conveniently. All the lecturers are trained for teaching and learning; each of the lecturers must undergo at least two training programmes each year and if the lecturer want to attend a training programme that is relevant to his or her needs, he or she must apply for Dean's permission and endorsement.

Assessment regulations and procedures are defined and made readily available in published form to students. The assessment methods comprised with components including Tasks (40%), Mid Test (30%) and Final Exam (30%) and appropriate with the CLO determined by each element/subject. Lecturers are given authority to develop and construct the questions for quizzes, assignments as well as mid semester and final examinations. They have to ensure that all the assessment methods and content must achieve the constructive alignment. The faculty has a procedure for preparing test/final exam items that involve Head of Academic Division, Coordinator Lecturer of a course and Course lecturer. The assessment methods and procedures are according to and approved by the Quality Management Representative. Responsibilities and structures related to the organization of final examination and mid-term examination are clearly defined. Grading scales and distribution of grades are documented and assessed.

The most important indicator for the success of a programme is the achievement of the CLOs and PLOs. Assessment methods for each course/module are appropriate for the learning outcomes as defined in the course/module description. The university assesses the achievement of CLOs and PLOs by using iGracias and this system also helps monitoring the execution of OBE. Each lecturer will is able to manage their own courses by iGracias and will be monitored by the Programme Leader and the Dean.

For final examination, the moderation process for final examination questions will be performed by Head of Study. The respective lecturer will submit two sets of final year examination questions with Test Specification Table (TST) to the Head of Study. The confidentiality of final examination questions will be uphold during the moderation process. For the final year thesis, students must undergo two types of assessments which are proposal defence (in semester 7) and viva-voce (in final semester). The faculty will appoint only internal assessors whose area of expertise is relevant and in-line with the topic of the thesis for the proposal defence and viva-voce.

The faculty has established final examination rules and regulations which are published in the student handbook. If changes to the examination happen, it will be documented and communicated to the students.

In case a student it not satisfied with the examination results, the appeal procedure is documented and communicated to the students via the student handbook. There are transparent and published regulations to compensate for disadvantages, illness, or absence.

The failure rate for the programmes is too low (less than 2%). Telkom University should appoint an external examiner (a senior academic from another university who is involved in a BBA programme at his/her university) to assess the method and criteria, e.g. the quality of the final paper, the final exam questions, the student assignments and the quizzes as well as the markings. **(Finding 12)**

The internal quality committee at faculty level must proactively monitor the quality of assessment methods. The content of each assessment must be appropriate to the undergraduate level and it must be ensured that lecturers assess final examination papers, quizzes and assignments according to the regulations and plans. The Quality Management Officer must work closely with the Faculty Quality Committee to monitor the quality of student assessments. **(Finding 13)**

## Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

#### 4. Student admission, progression, recognition, and certification

##### **Bachelor degree**

*Consistently applied, pre-defined, and published regulations are in place which cover student admission, progression, recognition, and certification.*

[ESG 1.4]

##### **Description**

Telkom University uses an online system to regulate admission to undergraduate programmes, with the admission requirements available online. Undergraduate admissions are managed by the Directorate of Marketing & Admission and under the control of Vice Rector for Admission, Student Affairs and Alumni. Admission requirements differ based on the different pathways available for prospective students. Students are able to choose another admission pathway (e.g. if they want to upgrade their score). Most pathways to admission at Telkom University require some type of test (e.g. written, language, computer-based), though some offer alternatives based on academic report selection. There is also a scholarship pathway available.

Each student is paired with an academic supervisor who monitors the students' learning progress (e.g. class attendance, course score, GPA, final task progress) through the online application iGracias. Course lecturers also use two exams (mid test and final) as well as quizzes to monitor progression and tasks and assignments.

Telkom University offers international mobility programmes. The SER states that all aspects of the international mobility programme (including partnerships programmes, credit transfer and acknowledgment) need to be assessed by the Ministry of Education. On national level the university manages cooperation and exchange through Memorandum of Understandings. Decision power of admission and transfer of credits from courses taken outside the Tel-U campus lies within the faculty. According to the SER, Telkom University aims to integrate Kampus Merdeka (freedom of learning/campus) by acknowledging activities such as student exchanges, internship/field experience, independent projects, community service from other programmes or partner universities. The university also provides policies for students with special needs and scholarship programmes.

Upon successful completion of the study programmes, students are awarded the academic title of Bachelor of Arts for the Management programme or Bachelor of Business Administration for the Administration programme. This includes a certificate and transcript as well as a diploma supplement.

##### **Experts' evaluation**

The admission of students to the university programmes is organized in a centralized way and following the government regulations. The panel of experts appreciates that there are tests for specific competences requested at Telkom University which are considered to be necessary to be able to achieve the qualification goals of the programmes. The selection procedure as well as the requirements are transparently presented and communicated to the public and potential applicants. Due to the status of the university as one of the best private universities, the number of applicants is very impressive. Therefore, the university attracts significantly more applicants than places available in the programmes.

With regard to recognition of prior learning and competences gained abroad, the university has well defined recognition policies that are applied consistently in the programmes. The recognition policy follows international standards and is generally interpreted to the benefit of the students in order to support international mobility. Credit transfers are possible on the basis of a comparison of learning outcomes and competences

gained and Credit Points are converted with standardized calculation methods. To improve plannability and transparency, the university uses pre-mobility declarations similar to European learning agreements.

In addition, the university has an impressive student progression monitoring system, where the academic supervisor is able to detect students with special needs or need for help in the structuring of their learning. The semesters are furthermore designed to enable regular measurement of performance and are therefore able to monitor the individual learning progress of students.

All students receive a graduation certificate after reaching the qualification goals of the programs. This certification is in line with European standards, corresponds to a Diploma Supplement used in Europe, and includes the necessary information for the job market as well as for international transfer for consecutive studies.

Concluding, the expert panel is convinced, that the students' admission, progression, recognition of learning as well as the certification for graduates is meeting international standards.

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 5. Teaching staff

### **Bachelor degree**

*The composition (quantity, qualifications, professional and international experience, etc.) of the staff is appropriate for the achievement of the intended learning outcomes.*

*Staff involved with teaching is qualified and competent to do so.*

*Transparent procedures are in place for the recruitment and development of staff.*

[ESG 1.5]

## Description

Lecturers at Telkom University are either employed in a part- or full-time position. The service period for a full-time lecturer is 65 years old (non-professor) and 70 years old (professor). For part-time lecturers a regulation is applied that the duration depends on the contract period, i.e. one year, and is prolonged in reference to the performance evaluation and study programme needs. Additionally, external practitioner lecturers from backgrounds relating to the study programmes teach courses in both the "Business Administration" as well as "Management" programmes.

The management of the teaching staff is in the responsibility of the Vice Dean for Finance and Resources and the recruitment is based on the needs proposed by him/her. The recruitment activities are carried out centrally by the Human Resources Unit of Telkom University. Activities to meet the needs of human resources, both lecturers and educational personnel, are adjusted to the foundation workforce plan. The plan draws to attention the ratio of lecturers compared to students and the ratio of other educational personnel to lecturers. The plan is generated to be a technical staffing plan for each faculty. A flowchart in the SER shows the recruitment process for lecturers and educational personnel: recruitment planning, search for candidate, selection process and appointment of prospective employee.

Telkom University has a support staff improvement programme which includes several trainings, seminars, workshops and other activities to improve the competencies of the lecturers. The application and implementation processes are regulated in a decree on employee training implementation. Fields of training include soft skills, ICT-based competencies, presentation technique.

Lecturers at Telkom University are required to conduct research, publish and take part in academic activities such as membership in an academic organisation or speaking at conferences. Research collaborations with other universities, research institutions and external parties (e.g. ministries, companies) are encouraged on both a national as well as international level. Funding for that is available. New lecturers are paired with a senior full-time lecturer who serves as a mentor.

## Experts' evaluation

### General

The university has provided a list of all teaching staff involved in the programme, including their academic qualification, their research and other relevant qualifications and the number of teaching hours.

The quantity of teaching staff is sufficient for the deliverance of the programmes in both faculties. The experts met very motivated and engaged staff. The panel of experts was informed that teaching resources are allocated to the study programmes by Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) based on the number of students. The national Indonesian regulation has to be considered for the development of these KPIs. KPIs were not given in the report nor detailed in the discussion rounds with the management of the faculties.

Staff development is organized in a structured way at the university level so that teaching skills can be developed appropriately. Moreover, lecturers are encouraged to take part in training programmes to improve their soft skills. Although, special trainings in the special subjects of the lecturer are not mandatory, lecturers are supported to continue studies to a doctoral level and are funded to attend specialized external trainings. Funds are fully available.

When it comes to the quality of the teaching staff, the number of full professors teaching in the two programmes is not sufficient. Experts were informed that full professors typically teach in the Master's programmes. However, the vision and mission of the private Telkom University clearly focuses on becoming a leading institution in research. According to the panel of experts, more full professors must be included in the BA programmes to reach this goal. Therefore, the panel of experts requests that a staff development plan must be provided which explains how more full professors will be included in BA programmes in the next three years. **(Finding 14)**

The experts were quite impressed by the high intrinsic motivation of teaching staff to deliver the required research output in addition to the high teaching workload. Detailed strategies for publishing papers were presented by some staff members. Moreover, the Research Center at the university level seems to offer sufficient guidance. However, the panel of experts recommends taking measures for supporting the teaching staff in its research ambitions by offering more time or regular research semesters. It is also recommended to exchange with industry regarding the research topics which would be beneficial for both sides. **(Finding 15)**

In addition, supporting teaching staff to go abroad would enhance research collaborations with international experts and improve their English skills as well. A more intense support of the staff in internationalization would be beneficial to foster the vision of the university of becoming a research university. **(Finding 16)**

The recruitment procedures were described to the experts in detail.

### Experts' evaluation BA Management

In 2021 the School of Economics has 117 teaching staff members: 26 Lecturers, 25 Assistant Professors, 60 Lectors, 5 Associate Professors and 1 full Professor.

A full list of all teaching staff including well documented CVs for the programme is provided. The number of female lecturers is commendable. Since only 13% percent of the lecturers are hired with a non-permanent contract, no severe vacancies are expected in the next years. However, no professor is teaching in the BA Management programme. Most of the lectures are given by assistant professors. This is not in line with the ambitious research objectives in the PLO.

Only three practitioner lecturers are hired in the programme, but many lecturers have working experience in the Telkom Ecosystem (e.g., Foundation, Management Institute). However, based on the feedback from the labour market, the panel experts recommend increasing the number of teaching staff with industry background or to enhance the exchange between teaching staff and companies (e.g., practice semester). **(Finding 17)**

### Experts' evaluation BA Business Administration

Teaching resources are allocated to the study programme by KPIs based on the number of students. National Indonesian regulation has to be considered for the development of these KPIs as well. A full list of all teaching staff for the programme is provided. 45% percent of the lecturers are hired with a non-permanent contract. No professor is teaching in this programme. Many lectures are given by lecturers. The quality of research outcome is not convincing. Additionally, too many mistakes in the citation style occur and indicate a lack of coordination. Only three practitioner lecturers are hired in the programme.

The composition of the staff should be modified. In line with the vision of Telkom University more professors should teach in the two programmes. The high percentage of non-permanent contracts in the Business Administration programme raises serious doubts on the staff availability for the next six years. Like explained above, the panel of experts requests that a staff development plan must be provided which explains how more permanent staff will be included in the programmes (see Finding 14). It must also be described how the teaching staff is selected and employed based on its research capacity and how staff is supported in its research activities.

### Conclusion

The criterion is partially fulfilled.

## 6. Learning resources and student support

### **Bachelor degree**

*Appropriate facilities and resources are available for learning and teaching activities.*

*Guidance and support is available for students which includes advice on achieving a successful completion of their studies.*

[ESG 1.6]

### Description

According to the SER, Telkom University offers facilities and buildings dedicated to the departments alone, sharing amongst departments, university events, and public spaces. Each department or the university manage the access and use of the facilities, depending on the area and status of assets. Centralised facilities include a library (including a discussion room), auditorium building, the Tel-U Convention Hall as well as the so-called Tokong Nanas Building, a 10-floor building containing classrooms for all departments, common rooms for students, seminar rooms, a swimming pool, and a student canteen.



Instructional processes for students and lecturers is provided through e. g. literature, e-books, e-journals, case studies, articles. Lecturers have the possibility to order books for the library if needed. Information on the university, faculty, and study programmes is available online. Monitoring and student records are implemented into the application iGracias, which can be accessed by students, lecturers, and parents. iGracias includes academic progress, study plans, the student activity transcript score, lecture attendance and registration.

Facilities for the Management and Business Administration programmes include classrooms, several laboratories, a training room, a counselling room as well as a student common room and student hall. Internet access is given through computer and laptops connected to the Local Area Network and some rooms provide printers and scanners. The Management programme also provides an Investment Gallery. The SER states that both programmes offer facilities for students with special needs.

Quality maintenance of the facilities is laid down in procedural protocols and instructions concerning infrastructure as well. Telkom University is equipped with an integrated security system featuring CCTV, and there is also a security guard on duty 24 hours.

New students are provided with information and support in the transitional process during orientation and student introduction, with the former being held at the university and the faculty level. During the Covid-19 pandemic, orientation was held online.

The SER states that Telkom University offers the services of a psychologist on campus, consultation services by lecturers and support staff as well as counselling services for students with special needs and a special consultation service for inbound students.

### Experts' evaluation

The course description of both study programmes is available for the students in English Language. The delivered documents are clearly structured and provide all information on the Course Learning Outcomes (CLO). Teaching and assessment methods as well as the expected workload are communicated. Students confirmed that the documents are easily accessible by the Learning Management Systems Moodle. However, the panel of experts recommend reviewing the many mistakes in the descriptions and to reduce the high amount of information given (more than 500 pages). The Handbook should not only address teaching staff, but student's needs as well (see above).

Both study programmes are implemented in a way that the intended study duration can be realistically achieved. This is impressively proven by the high employability of the graduates and the high number of applicants to both programmes. Some basic figures on study duration were given to the panel of experts on request. However, the experts recommend initiating a stronger analysis of the available data (see Finding 1). Especially the appropriateness of the workload in the first semesters should be checked. Students confirmed the well-organized examination schedule (which is done with the help of the computer system) with no overlaps. The internships are well organised, but the duration of only one month is not sufficient and an extension is recommended. **(Finding 18)** There are mobility programmes that could usefully be extended to other English-speaking countries. **(Finding 19)**

Sufficient guidance and support for students is given by the faculties and at the university level (e.g., scholarships). Students with special needs or special conditions are addressed clearly and can ask for advisors. For the bachelor thesis, advisors are assigned to the students at a very early stage which helps them to complete the thesis on time. However, the panel of experts was not convinced by the quality of all the theses provided. Some of the papers submitted are not in line with international academic writing standards. Furthermore, mistakes and inconsistencies were found in the references. Accordingly, the experts recommend that academic

writing is trained more thoroughly in both programmes and starts in the earlier semesters. Expertise should be increased by additional research projects (see Finding 7).

Due to the ongoing pandemic, an on-site visit of the university was not possible. Therefore, the evaluation of the facilities is based on the two films shown online. The campus of the university is newly constructed following all principle of modern architecture. The many parks and recreation areas offer an inspiring environment for learning and teaching. The facilities of both faculties are accommodated to the number of students with regards to rooms and space. Furthermore, the university is providing an amazingly high number of dormitories for the students. Experts were informed by the students that courses on soft skill development are offered there. The whole infrastructure is very good:

- The library is very well equipped. Students get access to all relevant international databases. Moreover, the library is open to the general public.
- The university is extraordinary well equipped with laboratories. This allows access to experimental research for the students of both study programmes. The Technical Hub for entrepreneurs was mentioned many times in the discussion rounds. Examples for recent start-ups were given in the discussion rounds. The standard of the labs is very high, and they are maintained appropriately. However, the expert panel recommends initiating partnerships with the industry to enhance the transfer of knowledge into practice in the future.

The management of the faculty pointed out that enough funds are available for all needs (e.g., training of the staff). However, the panel of experts got no deeper insights into the processes of funding and the allocation of funds between faculties and programmes. Some students related KPI were mentioned but not shown in the discussion rounds. Moreover, the role of the Telkom Foundation in financing the university remained at least opaque. Although the Telkom University is a private university collecting fees from their students so that income also depends on the student number, the experts got the impression that the programmes seem to be in a safe position

## Conclusion

The criterion is fulfilled.

## 7. Information

### **Bachelor degree**

*Impartial and objective, up-to-date information regarding the programme and its qualifications is published regularly. This published information is appropriate for and available to relevant stakeholders.*

[ESG 1.8]

### **Description**

Information on the university (overview, vision and mission), faculties and study programmes can be accessed online via Telkom's website as well as the respective study programmes' and faculties' websites. The websites provide information on curriculum structure, subject description, lecturers, and a study programme overview as well as information on student admission, registration procedure, selection track, tuition fee, and scholarships.

Further information channels include email, WhatsApp and via phone as well as university-specific online.



**Experts' evaluation**

Comprehensive information about the structure of the university and its service areas as well as all relevant information for students and prospective students is available in Bahasa Indonesian via the official website of the university, the integrated academic information system (iGracias) and the documented study regulations. A range of information is available on the website in English language. For future enhancement, it is recommended to review the required information from the user's point of view, i.e. to present detailed descriptions of requirements, procedures and processes in a user-friendly way by addressing the different stakeholders. A short version of the information is desirable in order to be able to obtain information quickly.

**Conclusion**

The criterion is fulfilled.

## V. Recommendation of the panel of experts

---

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the Bachelor programme “**Management**” offered by Universitas Telkom with conditions.

The panel of experts recommends accrediting the Bachelor programme “**Business Administration**” offered by Universitas Telkom with conditions.

Most of the findings refer to both programmes. In case a finding addresses only one of the programmes, it is pointed out in the specific finding.

### Findings:

1. Telkom University should use the **information provided by the internal management system** as a strategic tool. The process of using the data should be described in a comprehensive way.
2. The **course descriptions** for both programmes should be provided to the students in an user-friendly way and be oriented on the needs of this stakeholders. Mistakes in the course handbook should be corrected.
3. Assessment methods in both programmes should be verified by **external examiners**.
4. The **grading of the exams** in both study programmes should reflect the normal distribution of competencies in the student population.
5. The programme “**Management**” **should be renamed** and the specialisation of the programme should become clear for students and stakeholders. The renaming should consider the international comparability but also pay attention to the frame set by the national regulations.
6. The **English-speaking competences** of the students should be improved to make them competitive on the international labour market.
7. **Academic writing** should be trained more intensively and should start in the earlier semester.
8. As a service to the students Telkom University should provide an overview how much credits can be gained in the national workload system and how this **corresponds to the European Credit System (ECTS)**.
9. **A “Board of Study”** should be appointed which consists of alumni of the programmes, external academics from other universities who are involved in similar programmes in their universities and industrial advisors to evaluate the relevancy and validity of the programmes.
10. The **curriculum review** must be performed by involving not only internal stakeholders, but the faculty must include external stakeholders including alumni, external academic experts, and industrial representatives.
11. To improve the **entrepreneurial skills** of the students in the Business Administration programme the following content must be offered: Franchising, Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) Management, Business Plan, Company Law, Business Law.
12. **External Academician Assessors** should evaluate the method and content of assessments.
13. The internal QA system must **monitor the quality of assessment methods**. The content of each assessment must meet undergraduate level and make sure that the lecturers are marking the different types of final examinations according to the regulations and schemes.

14. A **staff development plan** must be provided which explains how more fulltime teaching staff (including professors) will be included in BA programmes in the next three years.
15. Measures should be taken to **support the teaching staff in its research ambitions** by offering more time or regular research semesters.
16. Support of staff in **internationalization** should be intensified to foster the university's vision to become a research university
17. The **number of teaching staff with industry background** should be raised and the exchange between teaching staff and companies (e.g., practice semester) should be supported.
18. The **duration of the internships** should be extended.
19. The existing **mobility programmes** should be extended to other English-speaking countries.